



# SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

---

## Certificate of Appropriateness Case Report HEARING DATE: NOVEMBER 7, 2018

1650 Mission St.  
Suite 400  
San Francisco,  
CA 94103-2479

Reception:  
**415.558.6378**

Fax:  
**415.558.6409**

Planning  
Information:  
**415.558.6377**

*Filing Date:* January 12, 2018  
*Case No.:* 2018-000571COA  
*Project Address:* 1348 SOUTH VAN NESS AVENUE  
*Historic Landmark:* No. 74 – Frank M. Stone House  
*Zoning:* RTO-M (Residential Transit Oriented-Mission)  
50-X Height and Bulk District  
*Block/Lot:* 6518 / 006  
*Applicant:* Benjamin Damron  
Aidlin Darling Design  
500 Third Street, Suite 410  
San Francisco, CA 94107  
*Staff Contact* Rebecca Salgado – (415) 575-9101  
rebecca.salgado@sfgov.org  
*Reviewed By* Tim Frye – (415) 575-6822  
tim.frye@sfgov.org

### PROPERTY DESCRIPTION

1348 SOUTH VAN NESS AVENUE, also known as the Frank M. Stone House, is located on the west side of South Van Ness Avenue between 24<sup>th</sup> Street and 25<sup>th</sup> Street, on Assessor's Block 6518, Lot 006. The subject property is San Francisco Landmark No. 4. The subject property was constructed in 1886. The Frank M. Stone House was designated as City Landmark No. 74 in June 1975.

### PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The proposed project includes interior and exterior alterations to the property, including the removal of an existing one-story rear addition and the construction of a new one-story rear addition in the footprint of the existing addition; the construction of a new carport and deck in the rear yard; modifications to the existing rear fence; the installation of a new skylight at the rear of the roof; and interior alterations at all levels. Specifically, the proposal includes:

- Removal of an existing 6'-6" x 16'-6" one-story rear addition with wood siding and a shed roof with asphalt-shingle roofing and installation of a new one-story rear addition in the footprint of the removed rear addition. The new rear addition will add approximately 29 square feet of floor area to the building's interior, because the removed addition had a covered porch that will become interior space in the new addition. The new addition will have wood siding aligning with the rhythm of the historic wood siding, sliding glass windows and doors, and painted wood screen panels. The addition's shed roof will be clad with asphalt shingles to match the roofing on the main roof of the building. All exterior portions of the historic brick chimney that currently attaches to the rear elevation of the property and interacts with the rear addition to be removed

will be retained to interact with the roof of the new addition, and will be supported by new structural columns at the interior of the property.

- Construction of a new wood, steel, and concrete carport with a flat roof in the rear yard. The carport will have concrete support walls with intermittent steel structural columns and beams. The carport will have painted horizontal wood siding and wood boards along its roof to reference the historic wood siding of the main house.
- Construction of a new wood deck with stairs and railings connecting the carport to the rear addition.
- Creation of a new concealed entrance door in the existing rear fence.
- Installation of two (2) new skylights at either side of the main property's gabled roof at the rear of the property.
- Related interior alterations at all levels of the house at the rear of the property.

Please see photographs and plans for details.

### **OTHER ACTIONS REQUIRED**

None.

### **COMPLIANCE WITH THE PLANNING CODE PROVISIONS**

The proposed project is in compliance with all other provisions of the Planning Code.

### **APPLICABLE PRESERVATION STANDARDS**

#### **ARTICLE 10**

Pursuant to Section 1006.2 of the Planning Code, unless exempt from the Certificate of Appropriateness requirements or delegated to Planning Department Preservation staff through the Administrative Certificate Appropriateness process, the Historic Preservation Commission is required to review any applications for the construction, alteration, removal, or demolition of any designated Landmark for which a City permit is required. Section 1006.6 states that in evaluating a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for an individual landmark or a contributing building within a historic district, the Historic Preservation Commission must find that the proposed work is in compliance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*, as well as the designating Ordinance and any applicable guidelines, local interpretations, bulletins, related appendices, or other policies.

#### **THE SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR'S STANDARDS**

Rehabilitation is the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features that convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values. The Rehabilitation Standards provide, in relevant part(s):

**Standard 1:** A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

*The proposed project does not involve a change in use of the property. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 1.*

**Standard 2:** The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

*The proposed project will retain the historic character of the property, and will not remove any historic materials or features that characterize the property. The proposed work is all located at the rear of the property, and will be only minimally visible from a public right-of-way.*

*The proposed replacement of the existing rear addition with a new rear addition will maintain the footprint and roof form of the existing addition, and will not impact any character-defining features of the building. All exterior portions of the historic brick chimney that currently attaches to the rear elevation of the property and interacts with the rear addition to be removed will be retained to interact with the roof of the new addition, and will be supported by new structural columns at the interior of the property. The new rear addition will be minimally visible from Cypress Street over the existing rear fence, and will appear mostly unchanged from its existing condition.*

*The proposed work at the rear yard, including a new carport and rear deck, will not be visible from a public right-of-way and will not remove or alter any historic materials at the subject property. The existing rear fence, which includes a mural installed in 2012, will be retained, and the new concealed entrance door proposed to be installed at the fence will retain the portions of the mural at that area of the fence.*

*The proposed new skylights will be located at the rear gabled portion of the roof, and will be minimally visible from the street. The skylights will be mounted as low to the roof as possible, and the removal of portions of the non-historic asphalt shingle roofing to install the new skylights will not remove any character-defining features of the building. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 2.*

**Standard 3:** Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

*The proposed project does not include the addition of conjectural elements or architectural features from other buildings. The new work would not create a false sense of historical development and would be compatible with the landmark site. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 3.*

**Standard 4:** Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

*The proposed project does not involve alterations to changes to the property that have acquired significance in their own right. The rear addition that is proposed to be removed appears to be historic based on physical evidence and Sanborn map research, and may even date to the original construction of the house in 1886. However, no information has been located to suggest that this addition has acquired historical significance in its own right. The existing addition's simple design does not have any notable architectural features that contribute to the property's character-defining features as a whole. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 4.*

**Standard 5:** Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of fine craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

*The proposed project does not call for changes to or removal of the subject property's distinctive finishes and character-defining features. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 5.*

**Standard 6:** Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacements of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

*The proposed project does not call for the replacement or repair of deteriorated historic features. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 6.*

**Standard 7:** Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

*The proposed project does not involve chemical or physical treatments that will affect the building's historic materials. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 7.*

**Standard 8:** Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.

*The proposed project does not involve any excavation work. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 8.*

**Standard 9:** New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

*The proposed project will not destroy historic materials, features, or spatial relationships that characterize the property. The existing rear addition that is proposed to be replaced, while historic, is not a character-defining element of the property. The new rear addition to be constructed in the footprint of the existing rear addition will be differentiated from the historic elements of the property through its simple, contemporary design, which includes large glazed sliding doors, painted wood screens, and a cantilevered roof extension. The new addition will be compatible with the historic property through its use of painted wood siding cladding that has a similar rhythm to the historic painted wood siding and through its simple shed roof, which is similar to the roof profile of the historic addition to be removed.*

*The proposed rear deck and carport will not remove or destroy any historic features that characterize the property. The rear deck will be constructed of wood to match the predominant cladding material of the subject property, but will be minimal in design to be differentiated from the historic elements of the property. The proposed new concrete, steel, and wood carport is contemporary in design with minimal details and a flat roof, but will have painted horizontal wood siding to reference the historic wood siding found at the main house.*

*The proposed new skylights at the rear gabled portion of the main roof will not remove any character-defining features of the building, and will be mounted as low as possible to the roof surface to maintain the gabled profile of the roof. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 9.*

**Standard 10:** New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

*The proposed project would not affect the essential form and integrity of the building, as the work will be only minimally visible from a public right-of-way and will not impact any character-defining features of the subject property. If the proposed rear addition, rear-yard deck and carport, and skylights were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would remain. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 10.*

**Summary:** The Department finds that the overall project is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation*.

## **PUBLIC/NEIGHBORHOOD INPUT**

To date, the Department has received no public input on the project at the date of this report.

## **ISSUES & OTHER CONSIDERATIONS**

The proposed new carport will be replacing an existing non-contributing garage structure in the property's rear yard. This garage, which was constructed well-after the landmark's period of significance, was previously approved to be demolished under Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness ACOA 16.0200, for Planning Department Case Number 2016-003643COA.

This previously approved work conformed to the scopes of work delegated to Department Staff for Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness review in HPC Motion No. 0241. Specifically, the proposed demolition of the non-historic garage conformed to Scope No. 13, pertaining to Construction and/or Modification of Landscape Features outside of C-3 Zoning Districts, and Scope No. 14, pertaining to the Removal of Non-Historic Features.

A copy of Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness ACOA 16.0200 is attached as an exhibit of this application.

## STAFF ANALYSIS

Included as an exhibit are architectural drawings of the existing building and the proposed project. Based on the requirements of Article 10 and the *Secretary of Interior's Standards*, Department staff has determined the following:

The proposed project does not involve a change in use of the subject property and would not change the form of or remove any character-defining features from the building. The proposed work is all located at the rear of the property, and will be only minimally visible from a public right-of-way.

### Rear Addition

The rear addition that is proposed to be removed appears to be historic based on physical evidence and Sanborn map research, and may even date to the original construction of the house in 1886. However, no information has been located to suggest that this addition has acquired historical significance in its own right. The existing addition's simple design does not have any notable architectural features that contribute to the property's character-defining features as a whole.

The proposed replacement of the existing rear addition with a new rear addition will maintain the footprint and roof form of the existing addition, and will not impact any character-defining features of the building. The new rear addition will be minimally visible from Cypress Street over the existing rear fence, and will appear mostly unchanged from its existing condition. The new rear addition will be differentiated from the historic elements of the property through its simple, contemporary design, which includes large glazed sliding doors, painted wood screens, and a cantilevered roof extension. The new addition will be compatible with the historic property through its use of painted wood siding cladding that has a similar rhythm to the historic painted wood siding and through its simple shed roof, which is similar to the roof profile of the historic addition to be removed.

All exterior portions of the historic brick chimney that currently attaches to the rear elevation of the property and interacts with the rear addition to be removed will be retained to interact with the roof of the new addition, and will be supported by new structural columns at the interior of the property.

### Carport and Deck

The proposed work at the rear yard, including a new carport and rear deck, will not be visible from a public right-of-way and will not remove or alter any historic materials at the subject property. The rear deck will be constructed of wood to match the predominant cladding material of the subject property, but will be minimal in design to be differentiated from the historic elements of the property. The proposed new concrete, steel, and wood carport is contemporary in design with minimal details and a flat roof, but will have painted horizontal wood siding to reference the historic wood siding found at the main house.

### Rear Fence and Skylights

The existing rear fence, which includes a mural installed in 2012, will be retained, and the new concealed entrance door to be installed in the fence will retain the portions of the mural at that area of the fence.

The proposed new skylights will be located at the rear gabled portion of the roof, and will be minimally visible from the street. The skylights will be mounted as low to the roof as possible to maintain the historic gabled profile of the roof, and the removal of portions of the non-historic asphalt shingle roofing to install the new skylights will not remove any character-defining features of the building.

Department staff finds that the proposed work will be in conformance with the Secretary's Standards and requirements of Article 10, and that the proposed work is compatible with the character-defining features of the landmark site.

## **ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW STATUS**

The Planning Department has determined that the proposed project is exempt/excluded from environmental review, pursuant to CEQA Guideline Section 15301 (Class One-Minor Alteration of Existing facility) because the project is a minor alteration of an existing structure and meets the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards*.

## **PLANNING DEPARTMENT RECOMMENDATION**

Planning Department staff recommends APPROVAL of the proposed project as it appears to meet the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*.

## **ATTACHMENTS**

Draft Motion

Project Sponsor submittal, including:

- Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness ACOA 16.0200, approving demolition of the existing rear garage structure
- Secretary of the Interior's Standards Review prepared by Architectural Resources Group, dated June 18, 2018
- Historic and Existing Conditions Photographs
- Site Plan
- Reduced Drawings and Renderings