

# SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



## Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400  
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

**Wednesday, March 20, 2019**  
**12:30 p.m.**  
**Regular Meeting**

**COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:** Black, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram  
**COMMISSIONERS ABSENT:** Johns

**THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT HYLAND AT 12:36 PM**

**STAFF IN ATTENDANCE:** Chris Thomas, Frances McMillen, Rebecca Salgado, Seema Adina, Allison Vanderslice, Shelley Caltagirone, Tim Frye – Preservation Officer, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

**SPEAKER KEY:**

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

**A. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT**

**SPEAKERS:** Georgia Schuttish – Historic Survey, façade retention

**B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS**

## 1. Director's Announcements

None

## 2. Review of Past Events at the Planning Commission, Staff Report and Announcements

**Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:**

Good afternoon, Commissioners. Tim Frye, department staff. Just a few items to share with you, mainly, I give an update on some upcoming hearings. On April 11<sup>th</sup>, we will be presenting an overview of the Citywide Survey to the Planning Commission. Originally, we had proposed this to be at the April 4<sup>th</sup> hearing but due to some scheduling conflicts, it's been pushed to the April 11<sup>th</sup>. On April 15<sup>th</sup>, however, we will also be presenting an overview of the Citywide Survey to the Land Use Committee. Supervisor Peskin as the chair of that committee asked for that hearing to occur on April 15<sup>th</sup> and we will be presenting on your behalf on that date. And then on May 22<sup>nd</sup> we will be giving the Board of Appeals an overview of the Historic Preservation's Commission's review process around Certificates of Appropriateness and Major Permits to Alter. This largely came -- this request largely came about during the Pioneer Monument appeal and the Board of Appeals wanting a better understanding of how this commission operates and how you weigh certain decisions in terms of when they affect a character-defining feature and when they do not. So, more on that later but I did want to give you the heads up that the May 22<sup>nd</sup> calendar date has been scheduled. Another important event, tonight the department will be hosting a Mills Act workshop in the pending Russo Boulevard's district. And Commissioner Black will be attending with us to provide support to staff who will give an overview of the Mill's Act program should the district be interested in pursuing the program along with designation this upcoming year. And then we also provided -- or I'm not sure, I'll check with the Commission's Secretary. We asked for the order addressing the Julius Castle superior court decision from the Friends of Montgomery Street versus the City and County Of San Francisco and Julius Castle, that brief to be distributed. As you see, their determination was that the plaintiffs had not exercised or exhausted their full due process under-- concerning the -- I'm totally blanking out here I'm sorry -- the CEQA appeal process and therefore, did not decide to take up the matter. Forgive me for that. And that concludes my comments unless you have any questions. I did want to mention one last thing is, our Lady of Guadalupe has been forwarded to the clerk and we are waiting for that item to be scheduled at Land Use shortly.

**President Hyland:**

Great. Mr. Frye, I was going to mention this in my president's report but, with regard to Citywide Survey, I'm glad to know that it's been agendized for Land Use. I wanted to bring up to the Commission, I'd like us to write a letter or for me to write a letter with our opinion that the Citywide Survey move forward with the quickest time frame. Remember when it was presented to us, there were, it was like six to seven years with the current staff load and it can get reduced to two and a half to three years. I would like us to actually put

in the record that we would like the Planning Commission and Land Use to endorse the quickest possible path for that. Is that ok?

**Diane Matsuda:**

Am I on? Were we also going to mention in that letter about the priorities that, the neighborhood priorities?

**President Hyland:**

I think that's a -- well, we can. We can certainly do that. It's part of the presentation and I think in the first year, there will be kind of looking at the priorities as they teeth that survey up.

**Diane Matsuda:**

And the rational why we –

**President Hyland:**

Right.

**Diane Matsuda:**

Okay.

**Andrew Wolfram:**

Sounds like a good idea.

### C. COMMISSION MATTERS

#### 3. President's Report and Announcements

None

#### 4. Consideration of Adoption:

- [Draft Minutes for March 6, 2019](#)

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Adopted

AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

ABSENT: Johns

#### 5. Commission Comments & Questions

**President Hyland:**

I have one disclosure. I met with the project sponsor on the Third Street Hearst Building project this morning.

**Commissioner Pearlman:**

I will disclose the same thing. I had a tour this morning of the fabulous building.

**D. CONSENT CALENDAR**

6. [2018-016242COA](#) (J. VIMR: (415) 575-9109)  
1088 SANSOME STREET – located at the east side between Green and Vallejo Streets, Assessor’s Block 0135, Lot 009 (District 3). Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** to construct a roof deck along the eastern half of the subject property’s flat roof. The deck would include new flooring, planters, railings, and wooden trellises. No aspects of the proposed work would be visible from surrounding public rights-of-way, barring the top of potential plants within the planters. The subject property is located within a C-2 (Community Business) Zoning District, the Waterfront Special Use District No. 3, the Northeast Waterfront Special Sign District, and 65-X Height and Bulk District. It is contributory to the Northeast Waterfront Landmark District.  
*Preliminary Recommendation: Approve*

SPEAKERS: None  
 ACTION: Approved  
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram  
 ABSENT: Johns  
 MOTION: [0371](#)

**E. REGULAR CALENDAR**

7. [2014.0012E](#) (C. THOMAS: (415) 575-9036)  
BETTER MARKET STREET – The Historic Preservation Commission will discuss the **DRAFT Environmental Impact Report (DEIR)** to frame their written comments on the adequacy of the DEIR, pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and Chapter 31 of the San Francisco Administrative Code. Project sponsor San Francisco Public Works, in coordination with the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency and the Citywide Planning Division, would redesign and provide a program of transportation, streetscape and infrastructure improvements within the project corridor, including changes to the roadway configuration and private vehicle access, traffic signals, surface transit (including Muni-only lanes, stop spacing and service, stop locations, stop characteristics, and a new bi-directional F Market & Wharves historic streetcar (F-Line) track loop (F-loop) on Charles J. Brenham Place and McAllister Street), bicycle facilities, pedestrian facilities, streetscapes, commercial and passenger loading, vehicular parking, and utilities. The proposed project would also partially restore, reconstruct, and realign the Path of Gold (City Landmark No. 200) light standards to accommodate a new overhead contact system to increase transit service along Market Street; remove or alter several streetscape features, including the red brick sidewalk and plazas, granite curbs, street trees, traffic signals and signage along the 2.2-mile corridor of Market Street from Steuart Street to Octavia Boulevard (District 3, District 5, and District 6), including portions of streets that intersect Market Street, four off-corridor intersections, the entirety of Charles J. Brenham Place, and a portion of Valencia Street between Market Street and McCoppin Street.  
*Preliminary Recommendation: Review and Comment*

SPEAKERS: = Chris Thomas – Staff presentation  
 = Frances McMillen – Staff presentation

- + Ron Miguel – DEIR is complete and accurate
- + Ken Maley – Zuni Café
- = Charles Deffarges – Bicycle safety
- + Christine Olea, Proj. Mgr. Public Works – Market Street Bikes
- = Allison Vanderslice – Response to questions

ACTION: Reviewed and Commented

- 8a. [2016-007303PCA](#) (S. ADINA: (415) 575-8722)  
5 THIRD STREET (HEARST BUILDING) – located on the east side between Market and Stevenson Streets, Assessor’s Block 3707, Lot 057 (District 6). Consideration of **Planning Code Text Amendments** to Planning Code Section 188 – Noncomplying Structures: Enlargements, Alterations and Reconstruction. The Historic Preservation Commission will consider a proposal from the Project Sponsor to adopt an Ordinance that would extend the expiration date of Section 188(g) to allow Terrace Infill on a noncomplying structure designated as a Significant Building under Article 11 of the Code and would amend the text to allow for rooftop infill along the primary building frontage if obscured from view by existing parapet walls.  
*Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Resolution Recommending Approval to the Planning Commission and Board of Supervisors.*  
 (Continued from Regular Hearing on December 5, 2018)

SPEAKERS: = Rebecca Salgado – Staff report  
 = Seema Adina – Staff report  
 + Jan Smideck – Project presentation  
 + Frederick Knapp – Resource presentation, proposed modification  
 + Caroline Chase – Proposed legislation  
 = Georgia Schuttish – Julia Morgan penthouse, San Simeon tile?  
 = Allison Vanderslice – Mitigation measures

ACTION: Adopted a Resolution Recommending Approval

AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

ABSENT: Johns

RESOLUTION: [1035](#)

- 8b. [2016-007303PTA](#) (R. SALGADO: (415) 575-9101)  
5 THIRD STREET – located at the southeast corner of Market Street and 3rd Street, Assessor’s Block 3707, Lot 057 (District 6). Request for a **Major Permit to Alter** for alterations to the two existing buildings on the lot (5 3rd Street and 17-29 3rd Street) to accommodate a change in primary use from office to a hotel. Modifications would include changes to the historic entrance lobby and upper-floor corridors at 5 3rd Street; the installation of new and modified storefronts at both buildings on the lot; construction of a new raised roof deck on the fourth-floor roof of 17-29 3rd Street, to be accessed from converted window openings at 5 3rd Street; the demolition of select existing rooftop additions on the 13th-floor roof of 5 3rd Street; and the creation of new and modified rooftop additions at 5 3rd Street. The proposed project would result in an approximately 131,550 gross square foot building, with up to 170 hotel rooms, 5,920 square feet of office space, and 11,393 square feet of retail space, including 422 square feet of general retail, and 4,005 square feet of restaurant/bar uses. At a future hearing, the Planning Commission

will consider a request for a Conditional Use Authorization, Downtown Exception-309, and Planning Code Amendment for the project. The subject property is located within the Article 11 New Montgomery-Mission-2nd Street Conservation District and is within a C-3-O (Downtown-Office) Zoning District and 120-X Height and Bulk Limit.

*Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions*

(Continued from Regular Hearing on December 5, 2018)

SPEAKERS: Same as item 8a.

ACTION: Approved with Conditions as amended to include:

1. An interpretive program; and
2. In the event the penthouse part of the project is reduced in scope, that the review be delegated to staff.

AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

ABSENT: Johns

MOTION: [0372](#)

- 9a. [2019-002369LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)  
1747 BUCHANAN STREET – located at the southwest corner of Sutter and Buchanan streets in the Japantown neighborhood. Assessor’s Block 0685, Lot 001 (District 5). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. Benkyodo Company is a Japanese confectionery facility and shop established in 1906 that has served San Francisco for 113 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is located within the Japantown NCD (Neighborhood Commercial) Zoning District and 50-X Height and Bulk District.

*Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval*

SPEAKERS: = Shelley Caltagirone – Staff report  
 + Neil Ballard – Randy’s Place  
 + Jennifer Wong – Picture Machine  
 + Ben Nakajo – Benkyodo Company  
 + Sandy Mori – Benkyodo Company  
 + Nikki Yoshikawa – Benkyodo Company  
 + Miguel Bustos – Glide Memorial

ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval

AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

ABSENT: Johns

RECUSED: Matsuda

RESOLUTION: [1036](#)

- 9b. [2019-002396LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)  
330 ELLIS STREET – located on the north side of Ellis Street between Jones and Taylor streets in the Downtown/Civic Center neighborhood. Assessor’s Block 0324, Lot 027 (District 6). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. The Board of Trustees of

the Glide Foundation is a benevolent and religious corporation that provides the local community with programs and services that range from feeding the homeless and providing shelter to hosting Sunday Celebrations that has served San Francisco for 90 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is located within a RC-4 (Residential-Commercial, High Density) Zoning District and 80-T-130-T Height and Bulk District.

*Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval*

SPEAKERS: Same as item 9a.  
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval  
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram  
 ABSENT: Johns  
 RESOLUTION: [1037](#)

- 9c. [2019-002399LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)  
5124 GEARY BOULEVARD – located on the north side of Geary Boulevard between 15th and 16th avenues in the Richmond neighborhood. Assessor’s Block 1447, Lot 020A (District 1). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. Picture Machine Tattoo is a tattoo shop that has served San Francisco for 43 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is located within a NC-3 (Neighborhood Commercial, Moderate Scale) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

*Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval*

SPEAKERS: Same as item 9a.  
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval  
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Pearlman, Wolfram  
 ABSENT: Johns  
 RESOLUTION: [1038](#)

- 9d. [2019-002404LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)  
1101 OCEAN AVENUE – located on the southwest corner of Lee and Ocean avenues in the Ocean View neighborhood. Assessor’s Block 6944, Lot 001 (District 7). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a Legacy Business Registry application. Randy’s Place is a bar that has served San Francisco for 44 years. The **Legacy Business Registry** recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is located within the Ocean Avenue NCT (Neighborhood Commercial Transit) Zoning District and 45-X Height and Bulk District.

*Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval*

SPEAKERS: Same as item 9a.  
ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval  
AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram  
ABSENT: Johns  
RESOLUTION: [1039](#)

- 9e. [2019-002485LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)  
[1400 JUDAH STREET](#) – located on the northwest corner of Judah Street and 19th Avenue in the Outer Sunset neighborhood. Assessor's Block 1774, Lot 021 (District 4). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. Wah Mei School is a community-based nonprofit Chinese-English bilingual school that has served San Francisco for 45 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is located within a RH-3 (Residential-House, Three Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

*Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval*

SPEAKERS: Same as item 9a.  
ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval  
AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram  
ABSENT: Johns  
RESOLUTION: [1040](#)

ADJOURNMENT – 2:36 PM

ADOPTED APRIL 3, 2019