

SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Wednesday, November 7, 2018
12:30 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT WOLFRAM AT 12:35 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Rachel Schuett, Stephanie Cisneros, Rebecca Salgado, Shannon Ferguson, Desiree Smith, Shelley Caltagirone, Tim Frye – Preservation Officer, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

At this time, members of the public may address the Commission on items of interest to the public that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission except agenda items. With respect to agenda items, your opportunity to address the Commission will be afforded when the item is reached in the meeting. Each member of the public may address the Commission for up to three minutes.

SPEAKERS: Katherine Doumani – Potrero Community Center
Jonathan Lammers – Potrero Police Station

B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

1. Director's Announcements

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

Commissioners, Tim Frye department staff, the director is out of town but happy to provide any questions you may have for him, so he may answer them on a future date.

2. Review of Past Events at the Planning Commission, Staff Report and Announcements

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

Good afternoon Commissioners, Tim Frye department staff. Several items to share with you – first, this morning the Government Audit and Oversight Committee heard the six pending Mills Act applications that this Commission reviewed on October 5th. It was a very positive committee hearing and the committee is in full support of all six applications. And they were also very complimentary to Preservation staff in terms of our outreach this year, in coordinating between the supervisor's office, the committee, and the project sponsors. I'll let you know when those are moved forward to the full board. Second is, at your seats, we have provided you a list of, or an itinerary of all staff participating in next week's Past Forward National Trust conference here in San Francisco. As you know, the Planning Department is a sponsor for the Intangible Heritage track and as you can see, staff will be very busy next week as, and we anticipate we'll see many of you will be there. But if you wanted also to catch up on some of the other preservation activities the Department is working on, this may be a great time to attend one of those sessions, and we would love to see you there. And then finally, two appeals I wanted to make you aware of, one is the Commission's Certificate of Appropriateness related to Washington Square Park. You heard and approved in June of this year. The categorical exemption was appealed. The appellant is concerned regarding the notice. Appellant also believes he was impeded from filing his appeal and also believes that there are some significant environmental impacts related to the, specifically, excuse me, I misplaced that oh the Water Conservation project. This item will be heard on Tuesday and I will be representing the Commission at that hearing. Second, is 450 O'Farrell Street, the Church of Christ Scientist, in the Uptown Tenderloin National Register District. While you provided Review and Comment on the Draft EIR, I know this is an item that you are likely interested in. Both the Conditional Use Authorization and the Final Environmental Impact Report have been appealed. Those will also be heard on Tuesday and I will be representing this Commission. And, also filling in for Ms. Allison Vanderslice regarding the Environmental Impact Report appeal. SF Heritage and the adjacent neighbor at 540 Jones Street Hotel LLC are the appellants. They have concerns over the findings of the EIR and are disagreeing primarily with the finding that there was no impact to the uptown Tenderloin National Register district through the demolition of one contributor. There are other construction related impacts that they feel should be further examined and we will give you a full report on both appeals after next week. I've also asked the Commission Secretary to forward you links to both of the appeal documents, so you can see the contents, specific contents of the appeal and our response.

Certainly, happy to follow up with you individually if you have questions regarding those. And that concludes my comments to you unless you have any questions. Thank you.

Commissioner Pearlman:

I do have a question Tim, about the 450 O'Farrell. Our role because that -- it's not a landmark and it's not an Article 10 District or Article 11 district that's my understanding.

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

That is correct.

Commissioner Pearlman:

So, we only did comment on the EIR is that correct.

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

That is correct.

Commissioner Pearlman:

And my understanding was, and I haven't read the documents, but my understanding was that Heritage had come to an agreement with the developer or I don't know, the Department that some money was going to be given to Heritage to be used for other and now they're, so they came to that agreement and then now it's Heritage's appealing it.

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

My understanding, and the documents I think will explain that further. Apparently, that deal has not been finalized or there are issues with that agreement. Which maybe one of the reasons for the appeal.

Commissioner Pearlman:

Okay. Thank you.

Vice President Hyland:

I just want to follow up with the National Trust conference next week and a shout out to the Commissioners and anyone in the public. There's an evening reception dinner that is joint National Trust with US ICOMOS on Thursday night. And if it is not on your calendar, I think they need some attendance. So, think about it if you're not already filled with the rest of the conference.

Commissioner Johnck:

Regarding the Past Forward as well of course. I've been signed up for a long time and I -- the website is pretty confusing because there are various locations and then so many different tracks etc. So, if someone is available just to put the location of where everyone is speaking. I mean if they're all in the hotel, but I know there's stuff out at the, you know, the ICOMOS, that's...

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

Sure, we'd be happy to forward it to you. We purposely left that off knowing conferences locations tend to shift at the last minute but happy to forward those to you as well.

Commissioner Johnck:
Okay, thank you.

C. COMMISSION MATTERS

3. President's Report and Announcements

None

4. Consideration of Adoption:

- [Draft Minutes for October 17, 2018](#)

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Adopted as Corrected

AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

5. Commission Comments & Questions

Commissioner Johns:

Meeting is going so nicely and with such a happy tone to it, I'm almost reluctant to point out that really a colossal figure in the preservation movement, William Murtagh died recently. In 1988, he wrote a very fine famous and important book, *Keeping Time: The History and Theory of Preservation in America*. Which if you haven't read, you want to. And if you have a book club searching for something to read, may I suggest you consider that.

Commissioner Matsuda:

Yes, I was wondering if you could have staff follow up on the condition and the status of the old Potrero police station for us for our next meeting.

D. CONSENT CALENDAR

6. [2018-005952COA](#) (A. KIRBY: (415) 575-9133)
59 POTOMAC STREET – located on the west side between Waller and Duboce Park, Assessor's Block 0865, Lot 008 (District 5). Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** to construct a new three-story rear addition extending nineteen feet, nine inches from the existing rear wall at the ground floor and ten feet, nine inches at the second and third floors. The project includes an interior remodel of the residence and façade repairs. This item was previously approved on consent by the Historic Preservation Commission on September 5th. The subject property is located within the Duboce Park Landmark District, RH-2 (Residential – House, Two Family) Zoning District, and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Approved with Conditions

AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

MOTION: [0359](#)

E. REGULAR CALENDAR

7. [2015-004568ENV](#) (R. SCHUETT: (415) 575-9030)
10 SOUTH VAN NESS AVENUE – located at the southwest corner of South Van Ness Avenue and Market Street, Assessor’s Block 3506, Lots 003A and 004 (District 6). **Review and Comment on the Draft Environmental Impact Report.** The proposed project would develop a mixed-use residential building and ground-floor retail space. The project would involve demolition of the existing two-story, 30- to 45-foot-tall, 91,088 gross-square-foot (gsf) building, which most recently operated as the San Francisco Honda auto dealership and is a historic resource built in 1927, and construction of up to 984 residential units, in a mixed-use residential building with either two 41-story, 420-foot-tall towers over podiums, or one 55-story, 590-foot-tall tower over a single podium. Up to 518 parking spaces and 336 bicycle parking spaces would be provided within a two-level subterranean parking garage, accessible from 12th Street. The project site is located in the Downtown General Commercial (C-3-G) Use District and 120-R-2/120/400-R-2 Height and Bulk Districts.
Preliminary Recommendation: Review and Comment

SPEAKERS: = Rachel Schuett – Staff presentation
 = Larry Mansbach – Carousel Ballroom
 = Mike Buhler – Citywide assessment
 ACTION: Reviewed and Commented
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 CL: 087

8. [2016-010079COA](#) (S. CISNEROS: (415) 575-9186)
3620 BUCHANAN STREET – located at the south end of block 0459, lot 003 at the southeast corner of North Point Street and Buchanan Street (District 2). San Francisco Landmark No. 58, the Merryvale Antiques/S.F. Gas Light Co. Building. Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** to demolish a non-contributing, one-story garden house adjacent to the Merryvale Antiques/S.F. Gas Light Co. Building and construct a new, four-story, eight-unit residential building. The subject property is located within a NC-2 (Neighborhood Commercial, Small Scale) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: = Stephanie Cisneros – Staff report
 + Maggie Smith – Project presentation
 + Ian Birchall – Design presentation
 = Mike Buhler – Request for continuance
 = Lane Rapaport – Neighborhood character and fabric
 - Arnold Cohn – L-shaped lot, descriptions, dimensions
 - Gee Gee Platt – Concerns, open space
 - Stewart Morton – Opposition
 - Mark Conner – Out of scale, gardens
 - Speaker – View
 - Sharon Hefty – Merryvale property
 - Speaker – Street history

ACTION: After a motion to Continue failed +3-4 (Black, Johns, Pearlman, Wolfram against); Approved
 AYES: Black, Johns, Pearlman, Wolfram
 NAYS: Hyland, Johnck, Matsuda
 MOTION: [0360](#)

9. [2018-000571COA](#) (R. SALGADO: (415) 575-9101)
1348 SOUTH VAN NESS AVENUE – located at the west side of South Van Ness Avenue between 24th Street and 25th Street, Assessor's Block 6518, Lot 006 (District 9). San Francisco Landmark No. 74, the Frank M. Stone House. Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** for interior and exterior alterations to the property, including the removal of an existing one-story rear addition and the construction of a new one-story rear addition in the footprint of the existing addition; the construction of a new carport and deck in the rear yard; modifications to the existing rear fence; the installation of two new skylights at the rear of the roof; and interior alterations at all levels. The subject property is located within a RTO-M (Residential Transit Oriented-Mission) Zoning District and 50-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: = Rebecca Salgado – Staff report
 + David Darling – Project presentation
 ACTION: Approved
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 MOTION: [0361](#)

10. [2018-008827DES](#) (S. FERGUSON: (415) 575-9074)
22 BEAVER STREET (BENEDICT-GIELING HOUSE) – north side of Beaver Street, Assessor's Block 3561, Lot 060 (District 8). Consideration to Recommend to the Board of Supervisors **Landmark Designation** of 22 Beaver Street (Benedict-Gieling House) as an individual Article 10 Landmark pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the Planning Code. The subject property is architecturally significant as a very early and well-preserved example of an Italianate villa and carriage house located within a landscaped garden setting. This item has been calendared following receipt of a community-sponsored Landmark Designation Application. 22 Beaver Street is located within a RH-2 (Residential-House, Two Family) and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: = Shannon Ferguson – Staff report
 + Karen Kai - Support
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 RESOLUTION: [999](#)

11. [2018-014691DES](#) (D. SMITH: (415) 575-9093)
2 HENRY ADAMS STREET – Assessor's Block 3910, Lot 001 (District 10). Consideration to Recommend to the Board of Supervisors **Landmark Designation** of 2 Henry Adams, historically known as the Dunham, Carrigan, and Hayden Building, as an individual Article

10 Landmark pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the Planning Code. This item has been calendared following receipt of Legislation introduced by Supervisor Cohen to amend the Planning Code. 2 Henry Adams Street is located within a PDR-1-D (Production, Distribution & Repair - 1 – Design) and 45-X Height and Bulk District
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: = Desiree Smith – Staff report
 + Speaker - Support
 + John Kevlin – Owner representation
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 RESOLUTION: [1000](#)

12. [2018-014198LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
1743 BUCHANAN STREET - located in the Buchanan Street Mall between Sutter and Post Streets in the Japantown Neighborhood Commercial District. Assessor's Block 0685, Lot 038 (District 5). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business** Registry application. Paper Tree is a Japanese origami paper and art supply store that has served San Francisco for 50 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within a NCD (Japantown Neighborhood Commercial District) Zoning District and 50-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: = Shelley Caltagirone – Staff report
 + Linda Mijara – Paper Tree
 + Sandy Mori - Support
 + Karen Kai - Support
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 RESOLUTION: [1001](#)

13. (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
[LEGACY BUSINESS REGISTRY MARKETING PLAN](#) – LEGACY BUSINESS PROGRAM MARKETING AND BRANDING PLAN – A presentation by Office of Small Business staff of the marketing and branding plan developed to promote the **Legacy Business** Registry. The Legacy Business Program logo was reviewed and adopted by the Small Business Commission at its October 22, 2018 hearing.
Preliminary Recommendation: None - Informational

SPEAKERS: = Shelley Caltagirone – Staff report
 + Speaker – Logo
 ACTION: None - Informational

14. 2015-0071810TH (D. SMITH: (415) 575-9093; S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)

[LANDMARK DESIGNATION](#) AND [CULTURAL HERITAGE WORK PROGRAM](#) QUARTERLY REPORTS - Discussion of the HPC's Landmark Designation Work Program and the Cultural Heritage Work Program.

Preliminary Recommendation: None – Informational

SPEAKERS: = Desiree Smith – Landmark Designation Quarterly report
= Shelley Caltagirone – Cultural Heritage report
+ Karen Kai - API

ACTION: None – Informational

ADJOURNMENT - 3:45 PM
ADOPTED DECEMBER 5, 2018