SAN FRANCISCO
PLANNING COMMISSION

Meeting Minutes
Remote Hearing
via video and teleconferencing

Thursday, November 12, 2020
1:00 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Tanner, Chan, Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Moore, Koppel
COMMISSIONERS ABSENT: None

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT KOPPEL AT 1:27 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Claudine Asbagh, Rachel Schuett, Jorgen Cleemann, Katie Wilborn, Joy Navarrete, Rachna Ahuja, Sharon Young, Justin Grevling, Stephanie Cisneros, David Winslow, Rich Sucre, Corey Teague – Zoning Administrator, Rich Hillis – Planning Director, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:
+ indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
= indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. CONSIDERATION OF ITEMS PROPOSED FOR CONTINUANCE

The Commission will consider a request for continuance to a later date. The Commission may choose to continue the item to the date proposed below, to continue the item to another date, or to hear the item on this calendar.

1. 2012.0640OFA-2 (L. HOAGLAND: (628) 652-7320)
598 BRANNAN STREET – northeast intersection of 5th and Brannan Streets, Lots 045, 050, 051 & 052 on Assessor’s Block 3777 (District 6) – Request for an Office Development Authorization, pursuant to Planning Code Sections 321, 322 and 848, for Phase 2 or approximately 211,601 gross square feet of office use of the approved project at 598
Brannan Street, which was authorized by the Planning Commission on June 6, 2019 (See Planning Commission Motion Nos. 20459 and 20460). Phase 2 includes new construction of a mixed-use office building reaching a height of 150 feet (170 ft. to top of rooftop mechanical screening), located mid-block on Bryant Street, with 211,601 square feet of office use, 11,054 square feet of combined retail and PDR and 5,546 square feet of child care facility. Overall, the approved project included demolition of the existing four buildings and new construction of three new mixed-use/office buildings and one new residential building with a total of 922,737 square feet of office use, approximately 65,322 square feet of PDR/retail use, 5,546 square feet of child care use, 63,824 square feet of residential use, approximately 200 off-street below-grade parking spaces, and approximately 19,336 square feet of privately-owned public open space (POPOS). The project site is located within the Central SoMa Mixed-Use Office Zoning District, Central SoMa Special Use District, Western SoMa Eastern Neighborhoods and 40-X, 50-X, 130-X and 160-CS Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 31.04(h).

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions
(Proposed for Continuance to December 3, 2020)

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Continued to December 3, 2020
AYES: Tanner, Chan, Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Moore, Koppel

2. 2019-013951CUA
X. LIANG: (628) 652-7316
224-228 CLARA STREET – north side of Clara Street between 5th and 6th Streets; Lots 062 and 063 in Assessor’s Block 3753 (District 6) – Request for Conditional Use Authorization, pursuant to Planning Code Sections 303 and 317, to demolish a single-family residential building at 228 Clara Street and construct a five-story residential building at 224 and 228 Clara Streets (measuring approximately 13,265 gross square feet) with nine dwelling units and nine Class 1 bicycle parking spaces within a MUR (Mixed Use Residential) Zoning District, SoMa Youth and Family Special Use District, Central SoMa Special Use District, and 45-X Height and Bulk District. The Project also proposes the merger of Lots 062 and 063. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 31.04(h).
(Proposed for Continuance to December 10, 2020)

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Continued to December 10, 2020
AYES: Tanner, Chan, Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Moore, Koppel

3. 2016-012135CUA
G. PANTOJA: (628) 652-7380
2214 CAYUGA AVENUE AND 3101 ALEMANy BOULEVARD – between Sickles Avenue and Regent Street; Lots 001 and 034 in Assessor’s Block 7146 (District 11) – Request for a Conditional Use Authorization pursuant to Planning Code Sections 303, 317, and 710 for the demolition of an existing two-story, single family residence and the construction of four new four-story, 40-foot, residential buildings containing a total of seven dwelling units, approximately 15,196 square feet in area, and seven Class 1 bicycle parking spaces within a NC-1 (Neighborhood Commercial, Cluster) and 40-X Height and Bulk District. This
action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 31.04(h).

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions
(Continued from Regular hearing on October 29, 2020)
(Proposed for Continuance to January 14, 2021)

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Continued to January 14, 2021
AYES: Tanner, Chan, Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Moore, Koppel

13. 2020-007450DRP-02 (D. WINSLOW: (628) 652-7335)
428 LIBERTY STREET – between Sanchez and Rayburn Streets; Lot 036 in Assessor’s Block 3604 (District 8) – Request for Discretionary Review of Building Permit 2020.0812.1624 to correct existing building height dimensions from 29’-4” to 27’-10” measured to the midpoint of the existing sloped roof – resulting in a discrepancy of 2’-9” from the approved Building Permit #201710242502 to construct a third-floor vertical addition, and a rear horizontal addition to an existing one-family residential building within a RH-1 [Residential-House, One Family] Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 31.04(h).
Preliminary Recommendation: Do Not Take Discretionary Review and Approve

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Withdrawn
B. COMMISSION MATTERS

5. Commission Comments/Questions

Commissioner Moore:
I wanted to strongly encourage everybody to participate in Monday’s invitation for a noontime presentation by Director William Gilchrist, Planning Director of the City of Oakland. He will speak on a matter that I personally found fascinating hearing his presentation at an earlier AIA presentation in September. It is a perfect answer to how cities deal with the racial and social equity and I strongly encourage you if you have time to dial in to that presentation.

C. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

6. Director’s Announcements

None

7. Review of Past Events at the Board of Supervisors, Board of Appeals and Historic Preservation Commission

Rich Sucre:
Good afternoon Commissioners, on behalf of Aaron Starr Manager of Legislative Affairs.

Planning Commission
This week there were no planning items at the land use committee.

Full Board

At the Full Board, the Board passed on first read the landmark designation for the History of Medicine in California Frescos at the UCSF Parnassus campus.

- 200942 Hearing - Appeal of Conditional Use Authorization Disapproval - 552-554 Hill Street. Staff: Campbell. Special Order 3:00 PM, Items 14-17

Next, the Board again continued the CU appeal for 552-554 Hill Street at the request of the project sponsor to December 15, the very last Board hearing of the year.

- 200137 Hearing - Appeal of Final Mitigated Negative Declaration - Proposed Project at 2417 Green Street. Special Order 3:00 PM, Items 18-21

The Board did take up the CEQA appeal of the final mitigated negative declaration for 2417 Green Street. This project included a horizontal and vertical additions and the addition of an ADU to an existing single-family home.
This project has a long history. A categorical exemption for the project was appealed to the Board in January of 2018 and upheld in order to require additional review of historic resource and hazardous materials impacts. The Department reopened the analysis, and in June of 2019 issued a mitigated negative declaration that included a mitigation measure requiring ongoing coordination and monitoring by the Planning Department during DBI’s review. The Preliminary MND was appealed to you and upheld on January 9th of this year. After you took DR and approved the project on July 16th, the final MND was appealed to the Board.

During the Board hearing, the appellant and about half a dozen neighbors who spoke during public comment raised the same issues that were raised in previous appeals: Those issues included (1) structural impacts to the adjacent historic foundation at 2421 Green Street – also known as the Coxhead House - during project construction; (2) indirect historic resource impacts on the Coxhead House; and (3) impacts related to the potential release of hazardous materials. Staff emphasized compliance with the building code and the additional oversight provided by the mitigation measure. Nonetheless, Board members unanimously voted to return the project to the Planning Department for additional CEQA analysis, citing concerns related to slope stability, hazardous materials, historical resources, and the history of permit violations at the project site.

This decision by the Board voids your approval of the building permit made at the DR hearing. City attorneys are currently working with the Board to prepare CEQA findings that will determine the additional analysis required.

- **201112** Hearing - Appeal of Statutory Exemption from Environmental Review - Proposed SFMTA’s COVID-19 Muni Bus Service Adjustments and Associated Stop, Street and Parking Changes - August 22, 2020 Project. Special Order 3:00 PM, Items 22-25

- **201116** Hearing - Appeal of Statutory Exemption from Environmental Review - Proposed MTA’s COVID-19 Muni Rail Service Adjustments and Associated Street and Parking Changes - August 22, 2020, and Fall 2020 Project. Special Order 3:00 PM, Items 26-29

The Board also considered the two other CEQA Appeals, both statutory exemptions which were called together. One was for the SFMTA Muni Bus Service Adjustments and Associated Stop, Street and Parking Changes, and one for The SFMTA COVID-19 Muni Rail Service Adjustments and Associated Street and Parking Changes. These projects were not heard by the Planning Commission.

Both projects were determined to be statutorily exempt by the Planning Department under the emergency project and mass transit statutory exemptions, and both projects were approved administratively by the Director of Transit in August of this year.

The primary concerns raised by appellants included that the projects do not fit the definition of an emergency project or a mass transit project, and that there are potential significant cumulative impacts associated with the projects.
As explained in the Department’s response, both projects do qualify as emergency projects because they help mitigate an emergency by providing adequate space for people to social distance during a public health emergency. The projects also qualify as mass transit projects because they increase ridership capacity on existing transit lines.

Public comment in support of the appeal reflected the primary concerns raised by the appellants. There was also public comment in support of the projects. There were some questions by Supervisors, but they mainly had to do with MTA’s decision-making process, and not CEQA concerns. In the end the appeal request was unanimously denied by the Board.

**Introductions**

Finally last week the Mayor’s office introduced an ordinance amending the Planning Code to extend from January 1, 2021, to January 1, 2022, the sunset date for the provision allowing for the conversion of Medical Cannabis Dispensaries to a Cannabis Retail Use; Commissioners this is similar to an ordinance you reviewed last November that extended the date for conversions in Section 191. The reference in Section 190 should have also been amended at that time but was not included in the changes. Since you have already weighed in on this issue and the change is a minor correction staff is not planning on bringing this item to you for review and recommendation unless you direct me otherwise.

**D. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT**

**SPEAKERS:**

Georgia Schuttish – Extreme Alterations that should have been reviewed as Tantamount to Demolition have particular characteristics like maximum vertical and horizon expansions along with facade changes or facade obliteration….often with invasive roof decks, not necessary for open space requirements. The windows change, particularly on the rear facade with walls of glass having an impact on the rear yard mid-block open space. Also these projects have full lot excavations which eliminate carbon capturing and tree canopy. This exterior design translates into the interior design with an inefficient use of space with kitchens overwhelming the main living level. No hallways, no light wells, no discrete rooms for living. Bedroom number becomes extra square footage for sale. This is housing that does not comply with the intentions of Section 317 to preserve existing housing and relative affordability and is contrary to the City’s housing policies and is questionable in the age of COVID.

Ozzie Rohm – Follow up on public’s questions regarding ADU ordinance

Bruce Bowen – Follow through with questions brought forward regarding ADU ordinance

John Goldsmith – Historic preservation of the Castro Metro Muni station

**E. REGULAR CALENDAR**

The Commission Hearing Procedures provide for presentations by staff; followed by the project sponsor team; followed by public comment for and against the proposal. Please be advised that the project sponsor team includes: the sponsor(s) or their designee, lawyers, architects, engineers, expediters, and/or other advisors.
8. 2017-014833PRJ  
(C. ASBAGH: (628) 652-7329)  
469 STEVENSON STREET – south side of Stevenson Street, Lot 045 in Assessor’s Block 3704 (District 6) – Informational Presentation on a project that would demolish the existing surface parking lot and construct a new 27-story mixed-use building that is approximately 274 feet tall (with an additional 10 feet for rooftop mechanical equipment). The proposed project would total approximately 535,000 gross square feet and include 495 dwelling units, approximately 4,000 square feet of commercial retail use on the ground floor. 
_Preliminary Recommendation: None – Informational_

SPEAKERS:  
= Claudine Asbagh – Staff report  
+ Lou Vasquez – Project sponsor  
+ Corey Smith – Excited to continue the process moving forward  
+ Speaker – Approve more projects like this  
- John Elberling – Inclusionary housing, EIR, racial and social equity impact  
+ Paul Lachreft – Would love to partner with the project regards to energy  
- Alex Lansberg – Racial and social equity impact  
+ Sarah Ogilve – Strong interest with this project, density  
+ Sam Doich – Win win project, housing delayed is housing denied  
= Heidi Petersen – Reconsider amount of parking spaces  
+ Steve Marza – Excellent development  
- David Woo – Within SoMa Filipinas Cultural District, racial and social equity analysis needs to be done, gentrification impacts  
= Leona – Access to public transportation

ACTION: None – Informational

9. 2014.1036E  
(R. SCHUETT: (628) 652-7546)  
447 BATTERY STREET – Review and Comment on the Draft Environmental Impact Report  
– The project site is located at the northwest corner of Battery and Merchant streets on the block bounded by Washington, Sansome, Battery and Clay streets, Assessor’s Block 0206, Lot 002 (District 3). The proposed project would demolish most of the existing three-story, 45-foot-tall, 25,180 gross-square-foot (gsf) building, built in 1907, which is currently occupied by office and retail uses and is individually eligible for the listing on the California Register of Historical Resources. The proposed project would retain the existing building façade; replacing the internal structure; and construct an addition to create a new 18-story, 200-foot-tall hotel with 198 hotel rooms on 16 floors, a ground-floor lobby and restaurant and a second restaurant on the 18th floor. Four below-grade basement levels would contain conference rooms, mechanical equipment, a loading area, and 24 vehicle and 32 bicycle parking spaces with access provided via a new driveway on Merchant Street. A new privately owned public open space (POPOS) and streetscape improvements would be provided along Merchant Street. The project site is within the Downtown Office (C-3-O) Use District and 200-S Height and Bulk District. 
_Preliminary Recommendation: Review and Comment_

SPEAKERS:  
= Rachel Schuett – Staff presentation  
= Cynthia Gomez – Request clarifications on shadow impact, number of employees  
= Alex Lansberg – Land use issue, hospitality industry  
= Katherin Petrin – Historical significance
10. **2019-017837CUA**

1812-1816 GREEN STREET – north side of Green Street near the intersection of Octavia Street; Lot 007 in Assessor’s Block 0543 (District 2) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization**, pursuant to Planning Code Sections 209.1, 303, and 317, to legalize the merger of two residential units into a single-family dwelling located within a RH-2 (Residential – House, Two-Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. The Project has not undergone environmental review, as the Department is recommending disapproval of the application, CEQA review is not required to deny a project. Should the Commission wish to approve the Project, environmental review will be required.

**Preliminary Recommendation: Disapprove**

**SPEAKERS:**
- Katie Wilborn – Staff presentation
- Adrian Dollard – Project sponsor
- Kristen Jensen – City attorney

**ACTION:** After a Motion to Disapprove was made and seconded, a Motion to Continue to February 11, 2021 failed +3 - 4 (Chan, Imperial, Moore, Koppel against); the original Motion to Disapprove was adopted.

**AYES:** Chan, Imperial, Moore, Koppel

**NAYS:** Tanner, Diamond, Fung

**MOTION:**

11. **2019-017867CUA**

1566 - 1568 HAIGHT STREET – north side between Clayton and Ashbury Streets; Lot 017 in Assessor’s Block 1231 (District 5) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 719, 303, and 178(e)(2) to legalize the merger of two ground floor commercial spaces of an existing restaurant and bar d.b.a. Michael Collins Irish Bar & Restaurant of approximately 3,650 square feet of floor area, modify the conditions of approval from prior conditional use authorizations, legalize facade and interior modifications, and to add an entertainment use (if desired by current and future tenants at a future date) to the existing restaurant and bar. There will be no expansion of the existing building envelope or storefront modifications proposed under the current Project. The project site is located within the Haight Street Neighborhood Commercial Zoning District, Haight Street Alcohol Restricted Use Subdistrict, Fringe Financial Service Restricted Use District, and 40-X Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 31.04(h).

**Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions**

(Continued from Regular hearing on October 29, 2020)

**SPEAKERS:**
- Sharon Young – Staff report
- Tricia Wray – Project sponsor
- Tes Welborn – Limit hours
- Speaker – Noise

**ACTION:** Approved with Conditions as amended by Staff including:
1. Limiting amplified music to 10 pm weeknights and to 2 am weekends (Fri and Sat nights); and
2. To continue working with Staff on sound proofing measures.

AYES: Tanner, Chan, Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Moore, Koppel

MOTION: 20809

F. DISCRETIONARY REVIEW CALENDAR

The Commission Discretionary Review Hearing Procedures provide for presentations by staff; followed by the DR requestor team; followed by public comment opposed to the project; followed by the project sponsor team; followed by public comment in support of the project. Please be advised that the DR requestor and project sponsor teams include: the DR requestor and sponsor or their designee, lawyers, architects, engineers, expediters, and/or other advisors.

12. 2020-000056DRP  (D. WINSLOW: (628) 652-7335)
695 RHODE ISLAND STREET – between 18th and 19th Streets; Lot 004C in Assessor’s Block 4031 (District 10) – Request for Discretionary Review of Building Permit 2019.1220.0232 to construct to a third-floor vertical addition, rear horizontal addition, and facade alterations including a new garage door and driveway of an existing two-story, two-unit residential building within a RH-2 (Residential House-Two Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 31.04(h).

Preliminary Recommendation: Do Not Take Discretionary Review and Approve

(Continued from Regular hearing on October 15, 2020)

SPEAKERS: = David Winslow – Staff report
- Dan Feldman – DR
+ Marc Dimalanta – Project sponsor
+ Warren Chang – Support
- Jamie Brown – Disrupts the current character of the street
+ Ivy Chu – Consistent with design guidelines
- Speaker – Height and depth, shadow
- Ashley – Oppose height addition

ACTION: No DR

AYES: Tanner, Chan, Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Moore, Koppel

DRA: 727

14a. 2016-012745DRP-04  (D. WINSLOW: (628) 652-7335)
311 28TH STREET – between Sanchez and Noe Streets; Lot 048 in Assessor’s Block 6613 (District 8) – Request for Discretionary Review of Building Permit 2016.0906.6865 to construct a new three-story over garage single-family residence at the front of the property. The rear cottage is vacant and has an approved building permit to renovate and expand the habitable space by removing the two-car parking garage at the ground level within a RH-2 (Residential House, Two-Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section 31.04(h).

Preliminary Recommendation: Take Discretionary Review and Approve with Modifications

SPEAKERS: = David Winslow – Staff report
- Mark Collins – DR 1
- Erik Scher – DR 2
- Doug Melton – DR 3
- Jane Oyugi – DR 4

Exceptional and extraordinary circumstances exist:

- Conceals a CEQA Category A Historical Resource from public right-of-way.
- Carriage house has fallen into disrepair.
- Massive 4-story is out of scale, creates shadows, blocks light and air.
- Egregious loss of privacy from side entrance and decks.
- Variance negatively impacts adjacent and surrounding homes.
- Doesn’t meet Secretary of Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Buildings/Sites. Shouldn’t an EIR be required?

26 letters of opposition were sent to Planning, Mr. Winslow said 22.
Plans show 3569sqft with garage, Sponsor’s architect said it was less than that.
Sponsors’ architect email on 11/2/20 said the neighboring buildings are not accurately represented in his drawings.
Maximum height of building should include parapets after the height is reduced per the Commission determination.
Request 8ft_setback all the way back on west side of the building to view historic resource.

+ Daniel Robinson – Project sponsor
= Stephanie Cisneros – Staff report
- Alexander – Out of proportion
- Speaker – Lack of outreach, out of scale
- Georgia Schuttish – Support Requests for DR. Submission in supporting the DRs is on pages 224-228 of the online packet.
- Shows importance of CCW Haun ART STONE which links all three properties particularly 311 and 313 28th Street.
- Beautiful work that hopefully will be preserved during construction but that is questionable.
- Look at photos on pages 227 - 228.
- The three trees that unfortunately were cut down in 2015 and could have provided 5 years+ of carbon capture are just like story poles.
- Illustrates shading impacts on 309 and 313 the two immediately adjacent properties.
- Illustrates the overwhelming impact the mass of the proposed 311 footprint will have light/air/privacy on both 309 and especially on 313.
- These trees were not as tall or as bulky/massive as the proposal at 311 but they show the need for mitigation.
- The fourth floor should be eliminated at this historic Noe Valley site.

- Ozzie Rohm – Type A historic resource
- Speaker – Out of proportion
- Speaker – Refuse the variance
- Amy – Oppose
- Speaker – 4th story inappropriate

= Justin Greving – Response to questions
= Corey Teague – Response to questions on the variance

ACTION: Took DR and Approved with Staff modifications as amended to include:
1. Overall reduction in height of three feet;  
2. Reduction of four feet in depth of lowest level;  
3. Elimination of all rear decks;  
4. Reduction in fenestration by 36-inches from the bottom;  
5. Retention of an unobstructed side setback; and  
6. Increased privacy landscaping between structures.

AYES: Tanner, Chan, Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Moore, Koppel  
DRA: 728

14b. **2016-012745VAR** (S. CISNEROS: (628) 652-7363)  
311 28TH STREET – south side of 28th Street between Noe and Sanchez Streets; Lot 048 in Assessor’s Block 6613 (District 8) – Request for a **Variance** to the rear yard requirements of Planning Code Section 134 and exposure requirements of Planning Code Section 140 to construct a 3-story-over-basement, 3,164 square foot single family residence with garage at the front portion of the lot within a RH-2 (Residential House, Two Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. The subject property is required to maintain a rear yard of approximately 19 feet, 3 inches. The rear 13 feet 5 inches of the proposed new construction will project into the required rear yard. The subject property is required to maintain minimum dimensions for dwelling units to front onto an open area. The proposal would result in the dwelling unit in the rear building fronting an area of only 15 feet by 25 feet.

SPEAKERS: Same as item 14a.  
ACTION: ZA closed the PH and indicated an intent to Grant with similar conditions to those of the CPC.

ADJOURNMENT 7:07 PM  
ADOPTED DECEMBER 3, 2020