

**SAN FRANCISCO
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
AND
CIVIC DESIGN COMMITTEE OF THE ARTS
COMMISSION**



Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

**Wednesday, July 18, 2018
12:00 p.m.
Special Meeting**

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
COMMISSIONER ABSENT: Johns

CIVIC DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Stryker, Keehn, Schnair, Woolford
COMMISSIONER ABSENT: So

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT WOLFRAM AT 12:03 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Natalia Kwiatkowska, Rich Sucre, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and

= indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. SPECIAL CALENDAR

1. [2017-009220PTACOA-02](#) (N.KWIATKOWSKA: (415) 575-9185)
SAN FRANCISCO PUBLIC WORKS AND JCDECAUX REPLACEMENT OF PUBLIC TOILETS AND KIOSKS - located at Coit Tower (City Landmark No. 165), Washington Square Park (City Landmark No. 226), Civic Center Landmark District, Jackson Square Landmark District, Kearny-Market-Mason-Sutter Conservation District, New Montgomery-Mission-Second Street Conservation District, Kearny-Belden Conservation District, and Pine-Sansome Conservation District. **Review and Comment** before the Arts Commission and Historic Preservation Commission on the proposed replacement of the existing non-historic public toilets and kiosks located in the public right-of-way or on lots owned and operated by the Recreation and Park Department. The project proposes to remove and replace a total of 25 public toilets and 114 kiosks spread throughout the City of San Francisco. Of the total, 6 public toilets and 34 kiosks are located within the boundaries of Article 10 and Article 11 landmarks, landmark districts, and conservation districts.

Preliminary Recommendation: Review and Comment

SPEAKERS: = Natalia Kwiatkowska – Staff report
 + Beth Rubenstein – Project presentation
 + Francois Nion – Project presentation
 + Bill Cates – Design presentation
 + Tyler Krehlik – Response to questions
 + Stan Hayes – Once in a generation decision, wants design to be a success

ACTION: Reviewed and Commented

Recommendations on Overall Relationship

The HPC and CDR Committee of the Arts Commission concur with staff determination that the revised contemporary design relates better and is compatible with the surrounding landmarks and districts. The revised design with clean and minimalist detailing defines the base and the bowed surface of the body while distinguishing itself as a sculptural piece.

- The Commissions encouraged a more interactive components and programming on the structures that could potentially include exhibits, historic interpretations, or wayfinding; provided, the structures continue to read as minimalist sculptural objects.
- The Commissions recommended further refinement of the roof surface of the structures, given visibility from nearby buildings. If proposing vegetation, the plants should be carefully selected to be complimentary of the structures. The Commissions encourages exploring other options of roof treatment.

Recommendations on Form and Massing

The Commissions concur with the staff determination that the revised rounded form of the structures is more compatible with the surroundings.

- The Commissions encourage the Project Sponsor to explore opportunities to provide a more pronounced curve in the public toilets and a rounded corner version of the kiosks.
- Further, the Commissioners find that design 02.C of the kiosks, as shown in the Project Sponsor’s presentation, relates better with the surroundings due to the “pillowed” edges.

Recommendations on Materials and Color

The Commissions would like to see material samples to further understand the potential options for the structures.

- The Commissions recommend proposing materials that are scratch resistant in order to increase durability.
- Further, the Commissions recommend materials that would not reflect light in order to reduce glare for safety measures.

AYES:

ABSENT:

Black, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

Johns

ADJOURNMENT 1:43 PM

ADOPTED SEPTEMBER 5, 2018