

SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Wednesday, January 17, 2018
12:30 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Wolfram, Hyland, Pearlman, Johnck, Matsuda
COMMISSIONERS ABSENT: Johns

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT WOLFRAM AT 12:36 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: John Rahaim – Director of Planning Department, Deborah Landis, Rebecca Salgado, Shannon Ferguson, Desiree Smith, Frances McMillen, Shelley Caltagirone, Michael Christensen, Tim Frye – Preservation Officer, Jonas P. Ionin –Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

At this time, members of the public may address the Commission on items of interest to the public that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission except agenda items. With respect to agenda items, your opportunity to address the Commission will be afforded when the item is reached in the meeting. Each member of the public may address the Commission for up to three minutes.

SPEAKERS: David Silverman – 150 Eureka

B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

1. Director's Announcements
None
2. Review of Past Events at the Planning Commission, Staff Report and Announcements
None

C. COMMISSION MATTERS

3. President's Report and Announcements
None
4. Consideration of Adoption:
 - [Draft Minutes for ARC September 20, 2017](#)
 - [Draft Minutes for HPC December 6, 2017](#)

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Adopted
AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman
ABSENT: Johns

5. Commission Comments & Questions

President Wolfram:

I think I would like to follow up on the public comment that the speaker made so that we could get a report on that project on the 150 Eureka.

Jonas Ionin, Commission Secretary:

I will certainly relay that to staff.

Commissioner Pearlman:

I was hoping Mr. Frye was here. I sent, I asked Jonas to send around an article that was in the Chronicle about the historic houses, a number of houses that were illegally torn down and it's a very interesting problem because, you know, so often we hear these stories and it's so far out of the hands of the architect, the engineers, the planning staff, because it is, you know, an owner, typically a developer who takes it upon themselves to make some decisions in the field. I know that the fines often are, you know, not commensurate with the problem. I was just wondering if, you know, especially when it is a historic building, you know, if we could have a further conversation, if it's something we can schedule a conversation about, how to address this. I don't know if the staff is specifically already looking at -- thank you.

Director Rahaim:

Sorry, this isn't technically on your agenda, we shouldn't have a conversation about it but the Planning Commission has raised that exact same issue and we are looking at more

robust ways to make sure there is, number one, better communication between us and DBI on these issues and, number two, what we can do to try to address some of the particular players involved in some of these decisions where this has, frankly, happened repeatedly. So, we are working with the City Attorney's Office and Planning Commission and happy to work with you as well on future discussions about how to best address this, as this has become an issue that a number of people have asked us to start working on more robustly.

President Wolfram:

Maybe we can have it as a staff report in a subsequent hearing to know what's going on and we can ask questions about it.

Director Rahaim:

Happy to. Absolutely.

Commissioner Pearlman:

Yeah because the 841 Chestnut was an interesting one; that is the Willis Polk House where they came back and said the house was so deteriorated. Well that should have come up in a historic report. You know, that it was that deteriorated and could have been discussed as to whether that was appropriate to them, do more work or less work relative to that. So, thank you, I appreciate that. I do have one other thing. I'm giving a talk on February 2nd to the Alliance of Monterey-Area Preservationists in Pacific Grove, on, generally what we're doing here in San Francisco for preservation and then more specifically about the Hibernia Bank building. If anyone's down in the area, please join us. It's on -- I can give you more information --

President Wolfram:

Actually, I can add to that, I'm going to be on a CPS Panel next Friday about – it's about CEQA review and the Commission's perspective; Historic Preservation Commission's perspective on the CEQA and how we are involved in it. I'll be speaking with many other speakers that day, next Friday, it's at Pier One.

6. Election of Officers: In accordance with the Rules and Regulations of the San Francisco Historic Preservation Commission, the President and Vice President of the Commission shall be elected at the first Regular Meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission held after the first day of January each year; or at a subsequent Meeting, the date of which is fixed by the Historic Preservation Commission at the first Regular Meeting after the First day of January each year or at a subsequent meeting.

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Continued to February 7, 2018
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman
 ABSENT: Johns

D. REGULAR CALENDAR

7. [2017-014010CRV](#) (D. LANDIS: (415) 575-9118)
FY 2018-2020 PROPOSED DEPARTMENT BUDGET and WORK PROGRAM – An **Informational Presentation** of the Department's proposed revenue and expenditure budget in FY 2018-2019 and FY2019-2020, including grants, capital budget requests, and staffing changes;

high-level work program activities for the department in FY 2017-2018 and FY2018-2019; and proposed dates where budget items will be discussed during the budget process.

Preliminary Recommendation: None – Informational

SPEAKERS: John Rahaim – Presentation introduction
Deborah Landis – Staff presentation
Tim Frye – Preservation budget

ACTION: None – Informational

8. [2015-005890DES](#) (S. FERGUSON: (415) 575-9074)
546-554 FILLMORE, 735 FELL STREET, 660 OAK STREET – east side of Fillmore Street, north side of Oak Street, south side of Fell Street, Assessor’s Blocks/Lots 0828/021, 0828/022, 0828/022A and 0828/012 (District 5). Consideration of **Landmark Designation** for the former Sacred Heart Church Complex which includes the former rectory, church, school and convent buildings pursuant to Article 10, Section 1004(c) of the Planning Code. Sacred Heart Parish Complex is significant for its association with the growth and development of the Western Addition and Catholic religious institutions in San Francisco in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries; with prominent and influential civil rights activist Father Eugene Boyle, pastor of the church from 1968 to 1972; as a distinctive and well-executed example of a Romanesque Revival-style Catholic parish grouping and for its association with master architect Thomas J. Welsh. 546-548 Fillmore Street is located in a RM-3 Residential-Mixed, Medium Density Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District; 554 Fillmore Street is located in a RM-1 Residential-Mixed, Low Density Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District; 735 Fell Street is located in a RM-3 Residential-Mixed, Medium Density Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District; and 660 Oak Street is located in a RM-1 Residential-Mixed, Low Density Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve

(Continued from Regular hearing on October 18, 2017)

SPEAKERS: Mark Loper – Request for continuance
Merle Easton – Public suggest for the landmarking
Robert Pritchard – Support for landmarking

ACTION: Continued to March 21, 2018

AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman

ABSENT: Johns

9. [2017-007097COA](#) (R. SALGADO: (415) 575-9101)
3639 20TH STREET – located on the south side of 20th Street, Assessor’s Block 3608, Lot 068 (District 8). Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** for the removal of a portion of the roof at the rear of the building, to accommodate the construction of a roof deck. The proposed project also includes the in-kind replacement of the historic window sashes and the non-historic garage door and secondary entrance door at the 20th Street façade; modifications to existing window and door openings at the side and rear elevations; removal of select existing skylights and the installation of new skylights; the removal of a non-historic rear deck; modifications to the rear yard; and related interior alterations. The subject property is located within the Article 10 Liberty-Hill Landmark District, and is located within a RH-3 (Residential-House, Three Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk Limit.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: = Rebecca Salgado – Staff report
 + Blake Evans – Project presentation
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman
 ABSENT: Johns
 MOTION: [0328](#)

10. [2017-015688FED](#) (S. FERGUSON: (415) 575-9074)
1 TELEGRAPH HILL BOULEVARD – south side of Telegraph Hill Blvd. within Pioneer Park, Assessor’s Block/Lot 0086/012, (District 3). – Request for **Review and Comment** on amendment of the nomination of Coit Memorial Tower to the National Register of Historic Places. This nomination amends the 2008 National Register nomination in order to document Coit Memorial Tower at the national level of significance under National Register Criterion C in the area of art, and under Criteria Consideration F, Commemorative Properties. Coit Memorial Tower is associated with the extraordinary permanent exhibition of federally funded art created through the Public Works of Art Project (PWAP). The fresco, entitled *Aspects of Life in California, 1934* is the single largest PWAP project in the country and possesses exceptional value in interpreting the themes of the Great Depression and New Deal idealism. Financed by and named in honor of Lillie Hitchcock Coit, Coit Memorial Tower is exceptionally significant apart from the value of the person memorialized by the monument. 1 Telegraph Hill Blvd. is located in a P-Public Zoning district and OS (Open Space) Height and Bulk district.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Resolution in support of amending the National Register of Historic Places nomination.

SPEAKERS: = Shannon Ferguson – Staff report
 + Catherine Petrin – Sponsor presentation
 + Robert Cherny – Support
 ACTION: Adopted a Resolution supporting an amendment to the National Register of Historic Places nomination
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman
 ABSENT: Johns
 RESOLUTION: [927](#)

11. [2017-015684FED](#) (D. SMITH: (415) 575-9093)
3543 18TH STREET – south side of 18th Street at Lapidge Street, Assessor’s Block 3588, Lot 082 (District 8). Request for **Review and Comment** on the nomination of the property to the National Register of Historic Places for its association with second wave feminism, one of the late twentieth century’s most consequential social movements and as a location where the struggle for women’s rights was linked to additional community struggles, including those of marginalized racial/ethnic communities, LGBTQ people, immigrants, and others. The period of significance is 1978 to 1994, which captures the beginnings, formation, and consolidation of The Women’s Building, culminating with the creation of the major mural project, Maestrapeace, which visually communicates the organization’s mission of supporting and celebrating women across time and around the world. 3543 18th Street is located within a RTO-M - Residential Transit Oriented- Mission zoning district and 55-X Height and Bulk district.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Resolution in support of the nomination to the National Register of Historic Places.

SPEAKERS: = Desiree Smith – Staff report
 + Donna Graves – Sponsor presentation
 + Rohna Guy – Support

ACTION: Adopted a Resolution supporting the nomination to the National Register of Historic Places

AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman

ABSENT: Johns

RESOLUTION: [928](#)

12. [2017-015656FED](#) (F. MCMILLEN: (415) 575-9076)
220 GOLDEN GATE AVENUE – north side of Golden Gate Avenue between Leavenworth and Hyde streets, in Assessor's Block 0345, Lot 031 (District 6) – Request for **Review and Comment** on the nomination of the San Francisco Central YMCA to the National Register of Historic Places at the local level of significance under National Register Criterion A in the areas of social history and education, and under Criterion C in the area of architecture. The San Francisco Central YMCA is significant for its role as the lead branch of the San Francisco YMCA and as a major provider of social services, educational and recreational opportunities to City residents. The property is also significant for its association with Golden Gate University, which evolved out of educational programs offered by the YMCA and operated at the site until 1967. Designed by the McDougal Brothers and completed in 1910, the building is a distinctive example of Renaissance Revival style architecture. 220 Golden Gate Avenue is located within a C-3-G (Downtown-General) Zoning District and 80-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Resolution in support of the nomination, subject to revisions, to the National Register of Historic Places.

SPEAKERS: = Frances McMillen – Staff report
 + Speaker – Sponsor presentation

ACTION: Adopted a Resolution supporting the nomination, with revisions, to the National Register of Historic Places

AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman

ABSENT: Johns

RESOLUTION: [929](#)

- 13a. [2017-016394LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
1663 MISSION STREET – east side of Mission Street between Plum and 12th streets. Assessor's Block 3514, Lot 030 (District 8). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business** application. The AIDS Legal Referral Panel (ALRP) is a 501(c)(3) nonprofit organization that has been serving the AIDS/HIV community in San Francisco for Castro neighborhood for 35 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within a NCT-3 (Neighborhood Commercial Transit) Zoning District and an 85-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: = Shelley Caltagirone – Staff report
 + Bill Hirsch – Support

+ Janna Cordero – Support
 + Michael Gaston – Support

ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman
 ABSENT: Johns
 RESOLUTION: [930](#)

- 13b. [2017-016397LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
4073 24th STREET – on the south side of 24th Street between Castro and Noe streets. Assessor’s Block 6507, Lot 020 (District 8). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business** application. Noe Valley Bakery has been serving the Noe Valley community for 29 years, continuing a 94 year tradition of bakeries at the site. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within a NCD (24th Street – Noe Valley Neighborhood Commercial) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as Item 13a.
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval, as modified by Staff
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman
 ABSENT: Johns
 RESOLUTION: [931](#)

- 13c. [2017-016398LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
2095 JERROLD AVENUE – on the south side of Jerrold Avenue between Toland and Selby streets. Assessor’s Block 5984A, Lot 004 (District 10). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business** application. The San Francisco Market Corporation was founded 55 years ago to govern the Wholesale Produce Market, which has operated in the City for nearly 150 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within a NCD (Excelsior Outer Mission Street Neighborhood Commercial) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as Item 13a.
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman
 ABSENT: Johns
 RESOLUTION: [932](#)

- 13d. [2017-016399LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
2120 CHESTNUT STREET – on the north side of Chestnut Street between Pierce Street and Mallorca Way. Assessor’s Block 0486A, Lot 018 (District 2). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business**

application. Lucca Delicatessen has been operated continuously by the Bosco family for the past 89 years serving the Marina District and City by providing Northern Italian foods. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within a NC-2 (Neighborhood, Commercial, Small-Scale) Zoning District and 80-E Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as Item 13a.
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman
 ABSENT: Johns
 RESOLUTION: [933](#)

14. [2014-001272DVA](#) (R. SUCRE: (415) 575-9108; M. CHRISTENSEN: (415) 575-8742)
PIER 70 MIXED-USE PROJECT – east side of Illinois Streets between 20th and 22nd Streets – Assessor’s Block 4052 Lot 001 (partial), Block 4111 Lot 004 (partial), Block 4110 Lots 001 and 008A, and Block 4120 Lot 002 (District 10) – **Informational Presentation** on Phase 1 Submittal of the Pier 70 Mixed-Use Project. On December 15, 2017, the Board of Supervisors approved the Disposition and Development Agreement (DDA) associated with the Pier 70 Mixed-Use Project. The Pier 70 Mixed-Use Project includes new construction of market-rate and affordable residential uses, commercial use, retail, arts, and light industrial uses, parking, shoreline improvements, infrastructure development and street improvements, and public open space. The Pier 70 Mixed-Use Project is located within the Union Iron Works Historic District, which is listed in the National Register of Historic Places.
Preliminary Recommendation: None – Informational

SPEAKERS: = Michael Christensen – Staff report
 + Speaker – Project presentation
 + Speaker – Project presentation
 ACTION: None – Informational

15. (M. PAEZ: (415) 705-8674)
ALCATRAZ EMBARKATION SITE AT PIERS 31-33 – **Informational Presentation** from the Port of San Francisco and the National Park Service on a proposal for site improvements to establish ferry excursion facilities to service Alcatraz Island within portions of Piers 31 – 33 and the bulkhead wharf, contributing resources within the Embarcadero Historic District. Site improvements include but are not limited to expansion of berthing facilities, a visitor contact station, café and site furnishings. More information about the project may be found here:
<https://parkplanning.nps.gov/documentsList.cfm?parkID=303&projectID=41352>
Preliminary Recommendation: None – Informational

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Continued to February 21, 2018
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda, Pearlman
 ABSENT: Johns

16. (D. SMITH: (415) 575-9093; S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
[LANDMARK DESIGNATION WORK PROGRAM AND DRAFT CULTURAL HERITAGE WORK PROGRAM QUARTERLY REPORTS](#) – Discussion of the HPC's Landmark Designation Work Program and the draft Cultural Heritage Work Program.
Preliminary Recommendation: None - Informational

SPEAKERS: = Desiree Smith – Staff report
= Shelley Caltagirone – Staff report
ACTION: None – Informational

ADJOURNMENT – 3:46 PM
ADOPTED FEBRUARY 7, 2018