

SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Wednesday, October 17, 2018
12:30 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
COMMISSIONERS ABSENT: Hyland

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT WOLFRAM AT 12:34 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Rachel Schuett, Allison Vanderslice, Natalia Kwiatkoska, Shannon Ferguson, Jonathan Vimr, Shelly Caltagirone, Tim Frye – Preservation Officer, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

SPEAKERS: Mark Dwight – Dogpatch Community Center
J.R. Eppler – Dogpatch Community Center
Bruce Huie – Dogpatch Community Center

B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

1. Director's Announcements

None

2. Review of Past Events at the Planning Commission, Staff Report and Announcements

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

Good afternoon Commissioners. A few things to share with you -- in your packet was a memo from planner Carly Grob regarding your request for more information on the number of housing units affected by this Commission's review and approval. As you see, there is only one development, which is currently under construction. I'm happy to go into more detail about the memo if you like, but we are hoping this will address your questions. Second, I wanted to make you aware that 2 Henry Adams, which this Commission initiated and recommended landmark designation for a number of years ago, I think four years ago, was picked up again by Supervisor President Cohen and introduced by resolution because the former ordinance had been tabled so long. So it is coming back to this Commission for review and comment shortly. We are anticipating before the end of the year but it looks like that landmark designation will finally be realized. So I'm happy to report on that introduction at yesterday's hearing. Also, I want to let you know the Mills Act contracts have been, and your recommendations have been forwarded to the Clerk of the Board and we are briefing the supervisors currently and we will be scheduling the hearing before the GAO and the full board shortly. And then finally, I wanted to make you aware that the last item on your calendar for today, we are asking for a request for a continuance to December 5th because we had a great meeting with San Francisco Heritage and their policy committee. And we have, I think, a much better idea of how to construct a guidelines document that will address the previous comments of this Commission, and but also the preservation community. So we will pull everything together into one document, rather than trying to bounce back and forth between two separate documents. We will share that on the 5th if you do welcome that continuance. And that concludes my comments unless you have any questions. Thanks.

Jonas P. Ionin, Commission Secretary:

Very good and along those lines, if anyone is here for that item, number 11, the Façade Retention Policy or presentation part 4. There is a strong likelihood that the commission will be continuing that matter to December 5th.

C. COMMISSION MATTERS

3. President's Report and Announcements

President Wolfram:

A couple of brief announcements – one is, the firm I work for, TEF, actually has been working for the Friends of the Dogpatch Hub. So I would have to recuse myself from any discussion of that. I have not had to recuse myself from public comment before, so was not

quite sure what to do there. So if there is any request for further discussion on that matter at a future hearing, that would have to come from others, not to me. And the second is, I want to report on the outcomes of two Landmark Tree nominations that we put forward. The path for trees to become landmarked is a long and arduous one. They have to be approved -- recommended by this Commission and then subsequently it goes to the Landmark Tree Committee of the Urban Forestry Council for recommendation. Then if it gets through that hurdle, it goes to the Urban Forestry Council, who then makes a recommendation to the Board of Supervisors who would then landmark the trees. So, it is a multistep process. I attended the hearing of the Landmark Tree Committee on Monday. We had put forward two trees. One, in front of 1776 Vallejo Street, which is a *Metrosideros Robusta*, and one in front of 2694 McAllister Street, which is a California Buckeye.

Commissioner Johns:

That's our tree.

President Wolfram:

Yes, that's Commissioner Johns' and I's tree, that's our tree. That's right, thank you Commissioner Johns. The first tree, 1776 Vallejo Street, there was two committee members who were very enthusiastic about the tree. And actually all the committee members felt that it was a significant tree that it was important to the landmark house that was there, the Burr Mansion. And that it deserved in some way to be recognized. But three of the five committee members had deep concerns about the structural integrity of the tree. Apparently it's shaped sort of a "V" shaped two trunks and there is some rot and other conditions where the two trunks meet. And that means the tree is prone to structural failure specifically to that type of tree, which is quite a rare tree in San Francisco. So that tree did not get forwarded to the Urban Forestry Council to be landmarked. That one was tabled. The second tree, the "our tree" as Commissioner Johns stated, the California Buckeye, was enthusiastically endorsed by the committee and unanimously forwarded to the Urban Forestry Council. And Mike Williams, who wrote the book on San Francisco trees said, that if there is one tree that he could describe as a landmark tree in San Francisco, it would be that tree. So it has a great support. So, that is my report for today.

4. Consideration of Adoption:
- [Draft Minutes for October 3, 2018](#)

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Adopted
 AYES: Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 ABSENT: Hyland

5. Commission Comments & Questions

Jonas P. Ionin, Commission Secretary:

Just very briefly, I spoke with Commission President Wolfram, about the potential of you taking up your future hearing date of November 21st, which falls the day before Thanksgiving. There are currently no items on your advanced advance calendar for that hearing date. You may want to consider cancelling.

President Wolfram:

Anybody -- Commissioner Matsuda I think will not be there --

Commissioner Pearlman:

I would entertain the motion that we consider -- that we do cancel this.

President Wolfram:

Is that a motion?

Commissioner Pearlman:

Yes.

Commissioner Johnck:

Second.

***Hearing cancellation**

ACTION: Cancel November 21, 2018 Hearing

AYES: Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

ABSENT: Hyland

D. REGULAR CALENDAR6. [2017-011878ENV](#) (R. SCHUETT: (415) 575-9030)

POTRERO POWER STATION – DRAFT Environmental Impact Report The 29-acre site is located along San Francisco's central Bayshore waterfront and includes the site of the former Potrero Power Station. The proposed project would rezone the site, establish land use controls, develop design standards, and provide for a multi-phased, mixed-use development, including residential, commercial, parking, community facilities and open space land uses. The proposed project would include amendments to the General Plan and Planning Code, creating a new Potrero Power Station Special Use District. The proposed rezoning would modify the existing height limits of 40 and 65 feet to various heights ranging from 65 to 300 feet. Overall, the proposed project would construct up to approximately 5.3 million gross square feet of mixed uses and approximately 6.2 acres of open space. The project would include demolition of up to 20 existing structures, including up to five historic structures that are contributors to the historic Third Street Industrial District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Review and Comment

SPEAKERS:

- = Rachel Schuett – Staff presentation
- + Kirsten Hall – Project presentation
- = Allison Vanderslice – Preservation alternatives
- J.R. Eppler – Reasonable preservation goals
- Peter Linenthal – Historic national significance
- = Mike Buhler – Preservation alternatives
- Philip Anasovich – Full preservation alternatives
- = Bruce Huie – Unit 3 and the “Stack”

- Janet Carpinelli – Unit 3, over developed
 + Mark Dwight – Community outreach
 ACTION: Reviewed and Commented
 AYES: Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 ABSENT: Hyland

- 7a. [2017-009220COA-03](#) (N. KWIATKOWSKA: (415) 575-9185)
SAN FRANCISCO PUBLIC WORKS AND JCDECAUX REPLACEMENT OF PUBLIC TOILETS AND KIOSKS – located at Coit Tower (City Landmark No. 165), Washington Square Park (City Landmark No. 226), Civic Center Landmark District, and Jackson Square Landmark District. Request for **Certificates of Appropriateness** for the proposed replacement of the existing non-historic public toilets and kiosks located in the public right-of-way or on lots operated by the Recreation and Park Department. The project proposes to remove and replace a total of 25 public toilets and 114 kiosks spread throughout the City of San Francisco. Of the total, 4 public toilets and 3 kiosks are located within the boundaries of Article 10 landmarks and landmark districts.
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions
 (Continued from Regular hearing on September 19, 2018)

SPEAKERS: = Natalia Kwiatkowska – Staff report
 + Lisa Zhou – DPW remarks
 + Francois Nion – JCDecaux introduction
 + Tyler Kralik – Design presentation
 - Richard Carrillo – Designing in historic architecture style
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 ABSENT: Hyland
 MOTION: [0353](#), [0356](#), [0357](#), [0358](#)

- 7b. [2017-009220PTA](#) (N. KWIATKOWSKA: (415) 575-9185)
SAN FRANCISCO PUBLIC WORKS AND JCDECAUX REPLACEMENT OF PUBLIC TOILETS AND KIOSKS – located within Kearny-Market-Mason-Sutter Conservation District, New Montgomery-Mission-Second Street Conservation District, Kearny-Belden Conservation District, and Pine-Sansome Conservation District. Request for **Permit to Alter** for the proposed replacement of the existing non-historic public toilets and kiosks located in the public right-of-way or on lots operated by the Recreation and Park Department. The project proposes to remove and replace a total of 25 public toilets and 114 kiosks spread throughout the City of San Francisco. Of the total, 2 public toilets and 31 kiosks are located within the boundaries of Article 11 conservation districts.
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions
 (Continued from Regular hearing on September 19, 2018)

SPEAKERS: Same as item 7a.
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 ABSENT: Hyland
 MOTION: [0354](#)

8. [2017-001773DES](#) (S. FERGUSON: (415) 575-9074)
524 UNION STREET (PAPER DOLL) – north side of Union Street at Cadell Place, Assessor's Block 0103, Lot 009 (District 3) - Consideration to Recommend to the Board of Supervisors **Landmark Designation** of 524 Union Street as an individual Article 10 Landmark pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the Planning Code. 524 Union Street is significant as one of the earliest LGBTQ bars that is associated with the development of LGBTQ communities in San Francisco; and is also significant for its association with owner Dante Benedetti who became one of the people on the front lines in the fight for LGBTQ civil rights in San Francisco in the 1950s. This item has been calendared following receipt of a community-sponsored Landmark Designation Application. 524 Union Street is located within the NCD – North Beach Neighborhood Commercial District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve
- SPEAKERS: = Shannon Ferguson – Staff report
+ Shane Watson - Support
- ACTION: Approved
- AYES: Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
- ABSENT: Hyland
- RESOLUTION: [995](#)
9. [2017-015622COA](#) (J. VIMR: (415) 575-9109)
925 PIERCE STREET –located at the southwest corner of the intersection of Pierce Street and Golden Gate Avenue, Assessor's Block 0776, Lot 001 (District 5). Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** to remove an existing garage door and infill the opening with window windows, sill, and surround as part of the conversion of one (1) existing garage space into one (1) new accessory dwelling unit. Additional work would include window modifications at the basement level along Pierce Street and one new door opening at the Golden Gate Avenue façade. 925 Pierce Street is located within the Article 10 Alamo Square Landmark District, a RH-3 (Residential-House, Three Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk Limit.
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions
- SPEAKERS: = Jonathan Vimr – Staff report
+ Serina Calhoun – Project presentation
- ACTION: Approved with Conditions
- AYES: Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
- ABSENT: Hyland
- MOTION: [0355](#)
- 10a. [2018-013136LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
3630 BALBOA STREET – north side of Balboa Street between 37th and 38th avenues in the Outer Richmond neighborhood. Assessor's Block 1580, Lot 003a (District 1). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. Balboa Theatre is a neighborhood movie theatre that has served San Francisco for 92 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City.

In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within a NC-2 (Neighborhood Commercial, Small Scale) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: =Shelley Caltagirone – Staff report
 + Speaker – House of Bagels
 + Spencer Pon – Fireside Camera
 + Adam Bergeron – Balboa Theatre
 + Richard Carrillo – Legacy Business marketing campaign
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 ABSENT: Hyland
 RESOLUTION: [996](#)

- 10b. [2018-013141LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
2117 CHESTNUT STREET – southwest corner of Chestnut and Steiner streets in the Marina District. Assessor's Block 0490, Lot 047 (District 2). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. Fireside Camera is a photograph and camera store that has served San Francisco for 64 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within a NC-2 (Neighborhood Commercial, Small Scale) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as Item 10a.
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 ABSENT: Hyland
 RESOLUTION: [997](#)

- 10c. [2018-013142LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
5030 GEARY BOULEVARD – north side of Geary Boulevard between 14th and 15th avenues in the Inner Richmond neighborhood. Assessor's Block 1446, Lot 026 (District 1). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. House of Bagels is a bagel shop and bakery that has served San Francisco for 56 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within a NC-3 (Neighborhood Commercial, Moderate Scale) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as item 10a.
ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
AYES: Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
ABSENT: Hyland
RESOLUTION: [998](#)

11. (J. GREVING: (415) 575-9169)

[FAÇADE RETENTION: PART 4](#) – On August 2, 2017 the Historic Preservation Commission reviewed and commented on a draft Façade Retention memo. The purpose of this agenda item is to discuss a revised façade retention memo drafted by staff that addresses commissioners’ comments.

Preliminary Recommendation: Review and Comment

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Continued to December 5, 2018
AYES: Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
ABSENT: Hyland

ADJOURNMENT – 3:07 PM
ADOPTED AS CORRECTED NOVEMBER 7, 2018