

SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING COMMISSION



Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Thursday, June 9, 2022

1:00 p.m.

Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Tanner, Moore, Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Koppel, Ruiz
COMMISSIONERS ABSENT: None

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT TANNER AT 1:00 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Aaron Starr, Monica Giacomucci, Matt Dito, David Winslow, Rich Sucre, Trent Greenan, Lisa Gibson, Liz White, Chris Kern, Liz Watty – Director of Current Planning, Corey Teague – Zoning Administrator, Rich Hillis – Planning Director, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. CONSIDERATION OF ITEMS PROPOSED FOR CONTINUANCE

The Commission will consider a request for continuance to a later date. The Commission may choose to continue the item to the date proposed below, to continue the item to another date, or to hear the item on this calendar.

1. 2021-005907DRP (D. WINSLOW: (628) 652-7335)
79-81 HOMESTEAD STREET – east side between 24th and 25th Streets; Lot 024 in Assessor's Block 6504 (District 8) – Request for **Discretionary Review** of Building Permit No. 2021.0512.0274 to raise an existing two-story two-family residence to add a garage at

street level and reconfigure front and rear stairs and rear decks within a RH-2 (Residential House, Two-Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Do Not Take Discretionary Review and Approve
(Proposed for Continuance to June 30, 2022)

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Continued to June 30, 2022
AYES: Ruiz, Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Koppel, Moore, Tanner

B. COMMISSION MATTERS

2. Consideration of Adoption:

- [Draft Minutes for May 19, 2022](#)
- [Draft Minutes for May 26, 2022](#)

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Adopted
AYES: Ruiz, Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Koppel, Moore, Tanner

3. Commission Comments/Questions

President Tanner:

The Planning Commission acknowledges that we are on the unceded ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone, who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost, nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the Ancestors, Elders, and Relatives of the Ramaytush Ohlone community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.

Thank you, Commissioners, for that and I just want to wish everybody a happy Pride Month. Looking very much forward to the parade later this month and lots of events happening throughout the city. And I also just want to remind folks that today there's an open house in the Bayview about the Caltrain station. We had that informational session a few weeks ago to discuss the location of the train station. So, that will be, I believe at 5:30 to 7 at the Bayview Opera House this evening.

Commissioner Moore:

I wanted to commend the Department, director Hillis and everybody who participated for a remarkable Equity in Action program that was held last Tuesday. I saw Commissioner Imperial's name, many of you may have been there. There were lots of people attending particularly Planning staff. This meeting will be recorded and I strongly, strongly recommend everybody to listen to this recording. There were lots of insights shared by the directors from Seattle and Philadelphia. Cities which similar yet different problems than ours, Planning staff small and large. They were remarkable, even a remarkable session and

I hope that there will be a follow-up because there is a lot to learn from what we hear from others in a similar situation. Again, thank you.

4. [2021-009977CRV](#) – **Remote Hearings** – Consideration of action to allow teleconferenced meetings and adopting findings under California government code section 54953(e) to allow remote meetings during the COVID-19 emergency; continue remote meetings for the next 30 days; direct the Commission Secretary to schedule a similar resolution [motion] at a commission meeting within 30 days.

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Adopted
 AYES: Ruiz, Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Koppel, Moore, Tanner
 RESOLUTION: 21123

C. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

5. Director's Announcements

Rich Hillis, Planning Director:

Good afternoon, Commissioners. Just one announcement. You may know SPUR puts out or gives out Good Government awards every year. I think they're in their 41st year of doing it but a lot of this year's awards had to do with the City's response to Covid and the pandemic. And so, we were recognized specifically Robin Abad around our work but obviously, there are a lot of folks from Planning and across the city who worked on Shared Spaces. So, I just wanted to let you know that that was called out specifically as part of the SPUR's Good Government awards. So, thanks. That's all I have.

6. Review of Past Events at the Board of Supervisors, Board of Appeals and Historic Preservation Commission

Aaron Starr, Manager of Legislative Affairs:

Land Use Committee

- 220342 Planning Code - Fire-Damaged Liquor Stores in North Beach Neighborhood Commercial District. Sponsor: Peskin.

This week, the Land Use Committee considered Supervisor Peskin's ordinance that would extend the time from 3-6 years that a liquor store could relocate in the North Beach NCD due to a fire. Commissioners, you heard this item on May 12 as a consent item and voted to approve the ordinance. This week, the Committee voted unanimously to approve the ordinance as a Committee Report. 211300 Planning Code, Zoning Map - Group Housing Special Use District. Sponsor: Peskin

Next the Committee heard Supervisor Peskin's ordinance that would create the Group Housing Special Use District, which prohibits group housing in the Chinatown and Tenderloin communities.

The Planning Commission heard this on February 10th and recommended approval with the following modifications:

1. Revise the proposed SUD to exempt Student Housing and 100% Affordable Housing projects.
2. Exclude the single-room occupancy aspect from this specific legislation with the intent to continue discussions in the future.

The Land Use and Transportation Committee first heard this item on March 7th along with the Group Housing Definition Ordinance. During that hearing, the Committee incorporated two changes:

1. Exempting Affordable Housing projects from the SUD (Student Group-Housing would still be prohibited)
2. Exempted Single Room Occupancy hotel units required by the Hotel Conversion Ordinance from the SUD.

During this week's hearing, there were seven callers in support of the Ordinance citing the need for affordable family housing, as opposed to market-rate SROs. Callers included CCDC, Tenderloin People's Congress, TNDC, and existing SRO tenants. At the end of public comment, the Committee voted to send the item to Full Board with positive recommendation for June 14th 220446 Planning, Administrative, Subdivision Codes; Zoning Map - Density Exception in Residential Districts. Sponsor: Mandelman.

Last but not least, the Committee took up Supervisor Mandelman's ordinance to up-zone all RH-1 Districts to RH-2 and allow four-plexes on interior lots and six units on corner lots in RH Districts if certain conditions are met.

There had been several ordinances pending at committee that were sponsored by Mandelman and one sponsored by Mar; however, the one heard by the Land Use committee on Monday is the only one moving forward. Supervisor Safai's is still pending before the committee.

The amended ordinance now requires the subject property to have been owned by the applicant for at least five years prior to application, or to be owned by the related heirs of the owner to be eligible for the program. To be eligible for condo conversion in properties where a full demolition of existing units will not occur, applicants must attest that they will continue to live at the property for at least 3 years post development. The amended ordinance also requires all bonus units be rent-controlled.

Supervisor Mar introduced a reporting requirement for the Planning Department. Under Sup. Mar's requirement, the Department is required to prepare an annual report addressing the characteristics and demographics of the applicants to and participants of the program. Both amendments were adopted, and the ordinance was unanimously recommended to the Full Board. It is scheduled to appear before the Board for its first read on June 14th.

Full Board

- 220461 Initiating Landmark Designation - Turk and Taylor Streets Intersection. Sponsor: Preston. Adopted 220342 Planning Code - Fire-Damaged Liquor Stores in North Beach Neighborhood Commercial District. Sponsor: Peskin. Passed First Read

D. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

SPEAKERS: Georgia Schuttish – AB916
 Ozzie Rohm – Motions, 228 Vicksburg
 Eileen Boken – SB 9
 Francisco DeCosta – Invocation to the First People of SF
 Sue Hestor – Board of Appeals report on projects involving BMR units

E. REGULAR CALENDAR

The Commission Hearing Procedures provide for presentations by staff; when applicable, followed by a presentation of the project sponsor team; followed by public comment. Please be advised that the project sponsor team includes: the sponsor(s) or their designee, lawyers, architects, engineers, expeditors, and/or other advisors.

7. [2022-002926PCA](#) (A. MERLONE: (628) 652-7534)
AFFORDABLE HOUSING CODE ENFORCEMENT [BOARD FILE NO. 220262] – **Informational Presentation** – Presentation of the draft Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) between the Planning Department and the Mayor’s Office of Housing and Community Development (MOHCD). The MOU is required by a proposed ordinance (Board File No. 220262) that the Planning Commission approved on May 26, 2022, which would amend the Planning and Administrative Codes to allow the Zoning Administrator to delegate to MOHCD the enforcement and collection of penalties for certain violations of Planning Code provisions governing affordable housing.

Preliminary Recommendation: None – Informational

SPEAKERS: = Corey Teague – Staff report
 = Sue Hestor – Current situation on the Board of Appeals of BMR units

ACTION: Reviewed and Commented

8. [2019-023083CUA](#) (M. GIACOMUCCI: (628) 652-7414)
2955 MISSION STREET – east side between 25th and 26th Streets; Lot 025 in Assessor's Block 6528 (District 9) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 303 and 317 and Adoption of Findings Related to State Density Bonus pursuant to Planning Code Section 206.6 demolish an existing two-story mixed-use building containing one commercial unit and one owner-occupied residential unit, and construct a new six-story mixed-use building with a ground floor commercial unit and 18 residential units above, requesting waivers from Rear Yard (Planning Code Section 134), Dwelling Unit Exposure (Planning Code Section 140), and Building Height (Planning Code Section 260) within the Mission Street NCT (Neighborhood Commercial Transit) Zoning District and 40-X/65-B Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

(Continued from Canceled hearing on June 2, 2022)

- SPEAKERS: = Monica Giacomucci – Staff report
 + Josh Crandall – Project sponsor presentation
 + David Sternberg – Design presentation
 = Ozzy Rohm – Do the replacement units fall under SB 330
 = Jerry Dratler – Cal Act public meeting law
 - Speaker – Parking, privacy
 - Eric Arguello – Architectural design guidelines, concerns about the number of projects in Calle 24
 - Speaker - Project is highly detrimental to neighborhood
 - Speaker – Parking
 + Alexander – Support
 - Robert Fruchtman – Increase housing to the west side
 - Anastasia Yovanopoulos – Respect the voice of the community members asking for affordable housing
 = Rich Hillis – Response to comments and questions
 = Rich Sucre – Response to comments and questions
 = Kirsten Jensen – Response to comments and questions
- ACTION: Approved with Conditions, including: recognizing elements of the MOU as a Finding; and encouraging the Sponsor to review the design of the ground floor nested bedroom unit.
- AYES: Ruiz, Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Koppel, Moore, Tanner
- MOTION: 21124

9. [2021-001866CUA](#) (M. DITO: (628) 652-7358)
246-250 ALMA STREET – north side between Stanyan and Shrader Streets; Lot 051 in Assessor’s Block 1282 (District 8) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Section 303 and 317 for the removal of a dwelling unit via residential merger. The subject property is a three-story, three-family dwelling. Each dwelling unit is a residential flat that occupies an entire floor. The project proposes to remove the second floor flat. The first and third floor dwelling units are proposed to expand into the second floor, with each occupying half of the floor. The building will be reduced from three to two dwelling units. An Accessory Dwelling Unit is proposed in an existing accessory structure in the rear to replace the removed dwelling unit. The project also requires Planning Commission review for the removal of a residential flat, pursuant to Planning Commission Resolution No. 20024. The project site is located within a RH-2 (Residential, House – Two-Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions
 (Continued from Canceled hearing on June 2, 2022)

- SPEAKERS: = Matt Dito – Staff report
 + Serina Calhoun – Project sponsor presentation
 - Jerry Dratler – Unit merger, 2010 shed building permit
 - Ozzy Rohm – Problems that exist, removing unit
 - Anastasia Yovanopoulos – Resolution No. 20024
 = Rich Hillis – Response to comments and questions
 = Liz Watty – Response to comments and questions

ACTION: Approved with Conditions as amended to include holding issuance of the BPA for merger, until such time the BPA for the ADU has been issued.
 AYES: Diamond, Fung, Koppel, Tanner
 NAYS: Ruiz, Imperial, Moore
 MOTION: 21125

F. DISCRETIONARY REVIEW CALENDAR

The Commission Discretionary Review Hearing Procedures provide for presentations by staff; followed by the DR requestor team; followed by public comment opposed to the project; followed by the project sponsor team; followed by public comment in support of the project. Please be advised that the DR requestor and project sponsor teams include: the DR requestor and sponsor or their designee, lawyers, architects, engineers, expeditors, and/or other advisors.

10. [2020-009808DRP](#) (D. WINSLOW: (628) 652-7335)
45 CRAGMONT AVENUE – west side near Quintara Street; Lot 004 in Assessor's Block 2131A (District 7) – Request for **Discretionary Review** of Building Permit No. 2020.0923.4777 to construct a rear horizontal and fourth-story vertical addition to an existing three-story, one-family residence within RH-1 (Residential House, One-Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04](#)(h).
Preliminary Recommendation: Do Not Take Discretionary Review and Approve

SPEAKERS: = Trent Greenan – Staff report
 - Yet Mui – DR requestor
 + Steve Geisler – Project sponsor
 = Robert Fruchtman – Advocate to eliminate DRs
 - Mary – Oppose to the 4th floor addition
 = Yonathan Randolph – Guidelines on DRs

ACTION: No DR
 AYES: Ruiz, Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Koppel, Moore, Tanner
 DRA: 787

G. SPECIAL CALENDAR

11. [2019-016230ENV](#) (E. WHITE: (628) 652-7557)
HOUSING ELEMENT 2022 UPDATE ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT (EIR) – Hearing on the **Draft EIR** – The Planning Department proposes to update the 2014 Housing Element of the San Francisco General Plan. The EIR evaluates the physical impacts on the environment that could result from adoption and implementation of the Housing Element Update. The Housing Element Update would establish goals, policies, and actions to address existing and future housing needs, including the regional housing targets allocated to San Francisco for the 2023–2031 cycle. The Housing Element Update would also include policies designed to improve housing affordability and advance racial and social equity. The proposed policies and actions would guide development patterns and the allocation of resources to San Francisco neighborhoods. In general, the proposed Housing Element Update would shift an increased share of the city's future housing growth to transit corridors and low-density residential districts within well-resourced areas. Well-resourced areas are high- and highest-resource areas, which are neighborhoods identified by the

State of California that provide strong economic, health, and educational outcomes for its residents. The Housing Element Update would not include specific changes to existing land use controls (e.g., zoning) or approve any physical development (e.g., construction of housing or infrastructure). However, the EIR assumes that adoption of the proposed housing element update would lead to such actions in the future as necessary to implement the proposed goals, policies, and actions. Future implementation of the proposed housing element update may also include the designation of housing sustainability districts that would streamline review and approval of residential and mixed-use residential development. **Public comment for this DEIR is from April 20, 2022 till 5PM on June 21, 2022.**

Preliminary Recommendation: Review and comment

- SPEAKERS:
- = Rich Hillis – Introduction
 - = Lisa Gibson – Staff presentation
 - = Liz White – Staff presentation
 - = Kirsten Jensen – Response to comments and questions
 - Georgia Schuttish - Preservation alternative, CUs for demolitions
 - Jonathan – Higher growth alternatives
 - Eileen Boken – Mandatory water rationing, increase weather conditions
 - Tom – Evaluate impacts to displacements
 - Anastasia Yovanopoulos – Thoroughly evaluate the impacts of policies
 - Robert Fruchtman – Not a realistic EIR
 - Zach Weisenberger – Encourages demolition and displacements, report is inadequate
 - Joseph – Impacts of policies, not centered on Racial and Social Equity
 - Chantal – Does not benefit low income
 - Sue Hestor – Gentrification, should have more days to comment
 - Francisco De Costa – Focus on quality of life issue
 - Adam – Take impacts into account to add new housing, affordable housing
 - Angelica Cabande – Evaluate the impacts of policies
 - Tes Welborn – Must be explored further
 - = Chris Kern – Response to comments
 - Gwyneth – Concerns and impacts in Japantown
 - Bruce Wolfe – Evaluate the impacts
- ACTION: Reviewed and Commented

ADJOURNMENT 4:56 PM
ADOPTED JUNE 23, 2022