

SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Draft - Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Wednesday, June 7, 2017
12:30 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Matsuda, Pearlman, Johns, Hasz, Hyland
COMMISSIONERS ABSENT: Wolfram, Hasz, Johnck

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY VICE-PRESIDENT HYLAND AT 12:39 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: John Rahaim – Director of Planning, Rich Sucre, Marcelle Boudreaux, Desiree Smith, Tim Frye – Historic Preservation Officer, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary,

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

At this time, members of the public may address the Commission on items of interest to the public that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission except agenda items. With respect to agenda items, your opportunity to address the Commission will be afforded when the item is reached in the meeting. Each member of the public may address the Commission for up to three minutes.

None

B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS1. [Director's Announcements](#)**Director Rahaim:**

Just wanted to let you know, and you may have heard this, that yesterday at the Board of Supervisors they took the second reading to approve the Home SF Program, which is a program the Department has been working on more than two years to try to increase affordable housing production in the city through an innovative program providing some bonuses; that program went through some very challenging hearings and meetings in the last couple of years and interestingly enough was approved yesterday on the second reading at the Board unanimously. So staff was thrilled on that outcome--just want to thank everyone involved including Tim Frye who had a big part in kind of shaping that program around historic districts and historic resources, which was a big part of the discussion that happened early on when we were proposing that program. We look forward to moving that forward and seeing the results in the upcoming months. We already had several inquiries on how the program works and developers looking at sites so we're excited about that. Thank you.

2. Review of Past Events at the Planning Commission, Staff Report and Announcements

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

I have no formal report regarding the Planning Commission hearings, but two Board related items to share with you. This Monday the Land Use and Transportation Committee proposed or reviewed a proposed ordinance sponsored by Supervisor Kim to establish a Compton's Transgender Cultural District to commemorate and preserve sites associate with the transgender, gender variant, intersex, lesbian, gay, and bisexual communities and develop planning tools to affirm the community. So this is much like our other cultural heritage work that we're doing throughout the city. The Department spoke in support of the resolution and requested a series of minor edits to clarify the role of the Department as well as encourage the working group to collaborate with members of our LGBTQ Cultural Heritage Strategy so that tools for both efforts can be used in support of one another and the committee was supportive of those amendments and it was passed with a positive recommendation to the full Board of Supervisors. Then this morning I was at a--the Government Audit and Oversight Committee hearing. I presented on behalf of the Planning Department and Historic Preservation Commission along with the Office of Workforce and Development, the Arts Commission, MTA, Public Works and Mayor's Office of Housing and Community Development on our work to date in support of preservation of cultural heritage assets. This was a very broad hearing just to talk about how various city agencies are tackling the idea posed by a number of these cultural heritage districts and how we support those areas on a variety of public policy and quality of life topics. I presented an overview of cultural heritage, how it's defined, the tangible and intangible characteristics, as you know that we sometimes struggle with and our work to-date providing technical support for communities like Japantown, the LGBTQ and the Filipino Community in SOMA. There was also talk about a proposed, aside from the transgender district I just mentioned, there's also discussions about a SOMA Leather District and a 3rd Street Corridor District related to the African American community in the Bayview. Those are pending, but there was some general discussion at this hearing about those. I talked also about our own community led preservation planning process, the work of the HPC, your Landmark Designation Work Program and your prioritization of Cultural Heritage

Assets on that work program and your work to support the Legacy Business Registry as well as the Cultural Heritage Assets Committee's work. So, overall it was a very good hearing. I think one of the main topics that came out of the hearing was the desire to collaborate and break down the silo-ing of various city agencies and departments, but there does need to be an effort to provide some more uniformity in terms of how we engage the community in these processes rather than doing them on an individual or case-by-case basis. We understand they have to be tailored to the needs of each community, but in terms of access to resources, in terms of department staff or city family staff, it does make sense for us to collaborate and consolidate our efforts, so we'll be working with the Mayor's Office and getting the rest of the departments together again for a debrief and will likely be sharing with you sort of a baseline framework to move forward with cultural heritage efforts in the future, so I'll keep you posted on that. Finally, one item to invite you to, there is a mockup of the GFRC Cornice for 1095 Market currently installed on the Market Street side of the building and it's visible at street level. Through a Major Permit to Alter the commission approves the installation of the reconstructed cornice based on photographic evidence as part of your review of this Category I building being converted to a tourist hotel. I'm offering or inviting you all to go review the mock up. There will be at a future hearing, I believe the June 21st hearing, the project sponsor will be here with finished samples and some photographs of the mock up and the results of what we saw at the site. There is some fine tuning that has to happen before they start pulling the molds, but they do need your final review and approval to start fabrication so that will be here in a couple weeks but if you like to see it live it is on Market Street and it will be there through Saturday or through the end of this week. That concludes my comments unless you have any questions. Thanks.

Commissioner Pearlman:

I do have a question. Mr. Frye, on the discussion with all these other agencies, was there any discussion about how to identify these areas? We talked about with the legacy business program that maybe there is a sticker or something that can go on a door of a business to say we are participating in this program. There are all these cultural heritage districts that, how would anyone know even local people wouldn't know, that something exists so I'm wondering if there is conversation about that and how that gets out.

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

It is a great question. MTA and Public Works were there to talk about that; how they engage communities to provide more visible markers or wayfinding measures within their communities to let people know that these areas are present and they gave a variety of examples, but that is definitely one of the topics we will be addressing when we reconvene.

Commissioner Pearlman:

I know that in Philadelphia, in the gay neighborhood, they have the street sign that says 12th Street or something and then above it, it says Gayberhood or a rainbow flag in there. I mean simple things that that can say these blocks are part of that heritage. Thank you.

C. COMMISSION MATTERS

3. President's Report and Announcements

None

4. Consideration of Adoption:
- [Corrected Minutes for ARC March 1, 2017](#)
 - [Corrected Minutes for ARC March 15, 2017](#)
 - [Draft Minutes for May 17, 2017](#)

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Adopted
 AYES: Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
 ABSENT: Wolfram, Hasz, Johnck

5. Commission Comments & Questions

Commissioner Pearlman:

I have a disclosure. I had a conversation with Daniel Fraten of Reuben and Junius about the project, the Citizen M Project, that's on our agenda. The address is 72 Ellis Street.

6. [2017-004228COA](#) (T. FRYE: (415) 575-6822)
FRONTAGE OF COTTAGE ROW MINI PARK – facing Sutter and Steiner Streets (between Fillmore and Webster Streets), Assessor's Block 0677 Lot 012. **Request for hearing** on AOCA.17.0290 by member of the public per Section 1006.2(b) of the Planning Code. The Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness was issued by Planning Department staff in accordance with HPC Motion No. 0289 on May 10, 2017. Request for hearing was received by the Department on May 29, 2017.

Action: The HPC may decide to uphold the Department's review and approval of the proposed project pursuant to HPC Motion No. 0289; or the HPC may decide the proposed project shall be noticed and scheduled for future HPC hearing to approve, deny, or modify the proposed project pursuant the Standards of Review under Article 10 of the Planning Code.

SPEAKERS: - Marvin Lambert – Appeal of COA
 - Speaker – Lapse of procedure, by passing community process
 - Mary King – Inaccuracies, previous uses
 ACTION: After accepting public comment, scheduled a hearing for July 19, 2017

D. REGULAR CALENDAR

7. [2015-005848ENV](#) (D. LEWIS: (415) 575-9168)
1629 MARKET STREET – south side of Market Street between Brady and 12th Streets; Lots 001, 007, 008, 027, 028, 029, 031, 031A, 032, 032A, 033, 033A, 034, and 035 in Assessor's Block 3505 – Commission Review and Comment on the **Draft Environmental Impact Report**. The project would demolish the existing UA Local 38 building at 1621 Market Street and the majority of the Lesser Brothers Building at 1629-1645 Market Street, and remove the existing on-site surface parking lots. The proposed project would construct five buildings in addition to rehabilitating the Civic Center Hotel at 1601 Market Street, including a 10-story, 85-foot-tall addition to the Lesser Brothers Building. The Lesser Brothers Building and the Civic Center Hotel are historic resources for the purposes of the California Environmental Quality Act. Overall, the project would consist of six four- to ten-story buildings and include approximately 498,100 square feet of residential use containing 477 units, an additional 107 affordable units in the Colton Street Affordable

Housing Building, 32,800 square feet of open space, 27,300 square feet of union facility use, 13,000 square feet of ground-floor retail/restaurant use, and a below-grade garage with 316 off-street parking spaces. The proposed project would increase the height of the Colton Street parcel from 40-X to 68-X. The project site is located in the NCT-3 (Moderate Scale Neighborhood Commercial Transit District) and P (Public) zoning districts and the OS, 40-X, and 85-X height and bulk districts.

Note: This public hearing is intended to assist the Commission in its preparation of comments on the Draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR). Comments made by members of the public at this hearing will not be considered comments on the DEIR and may not be responded to in the Final EIR (FEIR). The Planning Commission will hold a public hearing to receive comments on the DEIR on June 15, 2017. Written comments on the DEIR will be accepted at the Planning Department until 5:00 p.m., June 26, 2017.

Preliminary Recommendation: Review and Comment

SPEAKERS: = Rich Sucre – Staff report
+ Speaker – Project presentation

ACTION: Reviewed and Commented

- The HPC found the DEIR to be adequate and accurate, and concurred with the analysis presented in the DEIR. The proposed alternatives appropriately address the required analysis, as outlined in HPC Resolution No. 0746.
- The HPC recommends a modification to the proposed mitigation measure for an interpretative display (Mitigation Measure M-CR-1b). Specifically, the proposed interpretative display should address the project site's history as a rare example of a tax-payer block. To the extent feasible, the interpretative display should incorporate an oral history.

LETTER: 0079

8. [2017-003134PTA](#) (M. BOUDREAUX: (415) 575-9140)
72 ELLIS STREET – on the north side of Ellis Street between Powell and Stockton Streets; Lot 011, Assessor's Block 0327 (District 3). Request for **Permit to Alter** for new construction within the Kearny-Mason-Market-Sutter (KMMS) Conservation District. The project proposes a new building approximately 130-foot-tall, 11-story with basement, for hotel use and ground-floor retail. The project site is within a C-3-R (Downtown Retail) Zoning District, the Downtown Plan Area, and 80-130-F Height and Bulk Districts. The proposed project will be heard by the Planning Commission on July 13, 2017, for a request to extend the performance period of the Downtown Project Authorization and Conditional Use Authorization.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Recommendations

SPEAKERS: = Marcelle Boudreaux – Staff report
+ Speaker – Project presentation
+ Speaker – Design presentation
- James Flood – Parking and traffic concern
- Claude Dubois

ACTION: Approved with Recommendations as amended

AYES: Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman

ABSENT: Wolfram, Hasz, Johnck

MOTION: 0305

- 9a. [2017-006201LBR](#) (D. SMITH: (415) 575-9093)
859 O'FARRELL STREET – on the south side of O'Farrell Street between Polk and Larkin Streets. Assessor's Block 0717, Lot 015 (District 6). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business** application. Founded in 1972, Great American Music Hall is one of the city's oldest and grandest nightclubs and performance venues. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within a NC-3 (Neighborhood Commercial, Moderate Scale) Zoning District and 130-E Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: = Desiree Smith – Project description
 + Dennis Juarez – Great American Music Hall
 + Douglas McFarland – Russian Hill Bookstore
 + Joan Albertson – Russian Hill Bookstore
 + Christine Monogal – Russian Hill Bookstore
 + Sally Whitehead – Russian Hill Bookstore
 + Kathy Wizowski – Russian Hill Bookstore
 + Jessica Tsang – Russian Hill Bookstore
 + Benjamin Bellman – Russian Hill Bookstore
 + Carol Spencer – Russian Hill Bookstore
 + Claudia Kraehe – Russian Hill Bookstore
 + Kevin Hershey – Spectacles of Union Square
 + Claude Bough – Spectacles of Union Square
 + Koshik Roy – Shanti Project
 + Harrison Anderson – Russian Hill Bookstore
 + Catherine McFarland – Russian Hill Bookstore

ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval

AYES: Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman

ABSENT: Wolfram, Hasz, Johnck

RESOLUTION: 872

- 9b. [2017-006202LBR](#) (D. SMITH: (415) 575-9093)
2162 POLK STREET – on the east side of Polk Street between Vallejo Street and Broadway. Assessor's Block 0572, Lot 019 (District 3). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business** application. Known for its wide selection of new and used books, cards, and toys, Russian Hill Bookstore is a destination for locals and tourists. Operating out of its current location since 1993, an earlier outpost of the business operated out of the Sunset District beginning in 1974. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within the Polk Street NCD (Neighborhood Commercial) Zoning District and 65-A Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as Item No. 9a.
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
 ABSENT: Wolfram, Hasz, Johnck
 RESOLUTION: 873

- 9c. [2017-006234LBR](#) (D. SMITH: (415) 575-9093)
730 POLK STREET – on the south side of Ellis Street at Polk Street. Assessor’s Block 0740, Lot 018 (District 4). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business** application. Established in 1974, the Shanti Project is a community-based caregiving nonprofit that trains volunteers to provide one-on-one psychosocial and practical support to individuals facing terminal or life-threatening illnesses, and whose program has become an international model. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within a NC-3 (Neighborhood Commercial, Moderate Scale) Zoning District and 130-E Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as Item No. 9a.
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
 ABSENT: Wolfram, Hasz, Johnck
 RESOLUTION: 874

- 9d. [2017-006235LBR](#) (D. SMITH: (415) 575-9093)
177 MAIDEN LANE – on the south side of Maiden Lane between Stockton Street and Grand Avenue. Assessor’s Block 0309, Lot 012 (District 3). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business** application. Opened in 1972, Spectacles of Union Square is a family-run optical store specializing in fine craftsmanship and on-site manufacturing of its optical wear and products. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within a C-3-R (Downtown Retail) Zoning District and 80-130-F Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as Item No. 9a.
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
 ABSENT: Wolfram, Hasz, Johnck
 RESOLUTION: 875

ADJOURNMENT – 2:20 PM