

SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



Draft – Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Wednesday, December 20, 2017
12:30 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Wolfram, Hyland, Pearlman, Johns, Johnck, Matsuda

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT WOLFRAM AT 12:55 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Desiree Smith, Jenny Delumo, Shannon Ferguson, Tim Frye – Preservation Officer,
Jonas P. Ionin –Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

At this time, members of the public may address the Commission on items of interest to the public that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission except agenda items. With respect to agenda items, your opportunity to address the Commission will be afforded when the item is reached in the meeting. Each member of the public may address the Commission for up to three minutes.

SPEAKERS: David Silverman – Historic Resource evaluation

B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

1. Director's Announcements

None

2. Review of Past Events at the Planning Commission, Staff Report and Announcements

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

A few items to share with you; one in regards to the outstanding Mills Act applications, the Full Board voted on the outstanding applications. It appears that 215-229 Haight Street, formerly 55 Laguna was approved and we're currently processing that contract; 973 Market as well, 940 Grove, and 627 Waller, and then 101 Vallejo Street. I will point out that 55 Laguna, 973 Market, and 627 Waller all have tenure limitations on those contracts, decided by the Government Audit and Oversight Committee. So those will be making their way through the assessor/recorder's office before the end of the year and then I did want to point out or remind you that there were two contracts that the Committee decided to essentially table or not take an action on and, therefore, we are working with those project sponsors on the next steps. One was 60-62 Carmelita, which I mentioned the Committee had a question about owner move-in eviction and then decided to not take a recommendation on that item; and then 56 Potomac Street, where there's an outstanding Certificate of Appropriateness for a vertical and horizontal addition. We're scheduling a special hearing at the request of President Wolfram on the Mills Act process and application procedures and policies for one of your February hearings and we will prepare some materials and some recommendations based on the committee's thoughts on this previous cycle, so that's coming up. Second, I did want to mention 56 Mason, which was a request for hearing from November regarding window placement in a Category 1 building in the Kearny-Market-Mason-Sutter Conservation District. You heard the item and upheld the department's decision on that Permit to Alter and now there has been a DR filed on that application, so it will be going to the Planning Commission in the New Year. That concludes my comments unless you have questions.

Commissioner Pearlman:

On 56 Mason, is that the one that there was a lot of community concern about?

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

That is correct.

President Wolfram:

This is in response to the member of the public who spoke about the CEQA question. I'm wondering if we could have potentially an update of where we are with the citywide survey because I think is—logic of the citywide survey is to address those kinds of concerns about historic resources.

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

Yup, we could schedule that in the New Year.

C. COMMISSION MATTERS

3. President's Report and Announcements

President Wolfram:

I have no formal report or announcement, but I would like to inform the members of the public we will be hearing item eight, the Peace Pagoda and Peace Plaza Landmark Designation, as the first item in the regular calendar, so that will be before item six.

4. Commission Comments & Questions

President Wolfram:

I have one disclosure which is that on item five, 920 North Point Street, the project sponsor there is client of my firm for other projects, but I'm not involved in this project.

D. CONSENT CALENDAR

All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the Historic Preservation Commission, and may be acted upon by a single roll call vote of the Commission. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Commission, the public, or staff so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item at this or a future hearing.

5. [2017-011162COA](#) (R. SALGADO: (415) 575-9101)
920 NORTH POINT STREET – located at Polk Street between Beach Street and North Point Street, Assessor's Block 0452, Lot 002 (District 2). Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** for the installation of mechanical louvers in existing window openings at the north façade of the historic Woolen Mill Building at Ghirardelli Square. The louvers will match the material and finish of the existing windows at this façade. The proposal also includes the installation of new signage and lighting at the Woolen Mill building's east façade, modifications to non-historic infill in existing historic and non-historic openings at the north, south, and east facades of the Woolen Mill Building, and related exterior landscape alterations at the Lower Plaza. The subject property is San Francisco Landmark No. 30, and is located within a C-2 (Community Business) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk Limit.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Approved
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
 MOTION: 0327

E. REGULAR CALENDAR

6. [2015-011274ENV](#) (J. DELUMO: (415) 575-9146)
150 EUREKA STREET – on the block is bounded by 18th Street to the north, Eureka Street to the east, 19th Street to the south, and Douglass Street to the west (Assessor's Block 2692, Lot 007) – Commission **Review and Comment** on the Draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR). The project site is currently developed with a two-story approximately 29-foot-tall wood-frame building, which most recently housed the Metropolitan Community Church of San Francisco. The proposed project would demolish the existing church building and construct two four-story buildings each with a total of two residential units, for a total of four residential units on the site. The two buildings would total approximately 14,441

gross square feet in size and would not exceed 40 feet in height. Each building would include a four-car garage and two class 1 bicycle parking spaces, for a total of eight vehicle parking spaces and four class I bicycle parking spaces. The project site is located in a Residential House-Two-Family (RH-2) District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Note: This public hearing is intended to assist the Commission in its preparation of comments on the DEIR. Comments made by members of the public at this hearing will not be considered comments on the DEIR and may not be addressed in the Final EIR. The Planning Commission will hold a public hearing to receive comments on the DEIR on Thursday, January 18, 2018. Written comments on the DEIR will be accepted at the Planning Department until 5:00 p.m. on Tuesday, January 23, 2018.

Preliminary Recommendation: Review and Comment

SPEAKERS: = Jenny Delumo – Staff presentation
+ David Silverman – Appropriate scope of a walking tour for a four unit building

ACTION: Reviewed and Commented

- The HPC concurred with the conclusions in the Draft EIR
- The HPC agreed that the alternatives analyzed are adequate and felt that the architect and sponsor have been honest in their assessment.
- The HPC has concerns about the practical implementation of the mitigation measure M-CR-1b (Interpretive program). The Commission felt the development of a full walking tour as outlined in the mitigation measure was generally not a reasonable or practical measure for the size of the project, and requested that a plaque or other interpretive display be used to note the existing property's history. In addition, the Commission discussed working with existing tour(s) in the neighborhood to add this site.

LETTER: 0085

7. [2017-011910DES](#) (D. SMITH: (415) 575-9093)
DIAMOND HEIGHTS SAFETY WALL – south side of Diamond Heights Boulevard at Clipper Street, Assessor's Block 7504, Lot 011 (District 8). Consideration to **Recommend to the Board of Supervisors** Landmark Designation of the Diamond Heights Safety Wall as an individual Article 10 Landmark pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the Planning Code. Constructed in 1968, the Diamond Heights Safety Wall is the notable work of Bay Area artist and architect, Stefan Alexander Novak, is an important visual landmark for the Diamond Heights neighborhood, and is significantly associated with the Diamond Heights Redevelopment Project, which dramatically reshaped the area into a neighborhood characterized by postwar Modernist master planning and Bay Area regional Modernist design. The property was nominated for Landmark Designation through a community-sponsored Landmark Application, submitted to the Department on May 1, 2017. It is located in a Residential-House, Two-Family (RH-2) zoning district and 40-X Height and Bulk district.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: = Desiree Smith – Staff report

ACTION: Approved

AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
 RESOLUTION: 926

8. [2014.1050L](#) (D. SMITH: (415) 575-9093)
1610 GEARY BOULEVARD – located between Post Street and Geary Boulevard, Assessor's Block 0700, Lots 022, 023 (District 5). **Consideration to adopt a Resolution** to recommend to the Board of Supervisors Landmark Designation of the Peace Pagoda and Peace Plaza at 1601 Geary Boulevard, as an individual Article 10 Landmark pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the Planning Code. Constructed in 1968, the Peace Pagoda and Peace Plaza were designed by master architect, Yoshiro Taniguchi and are significantly associated with the history and identity of the Japantown community. The HPC initiated landmark designation of the subject property on June 21, 2017. It is located in a Neighborhood Commercial, Moderate Scale (NC-3) zoning district and 50-X Height and Bulk district.
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve
Note: On August 16, 2017, after hearing and closing public comment, the Commission Continued to September 20, 2017 by a vote of +5 -0 (Matsuda recused; Hasz absent). On September 20, 2017, without hearing, Continued to December 6, 2017 by a vote of +6 -0. On December 6, 2017, Adopted a Motion of Intent to Recommend Approval and Continued to December 20, 2017 by a vote of +5 -0 (Matsuda recused).

SPEAKERS: = Desiree Smith – Staff report
 + Kaley Lloyd, Aide to Supervisor Breed – Pagoda and Peace Plaza
 = Alice Kowahatsu
 = Sandy Morry – Pagoda now, Plaza later
 + Karen Kai – Separating the Pagoda from the Plaza does not make sense
 - John Osaki – The Community is not ready to designate the Plaza
 - Judy Yamaguchi

ACTION: Approved
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Johnck, Johns
 ABSENT: Pearlman
 RECUSED: Matsuda
 RESOLUTION: 925

9. [2015-015453SRV](#) (S. FERGUSON: (415) 575-9074)
EUREKA VALLEY HISTORIC CONTEXT STATEMENT – Consideration to **adopt, modify or disapprove** a Motion to adopt the Eureka Valley Historic Context Statement was developed to provide a framework for consistent, informed evaluations of historic resources in the Eureka Valley/Castro neighborhood. The context statement documents the development history of the neighborhood and calls out influential themes, geographic patterns, and time periods in the district's history. The context statement also identifies key associated historic property types, forms, and architectural styles and their character-defining features, and a detailed discussion of potential areas of significance, criteria considerations, and integrity thresholds. The study period for the Eureka Valley Historic Context Statement dates from just before permanent European settlement in the region to 1976. The Eureka Valley Historic Context Statement study area encompasses all or a portion of twenty-nine city blocks roughly bounded by 16th, Market, and 17th streets on the north, Sanchez and Church streets on the east, 20th and 21st streets on the south, and Douglass Street on the west.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt

SPEAKERS: = Shannon Ferguson – Staff report
+ Susan Duttweiler – Support
+ Mark Ryser – Support
ACTION: Adopted
AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
MOTION: 0326

ADJOURNMENT – 2:38 PM IN HONOR OF MAYOR ED LEE