BACKGROUND
The Planning Department (Department) requests review and comment before the Architectural Review Committee (ARC) regarding a proposal for 3250-70 18th Street (subject property, Assessor’s Block No. 3574, Lots No. 085 and 086) to demolish an existing two-story former convent building and construct a three-story-over-basement, 13,654 square-foot K-8 educational building (“New School Building”) for La Scuola that will be located on a lot adjacent to Saint Charles School. The existing outdoor play yard space will be landscaped and hardscaped to achieve La Scuola’s recreational program. Saint Charles School, located at 3250 18th Street (3574/085), was designated Landmark No. 139 in 1981. The building was originally constructed as a church for the Sisters of the Holy Cross in the Italianate Style in 1887-1888 by architect Charles J.I. Delvin and was converted for educational use in 1895. 3250-3270 Shotwell Street is located in an RH-3 (Residential-House, Three Family) Zoning District and a 55-X Height and Bulk District.

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION
3250-3570 Shotwell Street is located on the north side of 18th Street east of its intersection with Shotwell Street in the Mission neighborhood. The subject property consists of two irregularly shaped lots (Lots 085 and 086) with 163 feet of frontage in aggregate along 18th Street. Lot 085 is large and irregularly shaped, with Saint Charles School located at the southeast corner of the lot and the remaining lot area open for use as a school-serving play yard. Lot 086 is wrapped on two sides by Lot 085 and is fully encompassed by a non-historic convent building (constructed in 1959) which is currently vacant. These buildings are part of the St. Charles Borromeo complex which spans west toward South Van Ness Avenue, and also includes St. Charles Borromeo Church (701 South Van Ness; built in 1915), St. Charles Borromeo Rectory (713 South Van Ness; built in 1926), and San Carlos Hall (741 South Van Ness; built 1919).

PROJECT DESCRIPTION
The proposed project includes demolition of the existing convent building on Lot 086 and construction of a new, three-story-over-basement school building connected to Saint Charles School via an open pedestrian footbridge oriented parallel to the 18th Street frontage. Both the new building and the Landmark will be used as a new K-8 campus for La Scuola, an Italian immersion school. The phased project would also remodel San Carlos Hall at 741 South Van Ness Avenue for use by La Scuola. Specifically, the project includes:
• **Saint Charles School.** Saint Charles School on Lot 058 will be raised approximately 2 feet to increase ceiling heights in the existing basement and to better align the floorplates of the Landmark with those in the new building. Any new foundation will be masonry clad with smooth cement plaster to match the existing foundation cladding. A pedestrian footbridge in the form of a ramp with glass guardrails will connect to the Landmark at the first floor of its west façade at the second window bay. In general, Saint Charles School is in good condition and requires minimal intervention beyond regular maintenance and repair. The project would undertake the following work to this building:

  o **South (Front) Façade.** Existing entry stairs will be expanded to accommodate added height. This original entry will no longer serve as the main entrance to the school campus but will be preserved.

  o **West (Play Yard) Façade.** At the raised ground floor (basement) level, new windows and doors will allow access to the sunken play yard. At the second window bay at the first floor, an existing double-hung wood window will be removed and replaced with a man-door to allow entry into Saint Charles School from the pedestrian footbridge. The existing decorative wood window frame and hood will remain in place, and the window opening will be minimally expanded at the sill. Mechanical units will be added at the rear of the roof level.

  o **North (Rear) Façade.** At the blind rear façade, a small three-story semi-enclosed addition will be constructed to accommodate a new circulation core. The addition will be clad with siding to match the existing building, and it will have glass guardrails. New openings for door access to the circulation core will be added at the ground, first, second, and third floors. Four new window openings will be added at the east side of the rear façade.

  o **East (Shotwell Street) Façade.** No alterations are proposed for this façade aside from the addition of three new skylights at the roof level.

• **New School Building.** The New School Building on Lot 086 will rise three stories and will be topped with an occupiable roof. The roof will be accessed by separate stair and elevator penthouses not exceeding 10 feet in height and not visible from the street. The project would undertake the following work to this building:

  o **South (Front) Façade.** The front façade of the New School Building will feature a colored glass curtain wall with a louvered system to control light and heat infiltration at the front façade. Backlit metal letters will serve as signage (to be reviewed under a separate permit) over a new entry featuring a glass and metal awning. This entry is ADA accessible and will serve as the primary entrance to the La Scuola campus.

  o **West Façade.** The west façade of the New School Building is blind. It will be clad with cement-board panels. At the rear portion of this façade, three brise-soleil openings will allow light and air to penetrate a second-floor terrace.

  o **North (Rear) Façade.** The rear façade will have a glass curtain wall at all levels. At the second floor, an open terrace will be shielded by a brise-soleil and will have a glass guardrail.

  o **East (Play Yard) Façade.** The west façade of the New School Building will be clad with cement-board panels. Punched window openings will be arranged in an irregular manner.
At the ground floor, three doors will open onto the Play Yard. At the rear portion of this façade, three brise-soleil openings will allow light and air to penetrate a second-floor terrace.

- **Connective Footbridge.** The footbridge connecting the New School Building to Saint Charles School will be set back approximately 18 feet from the front property line. It will span from the New Building’s large first-floor lobby to the existing first-floor entry vestibule of Saint Charles school at a slight downslope. The footbridge will be visible from the public-right-of-way, with the top of the bridge’s guardrail measuring approximately 10 feet in height above sidewalk level. The footbridge will have glass guardrails to minimize its visibility and will connect to an existing window opening retrofit with a man-door on Saint Charles School’s west façade to avoid destruction of historic fabric.

- **Play Yard.** The existing asphalt play yard is sunken below grade. It will be landscaped and hardscaped to meet La Scuola’s programming needs. New features include permeable pavers, playground surfacing and equipment, furniture, and a basketball court. The retaining wall at 18th Street will be rebuilt, and open spans along 18th and Shotwell streets will have new fencing and gates.

**OTHER ACTIONS REQUIRED**
Pursuant to Planning Code Section 1006.1, the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) shall review the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for compliance with Article 10 of the Planning Code, the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, and any applicable provisions of the Planning Code at a future date. The project also requires a Conditional Use Authorization-Planned Unit Development from the Planning Commission for expansion of a school use in an RH-3 Zoning District and to obtain Planning Code exceptions to address the front setback and rear yard requirements.

**ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW**
The proposed project will undergo environmental review pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) prior to a Historic Preservation Commission hearing.

**PUBLIC/NEIGHBORHOOD INPUT**
To date, the Department has not received any public comment about the proposed project.

**CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES OF THE LANDMARK BUILDING**
The landmark designation for Saint Charles School does not include a period of significance. Department staff has determined the period of significance to be 1887-1895, spanning the building’s construction as a Catholic church through its conversion to a school. The designation does not include a formal list of character defining features. Therefore, Department staff has identified the following character defining features:

- Italianate architectural style
- Three-story, boxlike form with symmetrical “in the round” design on three facades
- Wood-frame construction and wood shiplap cladding
- Two-stage hipped roof with arched ventilator dormers
- Grand full-height entry bay with ground floor recessed entry vestibule and second floor aedicule:
  - Paneled recessed entry with glazed wood double-doors and transom
January 29, 2020

Case Number 2019-004772COA
3250-70 18th Street

- Paired Tuscan columns flanking arched entry portal with Classical frieze and pediment
- Aedicule with ornate wood pilasters, paneled arch, bracketed entablature and cornice, and broken pediment surrounding a single window
  - Double-hung wood windows with ogee lugs and square or arched upper sashes
    - Single windows at the first floor of the east and west facades
    - Paired windows at the second floor of the east and west facades
  - Pedimented window hoods
  - Decorative wood corner quoins and pilasters
  - Wood profile belt courses

STAFF ANALYSIS

The Department seeks feedback from the ARC on the design, materiality, and relationship to setting of the new construction to the landmark property as defined by the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation (Secretary’s Standards) and Article 10 of the San Francisco Planning Code. Specifically, the Department seeks feedback on the overall massing of the New Building, the overall materials palette for the New Building, the location and attachment of the connective footbridge between the New Building and Saint Charles School, and the circulation core addition at the rear façade of Saint Charles School.

Staff reviewed the compatibility of the proposal (see attached plans) for conformance with:
- The Secretary’s Standards;
- Character-defining features of the landmark building

The Department would like the ARC to consider the following information:

Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation

The proposed project will not alter the existing Landmark aside from the connection for the footbridge and the rear circulation enclosure. The project has been sensitively designed so as to have its greatest impact on the blank rear façade. Likewise, the footbridge will require removal of only one window and will only minimally expand the existing window opening and will not damage any decorative window framing. The New School Building is designed in a contemporary idiom meant to differentiate it from the adjacent historic resource. Although the Play Yard is located on Lot 085 along with Saint Charles School, and is therefore included in the designating ordinance, the Play Yard has been substantially altered over time and retains no character-defining features. Department staff will undertake a complete analysis of the proposed project per the applicable Secretary’s Standards as part of the environmental review and the subsequent preservation entitlement (Certificate of Appropriateness).

- New School Building
  - Massing, Scale and Proportions: The overall proposed massing, scale and proportions of the New School Building are generally compatible with both the landmark site and the surrounding context. Standing at three stories and approximately 54 feet 9 inches tall, the new building will sit slightly lower than the 60-foot, three-story-over-basement Saint Charles School. The pedestrian bridge, which is approximately 37 feet 6 inches long, provides sufficient relief so that the Landmark’s character-defining west façade may be viewed from the public right-of-way.
Recommendation: Staff finds the massing of the proposed new construction consistent and compatible with the landmark site and the surrounding context. The new construction will read as a secondary, later addition on the campus and will replace an existing, non-historic convent building with the same footprint. Staff will provide a full compatibility analysis to the HPC as part of the Certificate of Appropriateness hearing materials. Staff requests clarification on whether the ARC concurs with this assessment.

- Design: The New School Building is designed in a contemporary idiom, with minimal decorative elements or features which allow those character-defining features found on Saint Charles School to take visual precedence on the 18th Street portion of the La Scuola campus.

Recommendation: Staff finds the design of the proposed New School Building substantially differentiated from and generally compatible with the Landmark. Proposed louvers and panes within the glass curtain wall reflect the scale and horizontality of Saint Charles School’s character-defining shiplap cladding. The New School Building’s front façade is also articulated in a tripartite arrangement, with clear base and terminating elements. Staff recommends that the subtle tripartite composition proposed for the front façade of the New School Building continue onto the other three facades to provide more compatibility with Saint Charles School. Staff requests clarification on whether the ARC concurs with this assessment.

- Materials: The materials proposed for the new construction include clear and multicolored glass curtain walls and multicolored cement board panels, striking a marked contrast with the Italianate Landmark, with its wood shiplap clapboarding and decorative millwork.

Recommendation: Staff believes that the proposed cladding materials highly differentiated from those found on the Landmark. Staff requests material samples for the proposed multi-colored glass and cement board surface materials. Staff finds cement board products to be variable in terms of texture and quality of finish, and requests that alternative, high-quality materials be explored. Staff asks for clarification on whether or not the ARC concurs with staff’s assessment.

- Fenestration: Fenestration of the proposed new construction includes glass curtain walls on the front and rear facades, and irregularly punched openings on the east (Play Yard) façade. The proposed fenestration will be simple in comparison to the fenestration of the Landmark.

Recommendation: Staff finds the irregularly-punched openings to be compatible with the Landmark in terms of size and orientation, but thoughtfully differentiated from the strict symmetry of the Landmark’s fenestration pattern. Staff requests additional information about the proposed window materials, and further requests that alternative, high-quality materials be explored. Staff asks for clarification on whether the ARC concurs with staff’s assessment.

- Saint Charles School: In order to accommodate a habitable head height in its existing basement, Saint Charles School will be raised approximately two feet. The new portions of the foundation will be masonry clad with smooth cement plaster to match the existing foundation. Although the entry will remain intact, the existing entry stair will be expanded with additional steps to accommodate the raised height. An encroachment permit from the Department of Public Works will be required, as the new steps will be located within the public right-of-way. A new semi-open circulation core
will replace an existing wood stair at the rear façade. New skylights will be added at the east side of the roof. See “Connective Footbridge” below for analysis of the proposed footbridge.

**Recommendation:** Staff finds the proposal to raise Saint Charles School approximately two feet appropriate with minimal impact of the existing historic property. The additional height will have minimal impact on perception and scale of the Landmark and will facilitate programmatic goals within the development. Any added foundation will match the existing in terms of material and surface finish. The new circulation core is designed sensitively and will be located where an exit stair already exists. On balance, the project requires little intervention at Saint Charles School beyond raising the building. Staff requests clarification on whether or not the ARC concurs with staff’s assessment.

- **Connective Footbridge:** The footbridge connecting the New Building to Saint Charles School will be located parallel to and set back approximately 18 feet from the 18th Street property line. It will span from the lobby entrance on the east façade of the New Building to an existing window opening in the second bay of the west façade of Saint Charles School, leading to the historic entry vestibule of the Landmark. To accommodate this new entry point, an existing wood double-hung window will be replaced with a man-door, and the window’s sill will be dropped. The new footbridge will have glass guardrails. This will allow wheelchair access to Saint Charles School without modification to the character-defining main entrance on 18th Street.

**Recommendation:** Overall, Staff finds the proposed footbridge’s design and manner of attachment to the historic resource to be compatible with the Standards, especially in terms of reversibility. Although the footbridge will result in the loss of one double-hung wood window on the west façade of Saint Charles School, care is taken to maintain the size of the existing opening and to avoid destruction of the character-defining milled window framing and hood. Glass guardrails are an appropriate selection for the footbridge in order to minimize its visibility. However, the footbridge will rise approximately 10 feet above grade at 18th Street (to top of guardrail), making it visible from the public right-of-way. Staff requests more information about the materials proposed for the deck and bulkhead of the footbridge to determine the general visual weight of the footbridge structure at this location. Staff requests clarification on whether or not the ARC concurs with staff’s assessment.

- **Play Yard:** The existing outdoor play yard, which is solely located on Lot 085 along with Saint Charles School, will be renovated into an outdoor recess and learning space. Located between the New School Building and Saint Charles School approximately 8 feet below grade, the play yard will have access at the ground floor from both buildings. The proposed footbridge will span above the play yard. Improvements will include landscaping, permeable hardscaping, new play equipment, new outdoor furniture, a learning garden, and a basketball court. The basketball court, located behind Saint Charles School, will be used for parking for St. Charles Borromeo Church on weekends, per an agreement with the property owner. The play yard will be bounded by a new perimeter fence to replace the existing.

**Recommendation:** Staff believes that modifications to the existing outdoor play yard will be generally compatible with the landmark site as it will enhance the educational and outdoor experience of the school with little to no impact to the Landmark. Staff requests more information on modifications to the play yard over time, if any, to ensure that the proposal does not impact any potential character-defining elements of Lot 085.
Staff also requests more information about the selected materials, such as pavers, fencing, furnishings, etc. Staff requests clarification on whether the ARC concurs with staff’s assessment.

REQUESTED ACTION
The Department seeks comments on:

- Compatibility of the proposal with the character defining features of the landmark property;
- Recommendations for overall form and continuity of the proposal;
- Recommendations for scale and proportion of the proposal;
- Recommendations for fenestration of the proposal;
- Recommendations for materials, texture, and details of the proposal.

ATTACHMENTS

- Exhibits including:
  - Parcel Map
  - Zoning Map
  - Aerial Photo
  - Sanborn Map
  - Exterior site photos
- Landmark Designation Report
- Architectural and Conceptual Plans dated August 28, 2019
Parcel Map

Subject property outlined in blue.
Subject property circled in blue.
Aerial Photo

Subject property outlined in blue.
Sanborn Map

Subject property outlined in blue.
Site Photos

Subject property looking west on 18th Street from Shotwell Street. Source: Google Maps.

Subject property looking east on 18th Street. Source: Google Maps.
Subject property looking south on Shotwell Street toward 18th Street. Source: Google Maps.
NEW BLDG & ST.CHARLES - ROOF DEMO PLANS
SAN CARLOS - ROOF PLAN

LEGEND

EXISTING
NEW CONSTRUCTION
NO ACCESS

GENERAL NOTES
1. FOR SYMBOLS SHOWN ON THIS PAGE, SEE BELOW FOR SYMBOL LEGEND.
2. SHELVES FOR LANDSCAPE SHRUBS AND STREET TREES.
3. SHELL IN FOR NEW BUILDING OCCUPIED ROOF LANDING.
4. SHELL IN FOR MAN DOCK DOOR IN ROOF LANDSCAPE PLANT.
5. SHELL IN TO TYPICAL EXTERIOR WINDOW AND DOOR TRIM.
6. HISTORICAL PRESERVATION OF CHARLES SCHOOL AND SAN CARLOS HISTORIC FEATURES APPLIES TO THIS PROJECT.
7. ALL DRYWALL PLASTER APPEARS TO BE IN GOOD CONDITION.
8. FUTURE MAINTENANCE AND REPAIRS SHOULD BE CONSIDERED.
9. HOIST AND ELEVATOR SHEATHING AS REQUIRED. IF REQUIRED, REPLACE IN KIND.
10. HOIST AND ELEVATOR SHEATHING AS REQUIRED. IF REQUIRED, REPLACE IN KIND.
11. CONCRETE FOUNDATIONS INCREASED IN SIZE FOR FOUNDATION WALLSĖ.
12. ELEVATOR SHEATHING TO BE CONSIDERED WITH HISTORIC WOOD SERIAL.
13. ROOF EXTERIOR SHOULD REMAIN UNPAINTED.
14. KEEP IN B.A.D. ACCOMMODATION OF ADDITIONAL REPAIRS IS REQUIRED. POTENTIAL BRICK FINISHING THE BUILDING SHOULD BE ACCOMMODATED BY RESERVING THE EXISTING DOORWAY.

SAN CARLOS - SECOND FLOOR PLAN

SHEET NOTES

A. SUBMIT
B. IN W/ SUS
C. IN PHOTOS
LEGEND

GENERAL NOTES
1. HISTORICAL PROPOSITION ST CHARLES SCHOOL AND SAINT CHARLES HISTORIC DISTRICT APPARENT TO BE IN GOOD MAINTENANCE.
2. FUTURE MAINTENANCE AND REPAIRS SHOULD BE CONSIDERED.
3. INSPECTION AND MAINTENANCE AS REQUIRED.
4. INSTALL NEW CLADDING ON EXTERIOR WALLS.
5. INSTALL NEW CLADDING ON EXTERIOR WALLS.
6. CONCRETE FOUNDATION DURING EXCAVATION NEED TO BE EXPANDED BOUNDARY WALL TO BE EXTENDED TO THE FULL WIDTH OF THE BUILDING.
7. INSTALL WOOD CLADDING.
8. REPAIR IN論MENT TO EXISTING DOORWAY AND REPLACE ANY DAMAGE AND REPAIR.

EXISTING 18TH STREET ELEVATION

PROPOSED 18TH STREET ELEVATION