

# SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



## Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400  
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

**Wednesday, March 6, 2019**  
**12:30 p.m.**  
**Regular Meeting**

**COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:** Black, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram  
**COMMISSIONERS ABSENT:** Johnck

**THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT HYLAND AT 12:32 PM**

**STAFF IN ATTENDANCE:** Rebecca Salgado, Jonathan Vimr, Veronica Flores, Shelley Caltagirone, Tim Frye – Preservation Officer, John Rahaim – Planning Director, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

**SPEAKER KEY:**

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

**A. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT**

**SPEAKERS:** None

**B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS****1. Director's Announcements****John Rahaim, Planning Director:**

Good afternoon Commissioners. First, just a congratulations to our three newly reappointed commissioners. Thank you for spending more time with us. We really appreciate it. All the work that you do for us so, thank you for that. Secondly, I just wanted to mention, you probably have heard that there are a number, I think the number is 200 bills in Sacramento right now dealing with housing issues of one sort or another. We're trying to sift through the ones that we think are most relevant. The most important we think, at this point, is the one put forward by Senator Wiener, which is SB50. Just want to call your attention to that next Thursday at the Planning Commission. We are having an informational hearing on that. Staff has done an analysis of the current version of that bill, which will be going out to the commission and the public on Friday. So, I'm happy to share that with you as well. It is very likely to change. Partly because there are provisions in the bill that are to be defined which are very clearly sort of still some gaps in the bill. But, at this point, we thought that it was important to bring it to the Planning Commission, have the hearing and then we are happy to kind of amend that analysis as it goes forward. So, we will share that with you this week. We're sifting through the other bills to see which ones we have the time to kind of do a similar analysis but there's literally at this point about 200 of them. So, we will hopefully some of those will kind of fall by the wayside as we move forward so we can narrow the field of what we'll have to do. But we'll share that current one with you. Thank you.

**President Hyland:**

So, a question for you Director Rahaim. On the analysis, first of all, can you or someone send the analysis to all of us? Can we actually have that on an email?

**John Rahaim, Planning Director:**

Sure, absolutely.

**President Hyland:**

Did the analysis include the Housing Accountability Act?

**John Rahaim, Planning Director:**

Yes, there's a concern – I think that has been expressed by a number of people about the relationship between this bill and the Housing Accountability Act. And the State Density Bonus, both of which are included.

**President Hyland:**

Great, thank you.

**2. Review of Past Events at the Planning Commission, Staff Report and Announcements****Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:**

Commissioners, just a couple of items to share with you. One is the, at yesterday's Board hearing, both Sunshine and Roosevelt schools were passed again. That was the second reading. They'll be on there one more time and then they are off to the Mayor's Office for signature. We'll open keep you posted on that. Second is your Certificate of Appropriateness and the Categorical Exemption or uh excuse me, the Conditional Use Authorization and the Categorical Exemption for your project on Buchanan Street was appealed. And so, we will be reporting back to you on the outcome of that appeal once it's scheduled. That concludes my comments unless you have any questions.

## C. COMMISSION MATTERS

### 3. President's Report and Announcements

None

### 4. Consideration of Adoption:

- [Draft Minutes for ARC Hearing on February 6, 2019](#)
- [Draft Minutes for HPC Hearing on February 20, 2019](#)

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Adopted

AYES: Black, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

ABSENT: Johnck

### 5. Commission Comments & Questions

#### **Commissioner Johns:**

I just wondered what -- remember when we had that joint meeting with the Planning Commission, and there were some things that, I think that we could have been doing to work little bit more effectively and efficiently with them. I just wondered, did we ever settled on a plan or procedure for changing our ways. And then know --

#### **President Hyland:**

Great question, I had the same question myself. And I believe there was a follow-up memo that's forthcoming? What's the status of it?

#### **John Rahaim, Planning Director:**

Yeah, we are working on a memo to that to make some suggestions about what that you two commissions can do and what procedures you might be able -- we can change and that you can change to kind of follow-up on those issues.

#### **President Hyland:**

Should we agendize it for conversation? Second hearing in April? Is that far enough?

#### **Commissioner Johns:**

Great.

**President Hyland:**

Okay. And then, add on to that, the item that we had last hearing on the Citywide Survey. Could we have an update on that as well?

**Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:**

Excuse me Commissioner. I'm sorry, what was the –

**President Hyland:**

The Citywide Survey? Is there an update on what the next steps based on our, the agenda - - it was an informational agenda item last hearing?

**Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:**

Yes, thank you for bringing that up. Commissioners, we are going to the Planning Commission at their April 4<sup>th</sup> hearing to give them the same overview presentation. We are already receiving some requests from Supervisors for briefings. So, I believe our next check in with you is at the end of the fiscal year. So, right around June, we were going to come back to you because that's right before we actually do our formal kickoff with the summer intern program and getting out into the field. Certainly, happy to schedule another informational hearing or another meeting if you feel it's necessary. But, we wanted to use the next several months in briefing the Supervisors and getting the Planning Commission up to speed before coming back to you with any other future recommendations.

**Commissioner Matsuda:**

Weren't we going to re-review the ordering which things are going to be surveyed?

**President Hyland:**

There's a whole host of comments that we had.

**Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:**

Yes.

**President Hyland:**

The end of the fiscal year might be too far out. You might want to target something in between.

**Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:**

Sure, we're happy to schedule something in the meantime.

**President Hyland:**

Okay, great thanks. And then I have one disclosure. I did meet with the project sponsor and the architect on the Seawall lots 323 and 324 to review the project.

**D. REGULAR CALENDAR**

- 6a. [2018-000619COA](#) (R. SALGADO: (415) 575-9101)  
50-52 FAIR OAKS STREET – located at the west side of Fair Oaks Street between 21<sup>st</sup> Street and 22<sup>nd</sup> Street, Assessor's Block 3618, Lot 045 (District 8). Request for a **Certificate of**

**Appropriateness** for the removal of an existing two-story rear addition and the construction of a three-story rear addition visible from Quane Alley. The proposed project also includes the demolition of an existing garage and construction of a new garage in the rear yard, and modifications to the existing rear fence. The proposed project also includes the installation of a new window opening at the Fair Oaks Street facade, new skylights at the roof, and interior alterations at all levels. The subject property is located within the Article 10 Liberty-Hill Landmark District and is within a RH-3 (Residential-House, Three Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk Limit.

*Preliminary Recommendation: Approve*

SPEAKERS: = Rebecca Salgado – Staff report  
 + Jeff Agassos – Project presentation  
 + Sean Braskin - Support

ACTION: Approved

AYES: Black, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Wolfram

ABSENT: Johnck

RECUSED: Pearlman

MOTION: [0367](#)

- 6b. [2018-000619VAR](#) (R. SALGADO: (415) 575-9101)  
50-52 FAIR OAKS STREET – located at the west side of Fair Oaks Street between 21<sup>st</sup> Street and 22<sup>nd</sup> Street, Assessor’s Block 3618, Lot 045 (District 8). Request for a **Variance** to the rear yard requirement pursuant to Planning Code Section 134, for the demolition of an existing garage and construction of a new garage in the required rear yard. The subject property is located within a RH-3 (Residential-House, Three Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk Limit.

*Preliminary Recommendation: Approve*

SPEAKERS: Same as item 6a.

ACTION: Assistant ZA closed the PH and indicated an intent to Grant

7. [2017-003843COA](#) (R. SALGADO: (415) 575-9101)  
809 MONTGOMERY STREET – located at the west side of Montgomery Street between Jackson Street and Pacific Avenue, Assessor’s Block 0176, Lot 005 (District 3). Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** for the construction of a one-story rooftop addition visible from a public right of way. The proposal also includes a horizontal addition at the rear of the lot, the replacement of non-historic windows and doors at the Montgomery Street façade with new windows and doors in the existing openings, and interior alterations at all floors. The subject property is located within the Article 10 Jackson Square Landmark District and is within a C-2 (Community Business) Zoning District and 65-A Height and Bulk Limit.

*Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions*

SPEAKERS: = Rebecca Salgado – Staff report  
 + Elisa Skaags – Project presentation  
 + Speaker – Project presentation  
 + Stan Hayes – TMD recommendations

ACTION: Approved with Conditions as amended to require the hip skylights and to continue working with Staff.  
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram  
 ABSENT: Johnck  
 MOTION: [0368](#)

8. [2018-003593COA](#) (J. VIMR: (415) 575-9109)  
906 BROADWAY – located on the north side between Mason and Taylor Streets; Lot 009 in Assessor’s Block 0149 (District 3) - Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** to complete interior alterations including the removal of 205 square feet of non-historic flooring to allow for the installation of an egress stair in a storage room at the northeastern corner of the first floor, and to install two new restrooms and glass partitions for conference rooms/classrooms in the basement. The storage room is completely out of view from within the main sanctuary space and does not contain any known character-defining features. The subject property, Our Lady of Guadalupe, is City Landmark No. 204 and is located within a RM-2 (Residential-Mixed, Moderate Density) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.  
*Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions*  
 (Continued from Regular hearings of February 6, 2019 and February 20, 2019)

SPEAKERS: = Jonathan Vimr – Staff report  
 + Jennois Croix – Project presentation  
 + Charles Blozies – Project presentation  
 + Gloria Ramos – Significance to Latino community  
 + Maxie McCoy – Support  
 + Michael Angelo Molina - Support  
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions  
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram  
 ABSENT: Johnck  
 MOTION: [0369](#)

9. [2015-016326COA](#) (J. VIMR: (415) 575-9109)  
SEAWALL LOTS 323 AND 324 – located at the north side of Broadway between The Embarcadero and Davis Street, Assessor’s Block 0138, Lot 001 and Assessor’s Block 0139/002 (District 3). Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** to demolish the existing parking lot and construct a new mixed-use development consisting of three components: an approximately 26,100 gross-square-foot (gsf) entertainment venue that would primarily house a theater space (dba “Teatro ZinZanni”); an approximately 112,700 gsf, four-story hotel building that would accommodate a maximum of 192 guestrooms; and an approximately 14,000 gsf privately financed and maintained public park. The proposal requires additional project entitlements that must be heard at a later date by the Planning Commission. The subject property is located within the Article 10 Northeast Waterfront Landmark District and is within a C-2 (Community Business) Zoning District, Waterfront Special Use District No. 3, and 40-X Height and Bulk Limit.  
*Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions*

SPEAKERS: = Jonathan Vimr – Staff report

- + Jay Wallace - Project presentation
- + Mark Hornberger – Project presentation
- = Randy Fry – Parking, hotel
- = Stan Hayes – Conflicts with General Plan
- + Timothy Reit – Support
- + Bob Harrer – Support
- + Debra Beaver Bauer – Support
- + Cynthia Gomez – Support
- + Jon Stewart – Support
- + Bill Hannon – Support
- + Ron Campbell – Support
- + Annie Jamison – Teatro Zinzanni
- + Speaker, Port - Origins
- + Aaron Goldman – Support
- Speaker, KRON 4 - Parking

ACTION: Adopted Findings as amended by Staff and read into the record.  
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram  
 ABSENT: Johnck  
 MOTION: [0370](#)

- 10a. [2018-016401PCA](#) (V. FLORES: (415) 575-9173)  
**ACCESSORY DWELLING UNITS IN NEW CONSTRUCTION** – Ordinance amending the **Planning Code and Business and Tax Regulations Code** to authorize the addition of an Accessory Dwelling Unit in the construction of a new single-family home or multi-family building; clarifying the ministerial approval process and creating an expedited Board of Appeals process for certain Accessory Dwelling Units in single-family homes meeting specific requirements; affirming the Planning Department’s determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; making findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1; and adopting findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare under Planning Code, Section 302.  
*Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Modifications*

SPEAKERS: = Veronica Flores – Staff report  
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval  
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram  
 ABSENT: Johnck  
 RESOLUTION: [1032](#)

- 10b. [2018-016401CRV](#) (V. FLORES: (415) 575-9173)  
**ACCESSORY DWELLING UNIT ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW STANDARDS** – Commission Review for approving Architectural Review Standards for “No Waiver” Accessory Dwelling Units and to delegate to staff review of projects for compliance with those standards in properties listed in the California Register of Historic Places, and properties designated individually or as part of districts pursuant to Articles 10 or 11.  
*Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval*

SPEAKERS: Same as item 10a.

ACTION: Reviewed and Commented

- 11a. [2019-001834LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)  
333 TURK STREET – located on the south side of Turk Street between Leavenworth and Hyde streets in the Downtown/Civic Center neighborhood. Assessor’s Block 0345, Lot 015 (District 6). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. Curry Senior Center is a non-profit service organization offering primary health care, substance abuse, mental health, and other social and community services to seniors that has served San Francisco for 46 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is located within a RC-4 (Residential-Commercial, High Density) Zoning District and 80-T Height and Bulk District.

*Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval*

SPEAKERS: = Shelley Caltagirone – Staff report  
 + David Knego – Curry Senior Center  
 + Judy Siu – Curry Senior Center  
 + David Kavrell – Jackson Fillmore Trattoria  
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval  
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram  
 ABSENT: Johnck  
 RESOLUTION: [1033](#)

- 11b. [2019-001835LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)  
2506 FILLMORE STREET – located on the east side of Fillmore between Jackson and Pacific streets in the Pacific Heights neighborhood. Assessor’s Block 0588, Lot 012 (District 2). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. Jackson Fillmore Trattoria is an Italian restaurant that has served San Francisco for 34 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is located within the Upper Fillmore NCD (Neighborhood Commercial) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

*Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval*

SPEAKERS: Same as item 11a.  
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval  
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram  
 ABSENT: Johnck  
 RESOLUTION: [1034](#)

ADJOURNMENT – 3:07 PM

ADOPTED MARCH 20, 2019