Certificate of Appropriateness

Executive Summary

HEARING DATE: OCTOBER 2, 2019

Record No.: 2019-004140COA
Project Address: 2066 PINE ST
Landmark: Landmark No. 211
Zoning: RH-2 RESIDENTIAL- HOUSE, TWO FAMILY Zoning District
40-X Height and Bulk District
Block/Lot: 0651/008
Project Sponsor: Matthew Kelly, Huang Iboshi Architecture
1736 Stockton St., #8
San Francisco, CA
Staff Contact: Shannon M. Ferguson - 415-575-9074
Shannon.Ferguson@sfgov.org

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION

2066 PINE STREET is located on the north side of Pine Street between Buchanan Street and Laguna Street (Assessor’s Block 0651; Lot 008). The subject building, known historically as the Madame C.J. Walker Home for Girls and Women, is individually designated as landmark No. 211 under Article 10 Planning Code (designated in 1999). The house served as the Walker Home, a boarding house for women, from 1921-1972. It was named to honor Madame C.J. Walker – a successful African American businesswoman of the early 20th century and one of America’s first black women millionaires.

The Italianate-style, 3-story, single-family residence was built between 1876-1878 by a local carpenter. The wood-framed building has large canted bay windows, elaborate ornamentation and an entry porch with columns. According to the landmark designation report, the subject property was clad in stucco in the 1940s. In 1999 the stucco was removed, and decorative elements were added to match shadows on the façade and existing elements on the east side of the house, as well as a 1920s photograph.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The proposed project involves a one-story horizontal addition at the east elevation with a deck above the addition. An existing fence and tradesman door will be removed at the east side of the subject property to make way for the addition. At the east elevation, an existing window and portion of the existing wall will be removed at the first story. The new addition will be clad in horizontal wood siding that is half as wide as the existing horizontal siding cladding the subject property. At the second floor, the existing double-hung, wood sash window and a portion of the wall under the window sill will be removed for a new wood and glass door panel surmounted by arched transom window. The door will access a new deck above the addition. The deck will have a wood railing and a firewall at the east elevation clad in horizontal wood siding. At the rear (north) elevation, a portion of two existing window openings will be infilled and filled with a new double-hung, wood sash windows. Also at the rear elevation, an existing door and portion of
the wall will be removed for wood French doors surmounted by a transom window. Please see photographs and plans for details.

**COMPLIANCE WITH PLANNING CODE**

Planning Code Development Standards.
The proposed project is in compliance with all other provisions of the Planning Code.

The proposed project will require neighborhood notification under Section 311 of the Planning Code.

In order to proceed, a building permit from the Department of Building Inspection is required.

Applicable Preservation Standards.
The proposal overall, is appropriate for and consistent with the purposes of Article 10, meets the standards of Article 1006.6 of the Planning Code, and complies with the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, in that:*

- the new addition will be minimally visible from the street
- the proposal will not destroy historic materials and features that characterize the building
- the new addition will be compatible yet differentiated from the old
- the proposal respects the character-defining features of the subject building;
- the architectural character of the subject building will be maintained;
- the integrity of distinctive stylistic features and examples of skilled craftsmanship that characterize the building shall be preserved; and,
- all new windows shall match the historic in materials, design, color, and other visual qualities.

The Department has determined that the proposed work will be in conformance with the requirements of Article 10 and the *Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.* Proposed work will not damage or destroy distinguishing original qualities or character of the subject building. The overall proposal includes a one story horizontal addition with deck above at the east elevation and new windows and doors at the east and rear (north) elevations of the subject property. Due to the projecting bay window at the east elevation, the addition will be minimally visible from the street and will be clad in compatible yet differentiated horizontal wood siding. New windows and doors at the east and rear (north) elevations will not be visible from the street and will be compatible with the materials and profile of existing fenestration. The Department finds that the historic character of the building will be retained and preserved and will not result in the removal of historic fabric.

**PUBLIC/NEIGHBORHOOD INPUT**
The Department has received no public inquiries for general information about the proposed project.

**ISSUES & OTHER CONSIDERATIONS**

- The Project is fully code complaint and is supported by Department Staff
ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW STATUS

The Project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (“CEQA”) as a Class 1 categorical exemption.

BASIS FOR RECOMMENDATION

The Department recommends APPROVAL WITH CONDITIONS of the proposed project as it meets the provisions of Article 10 of the Planning Code regarding major alterations to an Individual Landmark and the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation.

ATTACHMENTS

Draft Motion – Certificate of Appropriateness
Exhibit A – Conditions of Approval (as applicable)
Exhibit B – Plans and Renderings
Exhibit C – Maps and Context Photos
Certificate of Appropriateness
Draft Motion
HEARING DATE: NOVEMBER 6, 2019

Record No.: 2019-004140COA
Project Address: 2066 PINE ST
Landmark: Landmark No. 211
Zoning: RH-2 RESIDENTIAL- HOUSE, TWO FAMILY Zoning District
40-X Height and Bulk District
Block/Lot: 0651/008
Project Sponsor: Matthew Kelly, Huang Iboshi Architecture
1736 Stockton Street, #8
San Francisco, CA 94133
Staff Contact: Shannon M. Ferguson - 415-575-9074
Shannon.Ferguson@sfgov.org

ADOPTING FINDINGS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR MAJOR ALTERATIONS DETERMINED TO BE APPROPRIATE FOR AND CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSES OF ARTICLE 10 OF THE SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING CODE, AND TO MEET THE SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR’S STANDARDS FOR REHABILITATION, FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED ON LOT 008 IN ASSESSOR’S BLOCK 0651 IN A RH-2 RESIDENTIAL- HOUSE, TWO FAMILY ZONING DISTRICT AND A 40-X HEIGHT AND BULK DISTRICT.

PREAMBLE

On October 10, 2018, Matthew Kelly of Huang Iboshi Architecture (hereinafter “Project Sponsor”) filed Application No. 2019-004140COA (hereinafter “Application”) with the San Francisco Planning Department (hereinafter “Department”) for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a one-story horizontal addition at the east elevation with a deck above the addition at the subject property located on Lot 008 in Assessor’s Block 0651, which is individually designated as landmark No. 211 under Article 10 Planning Code.

The Project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (“CEQA”) as a Class 1 categorical exemption. The Historic Preservation Commission (hereinafter “Commission”) has reviewed and concurs with said determination.

On November 6, 2019, the Commission conducted a duly noticed public hearing at a regularly scheduled meeting on the Certificate of Appropriateness Application No. 2019-004140COA.

The Planning Department Commission Secretary is the custodian of records; the File for Record No. 2019-004140COA is located at 1650 Mission Street, Suite 400, San Francisco, California.
The Commission has heard and considered the testimony presented to it at the public hearing and has further considered written materials and oral testimony presented on behalf of the applicant, Department staff, and other interested parties.

MOVED, that the Commission hereby APPROVES the Certificate of Appropriateness, as requested in Application No. 2019-004140COA in conformance with the architectural plans dated July 30, 2019 and labeled Exhibit B based on the following findings:

FINDINGS

Having reviewed all the materials identified in the recitals above and having heard oral testimony and arguments, this Commission finds, concludes, and determines as follows:

1. The above recitals are accurate and also constitute findings of the Commission.

2. Project Description. The proposed project involves a one-story horizontal addition at the east elevation with a deck above the addition. An existing fence and tradesman door will be removed at the east side of the subject property. At the east elevation, an existing window and portion of the existing wall will be removed at the first story for the new addition. The new addition will be clad in horizontal wood siding that is half as wide as the existing horizontal siding cladding the subject property. At the second floor, the existing double-hung, wood sash window and a portion of the wall under the window opening will be removed for a new wood door with glass panel surmounted by arched transom window. The door will access a new deck above the addition. The deck will have a wood railing and a firewall at the east elevation clad in horizontal wood siding. At the rear (north) elevation, a portion of two existing window openings will be infilled and filled with a new double-hung wood-sash windows. Also at the rear elevation an existing door and portion of the wall will be removed for wood French doors surmounted by a transom window. Please see photographs and plans for details.

3. Property Description. 2066 Pine Street is located on the north side of Pine Street between Buchanan Street and Laguna Street (Assessor’s Block 0651; Lot 008). The subject building, known historically as the Madame C.J. Walker Home for Girls and Women, is individually designated as landmark No. 211 under Article 10 Planning Code. The Italianate-style, 3-story, single-family residence was built between 1876-1878 by a local carpenter. The wood-framed building has large canted bay windows, elaborate ornamentation and an entry porch with columns. The house served as the Walker Home, a boarding house for women, from 1921-1972. It was named to honor Madame C.J. Walker – a successful African American businesswoman of the early 20th century and one of America’s first black women millionaires.

4. Surrounding Properties and Neighborhood. Located in the Pacific Heights neighborhood, the subject property is one of several Italianate townhomes that line the north and south side of Pine Street. The adjacent property to the west is a late 19th century Victorian townhouse that also lost its ornamentation and appears to have recently undergone renovation to make the façade more compatible with neighboring buildings. The adjacent property to the east is a three story Italianate multiple family residence.
5. **Public Outreach and Comments.** The Department has received no public correspondence.

6. **Planning Code Compliance.** The Commission has determined that the proposed work is compatible with the exterior character-defining features of the subject property and meets the requirements of Article 10 of the Planning Code in the following manner:

A. **Article 10 of the Planning Code.** Pursuant to Section 1006.6 of the Planning Code, the proposed alteration shall be consistent with and appropriate for the effectuation of the purposes of this Article 10.

   The proposed project is consistent with Article 10 of the Planning Code.

B. **Secretary of the Interior’s Standards.** Pursuant to Section 1006.6(b) of the Planning Code, the proposed work shall comply with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties for significant and contributory buildings, as well as any applicable guidelines, local interpretations, bulletins, or other policies. Rehabilitation is the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features that convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values. The Rehabilitation Standards provide, in relevant part(s):

   (1) **Standard 1:** A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces and spatial relationships.

   Not applicable

   (2) **Standard 2:** The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

   The proposed project will require removal of one window and a modest area of siding, as well as removal of one existing door and modification to three existing windows. Modification to the second story window at the rear elevation will require a small area below the sill be removed for insertion of a new door. The arched window head and decorative wood surround will be retained, and an arched transom wood window inserted above the new door. At the rear elevation, two window sills will be raised, and the new windows will match the existing double hung wood window sash. The infilled area underneath the new windows will be clad in horizontal wood siding to match the existing siding. The rear elevation will also receive new French doors which will require a modest area of the existing siding to be removed. However, the rear elevation is not visible from the street and the new doors will be compatible with the materials and profile of existing fenestration. Therefore, the proposed project conforms with Standard 2.

   (3) **Standard 3:** Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural
features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

The proposed project will not add conjectural features or elements. Therefore, the proposed project conforms with Standard 3.

(4) **Standard 4:** Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

Not applicable.

(5) **Standard 5:** Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of fine craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

The proposed project will salvage and reuse existing distinctive wood trim elements surrounding the three windows that are proposed for modification. Therefore, the proposed project conforms with Standard 5.

(6) **Standard 6:** Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

Not applicable.

(7) **Standard 7:** Chemical or physical treatments, if possible, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.

Not applicable.

(8) **Standard 8:** Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.

Not Applicable.

(9) **Standard 9:** New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials and features that characterize the building. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

The proposed one-story horizontal addition is located behind an existing bay window, towards the rear of the subject property and in the approximate location of the existing fence. Because the addition is tucked far behind the bay window, it is minimally visible from the street. The blank façade helps to minimize the scale of the addition and the mass is further broken up by a simple horizontal
cornice detail at the middle of the facade. The narrow horizontal wood siding will be similar in profile to existing wide horizontal siding. The proposed siding is compatible yet helps to differentiate the new addition. The wood railing at the roof deck is compatible with the historic materials of the subject property. Therefore, the proposed project conforms with Standard 9.

(10) **Standard 10:** New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The proposed project, if removed in the future, will not destroy the essential form and integrity of the subject property. Therefore, the proposed project conforms with Standard 10.

C. **Landmarks/ Historic District.** Article 10 of the Planning Code outlines specific findings for the Commission to consider when evaluating applications for alterations to Landmarks or within designated Historic Districts.

**Landmarks**

1. Pursuant to Section 1006.6(c) of the Planning Code, for applications pertaining to landmark sites, the proposed work shall preserve, enhance or restore, and shall not damage or destroy, the exterior architectural features of the landmark and, where specified in the designating ordinance pursuant to Section 1004(c), its major interior architectural features. The proposed work shall not adversely affect the special character or special historical, architectural or aesthetic interest or value of the landmark and its site, as viewed both in themselves and in their setting, nor of the historic district in applicable cases.

The project is in conformance with Article 10 as the work shall not adversely affect the special character of the landmark.

7. **General Plan Compliance.** The proposed Certificate of Appropriateness is, on balance, consistent with the following Objectives and Policies of the General Plan:

**URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT**

THE URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT CONCERNS THE PHYSICAL CHARACTER AND ORDER OF THE CITY, AND THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN PEOPLE AND THEIR ENVIRONMENT.

**OBJECTIVE 1:**

EMPHASIS OF THE CHARACTERISTIC PATTERN WHICH GIVES TO THE CITY AND ITS NEIGHBORHOODS AN IMAGE, A SENSE OF PURPOSE, AND A MEANS OF ORIENTATION.

**Policy 1.3**

Recognize that buildings, when seen together, produce a total effect that characterizes the city and its districts.
OBJECTIVE 2:
CONSERVATION OF RESOURCES WHICH PROVIDE A SENSE OF NATURE, CONTINUITY WITH THE PAST, AND FREEDOM FROM OVERCROWDING.

Policy 2.4
Preserve notable landmarks and areas of historic, architectural or aesthetic value, and promote the preservation of other buildings and features that provide continuity with past development.

Policy 2.5
Use care in remodeling of older buildings, in order to enhance rather than weaken the original character of such buildings.

Policy 2.7
Recognize and protect outstanding and unique areas that contribute in an extraordinary degree to San Francisco’s visual form and character.

The goal of a Certificate of Appropriateness is to provide additional oversight for buildings and districts that are architecturally or culturally significant to the City in order to protect the qualities that are associated with that significance.

The proposed project qualifies for a Certificate of Appropriateness and therefore furthers these policies and objectives by maintaining and preserving the character-defining features of the subject property for the future enjoyment and education of San Francisco residents and visitors.

8. Planning Code Section 101.1(b) establishes eight priority-planning policies and requires review of permits for consistency with said policies. On balance, the project complies with said policies in that:

A) The existing neighborhood-serving retail uses will be preserved and enhanced and future opportunities for resident employment in and ownership of such businesses will be enhanced:

The proposed project will not have an impact on neighborhood serving retail uses.

B) The existing housing and neighborhood character will be conserved and protected in order to preserve the cultural and economic diversity of our neighborhoods:

The proposed project will strengthen neighborhood character by respecting the character-defining features of the building in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards

C) The City’s supply of affordable housing will be preserved and enhanced:

The project will not affect the City’s affordable housing supply.

D) The commuter traffic will not impede MUNI transit service or overburden our streets or neighborhood parking:
The proposed project will not result in commuter traffic impeding MUNI transit service or overburdening the streets or neighborhood parking.

E) A diverse economic base will be maintained by protecting our industrial and service sectors from displacement due to commercial office development. And future opportunities for resident employment and ownership in these sectors will be enhanced:

The proposed project will not have a direct impact on the displacement of industrial and service sectors.

F) The City will achieve the greatest possible preparedness to protect against injury and loss of life in an earthquake.

All construction will be executed in compliance with all applicable construction and safety measures.

G) That landmark and historic buildings will be preserved:

The proposed project is in conformance with Article 10 of the Planning Code and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards.

H) Parks and open space and their access to sunlight and vistas will be protected from development:

The proposed project will not impact the access to sunlight or vistas for the parks and open space.

9. For these reasons, the proposal overall, appears to meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and the provisions of Article 10 of the Planning Code regarding Major Alterations.
DECISION

That based upon the Record, the submissions by the Applicant, the staff of the Department and other interested parties, the oral testimony presented to this Commission at the public hearings, and all other written materials submitted by all parties, the Commission hereby APPROVES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the subject property located at Lot 008 in Assessor’s Block 0651 for proposed work in conformance with the architectural submittal dated July 30, 2019 and labeled Exhibit B on file in the docket for Record No. 2019-004140COA.

APPEAL AND EFFECTIVE DATE OF MOTION: The Commission’s decision on a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be final unless appealed within thirty (30) days after the date of this Motion No. XXXXXX. Any appeal shall be made to the Board of Appeals, unless the proposed project requires Board of Supervisors approval or is appealed to the Board of Supervisors as a conditional use, in which case any appeal shall be made to the Board of Supervisors (see Charter Section 4.135). For further information, please contact the Board of Appeals in person at 1650 Mission Street, (Room 304) or call (415) 575-6880.

Duration of this Certificate of Appropriateness: This Certificate of Appropriateness is issued pursuant to Article 10 of the Planning Code and is valid for a period of three (3) years from the effective date of approval by the Historic Preservation Commission. The authorization and right vested by virtue of this action shall be deemed void and canceled if, within 3 years of the date of this Motion, a site permit or building permit for the Project has not been secured by Project Sponsor.

THIS IS NOT A PERMIT TO COMMENCE ANY WORK OR CHANGE OF OCCUPANCY UNLESS NO BUILDING PERMIT IS REQUIRED. PERMITS FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF BUILDING INSPECTION (and any other appropriate agencies) MUST BE SECURED BEFORE WORK IS STARTED OR OCCUPANCY IS CHANGED.

I hereby certify that the Historical Preservation Commission ADOPTED the foregoing Motion on November 6, 2019.

Jonas P. Ionin
Commission Secretary

AYES:
NAYS:
ABSENT:
ADOPTED: November 6, 2019
EXHIBIT A

AUTHORIZATION UPDATE
This authorization is for a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow Alterations located at 2066 Pine Street, Block 0651, and Lot 008 pursuant to Planning Code Section(s) 1006.6 within the RH-2 District and a 40-X Height and Bulk District; in general conformance with plans, dated July 30, 2019, and stamped “EXHIBIT B” included in the docket for Record No. 2019-004140COA and subject to conditions of approval reviewed and approved by the Historic Preservation Commission on November 6, 2019 under Motion No XXXXXX. This authorization and the conditions contained herein run with the property and not with a particular Project Sponsor, business, or operator.

PRINTING OF CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL ON PLANS
The conditions of approval under the ‘Exhibit A’ of this Historic Preservation Commission Motion No. XXXXXX shall be reproduced on the Index Sheet of construction plans submitted with the site or building permit application for the Project. The Index Sheet of the construction plans shall reference to the Certificate of Appropriateness and any subsequent amendments or modifications.

SEVERABILITY
The Project shall comply with all applicable City codes and requirements. If any clause, sentence, section or any part of these conditions of approval is for any reason held to be invalid, such invalidity shall not affect or impair other remaining clauses, sentences, or sections of these conditions. This decision conveys no right to construct, or to receive a building permit. “Project Sponsor” shall include any subsequent responsible party.

CHANGES AND MODIFICATIONS
Changes to the approved plans may be approved administratively by the Zoning Administrator. Significant changes and modifications of conditions shall require Historic Preservation Commission approval of a new Certificate of Appropriateness. In instances when Planning Commission also reviews additional authorizations for the project, Planning Commission may make modifications to the Certificate of Appropriateness based on majority vote and not required to return to Historic Preservation Commission.
DEMOLITION NOTES

1. INTERIOR WALLS, DOORS, WINDOWS, & ELEMENTS INDICATED WITH DASHED LINES ARE TO BE DEMOLISHED.

2. ALL PARTITION WALLS TO BE DEMOLISHED MUST BE VERIFIED AS NON-STRUCTURAL.

3. SCOPE OF FLOORING MATERIALS & EXIST OF WALL AND CEILING FINISHES TO BE REMOVED ARE ORGANIZED BY LINES OR THRESHOLDS @ DOORWAYS.

4. THE CONTRACTOR SHALL TAKE ALL PRECAUTIONS DURING DEMOLITION TO MINIMIZE DAMAGE OF SURROUNDING MATERIALS.

5. THE CONTRACTOR SHALL NOTIFY THE ARCHITECT IMMEDIATELY AND PRIOR TO DEMOLITION OF ANY DISCREPANCIES BETWEEN THE DRAWINGS AND ACTUAL CONDITIONS.

6. KITCHEN INTERIOR - REMOVE (E) WALL FINISHES, (E) CEILING, (E) FLOORING, (E) APPLIANCES, (E) CABINETS AND PREPARE FOR NEW.

NOTE: NO WORK PROPOSED @ (E) BASEMENT & ROOF LEVEL.
Sanborn Map*

*The Sanborn Maps in San Francisco have not been updated since 1998, and this map may not accurately reflect existing conditions.
Aerial Photo

Certificate of Appropriateness
Case Number 2019-004140COA
2066 Pine Street