



MEMO TO THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

HEARING DATE: OCTOBER 21, 2020

Case Number: None - Informational
Project: Preservation Activities Annual Reporting
Staff Contact: Marcelle Boudreaux - 628-652-7375
marcelle.boudreaux@sfgov.org

Recommendation: Informational

This memorandum outlines recommendations for an updated strategy for reporting to the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) on activities by the preservation staff of the Planning Department.

Background

The most recent proposal for reporting preservation activities was shared with the HPC on May 15, 2019. In this intervening time, there have been management and staffing changes at the Department, the Covid-19 pandemic shifted parameters for how staff does work and engages the public, and the Planning Commission and Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) have both issued Resolutions centering the Department's work on racial and social equity.

Therefore, the reporting structure has been re-considered to balance staff capacity while updating the HPC and the public on key activities. A bi-annual, detailed report of multiple separate activities would consume staff time that could be better allocated to preservation activities. Although some statistics could be automated, all require staff to review and edit, and a majority would require staff to manually compile data. Further, individual activities may warrant more frequent or less frequent reporting updates.

Proposed

Staff proposes leveraging existing, required reporting timelines for the Department as well as expected programmatic updates from sister agencies. High level program details will be included in the reporting as well as maps, or other visuals, illustrating geographic distribution and progress, which could include, but not be limited to, number of application types by Supervisorial district, activities in Planning-defined neighborhood and/or Quadrant, and maps of application types by disadvantaged communities (DAC) data being developed by the Planning Department. The under-development DAC data pulls together indicators of racial and socioeconomic inequities, more details of which will be shared as finalized.

Details below outline anticipated timing for updates to the HPC on an annual (calendar year) basis. In addition, metrics to measure progress for Racial and Social Equity goals as part of Phase 2 Implementation are in development. However, that timeframe is unknown at this time. As this Phase 2 metrics timeframe is developed and finalized, an updated proposal for annual reporting on preservation activities may need to be prepared.

This schedule does not preclude hearings to discuss these activities at other times of the year, instead, offers a roadmap for Commissioners and the public while guiding staff efforts.

Proposed Annual Reporting Schedule to HPC

Quarter 1 (January – March):

- As part of the Certified Local Government (CLG)* reporting requirement, these details would be reported on and presented for discussion:
 - Landmark Designations and Work Program
 - Citywide Survey: context status, survey findings, Historic Resource Assessment (HRA)
 - CEQA review by staff and HPC: Historic Resource Evaluations, DEIR review, Section 106 review
 - Preservation entitlements: Certificate of Appropriateness (including Administrative), Permit to Alter (including Minor), Preservation incentives in Article 8 of the Planning Code
- Citywide Cultural Resources survey quarterly review. The details of this item will be discussed at the November 18, 2020 informational hearing on the Survey.
- Cultural Heritage items quarterly update (HPC Cultural Heritage liaison). Staff and Commissioner may present updates on items related to cultural heritage, including, cultural districts, legacy business registry, and such, which may include
 - Legacy Business Registry review and discussion– Annual Report prepared by Office of Small Business after the fiscal year closes
 - Cultural Heritage Districts review and discussion– Annual Report on grant activities prepared by MOHCD after the fiscal year closes

Quarter 2 (April – June):

- Citywide Cultural Resources survey quarterly review
- Cultural Heritage items quarterly update (HPC Cultural Heritage liaison)

Quarter 3 (July – September):

- Mills Act Annual Contracts and Program update
- Citywide Cultural Resources survey quarterly review
- Cultural Heritage items quarterly update (HPC Cultural Heritage liaison)

Quarter 4 (October – December):

- Citywide Cultural Resources survey quarterly review
- Cultural Heritage items quarterly update (HPC Cultural Heritage liaison)

* San Francisco is a Certified Local Government, administered by the California Office of Historic Preservation in partnership with the National Park Service, which requires annual reporting due in April, encompassing preservation activities from the prior year from October 1 – September 30.



MEMO TO THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

HEARING DATE: OCTOBER 21, 2020

Case Number: 2015- 0071810TH
Project: Landmark Designation update
Staff Contact: Marcelle Boudreaux - 628-652-7375
marcelle.boudreaux@sfgov.org

Recommendation: Informational

This memorandum highlights Landmark Designation activity since the last update to Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) on May 15, 2019. In addition, a discussion of prioritizing tasks for future Landmark activities is included.

Background

In this intervening time, there have been management and staffing changes at the Department, the Covid-19 pandemic shifted parameters for how staff does work and engages the public, and the Planning Commission and Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) both issued Resolutions centering the Department's work on racial and social equity.

On July 15, 2020, the HPC endorsed a Resolution centering preservation planning on racial and social equity (Resolution No. 1127), and held a hearing on August 19, 2020 for further discussion on a racial and social equity plan, including Phase I Action Plan implementation status and Phase II (implementation) next steps. Phase II implementation requires additional community input and is not final. However, initial findings from community outreach and engagement, as shared at the hearing as part of the summary of initial findings, highlighted this theme in relation to historic preservation:

Limited historic and cultural preservation of vulnerable communities.

Some participants feel that the experiences of communities of color are not sufficiently captured in the Department's context statements. They also find it difficult to prove historic and cultural significance to the Department. They feel that this is in part due to historic preservation lacking in cultural competency and being for and run by mostly wealthy, white people that lacks diversity and equity. Most participants would like histories in the city to be documented, created, and told by cultural historians, community members, and people of the respective cultures. Participants suggested redefining historic preservation with the racial and social equity lens, holistically review preservation decisions, among other ideas.

Audit of Existing Landmarks

In relation to Landmark activities, this initial finding for Racial and Social Equity in preservation informed the Department's decision to begin conducting an audit of the existing listing of individual and district Landmarks and Conservation Districts for omissions of community histories, identification of racist persons or events, and other areas that may warrant additional scrutiny and research. A list of potential Landmark amendments is under development, with intention of review by community groups and a presentation and discussion with the HPC. The timeline for returning to HPC with this item is before the end of the fiscal year 2020-21, in order to guide staff priorities for Landmark amendment tasks in the following year. It is anticipated that the level of effort for Landmark amendments may range between half to the same amount of time allocated to a new landmark designation. The regulatory process for amendments mirrors that of a new landmark, however, some of the background research has already been conducted.

New Landmark Designations

With projected staffing for Landmark efforts in fiscal year 2020-21, it is anticipated that 12 Landmark designations can be processed, including those from the Work program, Board-initiated and community-sponsored. As identified in the attached Landmark Designation Work program update, the items on the in-progress and pending list exceeds the staffing capacity in a fiscal year. Further, some Landmark nominations are initiated by the Board or are community-initiated, and the number of these is unknown; both are regulated by review timeframes identified in the Planning Code. The Department will continue to seek local, state and national grants to assist with this work but at this time does not have updates on new grants.

The Department will continue to process designations that are substantially complete and prioritize items on the Landmark Designation Work program based on the following criteria established by the HPC:

- Underrepresented groups
- Underrepresented geographic area
- Underrepresented property types

In relation to the initial finding for Racial and Social Equity in preservation and sites associated with underrepresented groups, the Department plans to engage the community to learn if these remain the correct sites to move forward and determine how to prioritize those on the work program.

For the remainder of the calendar year, staff plans to process substantially complete designations with property owner and/or community support and those that have companion National or California Register nominations.

Landmark Designation Work Program Update

These Landmark Designations have been finally approved and added to Article 10 of the Planning Code:

- **Paper Doll, 524 Union Street.** The HPC adopted a resolution to initiate landmark designation on September 5, 2018 and on October 17, 2018 adopted a resolution to recommend designation to the BOS. The Land Use and Transportation Committee heard the Ordinance on June 3, 2019,

recommending approval to the full BOS. The ordinance passed its first reading at the Board of Supervisors on June 11, 2019 and its second reading on June 18, 2019. The ordinance was signed by the mayor on June 25, 2019.

- **Kinmon Gakuen Building, 2031 Bush Street.** The HPC adopted a resolution to initiate Article 10 landmark designation on February 6, 2019 and on April 3, 2019 adopted a resolution to recommend landmark designation to the BOS. The Land Use and Transportation Committee heard the Ordinance on September 30, 2019, recommending approval to the full BOS. The ordinance passed its first reading at the Board of Supervisors on October 8, 2019 and its second reading on October 22, 2019. The ordinance was signed by the mayor on November 1, 2019.
- **Interior of Our Lady of Guadalupe Church, 906 Broadway (Landmark No. 204).** The HPC initiated an amendment on December 19, 2018 and adopted a resolution on February 6, 2019 to recommend to the BOS amendment of the existing landmark designation to designate interior character defining features. The Land Use and Transportation Committee heard the Ordinance on April 1, 2019, recommending approval to the full BOS. The ordinance passed its first reading at the Board of Supervisors on April 9, 2019 and its second reading on April 16, 2019. The ordinance was signed by the mayor on April 26, 2019.

These Landmark Designation recommendations have been transmitted to the Board of Supervisors, including:

- **Royal Baking Company Building, 4767-4773 Mission Street.** On November 19, 2019, the Land Use and Transportation Committee introduced a resolution to initiate landmark designation. The resolution did not advance to the full BOS. On February 5, 2020, the HPC initiated landmark designation. On May 6, 2020, the HPC adopted a resolution to recommend landmark designation to the BOS. On June 8, 2020, the Land Use and Transportation Committee recommended landmark initiation. On June 16, 2020, the Board of Supervisors initiated landmark designation and on June 26, 2020 the Mayor approved the Resolution. On September 22, 2020, the ordinance was introduced and assigned to the Land Use and Transportation Committee.
- **UCSF Parnassus/ Toland Hall – Zakheim Murals, 533 Parnassus.** On June 23, 2020, the Board of Supervisors initiated landmark designation, and on July 31, 2020 the Resolution became effective. On August 19, 2020, the HPC adopted a resolution to recommend designation to the Board of Supervisors and this was transmitted to the Clerk of the Board.
- **Galería de la Raza/Studio 24 Building, 2851-2861 24th Street.** The HPC adopted a resolution to initiate Article 10 landmark designation on January 16, 2019. On April 3, 2019, the HPC adopted a resolution to recommend designation to the Board of Supervisors and this was transmitted to the Clerk of the Board.
- **Former Welsh Presbyterian Church, 449 14th Street.** The HPC adopted a resolution to initiate Article 10 landmark designation on August 15, 2018. On September 19, 2018 the HPC adopted a resolution to recommend designation to the Board of Supervisors and transmitted to the Clerk of the Board thereafter.
- **George Washington High School, 600 32nd Avenue.** The HPC adopted a resolution on October 18, 2017 to initiate landmark designation and on December 6, 2017 adopted a resolution to recommend landmark designation to the BOS. The designation was transmitted to the Clerk of the BOS on December 20, 2017.
- **Diamond Heights Safety Wall, wall at the intersection of Diamond Heights Boulevard at Clipper Street.** The HPC adopted a resolution on November 1, 2017 to initiate landmark designation and on

December 20, 2017 adopted a resolution to recommend landmark designation to the BOS. On March 5, 2018, the LUC heard the item and forwarded it on to the full BOS without a recommendation. On March 13, 2018, the full BOS heard the item and referred it back to the LUC.

Staff is actively working/engaged with property owners on these Landmark Designations with anticipated HPC initiation hearings in the next six months:

- **Peace Pagoda & Peace Plaza, 1610 Geary Boulevard.** The HPC adopted a resolution on June 21, 2017 to initiate landmark designation and on December 20, 2017 adopted a resolution to recommend designation to the BOS. Since that time, a request has been made for the Peace Pagoda as separate Landmark, which requires updated Ordinance and additional review by HPC.
- **Japanese YWCA, 1830 Sutter Street.** Consultant-produced National Register nomination as part of NPS Underrepresented Communities grant. Consultant and Department-produced Landmark Designation Report. HPC Landmark initiation hearing is scheduled for October 21, 2020.
- **Mission Cultural Center for Latino Arts,** Consultant-produced National Register nomination. Consultant and Department-produced Landmark Designation Report. HPC Landmark initiation hearing is anticipated in Q4 2020.
- **Casa Sanchez,** Consultant-produced National Register nomination. Consultant and Department-produced Landmark Designation Report. HPC Landmark initiation hearing is anticipated in Q4 2020.
- **Sacred Heart, 554 Fillmore.** HPFC grant-funded consultant produced nomination. HPC Landmark initiation hearing is anticipated in Q1 2021.
- **Gran Oriente Filipino Hotel, Residence, and Masonic Temple Complex,** Consultant-produced National Register nomination as part of NPS Underrepresented Communities grant. Consultant and Department-produced Landmark Designation Report. TBD, Landmark Initiation.
- **Glide Memorial Church** Consultant-produced National Register nomination as part of NPS Underrepresented Communities grant. Consultant and Department-produced Landmark Designation Report. TBD, Landmark Initiation.

These sites are currently listed on the Landmark Designation Work Program, have substantially complete designation fact sheets, but require additional owner outreach and/or finalization of landmark designation fact sheet.

- Golden Gate Valley (Carnegie Library), 1801 Green Street
- Religious School for Congregation Emanu-El
- Wolski House
- Strand Theater
- Rousseaus' Boulevard Tract Landmark District
- Stowe Lake Boat House
- Sailors Union of the Pacific
- Golden Gate Park Landmark District

These individual sites and districts are currently on the Landmark Designation Work Program, but are pending designation fact sheet development and initiation.

- Haight-Ashbury Landmark District
- 6th Street Lodging House Landmark District
- North Beach Landmark District
- Planters Hotel
- 2173 15th Street
- Tonga Room
- Gladding, McBean
- The Delta House/Bayanihan House
- JACL Headquarters
- St. Francis Square Cooperative Apartments
- Fillmore Auditorium
- The Church of the Fellowship of All Peoples
- National Urban League, SF Chapter
- Southern Police Station
- First Baptist Church
- Crispus Attucks Club/Bayview Community Center
- Office of Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett
- Site of the Compton's Cafeteria Riots
- Site of the Mel's Diner Sit Ins
- Mona's 440 Club
- Community Thrift
- SF General Hospital
- Black Cat Café
- Mattachine Society Headquarters
- Society for Individual Rights
- St. Peters Catholic Church
- 4680 Mission Street
- Samuel Gompers Trade School
- Russell House
- 2 Clarendon
- Mother's Building
- San Francisco Galvanizing Works
- Alcoa Building*
- Order of the Foresters/Baha'i Temple*
- Interior of Hibernia Bank, Landmark No 130*
- I Magnin & Co.*

*Sites with active projects

Landmark Plaques

The Department received 39 applications for a historic landmark plaque. During the first phase of this pilot program, 25 individual landmark property were accepted into the program. The remaining applicants have been placed on a waiting list to receive a plaque in the future as funding allows. The Department will continue to move the program forward as staffing and the parameters of the Covid-19 scenario allow.

Plaque	Status
Doelger Building (320 Judah Street, LM No. 265)	plaque installed
Swedish American Hall (2168 Market Street, LM No. 267)	plaque installed
Lick Baths/Peoples' Laundry (165 10th Street, LM No. 246)	plaque installed
Haas-Lilienthal House (2007 Franklin Street, LM No. 69)	plaque installed
Third Baptist Church (1399 McAllister Street, LM No. 275)	plaque installed
San Francisco Mining Exchange (350 Bush Street, LM No. 113)	plaque installed
Filbert Street Cottages (1338 Filbert Street, LM No. 232)	plaque produced
First Unitarian Church (1187 Franklin Street, LM No. 40)	plaque produced
Alfred G. Hanson Residence (126 27 th Avenue, LM No. 196)	plaque produced
The Mechanics Institute (65 Post Street, LM No. 134)	plaque produced
Alfred E. (Nobby) Clarke Mansion (250 Douglass Street, LM No. 80)	plaque produced
Old Fire House, Engine 22 (1348 10 th Avenue, LM No. 29)	plaque produced
Feusier Octagon House (1067 Green Street, LM No. 36)	plaque produced
Potrero Hill Neighborhood House (953 De Haro Street, LM No. 86)	plaque produced
Brown's Opera House (2961 16 th Street, LM No. 215)	plaque produced
Havens Mansion and Carriage House (1381 South Van Ness Avenue, LM No. 125)	plaque produced
James Flood Building (870 Market Street, LM No. 154)	artwork created
Miller-Joost House (3224 Market Street, LM No. 79)	artwork created
Medico-Dental Building (441 Jackson Street, LM No. 14)	text written
Columbus Tower/Sentinel Building (916 Kearny Street, LM No. 33)	text written
Stadtmuller House (819 Eddy Street, LM No. 35)	text written
Stanyan House (2006 Bush Street, LM No. 66)	text written
Rothschild House (964 Eddy Street, LM No. 112)	text written
Marsden Kershaw House (845 Guerrero Street, LM No. 136)	text written
Lewis House (4143 23 rd Street, LM No. 186)	text written
The McCormick House (4040 17 th Street, LM No. 208)	text written
Ingleside Presbyterian Church (1345 Ocean Avenue, LM No. 273)	text written
Benedict-Gieling House (22 Beaver Street, LM No. 283)	artwork approved