

SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



Meeting Minutes

REMOTE HEARING
via video and teleconferencing

Wednesday, February 17, 2021
12:30 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Black, Foley, Johns, Pearlman, So, Matsuda, Hyland
COMMISSIONERS ABSENT: None

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT HYLAND AT 12:34 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Pilar LaValley, Michelle Taylor, Liz Watty, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

SPEAKERS: None

B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

1. Department Announcements

None.

C. COMMISSION MATTERS

2. President's Report and Announcements

None.

3. Consideration of Adoption:

- [Draft Minutes for February 3, 2021](#)

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Adopted

AYES: Black, Foley, Johns, Pearlman, So, Matsuda, Hyland

4. Commission Comments & Questions

President Hyland:

Okay. It looks like -- I don't know if we -- how we do this. We've been contacted by so many people on so many -- or on both of the items today. I guess as a disclosure, we've received hundreds of emails on the Observation Wheel, dozens on the Lyon-Martin House. So, I don't know if that was your disclosure, Commissioner Pearlman, but I'll let you go ahead and make that.

Commissioner Pearlman:

Yes. I was contacted by the San Francisco -- San Franciscans for Urban Nature as well as communicated with a number of people through e-mail about the Observation Wheel in particular, yeah. Thanks.

Commissioner Black:

Sorry I have one. I was also contacted by SF or [inaudible] and the Mayor's Office.

Commissioner Foley:

I have had lots of people talk to me. I actually met with Kathy Howard and four other women via Zoom to talk about the Ferris Wheel. But I have fielded multiple calls and e-mails on this matter.

Commissioner Matsuda:

I have also been contacted by the Mayor's Office on the Observation Wheel.

President Hyland:

I was -- I've been -- Kathy Howard and her group did reach out to me. I've been remiss in not getting back to her, so I was not able to speak to them. State Senator Wiener did reach out to me as well, so I have spoken to him.

5. San Francisco Unified Schools District - School Re-naming

Jonas P. Ionin, Commission Secretary:

Commissioners, we had not prepared any kind of presentation associated with this from staff. This was a request from you all to add this as an agenda item so that you may have an open discussion.

President Hyland:

Thank you, Jonas. Maybe I can just do some introductory and then maybe hand it over to Commissioner Pearlman for him to kind of restate in a briefer form maybe some of his concerns last time. But I'm sure that the Commissioners, many other Commissioners may have had a desire to respond and weren't able to due to this item not being noticed. So, this is our opportunity to discuss the item. So, Commissioner Pearlman if you're prepared, we're happy to hear a little introduction if you'd like.

Commissioner Pearlman:

Sure. I'm not completely prepared because I thought this would be a more open conversation. My request was that, given the School Board's efforts to rename 44 schools, a third of the schools in the City. From the reporting, it seemed like there was a very flimsy effort in terms of the research about the individuals or places that name the schools. Including what sounded like a significant amount of Wikipedia research and the fact that these we are the Historic Preservation Commission and that these names were named for historical figures and places in California and San Francisco history. It seemed strange to me that the School Board did not reach out to others beyond their own committee, including -- you know, not including their own schools: the teachers in the school, the parents and kids who go to these schools to really understand the nature of the particular person or place that the school was named for and their thoughts and ideas on that. So I found, you know, number of the -- obviously, there are a number of choices that based on you know, races or you know, other kinds of actions that that person took, yeah probably it's not a good thing to honor those people with a school name. But for some of them, the obscurity and the minimal infraction that that person or place might have -- you know, might have represented, you know, by the choice seemed insane to me. You know, particularly people like George Washington or Abraham Lincoln. Or Dianne Feinstein whose infraction included replacing a tattered flag that she eventually did take down, a Confederate flag, on the Court of Flags in front of City Hall at the time. And that was the only thing that they noted. So, basically it diminishes, you know, an entire person's life for one very small or not significant to their lives effort, you know, item that they might have done. So it just seems to me that we -- I know that we have very little power to influence the School Board. But it seemed like the San Francisco Historic Preservation Commission should at least send a letter to the School Board, to the Mayor's Office, and the Supervisors just expressing our thoughts about it. So, that was really my intentions. So, I'll leave it there for further conversation. Anybody else?

President Hyland:

If you'd like to comment, type your name in the chat box. There we go. Commissioner Black, I thought you might be having a little challenge.

Commissioner Black:

Sorry. I share some of Commissioner Pearlman's concerns and comments. I feel a little bit about this the way I did the murals at George Washington High. Something that we should acknowledge is that people in history are not perfect individuals. They are a mixture of good and bad. And so, we do need to be careful to make sure that people who are mostly bad are not accorded lots of adulation. But I also think it's really important that children are taught to be critical thinkers and think through the good and bad in some of our historical figures and come to their own conclusion about these people. So I would urge the School District to be very careful in their deliberations.

President Hyland:

Thank you, Commissioner Black. I would be supportive of sending a letter to the School Board. And if we can have staff draft one. I think we've had several issues in my tenure in the Commission where we felt that we could add value to their deliberation and their process. And even make -- provide them with some information that could make their lives easier and come to a conclusion much quicker than they apparently have. And we have, over the years, reached out and offered our assistance and have not really been taken up on that. So, I would certainly support a letter stating that we're dismayed that we weren't consulted and that we remain open to having these dialogues -- in our own venue, in our venue. We're open to using our venue to those dialogues. And that while they're processing defensible -- and I'm not trying to defend their conclusions -- I think they set up a process that from what I understand that they followed. So prior to making any conclusion, my understanding is they set a process and a criteria, but after the conclusions were made based on this criteria, I think they failed in reevaluating it to see if there was unintended consequences that had come out on that criteria. So while, you know, I think their intentions were probably good, it has kind of spiraled into something that is probably a little over the limits, let's say. So, I don't know if Jonas or some staff person can write a brief letter. I'm happy to draft something and send it onto the Mayor's Office and the School Board. I'm fully supportive of the Mayor's statement that we should be focused in getting the schools reopened as opposed to these things where we need more public dialogue and aren't able to have that because the schools are closed. That's my comments.

Commissioner Johns:

Yes, well, thank you. Actually, the things that I was going to say have already been said by my fellow Commissioners, and so that's -- I really don't have anything to add except that I support what all you folks have said.

President Hyland:

Jonas, do we need to take public comment on this item?

Jonas P. Ionin:

We should open up the matter for public comment. It is agendaized as you requested, but in response to your request, Commission President Hyland, we can certainly work with staff and draft something similar that we did for your adoption as we did for the Washington High School murals. Members of the public, this is your opportunity to speak to this matter by pressing star then three to enter the queue. Seeing no members of the public requesting to speak at this time, Commissioners, public comment is closed, and we can move onto your regular calendar.

President Hyland:

Before we do that, Jonas, I just want to thank Commissioner Pearlman for bringing this up last time and bringing it to our attention so we could agendaize it and really actually have an official response. I think that will be really helpful.

Commissioner Pearlman:

Thank you for doing this. I think it's -- I think it's important that we participate in these kind of conversations at the City level. Thanks.

D. REGULAR CALENDAR

6. [2020-011305DES](#) (P. LAVALLEY: (628) 652-7372))
LYON-MARTIN HOUSE, 649-651 DUNCAN STREET – Located mid-block on south side of Duncan Street between Diamond and Castro streets just east of intersection with Newburg Street, Assessor's Block 6604, Lots 036 and 037 (District 8). Consideration to Recommend to the Board of Supervisors **Landmark Designation** of the Lyon-Martin House (649-651 Duncan Street) as an individual Article 10 Landmark pursuant to Section 1004.2 of the Planning Code. The Lyon-Martin House was initiated for Landmark designation by the Board of Supervisors on October 20, 2020 (See BoS File No. 201138). The Lyon-Martin House is significant as the longtime home of pioneering lesbian activists Phyllis Lyon and Del Martin. The subject properties are in RH-1 (Residential-House, One Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS:

- = Pilar LaValley - Staff presentation
- + Jacob Bintliff, Aide to Sup. Mandelman
- + Shayne Watson - Friends of Lyon-Martin House
- + Yakuh Askew - Architect
- + Terry - Support
- + John Goldsmith - Support, affordable housing
- + Christina Morris - Support
- + Meredith - Current owner
- + Speaker - Support
- + Robert Stone - Support
- = Andrea Ruiz-Esquide - City Attorney

ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval, striking any reference to the adjacent vacant parcel.

AYES: Black, Foley, Johns, Pearlman, So, Matsuda

NAYS: Hyland
 RESOLUTION: [1170](#)

7. [2019-022126COA-04](#) (M. TAYLOR: (628) 652-7352)
55 HAGIWARA TEA GARDEN DRIVE – Located between John F. Kennedy Drive, Hagiwara Tea Garden Drive, Martin Luther King Jr. Drive, and Music Concourse Drive; Lot 001 in Assessor's Block 1700 (District 1). Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** to extend the operation of a temporary observation wheel installed in the Music Concourse. On January 15, 2020, the Historic Planning Commission (HPC) reviewed and approved with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness Application (Motion No. 0407) for the one-year installation of an observation wheel to commemorate the 150th Anniversary of Golden Gate Park. The wheel was scheduled to open April 4, 2020 and be removed in March of 2021; however, Covid-19-related restrictions limited operation and capacity of the wheel. The City of San Francisco Recreation and Parks Department requests to extend operation of the observation wheel for a total of four additional years. The project sponsor proposes operational extension until March 1, 2023 to offset financial hardship experienced by the vendor and an additional extension until March 1, 2025 to support economic recovery. The subject property is Landmark No. 249, Music Concourse, Golden Gate Park and is located in a P (Public) Zoning District and OS Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: = Michelle Taylor - Staff presentation
 + Dana Ketcham - SF Rec and Park
 = Supervisor Chan - Consider continuance
 + Rodney Fong - Support extension
 + Emily - Support
 + Speaker - Support
 + Misha Olivas - Support
 + Jay - Support, traffic
 - Whitney - Opposed
 + Kathy - Support
 + Speaker - Support
 + Tom - Support
 + Manny - Support
 + Andrew Sullivan - Support
 + Drew Becker - Support
 + James - Support
 - Jeff - Oppose
 - Linda Schafer - Oppose
 + Kyle Meyers - Support
 + Ana - Support
 + Speaker - Support
 - Speaker - Oppose
 - Katherine Howard - Oppose
 - Speaker - Oppose
 - Susan - Oppose
 + Nick - Support

- Patricia - Oppose
 - Robert - Oppose
 - Speaker - Oppose
 - Ann McPherson - Oppose
 - Nancy Opposed
 - + Christine - Support
 - + Robert - Support
 - + John Franklin - Support
 - + Mike Chen - Support
 - + Mercury - Support
 - Speaker - Opposed
 - Pat - Opposed
 - + Speaker - Support
 - + Theresa - Support
 - + Martha - Support
 - + David Miles - Support
 - + Karen Gonzales - Support
 - + Speaker - Support
 - + Zack - Support
 - Ellen Brown - Oppose
 - + Caroline Rose - Support
 - + Speaker - Support
 - + Speaker - Support
 - + Daniel - Support
 - + Robert - Support
 - + Theo Gordon - Support
 - + Sam - Support
 - + Bob - Support
 - + Sara Ogilve - Support
 - + Jeanie - Support
 - + Sean Alexander - Support
 - Mark Keller - Oppose
 - Lance - Oppose
 - Lisa Aubrey - Oppose
 - + Cliff - Support
 - Speaker - Oppose
 - + Kevin - Support
 - + Speaker - Support
 - Speaker - Oppose
 - Toby - Oppose
 - Cornelius - Oppose
 - + Martin Munoz - Ban cars in the park
 - + Phil Ginsburg - SF Rec and Park
 - = Supervisor Peskin - Continuance is appropriate
- ACTION: After hearing and closing public comment, Continued to March 3, 2021
AYES: Black, Foley, Pearlman, So, Matsuda, Hyland
ABSENT: Johns

ADJOURNMENT 4:35 PM
ADOPTED MARCH 3, 2021