[Planning Code - Amending Landmark Designation of 906 Broadway (Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church)]

Ordinance amending the Landmark Designation for Landmark No. 204, 906 Broadway (Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church), Assessor's Block No. 0149, Lot No. 009, under Article 10 of the Planning Code, to confirm the exterior features that should be preserved or replaced in kind, and to add interior features to the designation; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making public necessity, convenience, and welfare findings under Planning Code, Section 302, and findings of consistency with the General Plan and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1.

NOTE: Unchanged Code text and uncodified text are in plain Arial font.

Additions to Codes are in single-underline italics Times New Roman font.

Deletions to Codes are in strikethrough italics Times New Roman font.

Board amendment additions are in double-underlined Arial font.

Board amendment deletions are in strikethrough Arial font.

Asterisks (\* \* \* \*) indicate the omission of unchanged Code subsections or parts of tables.

Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San Francisco:

Section 1. Findings.

- (a) CEQA and Land Use Findings.
- (1) The Planning Department has determined that the Planning Code amendment proposed in this ordinance is subject to a Categorical Exemption from the California Environmental Quality Act (California Public Resources Code Sections 21000 et seq., "CEQA") pursuant to Section 15308 of California Code of Regulations, Title 14, Sections 15000 et seq., the Guidelines for implementation of CEQA for actions by regulatory agencies for protection of the environment (in this case, landmark designation). Said determination is

on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. \_\_\_\_\_ and is incorporated herein by reference. The Board of Supervisors affirms this determination.

- (2) Pursuant to Planning Code Section 302, the Board of Supervisors finds that the proposed amendment to the landmark designation of 906 Broadway, Assessor's Block No. 0149, Lot No. 009 ("Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church" or "906 Broadway"), will serve the public necessity, convenience, and welfare for the reasons set forth in Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_, recommending approval of the proposed designation, which is incorporated herein by reference.
- (3) The Board of Supervisors finds that the proposed amendment to the landmark designation of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church is consistent with the General Plan and with Planning Code Section 101.1(b) for the reasons set forth in Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. \_\_\_\_\_\_.
  - (b) General Findings.
- (1) Pursuant to Charter Section 4.135, the Historic Preservation Commission has authority "to recommend approval, disapproval, or modification of landmark designations and historic district designations under the Planning Code to the Board of Supervisors."
- (2) Ordinance No. 312-93, enacted in 1993, designated 906 Broadway, the site of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church, as Landmark No. 204. That ordinance, which is incorporated herein by reference, required that the particular features to be preserved include those "described in the Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board's Case Report, in Section A, entitled 'Architecture,' Subsection No. 5, 'Design' and in Section D, 'Integrity,' Subsection No. 13 'Alterations'," but it did not list those features in any detail. Moreover, those features refer only to the building's exterior. The ordinance did not

include any of the building's interior character-defining features as part of the Landmark designation.

- (3) On August 17, 2016, the Historic Preservation Commission added the interior of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church to the Landmark Designation Work Program, a list of individual properties and historic districts under consideration for landmark designation, adopted by the Historic Preservation Commission at its June 15, 2011 meeting.
- (4) The amended Landmark Designation Report prepared for this landmarking amendment was authored by Planning Department Preservation staff. All preparers meet the Secretary of the Interior's Professional Qualification Standards for historic preservation program staff, as set forth in Code of Federal Regulations Title 36, Part 61, Appendix A. Planning Department staff also reviewed the report for accuracy and conformance with the purposes and standards of Article 10 of the Planning Code.
- (5) The Historic Preservation Commission, at its regular meeting of \_\_\_\_\_\_\_, reviewed Planning Department staff's analysis of the historical significance of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church, as well as both the exterior and interior features of the church, pursuant to Article 10 of the Planning Code as part of the Landmark Designation Case Report dated \_\_\_\_\_\_.

  (6) On \_\_\_\_\_\_, the Historic Preservation Commission adopted Resolution No. \_\_\_\_\_, initiating an amendment of the Landmark Designation of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the Planning Code. Said resolution is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. \_\_\_\_\_ and is incorporated herein by reference.

  (7) On \_\_\_\_\_, after holding a public hearing on the proposed

designation amendment and having considered both the specialized analyses prepared by

Planning Department staff and the amended Landmark Designation Report, the Historic

Preservation Commission recommended approval of the proposed amendment to the

Landmark Designation of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe

Church by Resolution No. \_\_\_\_\_\_, to list the exterior and interior features that should be

preserved or replaced in kind. Said resolution is on file with the Clerk of the Board in File No.

and is incorporated herein by reference.

(8) The Board of Supervisors hereby finds that Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church has a special character and special historical, architectural, and aesthetic interest and value, and that expanding its designation as a Landmark to include interior features will further the purposes of and conform to the standards set forth in Article 10 of the Planning Code. In doing so, the Board hereby incorporates by reference the findings of the amended Landmark Designation Report.

### Section 2. Designation.

Pursuant to Section 1004 of the Planning Code, the Landmark Designation for 906 Broadway (Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church), Assessor's Block No. 0149, Lot No. 009, is hereby amended as specified in Section 3 of this ordinance. Appendix A to Article 10 of the Planning Code is hereby amended with respect to Landmark No. 204.

## Section 3. Required Data.

(a) The description, location, and boundary of the Landmark site consists of the City parcel located at 906 Broadway (Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church), Assessor's Block No. 0149, Lot No. 009, in San Francisco's North Beach neighborhood.

- (b) The characteristics of the Landmark that justify its designation are described and shown in the Landmark Designation Report and other supporting materials contained in Planning Department Case Docket No. 2018-008948DES. In summary, Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church, both the exterior and interior, is eligible for local designation as it is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history, embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, and is the work of a master. Specifically, Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church is associated with the development of San Francisco's Latino and Spanish-speaking communities from the latenineteenth to the mid-twentieth century, as both the geographical and spiritual heart of the Latino and Spanish-speaking enclave that existed in North Beach until the 1950s. Designation of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church is also appropriate given that it is one of the first churches in the country to be constructed of reinforced concrete, considered an innovative construction technology at that time, and is an exceptional example of an early twentieth century Mission Revival church with a highly ornate interior displaying Renaissance and Baroque ornamentation. Furthermore, Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church is the work of master architects Shea & Lofquist and its interior murals are the work of master artist Luigi Brusatori.
- (c) The particular features that shall be preserved, or replaced in-kind as determined necessary, are those generally shown in photographs and described in the Landmark Designation Report, which can be found in Planning Department Docket No. 2018-008948DES, and which are incorporated in this designation by reference as though fully set forth herein. Specifically, the following features shall be preserved or replaced in-kind:
- (1) The overall form, structure, height, massing, materials, and architectural ornamentation of the church's exterior identified as:

Section 4. Effective Date. This ordinance shall become effective 30 days after enactment. Enactment occurs when the Mayor signs the ordinance, the Mayor returns the ordinance unsigned or does not sign the ordinance within ten days of receiving it, or the Board of Supervisors overrides the Mayor's veto of the ordinance.

APPROVED AS TO FORM: DENNIS J. HERRERA, City Attorney

ANDREA RUIZ-ESQUIDE
Deputy City Attorney

n:\legana\as2018\1800206\01323708.docx

[Planning Code - Amending Landmark Designation of 906 Broadway (Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church)]

Ordinance amending the Landmark Designation for Landmark No. 204, 906 Broadway (Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church), Assessor's Block No. 0149, Lot No. 009, under Article 10 of the Planning Code, to confirm the exterior features that should be preserved or replaced in kind, and to add interior features to the designation; affirming the Planning Department's determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making public necessity, convenience, and welfare findings under Planning Code, Section 302, and findings of consistency with the General Plan and the eight priority policies of Planning Code, Section 101.1.

NOTE: Unchanged Code text and uncodified text are in plain Arial font.

Additions to Codes are in single-underline italics Times New Roman font.

Deletions to Codes are in strikethrough italics Times New Roman font.

Board amendment additions are in double-underlined Arial font.

Board amendment deletions are in strikethrough Arial font.

Asterisks (\* \* \* \*) indicate the omission of unchanged Code subsections or parts of tables.

Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San Francisco:

Section 1. Findings.

- (a) CEQA and Land Use Findings.
- (1) The Planning Department has determined that the Planning Code amendment proposed in this ordinance is subject to a Categorical Exemption from the California Environmental Quality Act (California Public Resources Code Sections 21000 et seq., "CEQA") pursuant to Section 15308 of California Code of Regulations, Title 14, Sections 15000 et seq., the Guidelines for implementation of CEQA for actions by regulatory agencies for protection of the environment (in this case, landmark designation). Said determination is

on file with the Clerk of the Boa	rd of Supervisors in File No	and is
incorporated herein by reference	e. The Board of Supervisors affirms	this determination.

- (3) The Board of Supervisors finds that the proposed amendment to the landmark designation of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church is consistent with the General Plan and with Planning Code Section 101.1(b) for the reasons set forth in Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. \_\_\_\_\_\_.
  - (b) General Findings.
- (1) Pursuant to Charter Section 4.135, the Historic Preservation Commission has authority "to recommend approval, disapproval, or modification of landmark designations and historic district designations under the Planning Code to the Board of Supervisors."
- (2) Ordinance No. 312-93, enacted in 1993, designated 906 Broadway, the site of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church, as Landmark No. 204. That ordinance, which is incorporated herein by reference, required that the particular features to be preserved include those "described in the Landmarks Preservation Advisory Board's Case Report, in Section A, entitled 'Architecture,' Subsection No. 5, 'Design' and in Section D, 'Integrity,' Subsection No. 13 'Alterations'," but it did not list those features in any detail. Moreover, those features refer only to the building's exterior. The ordinance did not

include any of the building's interior character-defining features as part of the Landmark designation.

- (3) On August 17, 2016, the Historic Preservation Commission added the interior of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church to the Landmark Designation Work Program, a list of individual properties and historic districts under consideration for landmark designation, adopted by the Historic Preservation Commission at its June 15, 2011 meeting.
- (4) The amended Landmark Designation Report prepared for this landmarking amendment was authored by Planning Department Preservation staff. All preparers meet the Secretary of the Interior's Professional Qualification Standards for historic preservation program staff, as set forth in Code of Federal Regulations Title 36, Part 61, Appendix A. Planning Department staff also reviewed the report for accuracy and conformance with the purposes and standards of Article 10 of the Planning Code.
- (5) The Historic Preservation Commission, at its regular meeting of \_\_\_\_\_\_\_, reviewed Planning Department staff's analysis of the historical significance of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church, as well as both the exterior and interior features of the church, pursuant to Article 10 of the Planning Code as part of the Landmark Designation Case Report dated \_\_\_\_\_\_.

  (6) On \_\_\_\_\_\_\_, the Historic Preservation Commission adopted Resolution No. \_\_\_\_\_\_, initiating an amendment of the Landmark Designation of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the Planning Code. Said resolution is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. \_\_\_\_\_\_ and is incorporated herein by reference.

  (7) On \_\_\_\_\_\_, after holding a public hearing on the proposed designation amendment and having considered both the specialized analyses prepared by

Planning Department staff and the amended Landmark Designation Report, the Historic		
Preservation Commission recommended approval of the proposed amendment to the		
Landmark Designation of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe		
Church by Resolution No, to list the exterior and interior features that should be		
preserved or replaced in kind. Said resolution is on file with the Clerk of the Board in File No.		
and is incorporated herein by reference.		

(8) The Board of Supervisors hereby finds that Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church has a special character and special historical, architectural, and aesthetic interest and value, and that expanding its designation as a Landmark to include interior features will further the purposes of and conform to the standards set forth in Article 10 of the Planning Code. In doing so, the Board hereby incorporates by reference the findings of the amended Landmark Designation Report.

## Section 2. Designation.

Pursuant to Section 1004 of the Planning Code, the Landmark Designation for 906 Broadway (Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church), Assessor's Block No. 0149, Lot No. 009, is hereby amended as specified in Section 3 of this ordinance. Appendix A to Article 10 of the Planning Code is hereby amended with respect to Landmark No. 204.

# Section 3. Required Data.

(a) The description, location, and boundary of the Landmark site consists of the City parcel located at 906 Broadway (Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church), Assessor's Block No. 0149, Lot No. 009, in San Francisco's North Beach neighborhood.

- (b) The characteristics of the Landmark that justify its designation are described and shown in the Landmark Designation Report and other supporting materials contained in Planning Department Case Docket No. 2018-008948DES. In summary, Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church, both the exterior and interior, is eligible for local designation as it is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history, embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, and is the work of a master. Specifically, Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church is associated with the development of San Francisco's Latino and Spanish-speaking communities from the latenineteenth to the mid-twentieth century, as both the geographical and spiritual heart of the Latino and Spanish-speaking enclave that existed in North Beach until the 1950s. Designation of Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church is also appropriate given that it is one of the first churches in the country to be constructed of reinforced concrete, considered an innovative construction technology at that time, and is an exceptional example of an early twentieth century Mission Revival church with a highly ornate interior displaying Renaissance and Baroque ornamentation. Furthermore, Iglesia de Nuestra Señora de Guadalupe/Our Lady of Guadalupe Church is the work of master architects Shea & Lofquist and its interior murals are the work of master artist Luigi Brusatori.
- (c) The particular features that shall be preserved, or replaced in-kind as determined necessary, are those generally shown in photographs and described in the Landmark Designation Report, which can be found in Planning Department Docket No. 2018-008948DES, and which are incorporated in this designation by reference as though fully set forth herein. Specifically, the following features shall be preserved or replaced in-kind:
- (1) The overall form, structure, height, massing, materials, and architectural ornamentation of the church's exterior identified as:

- (iv) Slightly projecting portrait medallions at the first-story nave arch junctions and organ loft balcony;
  - (v) Flush portrait medallions above the narthex;
  - (vi) Crest medallions above the clerestory windows;
- (vii) Border frieze dividing upper and lower nave levels containing dentil molding, ovular forms, and painted cherub/floral motifs;
  - (viii) Painted statuary figures flanking clerestory windows;
- (ix) Painted figures at the east and west walls of organ loft, within painted rope-coil frames;
- (L) Arched stained-glass aisle windows portraying the miracle at Guadalupe, the Sermon on the Mount, and other passages of the Bible;
- (M) Shallow arched stained-glass clerestory windows portraying saints set within wood frames and topped with decorative, circular grilles;
  - (N) Amber glass windows throughout the building;
  - (O) Wood parquet flooring located at former pew seating areas;
  - (P) Tile flooring located at center aisle and remaining areas;
  - (Q) Central entry hall cross-vaulted painted ceiling;
- (R) All interior millwork and molding, such as window surrounds, painted wood panels under molded wall sill, wood stair balustrade and newel posts;
- (S) Southeast entry room containing an arched stained-glass window and an arched multi-lite amber art-glass window, each flanked by blind niches;
- (T) Double-height arched pediment wood door surround and wood confessional vestibules at the south portion of the nave against the north-facing narthex wall;
  - (U) Organ loft at south portion of nave; and
  - (V) 24-set pipe mechanical Hook and Hastings organ.

Section 4. Effective Date. This ordinance shall become effective 30 days after enactment. Enactment occurs when the Mayor signs the ordinance, the Mayor returns the ordinance unsigned or does not sign the ordinance within ten days of receiving it, or the Board of Supervisors overrides the Mayor's veto of the ordinance.

APPROVED AS TO FORM: DENNIS J. HERRERA, City Attorney

By: ANDREA RUIZ-ASQUIDE Deputy City Attorney

n:\legana\as2018\1800206\01323708.docx

# Salgado, Rebecca (CPC)

Received at HPC Hearing 12/19/18

From:

Gary Jeffrey <gary.jeffrey36@gmail.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, December 19, 2018 10:28 AM

To:

Salgado, Rebecca (CPC)

Cc:

Yolanda Lew

Subject:

Re: Project Plans--50-52 Fair Oaks

#### Rebecca

My first concern is that an addition to the structure that rises above the front wall will change the character of the building. Three and a half feet seems a significant change to the style of the building as it presently exists. Also as I noted previously, the photos submitted with the plans do not reflect the changes adequately. From my front door across the street and from my neighbors front door those changes will be much more apparent. I know that various neighbors have voiced concern about the effects of adding another floor. I will talk to them and get their feedback regarding whether they still feel that way.

Second, I am concerned about the scale of the project. As you probably know this block on Fair Oaks as been subjected to a massive rebuild of the Zuckerberg house that went on for two years and created all sorts of confusion, hassle, traffic problems, parking problems, noise and inconveniences. I am concerned that they do not occupy spaces in front of the house every day for an extended period of time. This concern has also been conveyed to me by neighbors.

#### Thanks

Gary

gary.jeffrey36@gmail.com

CP: (415) 317-1943

From: "Salgado, Rebecca (CPC)" <rebecca.salgado@sfgov.org>

Date: Tuesday, December 18, 2018 at 4:07 PM

To: "gary.jeffrey36@gmail.com" <gary.jeffrey36@gmail.com>

Cc: "Yolanda Lew (flourishmeister@gmail.com)" <flourishmeister@gmail.com>

Subject: RE: Project Plans--50-52 Fair Oaks

#### Hi Gary,

The roof of the new addition is proposed to be three-and-a-half feet taller than the top of the front wall. The addition is set 15 feet back from the front wall. This information can be seen on sheets A-2.4 and A-3.3 of the plans that I sent. Please let me know if this clarifies your questions.

If you have any concerns or comments that you'd like to share with the ARC committee tomorrow, feel free to submit these concerns to me via email for me to share at the hearing. The hearing starts at noon, so I would need to hear from you by 11 at the latest to be able to print out any concerns you may have before the hearing. Thanks,

#### Rebecca

From: Jeffrey, Gary <GJeffrey@ReedSmith.com> Sent: Tuesday, December 18, 2018 3:11 PM