

SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Wednesday, May 1, 2019

12:00 p.m.

Architectural Review Committee Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Black, Hyland, Pearlman

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY COMMISSIONER PEARLMAN AT 12:00 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Shannon Ferguson, Tim Frye – Preservation Officer, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. COMMITTEE MATTERS

1. Committee Comments & Questions

None

B. REGULAR

2. [2018-013697COA](#) (S. FERGUSON: (415) 575-9074)
3500 JACKSON STREET – northwest corner of Jackson and Locust streets. Assessor's Block 0970, Lot 002 (District 2) – Request for **Review and Comment** by the Architectural Review Committee of the Historic Preservation Commission for the demolition of an existing garage and construction of new larger garage with roof deck, expansion of the building at the west elevation, new stairs at the west elevation, infill with new roof at the third story, modification of the porte cochere/carriageway, enlargement of window openings, replacement of chimneys, and interior alterations at all floors. At a future hearing, the Zoning Administrator will consider a request for a variance from rear yard requirements. The property is Landmark No. 56. The property is in a RH-1 (Residential-House, One Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Review and Comment

SPEAKERS: = Shannon Ferguson – Staff presentation
+ Thomas Kligerman - Project presentation
= Stewart Morton – Porte cochere
+ Speaker – Response to questions
+ Speaker - Response to questions
ACTION: Reviewed and Commented

ARC COMMENTS

1. **Garage:** Removal of an existing one-story, wood frame garage with stucco cladding and a composition roofing-clad gable roof form located at the northwest corner of the lot, and construction of a new larger one-story garage in approximately the same location that will require excavation into the hillside. The new larger garage will have a connector that accesses the north elevation of the house at the sub-basement level. The new garage will have a flat roof with a roof deck above. It will be clad in stucco with a horizontal wood garage door. A horizontal planter with simple brackets will be constructed above the door with the glass roof deck railing recessed above. An additional door and window opening will be cut into the sub-basement level on the north elevation of the house.
 - The Architectural Review Committee concurred with staff's assessment at the May 1, 2019 meeting that overall, the form, scale, proportions and materials of the one story, flat-roofed, rectangular form of the garage appears to be compatible with the subject property. The alternate design proposals presented have evolved and are preferable to the initial proposal. The proposed garage respects the design of the house and does not to present a false sense of history as the current garage does. The proposed landscaping helps to conceal the glass railing at the roof deck, however it is recommended the planter or stucco panels function as a railing instead of the proposed glass. The Committee recommended that the size and patterns of proposed windows and door at the north elevation of the house be more compatible with existing fenestration sizes and patterns found on the building.

2. **West Elevation Expansion:** Expansion of the west façade will occur near the middle of the façade, behind (to the north) of the porte cochere in a narrow passageway area referred to as the carriageway. It would extend the basement and first story, narrowing the carriageway. An existing projecting mass, and an existing projecting and recessed balcony at the first story would be subsumed by the increased massing. A new picture window with sidelights would be installed in the location of the balcony (facing north) and additional new windows to match similar windows found on the house would be located on the new areas of the west facing wall. A new assembly of French doors with sidelights will be added to the basement level wall to the immediate north of the addition, replacing an existing pair of windows.
 - The Architectural Review Committee reviewed alternative schemes for the west elevation expansion shown in drawings dated April 23, 2019, page 7. The Committee disagreed with staff's recommendation to set back the west elevation expansion at the existing laundry room bump out (see Alt 3). The Committee found that setting back the west elevation expansion to 10'-9" from the front facade was too visible from the street (see Alt 1). The Committee found that it is acceptable to set back the west elevation expansion at 24'-10" from the front façade or at approximately the existing foyer (see Alt 2). The Committee recommended that the size and patterns of proposed windows at the west elevation expansion be more compatible with existing fenestration sizes and patterns found on the building.
3. **West Elevation Stairs:** New stairs will be added at the north side of the west façade accessing a second-floor balcony located in a recessed section between the main mass of the house and the added Tea Room and balcony (1913, designed by Maybeck). Construction of the Tea Room and balcony removed an earlier stair that once provided access to an open terrace where the Tea Room is now located. The balcony currently features low boxy corner posts and planter railings similar to those elsewhere on the house. The new exterior stair will be constructed from the balcony to the rear yard. The quarter turn stair will have wood posts and an open railing. Basement level walls, windows, and a wood bracket will be removed to accommodate an expanded building mass at the basement level underneath the existing balcony with French doors accessing the carriageway.
 - The Architectural Review Committee concurred with staff's assessment that massing of the posts and elements of the stairs should be more in keeping with the overall vocabulary of the building. The Committee recommended that the size and patterns of proposed windows at the west elevation be more compatible with existing fenestration sizes and patterns found on the building.
4. **Third Floor Infill:** The third floor is currently two disconnected volumes. There are rooms within the main gable of the roof at the front (south) portion of the house and a separate small suite of rooms within a third-story pop-up mass to the immediate north of the main gable roof at the west side. A gap exists between the gable roof and the pop-up volumes. The proposed project will infill the gap between the gable roof and pop-up. A shallow roof will be inserted to connect the two volumes with the building

mass infilled underneath to create interior communication between the two living areas.

- The Architectural Review Committee concurred with staff's assessment that the form of the infill is compatible and appears minimally visible from the street and concurred with staff's recommendation of story poles to further analyze the visibility of the infill. The Committee recommended studying the use of a different cladding to differentiate the infill from the original.
5. **Porte Cochere & Carriageway:** The porte cochere and concrete carriageway will be modified to create a level area with a new narrow step accessing a new side entry. A new wood deck will elevate the carriageway under the porte cochere to the same level as the bottom of the first story, retaining the existing sloped grade beneath. The posts at the first story of the porte cochere will remain beneath the new wood deck and new wood planters similar to those elsewhere on the house will be added along with a gate. Along the west elevation, the sloped concrete carriageway will be modified with new stairs and garden.
- The Architectural Review Committee concurred with staff's assessment that foreshortening the columns is not compatible and that the columns should remain visible. The Committee recommended lowering the slope of the proposed decking and add additional risers at the proposed door to the kitchen.
6. **Enlarged Window Openings:** Window openings are proposed to be enlarged at the second story of the north and west facades (two windows on the north façade and three windows on the west façade of the "Morning Room" at the rear of the house). The new window sashes will be single-lite, wood awning sash, similar to existing window sash.
- The Architectural Review Committee concurred with staff's assessment that the scale of the windows should be reduced so as not to interfere with the eaves of the roof.
7. **Chimneys:** Three chimneys (concrete structure with stucco cladding) will be demolished and the stacks above roof level rebuilt to match the look of the original chimneys. Chimneys proposed for demolition are located at the northeast corner of the front gable (visible from Locust Street), at the west corner of the front gable (visible above and east of the porte cochere), and at the third-story pop up. Chimneys are proposed for demolition to provide more interior floor space and are proposed to be replaced with plywood clad in stucco.
- The Architectural Review Committee concurred with staff's assessment to explore if existing chimneys are able to be retained above the roof and asks that a structural engineer with preservation experience be engaged to provide alternate solutions to removal and replication of the chimneys. Detailed and dimensioned drawings and materials samples for replicated chimneys should be provided for Department

review. Alternatively, the Committee recommended exploring maintaining the internal chimney supports and design around them.

ADJOURNMENT 12:50 PM

ADOPTED – JUNE 19, 2019