

SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Wednesday, March 21, 2018
12:30 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Wolfram, Hyland, Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT WOLFRAM AT 1:23 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Jeff Joslin – Director of Current Planning, Shelley Caltagirone, Natalia Kwiatkowska, John Rahaim, Steve Wertheim, Desiree Smith, Matt Snyder, Tim Frye – Preservation Officer, Jonas P. Ionin –Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

At this time, members of the public may address the Commission on items of interest to the public that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission except agenda items. With respect to agenda items, your opportunity to address the Commission will be afforded when the item is reached in the meeting. Each member of the public may address the Commission for up to three minutes.

None

B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

1. Director's Announcements

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

No formal director's announcement for this afternoon but I am happy to forward any questions or comments you may have for him for another hearing.

2. Review of Past Events at the Planning Commission, Staff Report and Announcements

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

A few items to share with you; no formal Planning Commission report, however, a few items at the Board of Supervisors. One, New Era Hall on Market Street near the intersection of Church and Market Street, has finally made it through the landmark designation process at the Full Board. That was heard last week and I believe had its final reading and now moves on to a signature from the Mayor. The Diamond Heights Safety Sculpture also was heard at the Land Use Committee. There was some question from the Department of Public Works and the Committee members regarding the ownership of the structure. Staff was able to confirm that, in fact, the Redevelopment Agency had gifted the property to the City and that it's under DPW's jurisdiction. However, we're going to have a meeting in the next couple weeks with DPW and the community members that submitted the landmark designation just to talk about next steps. Our understanding is Department of Public Works would like a structural engineer to go out and look at the sculpture and really figure out if there are any immediate issues that need to be addressed sooner rather than later. Once that meeting takes place, then we have more information on the structural integrity of the Safety Wall, it will likely move to the Full Board for a vote.

Also, I wanted to update you on one remaining Mills Act application. This morning I was at the Government Audit and Oversight Committee for 60-62 Carmelita Street. This is a contributing building to the Duboce Park Landmark District and one of the remaining Mills Act applications that was postponed last November due to concerns from the Committee over the Owner Move-In Eviction that had previously taken place at that location. The Department was able to provide the Committee members with additional information and also to demonstrate that the Owner Move-In Eviction did not involve tenants that were of a protected class. The property owners in addition to Supervisor Sheehy's office were in attendance at the Committee meeting this morning. The Committee members felt satisfied with the level of information we provided regarding the Owner Move-In Eviction. They did state that they would prefer to receive that information as part of their case packet for future Mill's Act contract consideration. I'm not sure how it will be used in the deliberations, but that is something we will work with the City Attorney on those future applications, but ultimately, they forwarded a positive recommendation to support that Mill's Act contract and that will move forward to the Board of Supervisors next week.

Then finally, just to give you a heads-up that this week a member of the public filed an appeal on the Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the Early Days Sculpture from the Pioneer Monument. That will move to the Board of Appeals and that's scheduled for April 18th where the Department will present on the Commission's action. Based on our quick reading of the appeal documentation, the appellant does not believe that removing

the Early Days Sculpture meets the Secretary of Interior Standards. That's something we will prepare a case report for and we're happy to share that with you, if you're interested.

Commissioner Pearlman:

Thanks, a question about that.

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

Sure.

Commissioner Pearlman:

I thought that the path was from the Historic Commission to the Board of Supervisors.

President Wolfram:

It went back to the Arts Commission.

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

The Arts Commission has to move through a formal process to –

Commissioner Pearlman:

No what I meant in terms of appeal. I thought appeals of our decisions –

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

Only when they are coupled with a Conditional Use Authorization or another entitlement; if there's no other entitlement involved, it goes directly to the Board of Appeals.

Commissioner Pearlman:

Okay thank you.

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

Commissioners, that concludes my comments unless you have any questions.

Commissioner Matsuda:

I have just one question. We had Mill's Act revisions or discussion on our agenda and it was continued. Is that going to come back soon?

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

It is. We're currently working with the City Attorney's Office on some revised language for you to consider. Once we have that ready we will bring that back to you, hopefully in the next couple of months I believe.

C. COMMISSION MATTERS

3. President's Report and Announcements

President Wolfram:

I would like to announce today that I'm delighted to welcome our new Commissioner, Kate Black, to the Commission. Welcome and we're glad to have you.

Commissioner Black:

I am very happy to be here.

4. Consideration of Adoption:
- [Draft Minutes for HPC March 7, 2018](#)

SPEAKERS: None
ACTION: Adopted
AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman

5. Commission Comments & Questions

Commissioner Matsuda:

I have a comment. I think it was last week that I'm sure that I wasn't the only one, probably all the Commissioners got a number of emails regarding SB-827 by Senator Wiener. I was wondering if Mr. Frye, if you can provide us with any information or insight you have on that.

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

Commissioners, I believe the Planning Commission has received a couple informational items on those State Bills and we're happy to either have an informational hearing here or just forward you our case reports. Happy to do either and we can schedule that through the Department contacts.

Commissioner Matsuda:

What's the status of that legislation?

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

That I am not sure of at this moment.

President Wolfram:

Why don't we, I think it would be helpful to schedule an informational presentation to talk about the impact that the Department might see with regards to historic resources.

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

Sure.

D. CONSIDERATION OF ITEMS PROPOSED FOR CONTINUANCE

The Commission will consider a request for continuance to a later date. The Commission may choose to continue the item to the date proposed below, to continue the item to another date, or to hear the item on this calendar.

6. 2015-005890DES (S. FERGUSON: (415) 575-9074)
546-554 FILLMORE, 735 FELL STREET, 660 OAK STREET – east side of Fillmore Street, north side of Oak Street, south side of Fell Street, Assessor's Blocks/Lots 0828/021, 0828/022, 0828/022A and 0828/012, (District 5). Consideration to Recommend to the Board of Supervisors **Landmark Designation** of the former Sacred Heart Church Complex which includes the former rectory, church, school and convent buildings pursuant to Article 10, Section 1004(c) of the Planning Code. Sacred Heart Parish Complex is significant for its association with the growth and development of the Western Addition and Catholic religious institutions in San Francisco in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries;

with prominent and influential civil rights activist Father Eugene Boyle, pastor of the church from 1968 to 1972; as a distinctive and well-executed example of a Romanesque Revival-style Catholic parish grouping and for its association with master architect Thomas J. Welsh. 546-548 Fillmore Street is located in a RM-3 Residential-Mixed, Medium Density Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District; 554 Fillmore Street is located in a RM-1 Residential-Mixed, Low Density Zoning District and 40-X Height And Bulk District; 735 Fell Street is located in a RM-3 Residential-Mixed, Medium Density Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District; and 660 Oak Street is located in a RM-1 Residential-Mixed, Low Density Zoning District and 40-X Height And Bulk District.

(Proposed Continuance to April 18, 2018)

SPEAKERS: +Andrew Junius – Indefinite continuance
 ACTION: Continued Indefinitely
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman

E. REGULAR CALENDAR

7. [2018-003341LBR](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
5267 3RD STREET – east side of 3rd Street between Underwood Avenue and Van Dyke Avenue in the Bayview neighborhood. Assessor’s Block 5385, Lot 003 (District 10). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a Legacy Business application. The Jazz Room is a music venue and bar that has served San Francisco for 56 years. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within the within a NC-3 (Neighborhood Commercial District, Moderate Scale) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: = Shelly Caltagirone – Staff report
 + Theo Ellington – Jazz Room
 + Earl Shaddix – Jazz Room
 ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
 RESOLUTION: [942](#)

8. [2015-009647COA](#) (N. KWIATKOWSKA: (415) 575-9185)
3RD STREET BRIDGE – also known as the Francis “Lefty” O’Doul Bridge, located between King and Channel Streets (District 6). Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** for repair and rehabilitation of the existing bridge consisting of: repair and replacement of steel bridge members and the fender pile system, repair of the concrete piles and steel stairway, replacement of the existing deck, and repainting and recoating. The subject bridge is designated as San Francisco Landmark No. 194 per Article 10 of the Planning Code.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: = Natalia Kwiatkowska – Staff report
 + Thomas Reittman – Project presentation
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman

MOTION: 0333

- 9a. [2011.1356M](#) (S. WERTHEIM: (415) 558-6612)
CENTRAL SOMA PLAN – AMENDMENTS TO THE GENERAL PLAN – **Review and Comment** on General Plan Amendments to add the Central South of Market (SoMa) Area Plan, generally bounded on its western portion by 6th Street, on its eastern portion by 2nd Street, on its northern portion by the border of the Downtown Plan Area, and on its southern portion by Townsend Street; making conforming amendments to the Commerce and Industry Element, the Housing Element, the Urban Design Element, the Land Use Index, and the East SoMa and West SoMa Area Plans; and making environmental findings, including adopting a statement of overriding considerations, and findings of consistency with the General Plan and the eight priority policies of Planning Code Section 101.1. For more information on the Central SoMa Plan, go to <http://centralsoma.sfplanning.org>.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adoption

SPEAKERS: + John Rahaim – Introduction
 + Steve Wertheim – Plan presentation
 + Katherine Petrin – Two positive aspects of the plan
 + Mike Buhler – Support
 + Speaker – Support
 + Jon Lau – Mint restoration project

ACTION: Adopted a Resolution Recommending the Planning Commission and Board of Supervisors Approve Amendments to the GP, Administrative Code, Planning Code and Zoning Map as amended to include:
 1. Increasing the contribution for rehabilitation of the Old Mint building to at least \$50M; and
 2. Increasing the funding for cultural heritage tangible and intangible programming efforts to at least \$50M.

AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman

RESOLUTION: 943

- 9b. [2011.1356T](#) (S. WERTHEIM: (415) 558-6612)
CENTRAL SOMA PLAN – AMENDMENTS TO THE ADMINISTRATIVE CODE AND THE PLANNING CODE – **Review and Comment** on Administrative Code and Planning Code Amendments to give effect to the Central South of Market (SoMa) Area Plan, generally bounded on its western portion by 6th Street, on its eastern portion by 2nd Street, on its northern portion by the border of the Downtown Plan Area, and on its southern portion by Townsend Street; making approval findings under the California Environmental Quality Act, including adopting a statement of overriding considerations; and making findings of consistency with the General Plan and the eight priority policies of Planning Code Section 101.1, and findings of public necessity, convenience, and welfare under Planning Code Section 302. For more information on the Central SoMa Plan, go to <http://centralsoma.sfplanning.org>.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adoption

SPEAKERS: Same as Item 9a.

ACTION: Same as Item 9a.

AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman

RESOLUTION: 943

- 9c. [2011.1356Z](#) (S. WERTHEIM: (415) 558-6612)

CENTRAL SOMA PLAN – AMENDMENTS TO THE ZONING MAP. **Review and Comment** on Zoning Map Amendments to the Planning Code to create the Central South of Market (SoMa) Special Use District and make other amendments to the Height and Bulk District Maps and Zoning Use District Maps consistent with the Central SoMa Area Plan, encompassing an area generally bounded on its western portion by 6th Street, on its eastern portion by 2nd Street, on its northern portion by the border of the Downtown Plan Area, and on its southern portion by Townsend Street; affirming the Planning Department’s determination under the California Environmental Quality Act; and making findings of consistency with the General Plan and the eight priority policies of Planning Code Section 101.1. For more information on the Central SoMa Plan, go to <http://centralsoma.sfplanning.org>.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adoption

SPEAKERS: Same as Item 9a.
 ACTION: Same as Item 9a.
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
 RESOLUTION: 943

- 10a. [2017-004023DES](#) (D. SMITH: (415) 575-9093)
228-248 Townsend Street – north side of Townsend Street between Lusk and Clyde streets, Assessor’s Block 3787, Lot 018 (District 6). As part of the Central SoMa planning effort, consideration to **Initiate Landmark Designation** of the New Pullman Hotel as an individual Article 10 Landmark pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the Planning Code. The New Pullman Hotel is significant as the city’s only hotel that catered specifically to African American railroad workers, including Pullman porters and maids, during the early to mid-twentieth century. On a national scale, Pullman porters and maids established the first all-Black union in the country, contributed to the development of the African American middle class, and laid important foundations for the Civil Rights Movement. The property is also associated with the 1906 Earthquake and Fire post-disaster reconstruction era in San Francisco. 228-248 Townsend Street is located in the SLI – SOMA Service – Light Industrial Zoning District and 65-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Initiate

SPEAKERS: = Desiree Smith – Staff report
 = Speaker – Clyde and Crooks
 = Katherine Beckwith – No notice
 ACTION: Initiated Landmark Designation
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
 RESOLUTION: [944](#)

- 10b. [2017-002874DES](#) (S. FERGUSON: (415) 575-9074)
457 BRYANT STREET – south side of Bryant Street, Assessor’s Block 3775, Lot 085 (District 9). As part of the Central SoMa planning effort, consideration to **Initiate Landmark Designation** of the former Pile Drivers, Bridge and Structural Ironworkers Local No. 77 Union Hall as an individual Article 10 Landmark pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the Planning Code. The Pile Drivers, Bridge and Structural Ironworkers Local No. 77 Union Hall is significant as one of the early extant union halls in San Francisco and played an important role in the growth of organized labor in the city, and is also associated with the 1906 Earthquake and Fire post-disaster reconstruction era in San Francisco. 457 Bryant Street is

located in a SLI – SOMA Service – Light Industrial Zoning District and 45-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Initiate

SPEAKERS: Same as Item 10a.
 ACTION: Initiated Landmark Designation
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
 RESOLUTION: [945](#)

- 10c. [2017-004129DES](#) (F. MCMILLEN: (415) 575-9076)
500-504 FOURTH STREET – south side of Fourth Street, Assessor’s Block 3777, Lot 001 (District 9). As part of the Central SoMa planning effort, consideration to **Initiate Landmark Designation** of the Hotel Utah as an individual Article 10 Landmark pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the Planning Code. The Hotel Utah is associated with the 1906 Earthquake and Fire post-disaster reconstruction era in San Francisco and is significant as a rare remaining example of the numerous residential hotels constructed in SoMa during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Hotel Utah is also significant for its Edwardian style architecture, a style commonly employed in the design of residential hotels of the period. 500-504 Fourth Street is located in a SLI – SOMA Service – Light Industrial Zoning District and 65-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Initiate

SPEAKERS: Same as Item 10a.
 ACTION: Initiated Landmark Designation
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
 RESOLUTION: [946](#)

- 10d. [2017-010250DES](#) (F. MCMILLEN: (415) 575-9076)
CLYDE AND CROOKS WAREHOUSE HISTORIC DISTRICT – Assessor’s Block 3787 Lots 005, 014, 015, 016, 037, 040A, 044, 048, 033, 151, 017, 021, 022, 019, 036, 040, 018, 013, 152-159 (District 9). As part of the Central SoMa planning effort, consideration to **Initiate Landmark District Designation** of the Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District as an Article 10 Landmark District pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the Planning Code. The Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District is representative of 19th century development of the South of Market area as a center of industrial production in San Francisco and maritime commerce along the west coast. The district’s mix of industrial and warehouse buildings interspersed with residential structures is typical of the land use patterns developed in the 19th century in the South of Market neighborhood and continued during the 1906 earthquake and fire reconstruction period. The buildings exemplify early 20th century methods of construction and materials and the return of South of Market’s function as the industrial center of the city following the earthquake and fire. The Clyde and Crooks Warehouse Historic District is located in a SLI – SOMA Service – Light Industrial Zoning District and 65-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Initiate

SPEAKERS: Same as Item 10a.
 ACTION: Initiated Landmark Designation
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
 RESOLUTION: [947](#)

- 10e. [2017-010156DES](#) (F. MCMILLEN: (415) 575-9076)
MINT-MISSION CONSERVATION DISTRICT – Assessor’s Block 3704, Lots 003, 010, 012, 013, 017, 018, 019, 020, 021, 022, 024, 028, 029, 034, 035, 059, 079, 113, 144; Assessor’s Block 3725, Lots 087, 088 (District 4). As part of the Central SoMa planning effort, consideration to **Initiate Conservation District Designation** of the Mint-Mission Conservation District as an Article 11 Conservation District pursuant to Section 1107 of the Planning Code. The Mint-Mission Conservation District encompasses a cohesive concentration of reinforced concrete and brick masonry buildings constructed between 1906 and 1930. The District retains a mix of residential hotels, small-scale commercial buildings, warehouses and manufacturing facilities reflective of the area’s role as the center of industrial production in San Francisco and the major supplier of mining equipment, heavy machinery and other goods to the western states. The District is comprised of twenty-two properties, nineteen of which include contributing resources. The Mint Mission Conservation District is located in a C-3-G-Downtown General Zoning District and 90-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Initiate

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Continued to April 18, 2018
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman

- 10f. [2018-002775DES](#) (F. MCMILLEN: (415) 575-9076)
KEARNY-MARKET-MASON-SUTTER CONSERVATION DISTRICT – Assessor’s Block 3705, Lots 021, 023, 039, 054 (District 4). As part of the Central SoMa planning effort, consideration to **Initiate Change in Designation** of an unrated building, 55 5th Street, Assessor’s Block 3705 lot 039, to a Category IV (Contributing) resource pursuant to Section 1106 of the Planning Code; and Initiate a Change in the Boundary of the Kearny-Market-Mason-Sutter Conservation District to include 55 5th Street, Assessor’s Block 3705 lot 039; 67-99 5th Street, Assessor’s Block 3705 lots 021, 023; and 898 Mission Street, Assessor’s Block 3705 lot 054 pursuant to Section 1107 of the Planning Code. The Kearny-Market-Mason-Sutter Conservation District is located in a C-3-G-Downtown General Zoning District and 90-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Initiate

SPEAKERS: Same as Item 10a.
 ACTION: Initiated Landmark Designation
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Black, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
 RESOLUTION: [948](#)

11. 2007.0946CWP (M. SNYDER: (415) 575-6891)
CANDLESTICK POINT HUNTERS POINT SHIPYARD PHASE II DEVELOPMENT PROJECT – The Candlestick Point Hunters Point Phase II development project consists of Candlestick Point, which generally encompasses the former Candlestick Park Stadium and parking lot, the Candlestick Point State Recreational Area, the Alice Griffith Housing development site. The Hunters Point Shipyard Phase II site encompasses roughly 402 acres and includes all of Hunters Point Shipyard except for the portions referred to as “Hilltop” and “Hillside”. **Informational Presentation** on proposed revisions to the Project including the re-envisioning of the Hunters Point Shipyard, including plans on preserving the site’s historic resources. The resultant Project would consist of approximately 10,672 units, 4,265,000 of R&D/Office use, 790,000 gsf of regional retail, 432,000 gsf of neighborhood retail and maker space, along with new schools, public facilities, artist studios, and visitor

uses. The Project also includes establishing new streets and development blocks along with approximately of 338 acres of parks and open space. The Hunters Point Shipyard portion of the site is within the Hunters Point Shipyard Redevelopment Project Area, the Hunters Point Shipyard Special Use District and the HP Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: None – Informational

SPEAKERS: = Matt Snyder – Staff presentation
 + Speaker – Project presentation
 + Ben Treunel – Design presentation
 + Stacy Carter – Preservation of existing buildings
 + Scott Maddison – Endorse D4D changes

ACTION: None – Informational

ADJOURNMENT – 4:07 PM

ADOPTED APRIL 4, 2018