



SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Certificate of Appropriateness Case Report

HEARING DATE: JANUARY 16, 2019

CONSENT CALENDAR

Filing Date: May 30, 2018
Case No.: 2017-003989COA
Project Address: 1231 Fulton Street
Historic Landmark: Alamo Square Landmark District
Zoning: RH-3 (Residential-House, Three Family)
40-X Height and Bulk District
Block/Lot: 1181 / 025
Applicant: Jason Chan
615 Santa Barbara Avenue
Millbrae, CA 94030
Staff Contact Rebecca Salgado – (415) 575-9101
rebecca.salgado@sfgov.org
Reviewed By Tim Frye – (415) 575-6822
tim.frye@sfgov.org

1650 Mission St.
Suite 400
San Francisco,
CA 94103-2479

Reception:
415.558.6378

Fax:
415.558.6409

Planning
Information:
415.558.6377

PROPERTY DESCRIPTION

1231 FULTON STREET is within the Alamo Square Landmark District's boundaries on the south side of Hayes Street, on Assessor's Block 1181, Lot 025. The property's lot has approximately 37.5 feet of frontage on Fulton Street. 1231 Fulton Street was constructed circa 1906. The Classical Revival-style four-story, wood-frame building has a stucco exterior. The Alamo Square Landmark District was designated in 1984.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The proposed project includes the following work in connection with the creation of two new accessory dwelling units at the ground floor in an area of the building currently used as storage space:

- Modifications to the ground floor of the bay at the Fulton Street facade, including the following:
 - Removing a non-historic one-over-one double-hung window and a security grille from an existing 3'W x 3'H window opening at the center of the bay, enlarging the opening, and inserting one new 3'W x 4'-6"H wood one-over-one double-hung unit in the modified opening.
 - Removing limited portions of historic scored and textured stucco at the first floor bay to create two new window openings at the sides of the bay, and inserting two new 3'W x 4'-6"H wood one-over-one double-hung units in the new openings.
- Modifications to the ground floor of the secondary west and south elevations, including the following:

- At the visible secondary west elevation, removing select window openings and installing wood siding matching the existing siding at the filled-in areas; expanding two existing window openings to have lowered sills; inserting two new windows; relocating electrical service panels on the exterior secondary elevation; and installing lighting sconces for pedestrian and bicyclist safety.
- At the rear south elevation, replacing four (4) existing non-historic one-over-one double-hung windows with new wood one-over-one double-hung windows in the existing openings.
- Interior alterations at the ground floor related to the creation of the new accessory dwelling units, including reconfiguration of utility, storage, and trash-collection spaces and the creation of bicycle parking, and the insertion of vent flues for the new ADU units through chases and closets of the upper-floor units.
- Installation of two roof vents at the roof, to extend a maximum of 2' above the finished roof surface.

Please see photographs and plans for details.

OTHER ACTIONS REQUIRED

Since the building contains Rental Units, as defined in Section 37.2(r) of the Administrative Code, the property owner shall enter into an agreement with the City stating that the new Accessory Dwelling Units are not subject to the Costa Hawkins Rental Housing Act (California Civil Code Section 1954.50) and will be subject to the San Francisco Residential Rent Stabilization and Arbitration Ordinance (Chapter 37 of the Administrative Code). This agreement must be fully executed prior to the City's issuance of the first construction document.

COMPLIANCE WITH THE PLANNING CODE PROVISIONS

The proposed project is in compliance with all other provisions of the Planning Code.

APPLICABLE PRESERVATION STANDARDS

ARTICLE 10

Pursuant to Section 1006.2 of the Planning Code, unless exempt from the Certificate of Appropriateness requirements or delegated to Planning Department Preservation staff through the Administrative Certificate Appropriateness process, the Historic Preservation Commission is required to review any applications for the construction, alteration, removal, or demolition of any designated Landmark for which a City permit is required. Section 1006.6 states that in evaluating a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for an individual landmark or a contributing building within a historic district, the Historic Preservation Commission must find that the proposed work is in compliance with the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*, as well as the designating Ordinance and any applicable guidelines, local interpretations, bulletins, related appendices, or other policies.

THE SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR'S STANDARDS

Rehabilitation is the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features that convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values. The Rehabilitation Standards provide, in relevant part(s):

Standard 1: A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

The proposed project does not involve a change in use of the property. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 1.

Standard 2: The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

While the proposed project involves the removal of a limited amount of stucco cladding at the first floor of the bay at the Fulton Street façade, the amount of stucco removed will be limited to the minimum amount necessary for the creation of the new and expanded window openings in the bay. If an underlying historic cladding material other than stucco is discovered during the creation of the new window openings, then the ground floor portion of the bay will receive either the restored original cladding or new cladding matching the underlying historic cladding, with the guidance of Planning Staff. The new features will align with the character-defining features of the historic Fulton Street façade.

The changes to window and door openings at the secondary west and rear south elevations will not remove character-defining features of the building. The new wood windows to be installed at these elevations will match the material and operation of the historic windows at these elevations. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 2.

Standard 3: Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

The proposed project does not include the addition of conjectural elements or architectural features from other buildings. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 3.

Standard 4: Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

The proposed project does not involve alterations to changes to the property that have acquired significance in their own right. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 4.

Standard 5: Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of fine craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

The exterior elements of the ground floor that would be modified as part of the proposed work, including the non-historic double-hung window and stucco cladding, are not character-defining features of the building. The window is not original to the building, and the stucco cladding also appears to have been added after the building's initial construction. To ensure that the new facade cladding at the Fulton Street ground-floor bay will align with the historic cladding at this facade, Planning Staff will review and approve replacement cladding materials at the base by ensuring that any historic cladding materials underlying the existing stucco cladding are uncovered and restored or replaced in kind if they are too deteriorated to repair. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 5.

Standard 6: Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacements of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The proposed project does not call for the replacement or repair of deteriorated historic features, with the exception of the possible repair and/or replacement of any underlying historic cladding materials that may be found when portions of the existing stucco cladding at the Fulton Street facade are removed for the installation of the new window openings. Where necessary, damaged historic cladding materials will be repaired or replaced in kind with the guidance of Planning Staff. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 6.

Standard 7: Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

The proposed project would not involve chemical or physical treatments that would cause damage to historic materials.

Standard 8: Significant archaeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.

The proposed project does not involve any excavation work. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 8.

Standard 9: New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic

materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

The proposed work will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new wood one-over-one, double-hung windows at the ground floor will be compatible with the historic windows at the building, which are no longer extant, as well as the remaining historic elements of the building's exterior.

Similar to the new windows at the Fulton Street façade, the new windows at the rear and side elevations will match the materials and operation of the historic windows at these elevations. Overall, the proposed project maintains the historic integrity of the subject property and the district since the new windows are compatible with, yet differentiated from, the historic elements of the building's exterior. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 9.

Standard 10: New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The proposed project would not affect the essential form and integrity of the building, as the work visible from a public right-of-way is limited to alterations to openings in the ground-floor bay of the Fulton Street facade and the secondary west elevation, and will not impact any character-defining features of the subject property. The new windows at the Fulton Street facade and secondary west elevation could be removed in the future without impacting the essential form and integrity of the landmark. Therefore, the proposed project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 10.

Summary: The Department finds that the overall project is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation*.

PUBLIC/NEIGHBORHOOD INPUT

To date, the Department has received no public input on the project at the date of this report.

ISSUES & OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

None.

STAFF ANALYSIS

Included as an exhibit are architectural drawings of the existing building and the proposed project. Based on the requirements of Article 10 and the *Secretary of Interior's Standards*, Department staff has determined the following:

The proposed project would retain the existing residential use of the building and would cause minimal changes to the form of the building without removing any character-defining features or materials. While

the proposed project involves the removal of a limited amount of stucco cladding at the first floor of the bay at the Fulton Street façade, the amount of stucco removed will be limited to the minimum amount necessary for the creation of the new and expanded window openings in the bay. If an underlying historic cladding material other than stucco is discovered during the creation of the new window openings, then the ground floor portion of the bay will receive either the restored original cladding or new cladding matching the underlying historic cladding, with the guidance of Planning Staff. The new cladding will align with the character-defining features of the historic Fulton Street façade.

The window and security grille to be removed at the Fulton Street façade do not appear to be historic and are not character-defining features of the building, and as such, their removal will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new wood one-over-one, double-hung windows at the ground floor will be compatible with the historic windows at the building, which are no longer extant, as well as the remaining historic elements of the building's exterior.

The changes to window and door openings at the secondary west and rear south elevations will not remove character-defining features of the building. The new wood windows to be installed at these elevations will match the material and operation of the property's historic windows. The new windows will maintain the historic integrity of the subject property since the new windows are compatible with, yet differentiated from, the historic elements of the building's exterior. As a Condition of Approval, Planning Staff will review shop drawings of the new windows to be installed at the Fulton Street façade to ensure that these windows are compatible with the historic features of the property and the district.

The proposed project would not affect the essential form and integrity of the building, as the work visible from a public right-of-way is limited to alterations to openings in the ground-floor bay of the Fulton Street facade and the secondary west elevation, and will not impact any character-defining features of the subject property. The new windows at the Fulton Street facade and secondary west elevation could be removed in the future without impacting the essential form and integrity of the landmark.

Department staff finds that proposed work will be in conformance with the Secretary's Standards and requirements of Article 10, and that the proposed work is compatible with the character-defining features of the subject site and with the Alamo Square Landmark District.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW STATUS

The Planning Department has determined that the proposed project is exempt/excluded from environmental review, pursuant to CEQA Guideline Section 15301 (Class One-Minor Alteration of Existing facility) because the project is a minor alteration of an existing structure and meets the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards*.

PLANNING DEPARTMENT RECOMMENDATION

Planning Department staff recommends APPROVAL WITH CONDITIONS of the proposed project as it appears to meet the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL

To ensure that the proposed work is undertaken in conformance with this Certificate of Appropriateness, staff recommends the following condition:

1. As part of the Building Permit, Planning Staff will review any remaining underlying historic cladding found beneath the stucco cladding during the work at the Fulton Street facade. If a cladding material other than stucco is found, the Project Sponsor will work with staff to determine if the underlying cladding could be restored or would need to be replaced in kind.
2. As part of the Building Permit, Planning Staff will review and approved shop drawings of the new windows to be installed at the Fulton Street facade.

ATTACHMENTS

Draft Motion

Exhibits:

- Parcel Map
- Sanborn Map
- Alamo Square Landmark District Map
- Existing Conditions Photographs

Project Sponsor submittal, including:

- Reduced Plans