Certificate of Appropriateness Case Report
HEARING DATE: DECEMBER 5, 2018
CONSENT CALENDAR

Filing Date: February 28, 2018  
Case No.: 2018-002677COA  
Project Address: 1179 Hayes Street  
Historic Landmark: Alamo Square Landmark District  
Zoning: RM-2 (Residential-Mixed, Moderate Density)  
40-X Height and Bulk District  
Block/Lot: 0824 / 007  
Applicant: Sheila Nahi  
1179 Hayes Street  
San Francisco, CA 94127  
Staff Contact Rebecca Salgado – (415) 575-9101  
rebecca.salgado@sfgov.org  
Reviewed By Tim Frye – (415) 575-6822  
tim.frye@sfgov.org

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION

1179 HAYES STREET is within the Alamo Square Landmark District’s boundaries on the south side of Hayes Street, on Assessor’s Block 0824, Lot 007. The property’s lot has approximately 28 feet of frontage on Hayes Street. 1179 Hayes Street was constructed in 1912, and was built as part of a five-building development of apartment buildings spanning 1155 to 1179 Hayes Street. The Classical Revival–style four-story, wood-frame building has a stucco exterior. The Alamo Square Landmark District was designated in 1984.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The proposed project includes the following work in connection with the creation of one new accessory dwelling unit at the first floor in an area of the building currently used as storage space:

- Modifications to the first floor of the bay at the Hayes Street facade, including the following:
  - Removing painted wood boards and a security grille from an existing window opening at the center of the bay, enlarging the opening, and inserting one new 34”W x 42” H wood one-over-one double-hung unit with ogee lugs in the modified opening.
  - Removing limited portions of historic scored and textured stucco at the first floor bay to create two new window openings at the sides of the bay, and inserting two new 28”W x 42” H wood one-over-one double-hung units with ogee lugs in the new openings.

- Interior alterations at the first floor related to the creation of the new accessory dwelling unit, including reconfiguration of utility, storage, and trash-collection spaces.
Certificate of Appropriateness
December 5, 2018

Case Number 2018-002677COA
1179 Hayes Street

Please see photographs and plans for details.

OTHER ACTIONS REQUIRED

Since the building contains Rental Units, as defined in Section 37.2(r) of the Administrative Code, the property owner shall enter into an agreement with the City stating that the new Accessory Dwelling Units are not subject to the Costa Hawkins Rental Housing Act (California Civil Code Section 1954.50) and will be subject to the San Francisco Residential Rent Stabilization and Arbitration Ordinance (Chapter 37 of the Administrative Code). This agreement must be fully executed prior to the City’s issuance of the first construction document.

COMPLIANCE WITH THE PLANNING CODE PROVISIONS

The proposed project is in compliance with all other provisions of the Planning Code.

APPLICABLE PRESERVATION STANDARDS

ARTICLE 10

Pursuant to Section 1006.2 of the Planning Code, unless exempt from the Certificate of Appropriateness requirements or delegated to Planning Department Preservation staff through the Administrative Certificate Appropriateness process, the Historic Preservation Commission is required to review any applications for the construction, alteration, removal, or demolition of any designated Landmark for which a City permit is required. Section 1006.6 states that in evaluating a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for an individual landmark or a contributing building within a historic district, the Historic Preservation Commission must find that the proposed work is in compliance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, as well as the designating Ordinance and any applicable guidelines, local interpretations, bulletins, related appendices, or other policies.

THE SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR'S STANDARDS

Rehabilitation is the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features that convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values. The Rehabilitation Standards provide, in relevant part(s):

Standard 1: A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

The proposed project does not involve a change in use of the property. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 1.

Standard 2: The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

While the proposed project involves the removal of a limited amount of historic stucco cladding at the first floor of the bay at the Hayes Street façade, the amount of stucco removed will be limited to
the minimum amount necessary for the creation of the new and expanded window openings in the bay. The three new wood double-hung windows to be installed at the first floor will be compatible with the existing wood double-hung windows found at the upper floors of the building. In addition, the other four adjacent buildings that were constructed along with 1179 Hayes Street have received similar alterations at the first floor of their primary facade bay. The new features will align with the character-defining features of the historic Hayes Street façade. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 2.

**Standard 3:** Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

The proposed project does not include the addition of conjectural elements or architectural features from other buildings. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 3.

**Standard 4:** Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

The proposed project does not involve alterations to changes to the property that have acquired significance in their own right. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 4.

**Standard 5:** Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of fine craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

The painted wood boards and security grille at the existing window opening at the first-floor bay of the Hayes Street façade are not character-defining features of the building, and will be replaced with a new, slightly larger window that matches the material, configuration, and operation of the historic windows at the upper floors of the Hayes Street façade. A small amount of historic textured, scored stucco at the base of the building will be removed in the creation of the new window openings, and new stucco matching the finish, texture, and scoring patterns of the historic stucco will be installed around the three new/modified window openings at the Hayes Street façade. To ensure that the new stucco will align with the historic stucco, Planning Staff will review and approve replacement stucco samples against the historic stucco at the base. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 5.

**Standard 6:** Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacements of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The proposed project does not call for the replacement or repair of deteriorated historic features. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 6.
Standard 7: Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

The proposed project would not involve chemical or physical treatments that would cause damage to historic materials.

Standard 8: Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.

The proposed project does not involve any excavation work. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 8.

Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

The window and security grille to be removed at the Hayes Street façade do not appear to be historic and are not character-defining features of the building, and as such, their removal will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new wood one-over-one, double-hung windows at the ground floor will be compatible with the historic windows at the building, in that they will match the materials, configuration, and operation of the historic windows found at the upper floors of the Hayes Street facade, while also being differentiated from the historic windows due to their slightly different proportions and details. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 9.

Standard 10: New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The proposed project would not affect the essential form and integrity of the building, as the work visible from a public right-of-way is limited to alterations to openings in the first floor bay of the Hayes Street facade, and will not impact any character-defining features of the subject property, beyond a limited amount of historic stucco cladding that will be replaced in kind. The new windows at the Hayes Street facade could be removed in the future without impacting the essential form and integrity of the landmark. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 10.

Summary: The Department finds that the overall project is consistent with the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation.
PUBLIC/NEIGHBORHOOD INPUT

To date, the Department has received no public input on the project at the date of this report.

ISSUES & OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

None.

STAFF ANALYSIS

Included as an exhibit are architectural drawings of the existing building and the proposed project. Based on the requirements of Article 10 and the Secretary of Interior’s Standards, Department staff has determined the following:

The proposed project would retain the existing residential use of the building and would cause minimal changes to the form of the building without removing any character-defining features or materials, with the exception of a limited amount of historic scored and textured stucco at the base of the building. New stucco matching the texture, finish, and scoring pattern of the historic stucco will be installed around the three new/modified window openings at the Hayes Street façade. The painted wood boards and security grille to be removed from the existing window opening at the first floor of the Hayes Street façade are not character-defining features of the building, and as such, their removal will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new wood one-over-one double-hung windows with ogee lugs at the ground floor of the Hayes Street façade will be compatible with the historic windows at the building, in that they will match the materials, configuration, and operation of the historic windows, while also being differentiated from the historic windows due to their slightly different proportions and details.

Department staff finds that proposed work will be in conformance with the Secretary’s Standards and requirements of Article 10, and that the proposed work is compatible with the character-defining features of the subject site and with the Alamo Square Landmark District.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW STATUS

The Planning Department has determined that the proposed project is exempt/excluded from environmental review, pursuant to CEQA Guideline Section 15301 (Class One-Minor Alteration of Existing facility) because the project is a minor alteration of an existing structure and meets the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards.

PLANNING DEPARTMENT RECOMMENDATION

Planning Department staff recommends APPROVAL WITH CONDITIONS of the proposed project as it appears to meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

To ensure that the proposed work is undertaken in conformance with this Certificate of Appropriateness, staff recommends the following condition:

1. As part of the Building Permit, Planning Staff will review and approve replacement stucco samples, including an on-site mock-up showing the proposed finish, texture, and scoring pattern of the new stucco.
2. As part of the Building Permit, Planning Staff will review and approved shop drawings of the new windows to be installed at the Hayes Street facade.

ATTACHMENTS

Draft Motion
Exhibits:
- Parcel Map
- Sanborn Map
- Alamo Square Landmark District Map
- Existing Conditions Photographs
Project Sponsor submittal, including:
- Reduced Plans
ADOPTING FINDINGS FOR A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR PROPOSED WORK DETERMINED TO BE APPROPRIATE FOR AND CONSISTENT WITH THE PURPOSES OF ARTICLE 10, TO MEET THE STANDARDS OF ARTICLE 10 AND TO MEET THE SECRETARY OF INTERIOR’S STANDARDS FOR REHABILITATION, FOR THE PROPERTY LOCATED ON LOT 007 IN ASSESSOR’S BLOCK 0824, WITHIN AN RM-2 (RESIDENTIAL-MIXED, MODERATE DENSITY) ZONING DISTRICT AND A 40-X HEIGHT AND BULK DISTRICT.

PREAMBLE

WHEREAS, on February 28, 2018, Sheila Nahi (Project Sponsor) filed an application with the San Francisco Planning Department (hereinafter “Department”) for a Certificate of Appropriateness for work in connection with the creation of one new accessory dwelling unit at the first floor in an area of the building currently used as storage space. Specifically, the proposal includes:

- Modifications to the first floor of the bay at the Hayes Street facade, including the following:
  - Removing painted wood boards and a security grille from an existing window opening at the center of the bay, enlarging the opening, and inserting one new 34”W x 42”H wood one-over-one double-hung unit with ogee lugs in the modified opening.
  - Removing limited portions of historic scored and textured stucco at the first floor bay to create two new window openings at the sides of the bay, and inserting two new 28”W x 42”H wood one-over-one double-hung units with ogee lugs in the new openings.

- Interior alterations at the first floor related to the creation of the new accessory dwelling unit, including reconfiguration of utility, storage, and trash-collection spaces.
WHEREAS, the Project was determined by the Department to be categorically exempt from environmental review. The Historic Preservation Commission (hereinafter “Commission”) has reviewed and concurs with said determination.

WHEREAS, on December 5, 2018, the Commission conducted a duly noticed public hearing on the current project, Case No. 2018-002677COA (“Project”) for its appropriateness.

WHEREAS, in reviewing the Application, the Commission has had available for its review and consideration case reports, plans, and other materials pertaining to the Project contained in the Department’s case files, has reviewed and heard testimony and received materials from interested parties during the public hearing on the Project.

MOVED, that the Commission hereby grants the Certificate of Appropriateness, in conformance with the architectural plans dated October 12, 2018, and labeled Exhibit A on file in the docket for Case No. 2018-002677COA based on the following findings:

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

1. As part of the Building Permit, Planning Staff will review and approve replacement stucco samples, including an on-site mock-up showing the proposed finish, texture, and scoring pattern of the new stucco.
2. As part of the Building Permit, Planning Staff will review and approved shop drawings of the new windows to be installed at the Hayes Street facade.

FINDINGS

Having reviewed all the materials identified in the recitals above and having heard oral testimony and arguments, this Commission finds, concludes, and determines as follows:

1. The above recitals are accurate and also constitute findings of the Commission.
2. Findings pursuant to Article 10:

   The Historical Preservation Commission has determined that the proposed work is compatible with the character of the landmark district as described in the designation report dated January 18, 1984.
   
   • The project would retain the existing residential use of the building.
   • The project would cause minimal changes to the form of the building without removing any character-defining features or materials, with the exception of a limited amount of historic scored and textured stucco at the base of the building. The painted wood boards and security grille to be removed from the existing window opening at the first floor of the Hayes Street façade are not character-defining features of the building, and as such, their removal will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.
The project will ensure that the new wood one-over-one double-hung windows with ogee lugs at the first floor of the Hayes Street façade will be compatible with the historic windows at the building, in that they will match the materials, configuration, and operation of the historic windows, while also being differentiated from the historic windows due to their slightly different proportions and details.

The project will involve the removal of a limited amount of historic textured, scored stucco at the base of the building at the Hayes Street façade, in connection with the installation of new and modified window openings. New stucco matching the texture, finish, and scoring pattern of the historic stucco will be installed around the three new/modified window openings at the Hayes Street façade, under the consultation of Planning staff.

The proposed project meets the requirements of Article 10, Appendix E, of the Planning Code.

The proposed project meets the following Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation:

**Standard 1.**
A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

**Standard 2.**
The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

**Standard 3.**
Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

**Standard 4.**
Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

**Standard 5.**
Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

**Standard 6.**
Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
Standard 9.
New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

Standard 10.
New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

3. General Plan Compliance. The proposed Certificate of Appropriateness is, on balance, consistent with the following Objectives and Policies of the General Plan:

I. URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT
THE URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT CONCERNS THE PHYSICAL CHARACTER AND ORDER OF THE CITY, AND THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN PEOPLE AND THEIR ENVIRONMENT.

GOALS
The Urban Design Element is concerned both with development and with preservation. It is a concerted effort to recognize the positive attributes of the city, to enhance and conserve those attributes, and to improve the living environment where it is less than satisfactory. The Plan is a definition of quality, a definition based upon human needs.

OBJECTIVE 1
EMPHASIS OF THE CHARACTERISTIC PATTERN WHICH GIVES TO THE CITY AND ITS NEIGHBORHOODS AN IMAGE, A SENSE OF PURPOSE, AND A MEANS OF ORIENTATION.

POLICY 1.3
Recognize that buildings, when seen together, produce a total effect that characterizes the city and its districts.

OBJECTIVE 2
CONSERVATION OF RESOURCES WHICH PROVIDE A SENSE OF NATURE, CONTINUITY WITH THE PAST, AND FREEDOM FROM OVERCROWDING.

POLICY 2.4
Preserve notable landmarks and areas of historic, architectural or aesthetic value, and promote the preservation of other buildings and features that provide continuity with past development.

POLICY 2.5
Use care in remodeling of older buildings, in order to enhance rather than weaken the original character of such buildings.
POLICY 2.7
Recognize and protect outstanding and unique areas that contribute in an extraordinary degree to San Francisco’s visual form and character.

The goal of a Certificate of Appropriateness is to provide additional oversight for buildings and districts that are architecturally or culturally significant to the City in order to protect the qualities that are associated with that significance.

The proposed project qualifies for a Certificate of Appropriateness and therefore furthers these policies and objectives by maintaining and preserving the character-defining features of the Alamo Square Landmark District for the future enjoyment and education of San Francisco residents and visitors.

4. The proposed project is generally consistent with the eight General Plan priority policies set forth in Section 101.1 in that:

A) The existing neighborhood-serving retail uses will be preserved and enhanced and future opportunities for resident employment in and ownership of such businesses will be enhanced:

The proposed project will not have any impact on neighborhood serving retail uses.

B) The existing housing and neighborhood character will be conserved and protected in order to preserve the cultural and economic diversity of our neighborhoods:

The proposed project will strengthen neighborhood character by respecting the character-defining features of the landmark district in conformance with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards.

C) The City’s supply of affordable housing will be preserved and enhanced:

The project will not reduce the affordable housing supply as the existing units will be retained and one new housing unit will be added as part of the proposed work.

D) The commuter traffic will not impede MUNI transit service or overburden our streets or neighborhood parking:

The proposed project will not result in commuter traffic impeding MUNI transit service or overburdening the streets or neighborhood parking.

E) A diverse economic base will be maintained by protecting our industrial and service sectors from displacement due to commercial office development. And future opportunities for resident employment and ownership in these sectors will be enhanced:

The proposed project will not have any impact on industrial and service sector jobs.
F) The City will achieve the greatest possible preparedness to protect against injury and loss of life in an earthquake.

Preparedness against injury and loss of life in an earthquake is improved by the proposed work. The work will be executed in compliance with all applicable construction and safety measures.

G) That landmark and historic buildings will be preserved:

The proposed project is in conformance with Article 10 of the Planning Code and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards.

H) Parks and open space and their access to sunlight and vistas will be protected from development:

The proposed project will not impact the access to sunlight or vistas for the parks and open space.

5. For these reasons, the proposal overall is appropriate for and consistent with the purposes of Article 10, meets the standards of Article 10, and the Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, General Plan and Prop M findings of the Planning Code.
DECISION

That based upon the Record, the submissions by the Applicant, the staff of the Department and other interested parties, the oral testimony presented to this Commission at the public hearings, and all other written materials submitted by all parties, the Commission hereby APPROVES a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property located at Lot 007 in Assessor’s Block 0824 for proposed work in conformance with the renderings and architectural sketches dated October 12, 2018, and labeled Exhibit A on file in the docket for Case No. 2018-002677COA.

APPEAL AND EFFECTIVE DATE OF MOTION: The Commission's decision on a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be final unless appealed within thirty (30) days. Any appeal shall be made to the Board of Appeals, unless the proposed project requires Board of Supervisors approval or is appealed to the Board of Supervisors as a conditional use, in which case any appeal shall be made to the Board of Supervisors (see Charter Section 4.135).

Duration of this Certificate of Appropriateness: This Certificate of Appropriateness is issued pursuant to Article 10 of the Planning Code and is valid for a period of three (3) years from the effective date of approval by the Historic Preservation Commission. The authorization and right vested by virtue of this action shall be deemed void and canceled if, within 3 years of the date of this Motion, a site permit or building permit for the Project has not been secured by Project Sponsor.

THIS IS NOT A PERMIT TO COMMENCE ANY WORK OR CHANGE OF OCCUPANCY UNLESS NO BUILDING PERMIT IS REQUIRED. PERMITS FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF BUILDING INSPECTION (and any other appropriate agencies) MUST BE SECURED BEFORE WORK IS STARTED OR OCCUPANCY IS CHANGED.

I hereby certify that the Historical Preservation Commission APPROVES the foregoing Motion on December 5, 2018.

Jonas P. Ionin
Commission Secretary

AYES: X

NAYS: X

ABSSENT: X

ADOPTED: December 5, 2018
Historic Preservation Commission Hearing
Case Number 2018-002677COA
Alamo Square Landmark District
1179 Hayes Street
*The Sanborn Maps in San Francisco have not been updated since 1998, and this map may not accurately reflect existing conditions.*
Alamo Square District Map

Historic Preservation Commission Hearing
Case Number 2018-002677COA
Alamo Square Landmark District
1179 Hayes Street
1916 Photo of 1179 Hayes Street

Historic Preservation Commission Hearing
Case Number 2018-002677COA
Alamo Square Landmark District
1179 Hayes Street
Historic Preservation Commission Hearing
Case Number 2018-002677COA
Alamo Square Landmark District
1179 Hayes Street