

SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Wednesday, October 2, 2019
12:30 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Black, Foley, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, So

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT HYLAND AT 12:43 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Rich Sucre, Stephanie Cisneros, Monica Giacomucci, Michelle Taylor, Shannon Ferguson, Frances McMillen, Jorgen Cleemann, Corey Teague – Zoning Administrator, John Rahaim – Planning Director, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

SPEAKERS: None

B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

1. Director's Announcements

Rich Sucre:

Commissioners, I just want to call your attention to the new staff reports that we have published. So, we reformatted the Executive Summary as well as the Motions in consultation with the City Attorney. So, from here on forward, you will kind of see a new packet being produced for you all.

John Rahaim, Planning Director:

I just wanted to tell you Commissioners, you know I think last month I announced that I would be retiring from my position at the end of February and I didn't get a chance to talk to all of you when it happened. And since this is the first meeting you've had since I made that announcement. So, I just wanted to let you know that that is happening. The planning commission is of course charged with vetting candidates and presenting at least three names to the mayor for her consideration, and that process has already started. There will be plenty of time to talk about the retrospectives and everything that's happened, but I just wanted to let you know how much I've appreciated your support and the work that you do at this commission and everything you have done for the department over the years. I look forward to being here the next five months, and I look forward to my next phase. So, we will have plenty of time to chat about that in the future. But I just wanted to acknowledge that and let you know how much I appreciate all your work and support. Thank you.

2. Review of Past Events at the Planning Commission, Staff Report and Announcements

None

C. COMMISSION MATTERS

3. President's Report and Announcements

President Hyland:

Well, I just want to welcome our two new commissioners, Commissioner Foley and Commissioner So. It has been a while that your seats have been vacant and we are lucky to have you. And it would be good not to have to worry about quorum. That's not the best part of it though. Thank you.

4. Consideration of Adoption:

- [Draft Minutes for HPC September 18, 2019](#)

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Adopted

AYES: Black, Foley, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, So

5. Commission Comments & Questions

None

D. REGULAR CALENDAR

- 6a. [2018-014701COA](#) (S. CISNEROS: (415) 575-9186)
26 HILL STREET – located on the north side of Hill Street between Guerrero and Valencia streets, Lot 054 in Assessor’s Block 3617 (District 8). Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** to correct Planning Enforcement Case No. 2018-016476ENV for a remodel and expansion of existing ground floor residential unit into unconditioned space, expansion of the second-floor unit at the rear, and modifications to an existing one-story portion of the building at the rear. The subject property is a contributing resource within the Liberty-Hill Landmark District. 26 Hill Street is located in a RH-3 (Residential-House, Three Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: = Stephanie Cisneros – Staff report
 + Toby Morris – Project presentation
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Black, Foley, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, So
 MOTION: [0390](#)

- 6b. [2018-014701VAR](#) (S. CISNEROS: (415) 575-9186)
26 HILL STREET – located on the north side of Hill Street between Guerrero and Valencia streets, Lot 054 in Assessor’s Block 3617 (District 8). Request for a Variance from the Zoning Administrator for the rear yard requirement pursuant to Planning Code Section 134. 26 Hill Street is located in a RH-3 (Residential-House, Three Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

SPEAKERS: Same as item 6a.
 ACTION: ZA Closed the PH and indicated an intent to Grant

- 7a. [2018-008528COA](#) (M. GIACOMUCCI: (415) 575-8714)
3733-3735 20TH STREET – located on the south side of 20th Street between Guerrero and Dolores streets, Lot 070 in Assessor’s Block 3607 (District 8). Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** to construct a 981 square-foot, one-story garage and deck within the front setback area of a two-family, two-story dwelling. The project also includes excavation under the existing building to accommodate habitable space. The subject property is a contributing resource within the Liberty-Hill Landmark District. 3733-3735 20th Street is located in a RH-2 (Residential-House, Two Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions
 (Continued from Regular Hearing on September 18, 2019)

SPEAKERS: = Monica Giacomucci – Staff report
 + Andy Rodgers – Project presentation
 - Heidi Kline – Opposition to garage
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Black, Foley, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, So
 MOTION: [0391](#)

- 7b. [2018-008528VAR](#) (M. GIACOMUCCI: (415) 575-8714)
3733-3735 20TH STREET – located on the south side of 20th Street between Guerrero and Dolores streets, Lot 070 in Assessor’s Block 3607 (District 8). Request for a **Variance** from the Zoning Administrator for the front setback pursuant to Planning Code Section 132. 3733-3735 20th Street is located in a RH-2 (Residential-House, Two Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
 (Continued from Regular Hearing on September 18, 2019)

SPEAKERS: Same item 7a.

ACTION: ZA Closed the PH and took the matter under advisement

8. [2015-014170COA](#) (M. GIACOMUCCI: (415) 575-8714)
804-806 22ND STREET – located on the north side of 22nd Street between Tennessee and Minnesota streets, Lot 010 in Assessor’s Block 4107 (District 10). Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** to construct a 427 square-foot, one-story horizontal addition at the rear; a 1,252 square-foot, one-story vertical addition; two rear decks, a front deck, and a roof deck; and restoration of the commercial storefront of a two-family, two-story mixed-use building. The subject property is a contributing resource within the Dogpatch Landmark District. 804 22nd Street is located in a NCT-2 (Neighborhood Commercial Transit-2) Zoning District and 45-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: = Monica Giacomucci – Staff report
 + Mark Topetcher – Project presentation
 - Annette Carrier - Opposition
 - Susan Fahey - Opposition

ACTION: Approved with Conditions

AYES: Black, Foley, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, So

MOTION: [0392](#)

- 9a. [2019-006323MLS](#) (S. FERGUSON: 415-575-9074)
2251 WEBSTER STREET – west side of Webster Street between Washington and Clay streets. Assessor’s Block 0612, Lot 001A (District 2). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a **Mills Act** historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Designated as a Contributor to the Webster Street Historic District under Article 10 of the Planning Code, the two-story, plus basement, wood-frame, single-family dwelling was designed in the Italianate style and built circa 1900. The subject property is located within a RH-2 (Residential-House, Two-Family District) Zoning District and a 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: = Michelle Taylor – Staff report
 + Sally Sadosky – 2251 Webster Street

- + Sarah O'Rourke – St. Joseph's
- + Gustav Lindquist – 64 Potomac
- + Ted Olsson – Swedish American Hall
- + Adele Feng – 2731 – 3735 Folsom Street

ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, So
 RESOLUTION: [1090](#)
 RECUSED: Foley

- 9b. [2019-006384MLS](#) (M. TAYLOR: 415-575-9197)
1401 HOWARD STREET – south corner of Howard and 10th Streets. Assessor's Block 3517, Lot 035 (District 6). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a **Mills Act** historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Designated as an Individual Landmark (No. 120) under Article 10 of the Planning Code, the former church is a three-story, steel-frame masonry building designed in the Romanesque-Revival style by architect John J. Foley and constructed in 1913. The subject property is located within a RCD (Regional Commercial District) Zoning District and 55/65-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as item 9a.
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, So
 RESOLUTION: [1091](#)
 RECUSED: Foley

- 9c. [2019-006322MLS](#) (M. TAYLOR: 415-575-9197)
64 POTOMAC STREET – east side of Potomac Street between Waller Street and Duboce Park. Assessor's Block 0866 Lot 014 (District 8). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a **Mills Act** historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Designated as a contributing building to the Duboce Park Historic District under Article 10 of the Planning Code, the two story over garage, wood-frame, single-family dwelling features a gable roof and bay window and was built in 1899. The property is located within a RH-2 (Residential-House, Two-Family District) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as item 9a.
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, So
 RESOLUTION: [1092](#)

RECUSED: Foley

- 9d. [2019-005831MLS](#) (S. CISNEROS: 415-575-9186)
2168 MARKET STREET – northwest side of Market Street between Sanchez and Church Streets. Assessor’s Block 3542, Lot 062 (District 8). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Board of Supervisors approval with conditions of a **Mills Act** historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Designated as City Landmark No. 267 (the Swedish American Hall), the three-story plus basement, wood-frame, commercial building was designed in the Arts and Crafts style by master architect August Nordin circa 1907. The subject property is located within a NCT (Upper Market Neighborhood Commercial Transit) Zoning District and 40-X, 50-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as item 9a.
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, So
 RESOLUTION: [1093](#)
 RECUSED: Foley

- 9e. [2019-006455MLS](#) (M. TAYLOR: 415-575-9197)
2731-2735 FOLSOM STREET – west side of Folsom Street between 23rd and 24th streets. Assessor’s Block 03640 Lot 031 (District 9). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a **Mills Act** historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Designated as an individual Landmark (No.276) under Article 10 of the Planning Code, the three-story, three-unit residential building designed in the Beaux-Arts style by James Francis Dunn and built in circa 1900. The subject property is located within a RH-2 (Residential House, Two-Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as item 9a.
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, So
 RESOLUTION: [1094](#)
 RECUSED: Foley

10. [2018-007267PTA](#) (J. VIMR: (415) 575-9109)
865 MARKET STREET – located on the south side of Market Street at its intersection with Fifth Street, Lot 042 in Assessor’s Block 3705 (District 6) – Request for a **Permit to Alter** to complete exterior alterations, including modifications to entryways at each elevation and to

the northern edges of levels 6-8. New window openings would also be added along levels 6-8. The subject property is a Category V – Unrated building located within the Article 11 Kearny-Market-Mason-Sutter Conservation District, the C-3-R (Downtown-Retail) Zoning District, and the 120-X /160-S Height and Bulk Districts.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: = Jonathan Vimr – Staff report
 + Chris Kitchen – Project presentation
 + Charles Chase – Design presentation
 + Rayme Kuniyuki – Design presentation
 + Karen Flood – Support
 + Lynn Farzaroli - Support
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Black, Foley, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, So
 MOTION: [0393](#)
 RECUSED: Hyland

11. [2016-008192SRV](#) (F. MCMILLEN: (415) 575-9076)
104-106 SOUTH PARK STREET– located on the west side of South Park Street between Jack London Alley and Third Street, Lot 058 in Assessor’s Block 3775 (District 9). Request for **Review and Comment** on the nomination of the property, also known as the Gran Oriente Filipino Hotel, to the National Register of Historic Places for its association with for its association with Filipino ethnic heritage and with assisting Filipino immigrants in community formation in San Francisco. 104-106 South Park Street is located in the SPD (South Park District) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk district.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Resolution in support of the nomination to the National Register of Historic Places.

SPEAKERS: = Frances McMillen – Staff report
 + Erica Schultz – Project presentation
 + Paul Herrera – Support
 + Karen Kai – Support
 + Woody LaBounty - Support
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Black, Foley, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, So
 RESOLUTION: [1095](#)
 RECUSED: Hyland

12. [2016-008192SRV](#) (F. MCMILLEN: (415) 575-9076)
1830 SUTTER STREET – located on the north side of Sutter Street between Webster and Buchanan streets, Lot 035 in Assessor’s Block 0676 (District 5). Request for **Review and Comment** on the nomination of the property, also known as the Japanese YWCA/Issei Women’s Building, to the National Register of Historic Places for its association with Japanese ethnic heritage and Women’s History for its association with the struggles and accomplishments of Japanese American women. The property is also significant for its association with African American ethnic heritage and LGBTQ history for its association

African American civil rights and LGBTQ rights. 1830 Sutter is located in a RM-3 (Residential-Mixed, Medium Density) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk district.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Resolution in support of the nomination to the National Register of Historic Places.

SPEAKERS: = Frances McMillen – Staff report
 + Cathy Inamasu - Project presentation
 + Karen Kai – Support
 + Augie Phillips – Support
 + Robert Rusky – Support
 + Woody LaBounty - Support

ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval

AYES: Black, Hyland, Johns, Pearlman, So

ABSENT: Foley

RESOLUTION: [1096](#)

RECUSED: Matsuda

13. [2014.1036ENV](#) (J. CLEEMANN: (415) 575-8763)
447 BATTERY – located on the west side of Battery Street at its intersection with Merchant Street, Lot 002 in Assessor’s Block 0206 (District 3) – Request for **Review and Comment** on the adequacy of the proposed preservation alternatives for inclusion in the Draft Environmental Impact Report. The subject property has been identified as a historic resource individually eligible for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources. The proposed project would demolish the subject building and construct a new 18-story hotel building with 198 guest rooms, two restaurants occupying 7,486 square feet, 24 vehicular parking spaces, 27 bicycle parking spaces, and approximately 2,720 square feet of publicly accessible private open space (POPOS) on Merchant Street. The existing building’s street-facing west and south facades would be retained and incorporated into the new building with modifications for storefronts and entries. The property is located in a C-3-0 (Downtown-Office) Zoning District, and 200-S Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Review and Comment

SPEAKERS: = Jorgen Cleemann – Staff report
 + Jody Knight – Project presentation
 + Stacy Kozakavich – Alternatives
 + Eric Lundquist – Project presentation
 = Woody LaBounty – Facadism

ACTION: Reviewed and Commented

ADJOURNMENT 3:44 PM
 ADOPTED NOVEMBER 6, 2019