DATE: June 19, 2019
TO: Architectural Review Committee (ARC) of the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC)
FROM: Alexandra Kirby, Preservation Planner, (415) 575-9133
REVIEWED BY: Claudine Asbagh, Principal Planner, Northeast Quadrant, (415) 575-6822
RE: Review and Comment: 1000 Market Street, San Christina Building Case No. 2019-000539PTA

BACKGROUND

The Planning Department (Department) requests review and comment before the Architectural Review Committee (ARC) regarding the proposed project at 1000 Market Street, a Renaissance Revival-style mixed-use flatiron building at the corner of Market Street and Golden Gate Avenue that is an individually significant Category I (Significant Building, No Alterations) property under Article 11 and located within the Market Street Theater and Loft Historic District on the California and National Registers of Historic Places. The project scope would modify the previously approved new construction of a 13-story, 193-unit mixed-use building at the adjacent 1028 Market Street to retain portions of the cornice return of 1000 Market Street, which extends beyond the property line onto 1028 Market Street.

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION

1000 Market Street is located on the north side of Market Street at the intersection of Golden Gate Avenue, Taylor Street, and 6th Street on a triangular parcel with 154 feet of frontage on Market Street and 152 feet of frontage on Golden Gate Avenue. The four-story steel-frame flatiron building was constructed in 1913 by Miller & Colmesnil and is built out to the property line on both frontages with a circular bay at the corner. The four-story structure features ground floor retail and offices with altered storefronts, and 59 residential hotel units above with tripartite wood casement windows and terracotta cladding. A prominent sheet metal cornice with ornate detailing wraps along both frontages as well as along the interior property line walls for a length of approximately 8’-6”; the cornice is a character-defining feature of the property. The project site is located within the C-3-G (Downtown – General) Zoning District and 120-X Height and Bulk Limit.

The property is listed under Appendix A of Article 11 in the Planning Code, which identifies Category I (Significant Building, No Alterations) Buildings of Individual Importance. The subject property was also listed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1991 as part of the Market Street Theater and Loft Historic District, which includes 20 contributing buildings along the one-block stretch between 6th and 7th streets on both side of Market Street.
PREVIOUS ACTIONS
The Planning Commission approved an application (Case No. 2014.0241CUA/E/VAR/X, Motion No. 19845) for new construction at 1028 Market Street on January 26, 2017, to allow demolition of the adjacent existing two-story commercial building and construction of a new 13-story mixed use building with up to 193 dwelling units and approximately 6,000 square feet of ground floor retail. The approved proposal showed the full removal of the cornice returns on both facades of 1000 Market Street. A Permit to Alter (Case No. 2019-000539PTA) was filed for the removal of the cornice on May 14, 2018.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION
The proposed project (“Option 1”) would retain and repair the full length of the cornice at the Market Street frontage by pulling the “prow” detail of the approved new building at 1128 Market Street back at the first through sixth floors along Market Street. The portion of the cornice that extends over the property line at the Golden Gate Avenue frontage would be removed to accommodate the full width of the new construction while retaining the face of the cornice that extends beyond the property line to maintain the appearance of the original cornice design. Two alternative options have been proposed by the project sponsor, although the below Staff Analysis only assesses Option 1, as it provides the greatest compliance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation (“Standards”).

OTHER ACTIONS REQUIRED
As proposed, the project will require a Major Permit to Alter, which would be heard before the Historic Preservation Commission, and corresponding Building Permit Application. No additional entitlements are required.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW
The proposed project would qualify for a Categorical Exemption under CEQA based on the below Standards Analysis.

PUBLIC/NEIGHBORHOOD INPUT
To date, the Department has not received any public comment about the proposed project.

STAFF ANALYSIS
In an effort to provide initial feedback to the Project Sponsor, the following Standards analysis outlines general staff assessment of the proposed Option 1 to retain the full cornice return on the Market Street frontage.

Standard 1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

The proposed project would not change the existing use of building and would minimally change the distinctive materials, features, and spatial relationships by retaining the greatest amount possible of the historic cornice.
Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 1.

**Standard 2.** The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

The Option 1 proposal would retain the full length of the historic cornice at the primary Market Street frontage while allowing for partial removal at the Golden Gate Avenue frontage to accommodate new housing. The proposed scope would remove a minimal amount of the distinctive cornice while maintaining the character of the building at both facades.

Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 2.

**Standard 3.** Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

The proposed project would not add any conjectural features to the exterior of the property. Any repair work to the existing cornice, which is failing in areas, would be fully based on the existing fabric in design and materials.

Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 3.

**Standard 5.** Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

The Option 1 proposed project would retain the entire character-defining cornice return along the Market Street façade while removing a portion of the cornice return at the return on Golden Gate Avenue. As such, a majority of the character-defining cornice would be retained.

Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 5.

**Standard 6.** Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Although repair details have not yet been provided, the historic cornice would be repaired to the greatest extent possible as needed. An inspection report prepared by ARG Conservation Services (“ARG”) has been provided for review, documenting the conditions of the cornice at both corners in question.

Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 6.

**Standard 9.** New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

The proposed Option 1 project would destroy less than 50 percent of the cornice returns in question and allow the entire return at the Market Street frontage to be read clearly from the pedestrian...
perspective along Market Street. No new construction is proposed at the subject property under the current proposal.

Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 9.

**STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS**

Following ongoing discussions with senior Planning staff and the project sponsor, the Department recommends that Option 1 be implemented as it reflects the greatest level of compliance with the Standards while allowing for retention of much of the interior space and housing supply originally approved for the adjacent new structure. Options 2A and 2B have been reviewed by ARG (see attached report) and were found not to fully comply with Standards 2, 5, and 9. The building’s cornice extends around the both street-facing facades of the subject building and the proposed removal under any of the options under consideration would retain over 90% of the cornice structure. Staff additionally recommends that the cornice be fully evaluated for structural stability as the documented sections appear to be significantly damaged due to corrosion.

**REQUESTED ACTION**

Review and comment on the proposed Option 1 design. The ARC may provide additional comments regarding the alternative proposals that would partially remove the Market Street cornice return.

**ATTACHMENTS**

- Exhibits including:
  - Parcel Map
  - Aerial Image
  - Site Photo
- Sponsor presentation and plans
- Memorandum prepared by Architectural Resources Group
- Inspection report prepared by ARG Conservation Services
Aerial Photo
(looking north)
1028 Market
San Francisco, CA

CORNICE STUDY AT 1000 MARKET

HISTORIC PRESERVATION
COMMISSION HEARING
06 - 19 - 2019
1028 Market is a 13-story mixed-use development in San Francisco's Mid-Market Corridor

- **193 Apartments**
- **26 On-Site Below Market Rate Apartments**
- **~6,000 Square Feet of Retail Along Market Street and Golden Gate Avenue**
- **January 2017** - Project received unanimous approvals/entitlements from Planning Commission

- **May 2018** - Agreement signed with 1000 Market Property owner to allow cornice for modification and repair in line with approved plans

- **December 2018** - Site permit pulled for 1028 Market Street

- **August 2019** - Anticipated start of construction
APPROVED PROJECT DESIGN

MARKET ST: MODIFY CORNICE TO STOP AT PROPERTY LINE, CAP WITH SHEET METAL PER CONSULTANT RECOMMENDATIONS

GOLDEN GATE AVE: MODIFY CORNICE TO CONTINUE PAST FACE OF 1028 MARKET PROJECT AND MAINTAIN APPEARANCE FROM GOLDEN GATE AVE
PORTION OF CORNICE ENCROACHING ON 1028 MARKET PROPERTY, PROPOSED TO BE REMOVED
ORIGINAL PROPOSED CORNICE MODIFICATIONS

3. (E) IMAGE - GOLDEN GATE AVE

4. (E) IMAGE - MARKET STREET

ARCHITECTURAL RESOURCES GROUP

Sheet Title

Revisions

Description

Date

Issuance

Proj No.

Drawn

Checked

CORNICE MODIFICATION

1000 MARKET STREET

SAN FRANCISCO, CA, 94102

DRAWING NO.

1000 MARKET STREET (SAN CRISTINA)

ISSUED FOR CONSTRUCTION

MARCH 30, 2018

17274

NO.

ZY & MP

DW & LY

A5.0

CORNICE PLAN & DETAILS
CURRENT CONDITIONS OF GOLDEN GATE CORNICE
PORTION OF CORNICE TO BE REMOVED AND CAPPED PER CONSULTANTS DETAIL AT PROPERTY LINE
APPROVED PROJECT DESIGN - SNAPSHOTs AT MARKET STREET
LEVEL 03
19' - 4 1/2"

LEVEL 02
10' - 3"

LEVEL 04
28' - 6"

LEVEL 05
37' - 7 1/2"

LEVEL 06
46' - 9"

LEVEL 07
55' - 10 1/2"

LEVEL 08
65' - 0"

LEVEL 09
74' - 1 1/2"

LEVEL 10
83' - 3"

LEVEL 11
92' - 4 1/2"

LEVEL 12
101' - 6"

LEVEL 13
110' - 7 1/2"

LEVEL 14 (ROOF)
120' - 0"

MECH.
PENTHOUSE
134' - 0"

LEVEL 01 B
0"

MODIFIED CORNICE,
CAPPED PER
CONSULTANT’S
RECOMMENDATIONS
**OPTION 1 - RAISED PROW**

**MARKET ST:** RAISE BOTTOM OF PROW THREE FLOORS ABOVE CURRENT DESIGN TO MAINTAIN CLEARANCE FOR ENTIRE CORNICE TO RETURN OVER 1028 MARKET PROPERTY LINE

**GOLDEN GATE AVE:** MODIFY CORNICE TO CONTINUE PAST FACE OF 1028 MARKET PROJECT AND MAINTAIN APPEARANCE FROM GOLDEN GATE AVENUE
OUTLINE OF CURRENT ENTITLED DESIGN, LEVELS 4-13

CORNICE TO REMAIN AS EXISTING, NO WORK PROPOSED
CORNICE TO REMAIN AS EXISTING, NO WORK PROPOSED
CORNICE TO REMAIN AS EXISTING, NO WORK PROPOSED

ORIGINAL DESIGN INTENT WAS TO REFERENCE THE MARQUEE OF THE GOLDEN GATE THEATER, BY TRUNCATING THE GEOMETRY OF PROW WE LOSE THAT CONNECTION TO THE SURROUNDINGS

MARKET STREET ELEVATION

UNITS ON LEVELS 4-6 LOSE THE DYNAMIC VIEW DOWN MARKET STREET FROM THE PROJECTING PROW ELEMENT
SNAPSHOTS AT MARKET STREET

LOOKING WEST

LOOKING EAST
CORNICE CONTINUES PAST FACE OF PROJECT TO MAINTAIN EXISTING APPEARANCE FROM STREET, AND A PORTION IS REMOVED WHERE IT ENCROACHES OVER THE PROPERTY LINE.
CORNICE IS MODIFIED BUT MAINTAINS THE APPEARANCE OF EXTENDING BEYOND PROPERTY LINE BY RUNNING IN FRONT OF 1028 MARKET PROJECT
SNAPSHOT FROM GOOGLE EARTH Overlay - Golden Gate Ave

Olympic Club Precedent

295 California

Proposed Cornice Modification
OPTION 2 - MODIFIED CORNICE STUDY

MARKET ST - 2A: (APPLICANT PREFERRED)
PULL TIP OF PROW FURTHER BACK TO MAINTAIN CORNICE RETURN FOR ONE BAY, CAP REMAINING CORNICE

MARKET ST - 2B:
MODIFY CORNICE TO RETURN UPPER DECORATIVE BAND ONLY, SIMILAR TO 1019 MARKET PRECEDENT

GOLDEN GATE AVE:
SAME PROPOSAL AS OPTION 1
62sf REDUCTION FROM CURRENT DESIGN AT LEVELS 4-13 = 620sf TOTAL

OUTLINE OF CURRENT ENTITLED DESIGN, LEVELS 4-13

CORNICE TO RETURN AROUND CORNER, PARTIALLY MODIFIED TO PROVIDE CLEARANCE FROM THE REDUCED PROW.
CORNICE IS PARTIALLY MODIFIED AROUND THE REDUCED PROW PROJECTION, APPEARS AS EXISTING FROM MARKET STREET.
SNAPSHOT FROM MARKET LOOKING EAST

2A (APPLICANT PREFERRED): REDUCED PROW ANGLE

OLYMPIC CLUB PRECEDENT

295 CALIFORNIA

PROPOSED CORNICE MODIFICATION
PORTION OF CORNICE TO BE REMOVED

MAINTAINS PROW SHAPE OF ORIGINAL ENTITLED DESIGN

CAP END OF CORNICE WITH DECORATIVE ELEMENT IN KEEPING WITH ORIGINAL CORNICE LANGUAGE

2B: MODIFIED CORNICE RETURN
CORNICE IS PARTIALLY MODIFIED TO CONTINUE DECORATIVE MOULDING AROUND EDGE OF PROJECTION.
SNAPSHOT FROM MARKET LOOKING WEST

2B: MODIFIED CORNICE RETURN

PRECEDENT - 48 GOLDEN GATE

PROPOSED CORNICE MODIFICATION
THANK YOU!
Memorandum

To: Tim Frye, Preservation Officer
San Francisco Planning Department
1650 Mission Street, Suite 400
San Francisco, CA 94

Project: 1000-1028 Market Street - Cornice Modification Options
Secretary of Interior Standard Compliance Evaluation

Project #: 17274
Date: 17 May 2019
Via: Email

Architectural Resources Group, Inc. (ARG), at the request of the San Francisco Planning Department (Planning), prepared the following assessment on the potential impact for four (4) options to modify existing cornice returns at 1000 Market Street (hereafter “the Project”), located within the Market Street Theatre and Loft Historic District. This memorandum uses the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation (“The Standards”) to assess the impact of the proposed modifications.

Introduction, Project Overview, and Methodology

Located within the Market Street Theatre and Loft Historic District (“the District”), the Project proposes to construct a thirteen (13) story building on the parcel known as 1028 - 1056 Market Street. 1000 Market Street currently contains a four (4) story commercial building and is a contributor to the District. The prominent projecting cornice is a character defining feature of the historic resource. The San Francisco Planning Department has requested review and comment on compliance of the options with the Standards.

Project Overview

The Project’s sponsors propose four (4) options for the treatment of cornice returns along the west elevation of 1000 Market Street. The property is triangular in shape with approximately 306’ of uninterrupted cornice with 154’ along Market Street and 152’ along Golden Gate Avenue. The cornice terminates or returns along the property’s western elevation adjacent to Market Street and Golden Gate Avenue. Except for the two six foot sections of cornice return, the western elevation is an undecorated party wall to 1028-1056 Market Street. For purposes of clarity, these cornice sections are identified as “cornice returns” in this report. Each return is approximately eight and one half (8’-6”) feet in length and are visible from Market Street and Golden Gate Avenue. In each location, the cornices extend over the
adjacent 1028-1056 Market Street property boundary. The proposed four (4) options address the Market Street side of the property. Three (3) of the four (4) options propose to modify the west facing cornice returns. The options are identified as follows:

- **Approved Project Design**
  In line with the Planning Commission approved plans, the original proposal would remove the west facing cornice returns at Market Street and Golden Gate Avenue.

- **Option 1 – Raised Prow:**
  This option would retain all original cornice material and recess the adjacent new construction.

- **Option 2A – Reduced Prow Angle (Preferred by Applicant)**
  This option would remove 5’2” of the cornice returns (two (2) coffers and one (1) bracket) to accommodate the new construction.

- **Option 2B – Modified Cornice Return**
  This option would modify the cornice returns by removing the existing cornice section and create a new cornice composed of replicated components of the original. The new cornice returns would be composed of the original design’s ogee molding, medallions, and cresting.

**Methodology**

To prepare for this compatibility assessment, ARG staff examined the following materials to gain an understanding of the proposed project, the development and character of 1000 Market Street, the adjacent property at 1028-1056 Market Street, and the Market Street Theatre and Loft Historic District:

- Market Street Theatre and Loft Historic District Nomination (1985)
- DPR Form for 1000-1026 Market Street (1997)
- DPR Form for 1028-1056 Market Street (1997)
- Existing Conditions Photographs by Architectural Resources Group (01.04.2018)
- 1000 Market Street Cornice Modification Drawings (03.30.2018)
- Cornice Study-Plan + Elevation Sketches prepared by Solomon Cordwell Buenz (03.21.2019)

ARG staff also reviewed plan drawings for the proposed project prepared by Solomon Cordwell Buenz. ARG staff involved in preparing the Standards review include Charles Edwin Chase, AIA, and Sarah Hahn,
Architectural Historian, who meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Professional Qualifications Standards in Historical Architecture and Architectural History, respectively.

Standards Compliance Assessment

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation (the Standards) are a set of treatment standards for historic buildings developed by the National Park Service. The Standards are used at the federal, state, and often the local level to provide guidance regarding the suitability of a proposed project that could affect a historic resource. The Standards are as follows:

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

8. Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

As 1000 Market Street and the Market Street Theatre and Loft Historic District are identified historic resources, any proposed project that may have an impact on their historic significance is subject to CEQA review. The Standards are employed under CEQA by the lead agency to determine the appropriateness of a proposed project. As noted in the California Office of Historic Preservation Technical Assistance Series #1, California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and Historical Resources:

A project that has been determined to conform to the Standards can generally be considered to be a project that will not cause a significant impact (14 CCR § 15126.4(b) (1)). In fact, in most cases if a project meets the Standards it can be considered categorically exempt from CEQA (14 CCR § 15331).

Findings
This section provides an assessment of the appropriateness of the proposed Project’s cornice modification options based on conformance with the ten Standards. This evaluation is directed to conformance with Standards 2, 3, 5, and 9, which address removal or alteration of character-defining features; false sense of historical development; preservation of distinctive features; and destruction of historic materials that characterize a property.

The original proposal included in the Approved Project Design removes the cornice returns at the west elevation of the property. Removing historic material and altering a character defining feature, this option is not in keeping with Standards 2, 5, or 9, because it would remove approximately 8'6" of cornice work visible at the corner. However, this option would retain 300 feet of cornice along Market Street and Golden Gate Avenue. Though this option is not fully compatible with Standards 2, 5, or 9, a sufficient amount of cornice would remain intact along Market Street and Golden Gate Avenue to convey the property’s historic character.

Option 1 retains the existing cornice returns. This option would alter the adjacent development retaining the existing cornice intact. Retention of the cornice returns complies with Standards 2, 3, 5, and 9.

---

1 Document can be found online at: https://www.nps.gov/tps/standards/rehabilitation.htm
2 Document can be found online at: http://ohp.parks.ca.gov/pages/1069/files/11%20online%20resources.pdf.
**Option 2A** removes a portion of return cornices’ length. Option 2A would retain in place approximately 50% of the return cornices’ length. While less of an impact than proposed by Entitled Design Option, this option does not fully comply with Standards 2, 5, and 9. However, it retains sufficient historic material for the property to continue to convey its historic character.

**Option 2B** would replace the existing cornice returns with a modified design replicating the existing cornice’s ogee molding and medallions. It proposes to create a hybrid, using components of the historic cornice resulting in a cornice return that may convey a false sense of historic development. However, its visual impact does not create a significant impact to the resource. It is also a method previously used at 48 Golden Gate to accommodate the adjacent construction of the Golden Gate Theater in 1922.

**Conclusions**

The removal of the west facing cornice returns located at 1000 Market Street while a visual change, does not alter the building to a level considered a significant impact to the resource. The property would retain in place more than 300 feet of cornice sufficient to convey the historic character and craftsmanship which characterizes the historic resource.

**Option 1** complies with all of the Standards by preserving historic design and workmanship which characterizes the resource.

The Approved Project Design Option, Option 2A, and Option 2B will not have a significant impact on the property’s ability to convey its historic significance. While varying in degree of cornice return removal, neither are sufficient to result in a significant impact. These treatment options would comply with the Standard 2, 5, and 9.
November 17, 2019

Mr. Adam Tetenbaum
Olympic Residential Group
325 Montgomery Street, Suite 960
San Francisco, CA 94104

Re: 1028 Market Update / 1000 Market Cornice

Dear Mr. Tetenbaum,

This document will serve as an inspection report for the cornice sections surveyed at 1000 Market on April 11th, 2019.

![Image 1: Aerial photo of 1000 Market with the location of the two cornice sections highlighted.](image)

INVESTIGATION
An investigation of the two cornice sections was conducted by rope using a tape measure and hand-held laser distance measurer. The dimensions of both the West and South cornices were measured to be the same. The only measurements that differed between the two cornices were O, P, Q, and R as the distances from the cornice to street level vary depending on the slope of the street.
Image 2: Detail of the West cornice with measurements labeled A through U.

**Measurements**

- A: 5”
- H: 10”
- O: (West) 45’
  (South) 50’ – 6”
- S: 24” vertical
  25” horizontal
  12” vertical
- B: 9”
- I: 23”
- P: (West) 46’ – 6”
  (South) 51’ – 11”
- T: 30” vertical
  22” horizontal
- C: 52”
- J: 26”
- Q: (West) 48’
  (South) 53’ – 5”
- U: 4” vertical
  8” horizontal
  – vertical
- D: 100”
- K: 30”
- R: (West) 45’
  (South) 49’ – 5”
- E: 23”
- L: 21”
- F: 10”
- M: 13”
- G: 23”
- N: 21”
CONDITIONS

Image 3: Conditions on both the South and West cornices are poor.

Image 4: Sections of sheet metal have rusted through exposing the interior of the cornice.
Image 4: Loose sections of the cornice have fallen onto the adjacent rooftop.