

SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Wednesday, September 5, 2018
12:30 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT WOLFRAM AT 12:33 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Pilar LaValley, Shannon Ferguson, Shelley Caltagirone, John Rahaim – Planning Director, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

At this time, members of the public may address the Commission on items of interest to the public that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission except agenda items. With respect to agenda items, your opportunity to address the Commission will be afforded when the item is reached in the meeting. Each member of the public may address the Commission for up to three minutes.

SPEAKERS: None

B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

1. Director's Announcements

None

2. Review of Past Events at the Planning Commission, Staff Report and Announcements

Pillar LaValley:

I do have a couple of announcements. Last week at the Planning Commission, they have approved -- unanimously approved with conditions a project at 807 Franklin/635 Fulton Street. This project includes the relocation of an 1870's Victorian residential building at 807 Franklin Street to the same site as 635 Fulton Street and then new construction on the site of 807 Franklin. 635 Fulton Street was identified as a historic resource significant for its association with African-American history as the Bryant Mortuary and 807 Franklin Street building was also a historic resource identified for its architecture and its association with the development of San Francisco after the Comstock silver discovery. And so, 635 Fulton was also relocated a few feet on the site to make room for the 807 Franklin building and then both buildings would be converted to multifamily residences with minimally visible 1-story additions.

Also last week, last Wednesday, Department staff and Commissioner Hyland attended the Victorian Alliances regular meeting to begin the public outreach process for the Historic Design Guidelines. The intent is to continue additional outreach with neighborhood and other organizations throughout the next couple of months and the meeting was well attended and following comments from Jeff Joslin and Commissioner Hyland, Tim Frye gave a presentation detailing why the guidelines are being develop to describe the overall process and provide room to review a number of some early ideas as to what areas the guidelines will cover. Then, Victorian Alliance members circulated to review a bunch of poster boards and speak with staff and we received many valuable comments. As with all outreach meetings, the Department intends to use the comments in drafting the eventual final document and shaping the guidelines and the recommendations that are contained. That concludes my report.

Commissioner Wolfram:

Since we have the Director here, I would just ask, given the Mayor's directive about expediting housing, if there is anything we, as a Commission, can do or Preservation staff can do too or are doing. If you can, maybe just explain a little bit about that?

John Rahaim, Planning Director:

Thank you for that question. The Mayor issued a directive late last week around, actually it was specifically around Accessory Dwelling Units. And we -- there had been -- there's been a substantial, well, a surprising, first of all, a surprising amount of interest. We are getting applications at the rate of about 500 a year for new units. Many of those are -- some of those are applications with multiple units in the same building. And there's been a backlog

partially due to disagreements among some of the departments around permitting and fire exiting and that sort of thing and there has been an agreement on how to move forward. And the Department has set up a desk on the 5th floor at DBI, the Permit floor at DBI that is specifically devoted to ADUs, just because of the sheer volume. The good news is that we have created a process and just kudos to Marcelle Boudreaux and our staff, to create a process where we believe we can actually approve that – the entire process for all the departments that can happen in four months. And so the Mayor's directive cites that goal and also cites the goal of clearing the backlog. There are actually 900 units in the backlog right now just for ADUs and she's asked us to clear that backlog within six months. Staff believes this is doable given this new procedure. I think for this Commission, of course the issue only comes up -- only -- comes up when there are historic resources involved. We are getting a number of, and you've probably seen them around town, a number of accessory dwelling units proposed in buildings that have garages on the first floor. And that's primarily because of the legislation passed three or four years ago by the Board to allow for ADUs when there's a seismic upgrade to a soft story building. And there's no limit as to the number of those units that can be placed on those buildings. So you will see those early twenty century buildings with garages along the first floor that have continuous curb cuts on the street, those are being converted, in many cases to units. Those go through the normal process with the preservation staff, but there are a number of those in our pipeline and so as they come up, we can certainly keep you informed. One of the goals -- the request I should say of the directive is to provide a report, I think quarterly, to the Mayor and the Board and this Commission, if you would like, on the status of the ADU Program. But I think, and overall, the good news is that is a much more robust program than anybody ever imagined it would be. And it does provide a more affordable mode of housing. And the way the legislation works is that if the units are in buildings that are currently subject to rent control, the new units are actually subject to rent control, because they're in a building constructed before 1989. So it actually, for the first time, we can construct new units that actually would be rent-controlled.

Commissioner Wolfram:

That's great. Thank you.

John Rahaim, Planning Director:

Certainly.

C. COMMISSION MATTERS

3. President's Report and Announcements

None

4. Consideration of Adoption:

- [Draft Minutes for Joint Hearing on July 18, 2018](#)
- [Draft Minutes for HPC Hearing on August 1, 2018](#)

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Adopted

AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

- [Draft Minutes for HPC Hearing on August 15, 2018](#)

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Adopted as Corrected

AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram

5. Commission Comments & Questions

Commissioner Johnck:

I just wanted to take a minute and congratulate the Planning Department on your Intern Program. It's convened in the summer; I know it's every summer, every year. And I took it up on recommendation of the Department and my colleague here, Commissioner Johns, to attend. I was only able to attend one of the sessions, but it was the Wednesday, August 22nd and there were five presentations, very, how should I say, very different and unusual, but very helpful to our program. There was a discussion of a historic context statement for the Edwardian style of architecture, which I thought, we always hear the word Victorian, but it was really a good, a detailed account of the elements of Edwardian. That was great. And then there was a discussion of the Social and Cultural aspects of architectural significance. In other words, beyond the building, how do we identify significance from a social and cultural standpoint? And identify different levels? And that was really quite interesting as well. Then there was a summary of the -- of Mayor Lee's directive to improve and streamline the environmental planning process for housing. And that was also very good. And I even suggested, why don't we look at that program for the entire all projects that go through Planning. So we'll see about that. Then there was a presentation on the history of the Russian families and Russian history in San Francisco and historic context statement on that history. And then a good friend of mine, who has been a consultant, an archaeological consultant for years, she is getting her degree, as I did, from Sonoma State in Archaeology and Cultural Research and Management. And she did a history of the archaeological influence of cemeteries here in the city and how oftentimes that's forgotten. It was called "The Departed" and it provided a lot of good information on that whole arena. I think you can probably look up the presentations. Tina Tam was in charge of it. There might be some of the presentations' power points on the website. We'll see. Well, anyway. But I just wanted to let you know. It's wonderful.

Commissioner Wolfram:

Glad you were able to attend.

Commissioner Johnck:

Yeah, it was great, yeah.

Commissioner Johns:

While you were attending those programs, I was in Victoria, British Columbia. I know the subject of facades comes up before this Commission every now and again and I found that Victoria has really gone to great lengths to attempt to preserve the facades of its old buildings. I said earlier that it is not an example of unmitigated bliss but many of the

preserved facades have been integrated very, very nicely into buildings in Victoria. So if you're thinking of going north of the border, it would be a very, very interesting, and I think informative, trip.

D. CONSENT CALENDAR

All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the Historic Preservation Commission, and may be acted upon by a single roll call vote of the Commission. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Commission, the public, or staff so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item at this or a future hearing.

6. [2018-005952COA](#) (A. KIRBY: (415) 575-9133)
59 POTOMAC – located on the west side between Waller and Duboce Park, Assessor's Block 0865, Lot 008 (District 5). Request for **Certificate of Appropriateness** to construct a new three-story rear addition extending ten feet, nine inches from the existing rear wall, interior remodel of the residence, and façade repairs. The subject property is located within a Duboce Park Landmark District, RH-2 (Residential – House, Two Family) Zoning District, and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 MOTIONS: 0347

E. REGULAR CALENDAR

7. [2018-008949DES](#) (S. FERGUSON: (415) 575-9074)
175 GOLDEN GATE AVENUE – South side of Golden Gate Avenue between Jones and Leavenworth streets, Assessor's Parcel Block No. 0349, Lot No. 011 (District 6) Consideration to adopt a Resolution recommending the Board of Supervisors approve an Ordinance amending the Planning Code and Zoning Map to rezone the building at 175 Golden Gate Avenue from RC-4 (Residential-Commercial, High Density) to C-3-G (Commercial, Downtown General) and **designate 175 Golden Gate Avenue as a Category III, Contributory Building** in order to provide for eligibility to sell transferable development rights (TDR). Historically known as the St. Boniface School, 175 Golden Gate Avenue was constructed in 1908 as part of the adjacent St. Boniface Catholic Church complex. In 1983, the church and rectory building (133-135 Golden Gate Avenue, Assessor's Parcel Block No. 0349, Lot Nos. 012 and 013) was designated as San Francisco City Landmark No. 172. The subject building located at 175 Golden Gate Avenue is not designated as part of San Francisco City Landmark No.172. 175 Golden Gate Avenue is located in RC-4 – Residential-Commercial, High Density zoning district and an 80-T, 120-T Height and Bulk district.
 (Continued from Regular Hearing on August 1, 2018)
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: = Shannon Ferguson – Staff report

ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 RESOLUTION: [970](#)

8. [2017-001773DES](#) (S. FERGUSON: (415) 575-9074)
524 UNION STREET (PAPER DOLL) – north side of Union Street at Cadell Place, Assessor's Block 0103, Lot 009 (District 3). Consideration to **Initiate Landmark Designation** of the former Paper Doll bar as an Article 10 Landmark pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the Planning Code. The subject property is significant as one of the earliest LGBTQ bars that is associated with the development of LGBTQ communities in San Francisco; and is also significant for its association with owner Dante Benedetti who became one of the people on the front lines in the fight for LGBTQ civil rights in San Francisco in the 1950s. This item has been calendared following receipt of a community-sponsored Landmark Designation Application. 524 Union Street is located within a NCD – North Beach Neighborhood Commercial District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Initiate

SPEAKERS: = Shannon Ferguson – Staff report
 + Speaker – Mona Sargent
 + Speaker – Support
 ACTION: Initiated
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 RESOLUTION: [971](#)

- 9a. [2018-011493LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
1399 CHURCH STREET – on the northeast corner of 26th Street and Church Street in Noe Valley. Assessor's Block 6551, Lot 022A (District 8). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. Chloe's Café has served San Francisco for 31 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within the within a NC-1 (Neighborhood Commercial, Cluster) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: = Shelley Caltagirone – Staff report
 + Richard Carrillo – Chloe's Café
 + Taylor Safford – Pier 39
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval with findings, recommendations and features listed in the case report
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 RESOLUTION: [972](#)

- 9b. [2018-011495LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
1632 HAIGHT STREET – on the north side of Haight Street between Clayton and Cole streets in the Haight Ashbury District. Assessor's Block 1230, Lot 009 (District 5). Consideration of

adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. FTC Skateboarding has served San Francisco for 24 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within the within the Haight Street NCD (Haight Street Neighborhood Commercial District) Zoning District and in 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as item 9a.
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval with findings, recommendations and features listed in the case report
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 RESOLUTION: [973](#)

- 9c. [2018-011496LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
501 HAIGHT STREET – on the west side of Fillmore Street between Haight and Laussat streets in the Lower Haight neighborhood. Assessor’s Block 0860, Lot 061 (District 5). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. Haight and Fillmore Whole Foods has served San Francisco for 40 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within the within a NC-2 (Neighborhood Commercial, Small Scale) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as item 9a.
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval with findings, recommendations and features listed in the case report
 AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
 RESOLUTION: [974](#)

- 9d. [2018-011497LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
2323 CHESTNUT STREET – on the southwest corner of Chestnut and Scott streets in the Marina District. Assessor’s Block 0936, Lot 001 (District 2). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. Marina Supermarket has served San Francisco for 94 years. The **Legacy Business Registry** recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within the within a NC-2 (Neighborhood Commercial, Small Scale) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as item 9a.
ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval with findings, recommendations and features listed in the case report
AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
RESOLUTION: [975](#)

- 9e. [2018-010966LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
PIER 39 – on the north side of the Embarcadero between Pier 41 and Pier 35 in the North Beach neighborhood. Assessor’s Block 0031, Lots 007-079; Assessor’s Block 990, Lot 039; and Assessor’s Block 990, Lot 502 (District 3). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business Registry** application. Pier 39 Ltd Partnership has served San Francisco for 40 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within the within a C-2 (Community Business) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as item 9a.
ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval with findings, recommendations and features listed in the case report
AYES: Black, Hyland, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman, Wolfram
RESOLUTION: 976

ADJOURNMENT – 1:22 PM
ADOPTED SEPTEMBER 19, 2018