

SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING COMMISSION



Meeting Minutes

Remote Hearing
via video and teleconferencing

Thursday, October 22, 2020
1:00 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Moore, Koppel
COMMISSIONERS ABSENT: Chan

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT KOPPEL AT 1:01 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Aaron Starr, Samantha Updegrave, Monica Giacomucci, Mary Woods, David Winslow, Corey Teague – Zoning Administrator, Rich Hillis – Planning Director, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. CONSIDERATION OF ITEMS PROPOSED FOR CONTINUANCE

The Commission will consider a request for continuance to a later date. The Commission may choose to continue the item to the date proposed below, to continue the item to another date, or to hear the item on this calendar.

1. 2020-003248PCA (V. FLORES: (628) 652-7525)
STATE-MANDATED ACCESSORY DWELLING UNIT CONTROLS [BF 201008] – Planning Code Amendments – Ordinance amending the Planning Code to clarify the ministerial approval process for certain Accessory Dwelling Units meeting certain requirements in single-family and multifamily buildings; affirming the Planning Department’s determination under the

California Environmental Quality Act; and making findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Modifications
(Proposed for Continuance to November 5, 2020)

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Continued to November 5, 2020
 AYES: Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Moore, Koppel
 ABSENT: Chan

- 2a. 2018-014357GPR (M. SNYDER: (628) 652- 7460)
MISSION BAY SOUTH REDEVELOPMENT PLAN AMENDMENTS – the Mission Bay South Redevelopment Project Area is generally bounded by Mariposa Street on the south, Interstate 280 on the west, Mission Creek on the north, and San Francisco Bay on the east (District 6) – **General Plan Conformity Findings** – Pursuant to Section 4.105 of the Charter and Section 2A.53 of the Administrative Code of the City and County of San Francisco, recommending General Plan conformity findings for an amendment to the Mission Bay South (MBS) Redevelopment Plan, that would increase the allowable amount of leasable square feet of commercial industrial use on MBS Parcel 7 of Block 43 (1450 Owens Street -- Lot 017 in Assessor’s Block 8709) specifically, and the MBS Plan Area in general; and increase the allowable FAR on MBS Parcel 7 of Block 43; and making Planning Code Section 101.1(b) findings. The Office of Community Investment and Infrastructure (OCII) is the lead agency for purposes of CEQA review of this project. The Planning Commission is a responsible agency under CEQA and will be relying on OCII’s CEQA decision for purposes of this action.
(Proposed for Continuance to November 19, 2020)

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Continued to November 19, 2020
 AYES: Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Moore, Koppel
 ABSENT: Chan

- 2b. 2018-014357OFA (M. SNYDER: (628) 652- 7460)
1450 OWENS STREET – located on the west side of Owens Street between A Street and Mission Bay Drive; Lot 017 in Assessor’s Block 8709 (District 6) – Request for an **Office Development Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 321 and 322 to authorize up to 49,999 square feet from the Office Development Annual Limit. The proposal would construct a new mixed-use life sciences facility consisting of up to approximately 131,000 gross square feet (gsf) of life science research and development (R&D) space, 49,998 gsf of office space, and 2,600 gsf of ground-floor retail space. The new building would be 109-foot tall excluding a 20-foot tall screen mechanical penthouse. The property is within the Mission Bay South (MBS) Redevelopment Project Area and is zoned Commercial Industrial (MBS Redevelopment Plan) and is within the HZ-7 Height Zone (MBS Design for Development) and making findings of consistency with the General Plan, and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1. The Office of Community Investment and Infrastructure (OCII) is the lead agency for purposes of CEQA review of this project. The Planning Commission is a responsible agency under CEQA and will be relying on OCII’s CEQA decision for purposes of this action.
(Proposed for Continuance to November 19, 2020)

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Continued to November 19, 2020
 AYES: Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Moore, Koppel
 ABSENT: Chan

- 3a. 2013.0511DNX (C. ALEXANDER: (628) 652-7334)
1125 MARKET STREET – located on the south side of Market Street between 7th and 8th Streets; Lot 047, in Assessor’s Block 3702 (District 6) – Request for **Downtown Project Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 210.2 and 309 to allow a project greater than 50,000 square feet of floor area within a C-3 Zoning District with exceptions for reduction of ground-level wind currents in C-3 Districts (Section 148) and reduction of sunlight on the public sidewalks (Section 146). The proposed project (“Project”) includes the construction of a new 12-story mixed-use hotel and office building reaching a roof height of up to 119-feet-tall (141-feet-tall inclusive of rooftop screening/mechanical equipment). The Project includes a total gross floor area of approximately 111,711 square feet, with approximately 99,626 gross square feet of hotel use (180 hotel guest rooms), 9,529 gross square feet of office use (coworking space), and approximately 2,556 gross square feet of restaurant/retail uses on the ground floor. The Project also includes 2,482 gross square feet of privately-owned public open space (POPOS) within the ground floor, 9 Class 1 and 19 Class 2 bicycle parking spaces for the hotel, office, and retail uses. The subject property is located within a C-3-G Zoning District and 120-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions
 (Continued from Regular hearing on September 10, 2020)
(Proposed for Continuance to December 3, 2020)

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Continued to December 3, 2020
 AYES: Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Moore, Koppel
 ABSENT: Chan

- 3b. 2013.0511CUA (C. ALEXANDER: (628) 652-7334)
1125 MARKET STREET – located on the south side of Market Street between 7th and 8th Streets; Lot 047, in Assessor’s Block 3702 (District 6) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 210.2 and 303 to allow a hotel use. The proposed project (“Project”) includes the construction of a new 12-story mixed-use hotel and office building reaching a roof height of up to 119-feet-tall (141-feet-tall inclusive of rooftop screening/mechanical equipment). The Project includes a total gross floor area of approximately 111,711 square feet, with approximately 99,626 gross square feet of hotel use (180 hotel guest rooms), 9,529 gross square feet of office use (coworking space), and approximately 2,556 gross square feet of restaurant/retail uses on the ground floor. The Project also includes 2,482 gross square feet of privately-owned public open space (POPOS) within the ground floor, 9 Class 1 and 19 Class 2 bicycle parking spaces for the hotel, office, and retail uses. The subject property is located within a C-3-G Zoning District and 120-X Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

(Continued from Regular hearing on September 10, 2020)
(Proposed for Continuance to December 3, 2020)

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Continued to December 3, 2020
 AYES: Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Moore, Koppel
 ABSENT: Chan

4. 2020-002440DRP (D. WINSLOW: (628) 652-7335)
56 SCENIC WAY – between 25th and 26th Avenues; Lot 011 in Assessor’s Block 1303 (District 2) – Request for **Discretionary Review** of Building Permit 2020.0213.4381 to add 41 s.f. to the rear deck at the 2nd floor and create a new 100 s.f. deck at the 3rd floor of an existing three-story, one-family residential building within a RH-1(D) [Residential-House, One Family - Detached) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).

Preliminary Recommendation: Do Not Take Discretionary Review and Approve
WITHDRAWN

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Withdrawn

B. COMMISSION MATTERS

5. Consideration of Adoption:
 • [Draft Minutes for October 8, 2020](#)

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Adopted
 AYES: Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Moore, Koppel
 ABSENT: Chan

6. Commission Comments/Questions

None

C. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

7. Director’s Announcements

Rich Hillis, Planning Director:

Good afternoon, Commissioners. I just wanted to give you a quick update on our budget. We had to submit a three month report to the Controller’s Office and they’re compiling a broader three month report for the City, but again, revenue’s not looking good. We’re projecting about a \$19 million shortfall in revenues. That’s on a total revenue budget of about \$45 million. Now this may change as they kind of – as we move forward in the year. There are two factors at play and they’re kind of driving this lower than expected. Phase 1 obviously is the economy and the downturn; we’re seeing less applications than in the prior year. Also, working with DBI and the Permit Center, because of COVID, we’ve limited

the number of permits we are actually taking in at the Permit Center. So that is leading to additional reduction in our revenue. So, we'll keep you – you know, we're working with DBI to try to expand the number of permits we take in on a daily basis. So, we're hoping that will help with our revenue numbers. And we'll certainly keep you apprised of that, but I wanted to give you a sense of where we are currently and what we projected to the Controller's Office. And that concludes my report.

8. Review of Past Events at the Board of Supervisors, Board of Appeals and Historic Preservation Commission

Aaron Starr, Manager of Legislative Affairs:

Good afternoon commissioners, Aaron Starr Manager of Legislative Affairs.

- 201138 Initiating Landmark Designation - Phyllis Lyon and Del Martin House. Sponsor: Mandelman. Staff: Boudreaux

At this week's Land Use, the Committee considered initiating the landmark designation for the Lyon Martin House. Although not significant for its architecture, the Lyon Martin house is significant for its place in Queer history as the long-time residence for Phillis Lyon and Del Martin, two pioneers in the movement for LGBTQ equality. This is just the initiation, and the landmark designation will need to go before the Historic Preservation Commission for review and approval, followed by another Land Use hearing and vote at the Board. The initiation was recommended to the Full Board as a committee report.

FULL Board

- 200997 Approving/Disapproving Conditional Use Authorization - 2001-37th Avenue. Items 7-9

At the Full Board this week, the Board once again considered the CU appeal for the field lights at St Ignatius. If you recall, two weeks ago the Board held a hearing on both the CEQA Appeal and the CU Appeal. The Board voted to deny the CEQA appeal but continued the CU appeal to the next Board hearing. This week, Supervisor Mar made a motion to amend the conditions on the CU and further restrict the usage of the lights.

One new condition requires that the Field lights may only be used Monday-Thursday and shall be dimmed no later than 8pm and turned off no later than 8:30pm. The Commission had this requirement at a ½ later, or 8:30 to turn down the lights, and 9:00 to turn them off.

Lights will still be allowed to operate 150 nights a year, as the Commission conditioned.

Supervisor Mar also proposed restrictions on sound systems or amplified sound, stating that they shall not be used past 7:30 pm. The Commission restricted the sound system to 9:30 pm.

Supervisor Mar did include exceptions to these limitations, as did the commission. Those exceptions state that for no more than 15 evenings per year, the lights may remain on until 10:00pm on any day of the week except Sunday. Events must end by 9:30pm and lights

shall be dimmed by 9:30pm. The Commission allowed 20 evening per year and for the lights to be off by 10 with no specified dimming requirement.

Finally, Supervisor Mar included a provision that events must be hosted by the Project Sponsor serving primarily St. Ignatius students and those from opposing teams. The Commission allowed some of these events to be hosted by affiliates of SI.

These modifications were accepted and the Board voted unanimously to amend the CU.

- 200908 Hearing - Appeal of Determination of Exemption From Environmental Review - Proposed Department of Public Health - Local Oversight Program Site No. 12076 Investigation/Remediation Project (1776 Green Street). Special Order 3:00 PM, Items 24-27
- 200137 Hearing - Appeal of Final Mitigated Negative Declaration - Proposed Project at 2417 Green Street. Special Order 3:00 PM. Items 28-31

The Board continued both CEQA Appeals for 1776 Green Street and 2417 Green Street to November 17th.

- 201138 Initiating Landmark Designation - Phyllis Lyon and Del Martin House] Sponsor: Mandelman. Staff: Boudreaux. Item 35

Finally, the Board voted unanimously to initiate the landmark designation for the Lyon Dell House.

Jonas P. Ionin, Commission Secretary:

Thank you, Aaron. I see no questions from the Commissioners so I will move on to the report from the Historic Preservation Commission. There's no report from the Board of Appeals. The Historic Preservation Commission did meet yesterday and they adopted recommendations for approval of several Legacy Business Registry applicants. First, being Secret Studios on Cesar Chavez, Washington Vegetable on Jerrold Avenue, Iyengar Yoga Association of Northern California on Sutter Street, Munroe Motors on Valencia Street, Don Ramon's Mexican Restaurant on 11th street and Fior d'Italia on Mason Street. It then initiated landmark designation of the Japanese YWCA, the Issei Women's Building on Sutter Street. That concludes my report for the Historic Preservation Commission and seeing no questions from the commissioners, we can move on to general public comment.

D. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

SPEAKERS: Georgia Schuttish – Timelines for demolition legislation

E. REGULAR CALENDAR

The Commission Hearing Procedures provide for presentations by staff; followed by the project sponsor team; followed by public comment for and against the proposal. Please be advised that the project sponsor team includes: the sponsor(s) or their designee, lawyers, architects, engineers, expeditors, and/or other advisors.

9. [2019-002900IMP](#) (S. UPDEGRAVE: (628) 652-7322)
1145 MARKET STREET – Informational Presentation – located between 7th Street and 8th Street; Lot 044 in Assessor’s Block 3702 (District 6) – submittal of the first **Abbreviated Institutional Master Plan**, pursuant to Planning Code Section 304.5, for the Minerva Schools at the Keck Graduate Institute. This is an informational item and no action is required. However, the Planning Commission has the discretion under Planning Code Section 304.5(d) to hold or not hold a public hearing on an Abbreviated IMP. If the Commission requests a hearing, it will be scheduled for a later date. The subject property is located within the Downtown General (C-3-G) Zoning District and 120-X Height and Bulk District. The Abbreviated IMP is not a “Project” under a California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Sections 15060(c) and 15378 because there is no direct or indirect physical change in the environment.

Preliminary Recommendation: None - Informational

SPEAKERS: = Samantha Updegrave – Staff report
 + Teri Cannon – Project sponsor
 ACTION: Closed the Public Hearing

- 10a. [2017-011878OFA](#) (M. GIACOMUCCI: (628) 652-7414)
420 23RD STREET (POTRERO POWER STATION) – located on the north side of 23rd Street west of Illinois Street; Lot 017 in Assessor’s Block 4175 (District 10) – Request for an **Office Development Authorization** pursuant to Planning Code Sections 321 and 322 to authorize up to 403,750 square feet from the Office Development Annual Limit. The proposal would rehabilitate the existing approximately 65-foot tall Station A and construct a six-story vertical addition, resulting in an 11-story building with 76 Class 1 bicycle parking spaces, 10 Class 2 bicycle parking spaces, 24 lockers, and four showers. The property is within the PPS-MU (Potrero Power Station Mixed Use) Zoning District, the Potrero Power Station Special Use District, and 65-PPS/240-PPS Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: = Monica Giacomucci – Staff report
 + Enrique Landa – Project sponsor
 + Jason Frantzen – Architect
 + Keith Goldstein – Exceeds community expectations
 + Allison Heath – Protection for Station A, unique landmark
 + Bruce Huie – Support
 + Speaker – Local 2 in support of project
 = Victoria Fong – How do local businesses get involve
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Moore, Koppel
 ABSENT: Chan
 MOTION: [20801](#)

- 10b. [2017-011878PHA-02](#) (M. GIACOMUCCI: (628) 652-7414)
420 23RD STREET (POTRERO POWER STATION) – located on the north side of 23rd Street west of Illinois Street; Lot 017 in Assessor’s Block 4175 (District 10) – Request for a **Major Modification** to the Off-Street Loading requirements pursuant to Planning Code Section 249.87 and adopted within the Development Agreement. The proposal would rehabilitate the existing approximately 65-foot tall Station A and construct a six-story vertical addition,

resulting in an 11-story building with a 33-foot entrance to two off-street loading spaces on the property's Georgia Lane frontage. The property is within the PPS-MU (Potrero Power Station Mixed Use) Zoning District, the Potrero Power Station Special Use District, and 65-PPS/240-PPS Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: Same as item 10a.
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Moore, Koppel
 ABSENT: Chan
 MOTION: [20802](#)

11. [2014.0734CUA](#) (M. WOODS: (628) 652-7350)
1950 PAGE STREET – north side between Stanyan and Shrader Streets, Lot 010 of Assessor's Block 1227 (District 5) – Request for **Conditional Use Authorization**, pursuant to Planning Code Sections 209.2, 303, and 304, for a Planned Unit Development (PUD) to legalize the change of use from a community facility (formerly the Boys & Girls Club of San Francisco) to a performing arts school (San Francisco Middle School of the Arts & San Francisco High School of the Arts) for Grades 6 through 12, up to 250 students within a RM-2 (Residential, Mixed, Moderate Density) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District. The proposal would add a new 3rd floor level consisting of classrooms and seven group housing units for teachers and visiting artists and a 2nd floor horizontal addition to the existing 2-story building. The building area would increase from approximately 31,000 square feet to 54,700 square feet. The proposal would include 25 classrooms, 7 vehicle parking spaces, 103 Class 1 bicycle parking spaces, and 28 Class 2 bicycle parking spaces. The project is requesting PUD modifications of the floor area ratio (Planning Code Section 124), front setback (Planning Code Section 132), rear yard (Planning Code Section 134), and dwelling unit exposure (Planning Code Section 140) requirements. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions
 (Continued from Regular hearing on October 8, 2020)
Note: On October 8, 2020, after hearing and closing public comment, continued to October 22, 2020 by a vote of +6 -0.

SPEAKERS: = Mary Woods – Staff report
 + Larry Badiner – Project sponsor
 - Karl Russo –
 - Speaker – Timeframe rushed through
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions as Amended by Staff
 AYES: Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Moore, Koppel
 ABSENT: Chan
 MOTION: [20803](#)

F. DISCRETIONARY REVIEW CALENDAR

The Commission Discretionary Review Hearing Procedures provide for presentations by staff; followed by the DR requestor team; followed by public comment opposed to the project; followed by the project sponsor team; followed by public comment in support of the project. Please be

advised that the DR requestor and project sponsor teams include: the DR requestor and sponsor or their designee, lawyers, architects, engineers, expeditors, and/or other advisors.

- 12a. [2019-005728DRP](#) (D. WINSLOW: (628) 652-7335)
945-947 MINNESOTA STREET – between 20th and 22nd Streets; Lot 018 in Assessor's Block 4107 (District 10) – Request for **Discretionary Review** of Building Permit 2019.1003.3468 to replace damaged façade stairs, entry doors, and all windows; replace all clapboard siding; infill below existing conforming habitable space and; create new rear decks at 3rd floor and roof of an existing three-story, two-unit residential building within a RH-3 [Residential-House, Three Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District within the Dogpatch Article 10 Landmark District. This action constitutes the Approval Action for the project for the purposes of CEQA, pursuant to San Francisco Administrative Code Section [31.04\(h\)](#).
Preliminary Recommendation: Do Not Take Discretionary Review and Approve

SPEAKERS: = David Winslow – Staff report
 - Spencer Gosch – DR presentation
 + Suheil Shatara – Project sponsor
 = Monica Giacomucci – Response to questions

ACTION: No DR
 AYES: Diamond, Fung, Imperial, Moore, Koppel
 ABSENT: Chan
 DRA: [726](#)

- 12b. [2019-005728VAR](#) (M. GIACOMUCCI: (628) 652-7414)
945-947 MINNESOTA STREET – east side of Minnesota Street between 20th and 22nd Streets, Lot 018 in Assessor's Block 4107 (District 10) – Request for a **Variance** from the rear yard requirement under Section 134 of the Planning Code to construct a rear stair, spiral stair, 3rd floor deck, and roof deck within the required rear yard area. The subject property is located within a RH-3 [Residential-House, Three Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District within the Dogpatch Article 10 Landmark District.

SPEAKERS: = Same as item 12a.
 ACTION: ZA Closed the PH and indicated an intent to Grant

ADJOURNMENT 2:41 PM
 ADOPTED NOVEMBER 5, 2020