

SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Wednesday, December 5, 2018
12:30 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT WOLFRAM AT 12:35 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Allison Vanderslice, Kei Zushi, Justin Greving, Natalia Kwiatkowska, Tim Frye – Preservation Officer, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

At this time, members of the public may address the Commission on items of interest to the public that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission except agenda items. With respect to agenda items, your opportunity to address the Commission will be afforded when the item is reached in the meeting. Each member of the public may address the Commission for up to three minutes.

SPEAKERS: Kathleen Courtney – Willis Polk residence, AIA tour

B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

1. Director's Announcements

None

2. Review of Past Events at the Planning Commission, Staff Report and Announcements

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

Good afternoon, Commissioners, Tim Frye, department staff. One item to share with you on behalf of the director - He just texted and said he wanted to extend his sort of appreciation and efforts to everyone who worked on the Central SoMa Area Plan. The legislation was adopted recently. And, as you are aware there are about 90 properties that will receive some sort of designation or recognition as part of the Central SoMa Plan, that are under the purview of this Commission. One other item to share with you regarding your special hearing last week, on the African American Arts and Cultural District for the Bayview-Hunters Point neighborhood, the Board of Supervisors took up the proposed amendments to the Administrative Code. And based on this Commission's recommendations last week, primarily that were in line with the Department's recommendations. One is to loosen up the deadlines in the legislation to provide more flexibility and discretion for the community group to move at its own pace. Two is to have some expectations around staff reports, whether it's Planning department, MOHCD, OEWD or the Small Business Commission, in working with those communities. And lastly an opportunity for the Board of Supervisors to revisit the boundaries once the CHSS, which is an acronym for, excuse me while I pull it up really quick, Cultural Heritage Housing History Economic Sustainability Strategy. The CHSS report. Once the CHSS report is completed, the board may revisit the boundaries and adjust those boundaries as necessary. I'm happy to report that all of the amendments that were suggested by this Commission were accepted by Supervisor Cohen, President Cohen. There were some minor tweaks, though, I did want to bring to your attention. So for instance, instead of the CHSS report being due by October 8th of next year, it's now extended to July 31st of 2020, which does give us about an extra year to work with the community on finalizing the report. And then the only other edit, which may be interesting to you is that the committee that's outlined, basically the CAC, Community Advisory Committee, outlined as part of the process went from seven to 15 voting members and now there are 15 specific seats that are required for the C.A.C. However, instead of the CAC being seated for three years, it's now limited to a one-year process. One thing that I did find interesting though is they did add a seat for -- seat six is to be held by a young person between the ages of 14-18 at the time of appointment, so I think it's great they are reaching out to the younger members of the community and getting them to participate. Pardon me? [Off mic] Exactly. I will forward you a copy of the legislation just for your own information, but I did want to let you know those amendments have been incorporated as part of the final product. That concludes my comments, unless you have any other questions. Thank you.

C. COMMISSION MATTERS

3. President's Report and Announcements

President Wolfram:

I wanted to announce that we are planning to have a holiday gathering on the 19th of December, I think at 5:00, but I'm not sure we have determined a location. We are looking for a legacy business.

Jonas P. Ionin, Commission Secretary:

I actually just emailed you the list that I received from our staff.

President Wolfram:

Okay. So, we will have a location determined shortly. And we will get additional information about that and that concludes my remarks.

4. Consideration of Adoption:

- [Draft Minutes for November 7, 2018](#)

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Adopted

AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

4. Commission Comments & Questions

Vice President Hyland:

I have three things. I will try to keep them brief so we can move on. But I wanted to follow-up on the special hearing from last week and the African American Cultural Heritage Strategy, I think that is the title of the --there was a term that was proposed and coined and it's the first I had heard of it. And I thought it was worthy of repeating, and that is REENTRIFICATION. And, this notion of bringing back residents who either were gone, or maybe younger people who could stay. So having a young person on the CAC, I think, is a great move towards that. But, instead of gentrification, re-entrification, I thought that was good. Second, Senator Weiner has released the beginning of SB50, the new housing legislation. And I spoke with him and he would be willing to come and speak with us. And so we will have staff coordinate with his staff. It looks like the first committee hearing won't happen until March. So there's a little runway to understand it and for us to get involved and making sure that our issues are covered. And then lastly, I bring this up because it's really concerning to me. But I became aware this morning that in Houston, Jenny's Noodle House had a pride mural on the wall. And it was defaced. And they captured the person, a single individual on camera. They haven't found him yet. But they have identified that it will be prosecuted as a hate crime. However, what's concerning me is that the building owner has decided to paint over it. And I think that this falls right into the Intangible Cultural Heritage. The lessor has no control over what the land owner really wants to do. So I don't know if in our cultural legacy business and cultural assets conversation, if Houston has been in the dialogue there. But they are looking to paint over

the mural, which I personally think is the wrong thing to do. And there are ways to protect the mural with anti-graffiti coatings and stuff. So, I don't know if staff can reach out to someone in Houston and see. I don't know what we can do as a Commission. If we can send a letter that kind of ask them to do something differently, or to help work with the property owner and you know, share some of our lessons learned working with property owners.

Commissioner Johnck:

I'm interested to know from Commissioner Hyland in response to the public comment about the proposal to the AIA.

President Wolfram:

Oh the 950 Lombard.

Commissioner Johnck:

950 Lombard. And the proposal to -- I have a case study about --

Vice President Hyland:

I think that's a great idea, I have it on my to-do to reach back out to the chapter. For those who don't know I was the chapter president a couple years ago. But I don't think we can discuss it any further.

Commissioner Johnck:

I know that. I just wanted to react to it. Thank you.

6. [Proposed 2019 Hearing Schedule](#)

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Adopted
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

D. CONSIDERATION OF ITEMS PROPOSED FOR CONTINUANCE

The Commission will consider a request for continuance to a later date. The Commission may choose to continue the item to the date proposed below, to continue the item to another date, or to hear the item on this calendar.

7. 2016-007303PCA (E. TUFFY: (415) 575-9191)
5 THIRD STREET (HEARST BUILDING) – located on the east side between Market and Stevenson Streets, Assessor's Block 3707, Lot 057 (District 6). Consideration of **Planning Code Text Amendments** to Planning Code Section 188 – Noncomplying Structures: Enlargements, Alterations and Reconstruction. The Historic Preservation Commission will consider the proposal from the Project Sponsor to adopt an Ordinance that would extend the expiration date of Section 188(g) to allow Terrace Infill on a noncomplying structure designated as a Significant Building under Article 11 of the Code and would amend the text to allow for rooftop infill along the primary building frontage if obscured from view by existing parapet walls.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve the resolution to recommend approval of the Planning Code amendments to the Board of Supervisors.

(Continued from Regular Hearing on September 19, 2018)

(Proposed for Continuance to March 6, 2019)

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Continued to March 6, 2019
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

8. 2016-007303PTA (E. TUFFY: (415) 575-9191)
5 THIRD STREET (HEARST BUILDING) – located on the east side between Market and Stevenson Streets, Assessor’s Block 3707, Lot 057 (District 6). Request for a **Major Permit to Alter** to convert the existing 131,650 gross square foot, 154-foot tall office building for use as a 170-room hotel. Retail will be retained on the ground floor facing Market Street. The project will retain 5,920 gsf of office use. Existing rooftop structures will be altered to create a rooftop lounge, pending approval of a legislative amendment to Planning Code Sec. 188. The project site, which includes the buildings at 5 3rd Street, 17-29 3rd Street, and 190 Stevenson Street, is designated as a Category I (Significant) building under Article 11 of the Planning Code. Historically known as the Hearst Building and San Francisco Examiner offices, the main building is 13 stories over two basement levels. Designed in 1909 by architects Kirby, Petit & Green, various aspects of the original Renaissance Revival façade were redesigned in 1938 by architect Julia Morgan. The brick American Commercial-style building at the southwest corner of the site was completed in 1910, housed an early “newspaper bar” from 1910-1917, and was later purchased by the Hearst Corporation in a 1940s expansion.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

(Continued from Regular Hearing on September 19, 2018)

(Proposed for Continuance to March 6, 2019)

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Continued to March 6, 2019
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

E. CONSENT CALENDAR

9. [2018-002677COA](#) (R. SALGADO: (415) 575-9101)
1179 HAYES STREET – located on the south side of Hayes Street between Scott Street and Pierce Street, Assessor’s Block 0824, Lot 007 (District 5). Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** for the removal of a limited amount of historic stucco cladding at the first floor bay of the Hayes Street facade in connection with the creation of two new window openings and the enlargement of one existing window opening, to allow for the installation of three new double-hung wood windows. The project also includes interior alterations at the first floor. All of the proposed work is in connection with the addition of one new accessory dwelling unit at the first floor of the building in a portion of the building currently serving as storage space. The subject property is located within the Article 10 Alamo Square Landmark District, and is located within an RM-2 (Residential-Mixed, Moderate Density) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 MOTION: [0362](#)

10. [2018-011663PTA-02](#) (J. VIMR: (415) 575-9109)
500 SUTTER STREET – located on the north side of Sutter Street at its intersection with Powell Street, Assessor’s Block 0284, Lot 004 (District 3). Request for a **Major Permit to Alter** for the installation of a roof-mounted powered davit carriage and track system for the purposes of exterior building maintenance. As part of this work, the parapet would be extended and a painted safety rail would be placed behind the parapet. The subject property is a Category I (Significant) Building located within the Article 11 Kearny-Market-Mason-Sutter Conservation District, and is located within a C-3-R (Downtown-Retail) Zoning District and 80-130-F Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 MOTION: [0363](#)

F. REGULAR CALENDAR

11. [2015-014028ENV](#) (K. ZUSHI: (415) 575-9038)
3333 CALIFORNIA STREET MIXED-USE PROJECT – located on the south side of California Street between Laurel Street and Presidio Avenue, Lot 003 in Assessor’s Block 1032 (District 2) - **Draft Environmental Impact Report**. The project would redevelop the 10.25-acre site currently occupied by the University of California San Francisco Laurel Heights Campus with a total of fifteen residential and mixed-use buildings. The project would demolish the existing one-story, 14,000-gross-square-foot (gsf) annex building and surface parking lots; construct thirteen new buildings, ranging in height from 37 to 45 feet, along the perimeter of the site; and partially demolish the existing four-story, 455,000-gsf office building, which is a historic resource for the purpose of CEQA. The project would include rooftop additions to the existing office building, and it would be adapted as two separate residential buildings, ranging in height from 80 to 92 feet. The project would provide 558 dwelling units; 49,999 gsf of office space; 54,117 gsf of retail space; a 14,690-gsf child care center; 896 parking spaces; 693 bicycle parking spaces; and 236,000 sf of open areas. Parking would be provided in four below-grade parking garages and six individual, two-car parking garages. A project variant that would increase the height of one of the proposed buildings to approximately 67 feet and replace the proposed office space in it with 186 residential units (for a total of 744 dwelling units) is also being considered. The project site is located in a Residential-Mixed, Low Density (RM-1) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. The project sponsor proposes to create a new Special Use District (SUD) to allow for the proposed development at the project site.
Preliminary Recommendation: Review and Comment

SPEAKERS: = Allison Vanderslice – Staff introduction
 + Lee Lewtensky – MOEWD comments
 = Kei Zushi – Staff presentation
 = Justin Greving – Staff presentation
 = Nancy Goldenberg – Alternative Preservation
 - Kathryn Devincenzi – Alternative landscaped open space, full preservation alternative
 - Richard Frisbie – Historic preservation
 - Tina Kwok – Construction time
 - Bill Cutler – Worst development proposal
 - Colleen Ryan –
 - Ronald Giampaoli – Negative impacts
 - Anne Harvey – Families
 - Speaker – Negative impacts
 - Rose Hilson – Historic significance of the building
 - Eileen Bogut – Laurel Heights Community alternative

ACTION: Reviewed and Commented

AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

CL: 0088

12. [2015-016239PRJ](#) (N. KWIATKOWSKA: (415) 575-9185)
1170 HARRISON STREET – located on the north side of Harrison Street between Berwick Place and 8th Streets, Assessor’s Block 3755, Lot 029 (District 6). **Request for Review and Comment**, pursuant to Planning Code Sections 803.9(b) and 844.65, on the proposed change in use and proposed addition resulting with approximately 21,500 square feet of office use. The subject property determined to be individually-eligible for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources and has been placed on the Historic Preservation Commission’s Landmark Designation Work Program. It is located within the WMUG (Western SoMa Mixed Use-General) Zoning District, Western SoMa Special Use District and 55-X Height/Bulk Limit.
Preliminary Recommendation: The Historic Preservation Commission may draft comments to the Planning Commission regarding the proposed use and its ability to enhance the feasibility of preserving the historic building.

SPEAKERS: = Natalia Kwiatkowska = Staff report
 + Will Millard – Project presentation

ACTION: Adopted Findings

AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

RESOLUTION: [1003](#)

13. [2016-016549PRJ](#) (N. KWIATKOWSKA: (415) 575-9185)
149 9TH STREET – located on the north side of 9th Street between Natoma and Minna Streets, Assessor’s Block 3728, Lot 048 (District 6). **Request for Review and Comment**, pursuant to Planning Code Sections 703.9 and 758, on the proposed change in use of approximately 31,000 square feet from mixed-use to non-retail service use. The subject property is rated Category III pursuant to Appendix C to Article 11 of the Planning Code. It

is located within the RCD (Regional Commercial District) Zoning District, Western SoMa Special Use District and 55-X Height/Bulk Limit.

Preliminary Recommendation: The Historic Preservation Commission may draft comments to the Planning Commission regarding the proposed use and its ability to enhance the feasibility of preserving the historic building.

SPEAKERS: = Natalia Kwiatkowska – Staff report
+ John Kevlin – Project presentation

ACTION: Adopted Findings

AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

RESOLUTION: [1004](#)

ADJOURNMENT – 2:53 PM

ADOPTED DECEMBER 19, 2018