



SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Executive Summary

Policy and Planning Amendment

HEARING DATE: JUNE 11, 2020

1650 Mission St.
Suite 400
San Francisco,
CA 94103-2479

Reception:
415.558.6378

Fax:
415.558.6409

Planning
Information:
415.558.6377

Project Name: **Centering Planning on Racial and Social Equity**
Case Number: **2016-003351CWP**
Staff Contact: Miriam Chion, Housing and Community Equity Manager
miriam.chion@sfgov.org (415) 575-9124
Reviewed by: Rich Hillis, Planning Department Director
Recommendation: **Adopt the Resolution**

PROPOSED POLICY AND PLANNING AMENDMENT

In the context of the recent displays of institutional and structural racism and white supremacy, and the responding popular outcries for deep and lasting transformation, the Planning Department Staff prepared a Resolution requested by the Planning Commission to consider and adopt regarding the centering of the Planning Department's work program and resource allocation on racial and social equity. The Resolution acknowledges and apologizes for the history of inequitable Planning policies resulting in racial disparities; directs the Planning Department to implement its Racial and Social Equity Action Plan; directs the Planning Department to develop proactive strategies to address structural and institutional racism in collaboration with Black and American Indian communities and Communities of Color; directs the Planning Department to amend its hiring and promotion practices to ensure the Department's staff reflects the diversity and demographics of the community at all staff levels; recommends that the Board of Supervisors condemn discriminatory government actions; and directs the Planning Department to build accountability through metrics and reporting.

Attachments:

Exhibit A: Draft Planning Commission Resolution



SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

1650 Mission St.
Suite 400
San Francisco,
CA 94103-2479

Reception:
415.558.6378

Fax:
415.558.6409

Planning
Information:
415.558.6377

Draft Planning Commission Resolution Centering Planning on Racial and Social Equity

HEARING DATE: JUNE 11, 2020

<i>Project Name:</i>	Racial & Social Equity Initiative
<i>Case Number:</i>	2016-003351CWP
<i>Staff Contact:</i>	Miriam Chion, Housing and Community Equity Manager miriam.chion@sfgov.org ; 415-575-9124
<i>Reviewed by:</i>	Rich Hillis, Director Planning Department

RESOLUTION CENTERING THE PLANNING DEPARTMENT'S WORK PROGRAM AND RESOURCE ALLOCATION ON RACIAL AND SOCIAL EQUITY; ACKNOWLEDGING AND APOLOGIZING FOR THE HISTORY OF INEQUITABLE PLANNING POLICIES THAT HAVE RESULTED IN RACIAL DISPARITIES; DIRECTING THE DEPARTMENT TO IMPLEMENT ITS RACIAL AND SOCIAL EQUITY ACTION PLAN; DIRECTING THE DEPARTMENT TO DEVELOP PROACTIVE STRATEGIES TO ADDRESS STRUCTURAL AND INSTITUTIONAL RACISM, IN COLLABORATION WITH BLACK, AMERICAN INDIAN AND COMMUNITIES OF COLOR; DIRECTING THE DEPARTMENT TO AMEND ITS HIRING AND PROMOTION PRACTICES TO ENSURE THAT THE DEPARTMENT'S STAFF REFLECTS THE DIVERSITY AND DEMOGRAPHICS OF THE COMMUNITY AT ALL STAFF LEVELS; RECOMMENDING THAT THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS CONDEMN DISCRIMINATORY GOVERNMENT ACTIONS; AND, DIRECTING THE DEPARTMENT TO BUILD ACCOUNTABILITY THROUGH METRICS AND REPORTING.

PREAMBLE

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission has reflected on the current events of COVID-19 and its disproportionate effects on American Indian communities, Black communities, and communities of color; the murders of George Floyd, Breonna Taylor, Ahmaud Arbery, Alex Nieto, Mario Woods, Luis Góngora Pat, and countless others as a result of police brutality and misconduct; and underlying government and economic structures that create the platform for these events; and

WHEREAS, the San Francisco Human Rights Commission states that racial equity means the systematic fair treatment of people of all Races that results in equal outcomes, while recognizing the historical context and systemic harm done to specific racial groups; and,

WHEREAS, San Francisco has a long history of creating and/or enforcing laws, policies, and institutions that have promoted white supremacy and perpetuated racial inequities in the City and County of San Francisco ("the City"), much of which is difficult to document due to historical erasure. The conditions that have created such racial inequities are also compounded by the intersection of race with class, gender,

sexuality, immigration status, disability, and other social identities and experiences that result in inequitable treatment or opportunities; and,

WHEREAS, using the power of zoning and land use, the City, its Planning Department ("Department") and other government agencies and private organizations have intentionally advanced policies aligned with white supremacy to segregate, displace, dispossess and extract wealth from Black communities, the American Indian community, and other communities of color. With the acknowledgement that this list is by no means exhaustive, examples include but are not limited to the following: Our history of state-sanctioned racism began with the genocide, exploitation, and dispossession of resources of the American Indian people on whose land our state and nation were founded. The City's 1870 Cubic Air Ordinance and 1880 Laundry Ordinance targeted the Chinese population using appeals of public safety to limit where they could live and work. Starting in the 1930s, Federal policies like redlining and local practices like racial covenants explicitly blocked American Indians, Black people and people of color from loans for homeownership and maintenance, as well as access to neighborhoods with good services and jobs; these policies led to cycles of disinvestment, segregation and poverty concentration among these communities. In 1942, in response to the bombing of Pearl Harbor, San Francisco aided the federal government in the forced eviction and internment of thousands of people of Japanese ancestry. In 1945, the Department identified neighborhoods that were predominately people of color as "blighted," including the Western Addition, South of Market, Chinatown, the Mission, and Bayview/Hunter's Point, and used this designation to justify the wholesale removal of Black communities and other communities of color through eminent domain. Furthermore, in the early 2000s, people of color were more likely to receive subprime housing loans than White borrowers. These predatory lending practices led to the foreclosure crisis starting in 2008, disproportionately impacting Black, Latinx, American Indian, and low-income people; during this period, middle-income Black and Latinx households lost nearly one-half of their wealth due to foreclosure. The cumulative impacts of these and other policies have resulted in the persistent outmigration and displacement of communities of color: the American Indian community in San Francisco experienced a decline from 0.5% of the population in 2006 to 0.1% today; while the Black community in San Francisco decreased from 11% of the City's population in 1990 to 5% in 2018; and,

WHEREAS, Although the City has taken steps to undo the damage caused by past policies and practices, the racial disparities caused continue to the present day. Despite progress in addressing explicit discrimination, racial inequities continue to be deep, pervasive, and persistent in San Francisco. In the 1950s and beyond, particularly in the context of a national Civil Rights Movement, systemic racism in San Francisco became much less explicit. Moving away from overtly race-based exclusionary policies regarding land or business ownership, the City's more recent and increasingly sophisticated racism has been defined by inaction or lack of intervention with regards to racial discrimination in employment, housing, neighborhood choice (through implicit exclusionary zoning), education, health care, or the criminal justice system; and,

WHEREAS, the legacy of these discriminatory policies is that San Francisco's American Indian, Black , and people of color have historically been, and many currently are, denied equal access to essential services and means of creating wealth, including affordable housing and homeownership opportunities, high-performing public schools, adequate transportation options, safe parks and open spaces, affordable health care, access to financial capital and entrepreneurship opportunities, and stores selling healthy food, among others; and,

WHEREAS, San Francisco's American Indian, Black, and people of color have historically been, and many currently are, disproportionately exposed to more environmental stressors including air and soil pollution, illegal dumping, industrial uses and transportation impacts, and are more likely to live in housing conditions where degraded indoor air quality contributes to the prevalence of asthma, other airborne diseases, and other health disparities; and,

WHEREAS, stark disparities continue to exist for City residents along racial lines. Race predicts worse outcomes for people of color across key indicators, including education, income, health, and incarceration, among others. For example, household income for White households is close to three times that of Black families and close to double that of American Indian and Latinx households, respectively. 53% of inmates in San Francisco County Jail are Black, while they only comprise about 5% of the City's total population. In 2018, American Indian and Black San Franciscans were more than three times more likely to be unemployed than Whites (11.9% and 12.5% versus 3.6%, respectively); and unemployment rates were similarly high for Native Hawaiian / Pacific Islanders (8.8%) and Latinxs (9.4%); and,

WHEREAS, The 2019 San Francisco Community Health Needs Assessment conducted by the San Francisco Health Improvement Partnership ("SFHIP") found that racial health inequities and poverty were foundational issues affecting the health of San Franciscans, impacting life expectancy, infant and maternal health, nutrition, stress, heart disease, and more. For example, in 2015-2017 the life expectancy in San Francisco was 72.1 years for Blacks, 76 years for Pacific Islanders, 81.7 years for White people, 85.1 years for Latinxs, and 87 years for Asians. (San Francisco data on American Indians was not included; such data is often unavailable in urban areas due to low population counts, which perpetuates disparities in documentation and policies that address their community needs.) The rates of asthma and COPD hospitalizations in the Black community are more than 10 times higher than for Asians; Pacific Islanders have the second highest rates. In San Francisco, Black women are twice as likely as White women to give birth prematurely, and Black and Pacific Islander women have the highest rates of prenatal morbidity. SFHIP also found that between 2007 and 2016, Black mothers had about 4% of births in San Francisco, but experienced 50% of maternal deaths, and 15% of infant deaths. While data on health outcomes in the American Indian population in San Francisco is limited, this community also faces persistent health disparities across a number of indicators. For instance, even though the overall rate of infant mortality in California has been declining since 2005, the American Indian/Alaska Native infant mortality rate in California remains high, averaging 6-7 infant deaths per 1,000 live births between 2005 and 2012; and,

WHEREAS, the impact of the redlining that went into effect in 1937 in San Francisco can still be seen today: 87% of redlined neighborhoods in San Francisco are neighborhoods currently undergoing displacement. The 2010 Census data showed a decline in the number of children of every racial group (including American Indian, Black, Latinx, and Asian and Pacific Islander) residing in San Francisco except white and multiracial children. Between 1990 and 2014-15, as housing prices rose, neighborhoods became more segregated, with the share of Black households in San Francisco living in high-poverty neighborhoods increasing from 41% in 2000 to 65% in 2015 (compared to Asian (27%), Latinx (19%), and White (12%) households). 50% of Black households, 31% of American Indian, and 30% of Latinx households are severely burdened by housing costs (spending more than 30% of their income on housing) while 16% of White households are similarly burdened. American Indian, Black, and Latinx residents have the lowest home ownership rates, at 0.3%, 4%, 9%, respectively. Latinxs reported the highest percentage of having been

threatened with eviction (24%), with 11% of those evictions having been raised with no cause, exceeding the percentage of no-cause evictions for other racial groups. 34% of Latinxs also reported having faced unstable living conditions in the last five years, with 36% stating they would have no other housing options if they were forced to move from their current residence.

WHEREAS, racial disparities in the rates of infection and death from COVID-19 have been documented, with American Indian, Black, and people of color disproportionately impacted by the disease. As of June 3rd, 2020 COVID-19 data for San Francisco, , indicate that Black communities in San Francisco comprised 9.3% of deaths, even though they comprise 5% of the population; Latinx communities comprised 47.8% of diagnosed cases (and comprise 15.2% of the population); American Indian communities comprised 0.4% of diagnosed cases (and comprise 0.1% of the population); and Asian communities comprised 46.5% of deaths (and comprise 34.1% of the population). In the April 2020 UCSF assessment in Mission District, 90% of the Latinx people tested for COVID-19 were positive, The health and economic impacts of the pandemic are exacerbating the existing disparities; and,

WHEREAS, Black and American Indian people are overrepresented among the homeless population. The 2019 San Francisco Homeless Count and Survey found that 37% of people experiencing homelessness were Black, while they represent only 5% of San Francisco's population. Overrepresentation in the homeless population was also high for American Indians (5% compared to 0.1%) and Pacific Islanders (2% compared to 0.2%). Of all people surveyed, 61% reported not being able to afford rent and 37% reported having no income. Discrimination and lack of access to opportunities for American Indian, Black and people of color put them at a higher risk of homelessness; and,

WHEREAS, San Francisco and other cities across the nation are part of a movement to eliminate institutional racism in partnership with the Government Alliance on Race and Equity (GARE), a national network dedicated to achieving racial equity and advancing opportunities for all. The Department's ongoing participation in GARE since January 2016 has given staff the training, tools, and support to build the Department's organizational capacity to advance racial equity in its programs, policies, and services; and,

WHEREAS, the Board of Supervisors, through Resolution No. 190547 on July 11, 2019, amended the Administrative Code to create an Office of Racial Equity as a Division of the Human Rights Commission, with authority to create a citywide Racial Equity Framework, analyze the impact of Board ordinances on racial equity, and create a racial reconciliation process; require City departments to create Racial Equity Action Plans and to provide annual updates on such Plans; require City departments to designate employees as racial equity leaders, and require the Department of Human Resources to produce an annual report concerning racial equity in the City workforce; and,

WHEREAS, in the coming years the Department will amend the General Plan through adoption of updated Housing and Transportation Elements, adoption of a Preservation Element, and updates to incorporate environmental justice, racial and social equity, and climate resilience across all relevant elements. On May 28, 2020, the Department launched the first of these updates: the Housing Element 2022 Update. The Housing Element policies will be grounded on the following values: racial and social equity, minimum displacement, more housing for all in all neighborhoods, and neighborhoods resilient to climate and health crises. The Transportation Element will be the next Element to undergo an update and will center its

policies in ConnectSF's goals of equity, economic vitality, environmental sustainability, safety and livability, and accountability and engagement; and,

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission (Commission) adopted the Racial & Social Equity Action Plan, Phase I on November 21, 2019 to guide the Department and Commission actions to strengthen our internal-facing processes and practices to address disparities in the Department's internal functions to advance organizational equity, through strategies that include: ongoing training for all staff; a biannual staff survey to assess Department attitudes and progress towards racial and social equity; and an interim Racial & Social Equity Assessment Tool to apply to relevant projects, policies, and practices; and,

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission adopted a Racial & Social Equity Vision on November 21, 2019, which envisions: inclusive neighborhoods that provide all with the opportunity to lead fulfilling, meaningful, and healthy lives; a city where public life and public spaces reflect the past, present and future of San Franciscans; a city where a person's race does not determine their lives' prospects and success; an inclusive Planning Department and Commissions that represent and engage the communities we serve; a Department that proactively infuses racial and social equity in both internal operations and external Planning work; and reimagines what the Planning field is and can be – inclusive, diverse and one that centers racial and social equity both as a practice and as an indicator of success; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission directed the Department to develop a Racial & Social Equity Action Plan, Phase II in collaboration with the new Office of Racial Equity, other City agencies, the Mayor's Office, the Board of Supervisors, and community stakeholders, to carefully examine and address legacy racial and social inequities and disparities in the Department's programs and policies and to develop Phase II with bold and forward-thinking strategies to advance racial and social equity in San Francisco; and,

MOVED, that the Commission considered public comment and reviewed the information before them and hereby adopts this Resolution.

FINDINGS

Having reviewed the materials identified in the preamble above, and having heard all testimony and arguments, this Commission finds, concludes, and determines as follows:

The Resolution directs the Planning Department to center its work program and resource allocation on racial and social equity; acknowledges and apologizes for the history of racist, discriminatory and inequitable planning policies that have resulted in racial disparities; directs the Department to develop proactive strategies to address and redress structural and institutional racism, in collaboration with Black and American Indian communities and communities of color; directs the Department to amend its hiring and promotion practices to ensure that the Department's staff reflects the diversity and demographics of the community at all staff levels; recommends that the Board of Supervisors condemn discriminatory government actions; and directs the Department to build accountability through metrics and reporting.

General Plan Compliance. The Resolution is in conformity with the General Plan's overall principles and discussion of preserving the cultural and economic diversity of our neighborhoods, although further changes to the General Plan may be needed to implement better the Planning Department's racial and social equity policies. While the current General Plan contains some discussion of equity as indicated in the

sections listed below, current objectives and policies across Elements do not adequately address disparities that are closely associated with race as well as other vulnerable populations.

I. HOUSING ELEMENT

POLICY 5.3. Prevent housing discrimination, particularly against immigrants and households with children.

POLICY 9.3. Maintain and improve the condition of the existing supply of public housing, through programs such as HOPE SF.

II. COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY ELEMENT

OBJECTIVE 3. PROVIDE EXPANDED EMPLOYMENT OPPORTUNITIES FOR RESIDENTS, PARTICULARLY THE UNEMPLOYED AND ECONOMICALLY DISADVANTAGED.

III. RECREATION AND OPEN SPACE ELEMENT

POLICY 1.2. Prioritize renovation in highly-utilized open spaces and recreational facilities and in high needs areas.

IV. TRANSPORTATION ELEMENT

POLICY 1.7. Assure expanded mobility for the disadvantaged.

V. COMMUNITY FACILITIES ELEMENT

POLICY 3.6 Base priority for the development of neighborhood centers on relative need.

VI. COMMUNITY SAFETY ELEMENT

OBJECTIVE 4. ASSURE THE SOUND, EQUITABLE AND EXPEDIENT RECONSTRUCTION OF SAN FRANCISCO FOLLOWING A MAJOR DISASTER.

VII. ARTS ELEMENT

OBJECTIVE II-2. SUPPORT ARTS AND CULTURAL PROGRAMS WHICH ADDRESS THE NEEDS OF DIVERSE POPULATIONS.

VIII. AIR QUALITY ELEMENT

POLICY 4.3. Minimize exposure of San Francisco's population, especially children and the elderly, to air pollutants.

IX. BAYVIEW HUNTERS POINT AREA PLAN

OBJECTIVE 15. COMBINE SOCIAL REVITALIZATION WITH PHYSICAL AND ECONOMIC REVITALIZATION EFFORTS.

POLICY 15.3. Make maximum use of Indigenous community resources to increase civic pride and support physical and economic revitalization.

X. CHINATOWN AREA PLAN

OBJECTIVE 1. PRESERVE THE DISTINCTIVE URBAN CHARACTER, PHYSICAL ENVIRONMENT AND CULTURAL HERITAGE OF CHINATOWN.

XI. EAST SOMA AREA PLAN

OBJECTIVE 7.3. REINFORCE THE IMPORTANCE OF THE SOUTH OF MARKET AS THE CENTER OF FILIPINO-AMERICAN LIFE IN SAN FRANCISCO.

XII. MISSION AREA PLAN

OBJECTIVE 7.3. REINFORCE THE IMPORTANCE OF THE MISSION AS THE CENTER OF LATINO LIFE IN SAN FRANCISCO .

XIII. WESTERN SOMA AREA PLAN

OBJECTIVE 9.4 REINFORCE THE IMPORTANCE OF THE SOUTH OF MARKET AS A CENTER FOR FILIPINO-AMERICAN AND LGBTQ LIFE IN SAN FRANCISCO.

POLICY 9.4.3. Protect and support Filipino, LGBTQ and other minority or culturally significant local business, structures, property and institutions in Western SoMa.

POLICY 9.4.6. Prioritize maintenance and support funding for cultural and service facilities that support Filipino-Americans, such as the Bayanihan Center, the Filipino Education Center, and the West Bay Pilipino Multi-Services Center.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Planning Commission condemns all forms of racism, sexism, homophobia, ableism, and other forms of discrimination; and affirms that all people – which explicitly includes American Indian people, Black and people of color – have a right to be in our City and have a right to safe and affordable housing, neighborhoods free from pollution and violence, opportunities for educational advancement and wealth creation, and access to essential services such as parks, transportation, health care, and places selling healthy food, among others; and,

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Planning Commission stands in solidarity with the civil unrest and demands for justice of our fellow San Franciscans and communities across the nation, and affirms that Black Lives Matter; and,

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Planning Commission must carry its responsibility for guiding **the** development of our city, streets, and open spaces with a central planning focus on racial and social equity; and,

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Planning Commission condemns and apologizes for government practices that have resulted in and continue to have disproportionate impacts upon American Indian people, Black people, and people of color, including racist, discriminatory, and inequitable land use planning policies, programs and government actions, such as redlining, exclusionary zoning, racial covenants, urban renewal and discriminatory enforcement of land use policies; and,

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Planning Commission recommends that the Board of Supervisors condemn all discriminatory government practices, including law enforcement practices that have resulted in a disproportionate number of American Indian people, Black people and people of color dying at the hands of law enforcement; and,

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Planning Commission recommends that the Board of Supervisors reallocate resources towards expanding access to open space, housing, transportation, and services for American Indian, Black, and communities of color; and that it minimize the negative impacts of budget cuts due to the COVID-19 pandemic on these communities; and,

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Planning Commission directs all Department staff to move beyond acknowledgement of injustice and take concrete actions that are visible in the reallocation of resources and work program to (1) increase the American Indian and the Black population and provide stability to communities of color; (2) expand access to open space, housing, transportation, quality amenities and public services, and reduce exposure to environmental pollution in these communities, while ensuring that such investments do not lead to displacement or exacerbate inequities; and, (3) develop and expand participation for American Indian, Black and communities of color ; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Planning Commission directs the Department to collaborate with the Office of Racial Equity (ORE) to align its work with ORE's framework to dismantle structural and institutional racism, which asserts that the City's work shall: (1) Affirmatively address racial and social inequities; (2) Assert that housing is a human right, and prioritize equitable housing development without displacement of American Indian, Black, and communities of color; (3) Develop public land strategies to meet affordable and inclusionary housing goals; (4) Support wealth-building through home ownership for American Indian, Black, and communities of color; (5) Champion housing choice by dismantling exclusionary zoning policies; (6) Promote environmental justice; and (7) Redress the consequences of government-sanctioned racial harm via meaningful City-supported, community-led processes; and,

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Planning Commission directs Department staff to expand the implementation of Phase I of the Racial & Social Equity Action Plan, to ensure that the Department's internal practices are thoughtfully examined and amended to advance racial and social equity across all of its core functions; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Planning Commission directs Department staff to devote the resources necessary for the successful completion and implementation of Phase II of the Racial & Social Equity Action Plan to ensure that its plans, policies and programs actively address and redress structural and institutional racism; and,

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Planning Commission directs Department staff to address racial and social equity as it develops policies and programs to respond to the health, economic and housing crises resulting from the COVID-19 pandemic, prioritizing meeting the needs of Black communities, American Indian communities, and communities of color through its policies and programs to support the adaptive use and design of the public realm, community engagement and planning, protection of tenants and cultural resources, affordable housing preservation and production, streamlining and other support for small businesses, and funding for public services and infrastructure, among others; and,

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Planning Commission directs the Department to assess, strengthen and fund its outreach and engagement strategies to ensure that American Indian, Black and communities of color have true access to representation and participation in planning processes, as well as resources for participatory capacity building; and,

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Planning Commission directs the Department to amend the General Plan to incorporate policies that explicitly prioritize racial and social equity for American Indian communities, Black communities, and communities of color; that subsequent amendments to the General Plan utilize a racial and social equity lens; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Planning Commission directs the Department to change hiring and promotion practices to correct the underrepresentation of American Indian people, Black people, and people of color across all staff levels and ensure the workforce reflects the needs of our communities; and,

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Planning Commission directs the Department to build accountability by identifying actions it will implement to advance racial and social equity, including developing performance measures, incorporating a racial and social equity lens in budgeting decisions, and reporting to the Commission on its progress at regular intervals; and,

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Planning Commission asserts that the responsibility for implementing these structural and institutional changes falls upon all Department staff, across all levels and functions, and that it should not fall solely or disproportionately upon the American Indian, Black, or people of color staff who are already burdened with their lived experiences of racism; and,

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the Commission hereby APPROVES the proposed Resolution on June 11, 2020.

Jonas P. Ionin

Commission Secretary

AYES:

NOES:

ABSENT:

ADOPTED: