



# SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

**MEMO**

**DATE:** March 27, 2019

**TO:** **President Hyland, and members of the Historic Preservation Commission**

**FROM:** Veronica Flores, Senior Planner, (415) 575-9173

**REVIEWED BY:** Aaron Starr, Manager of Legislative Affairs, (415) 558-6362  
Tim Frye, Historic Preservation Officer, (415) 575-6822

**RE:** **Review and Approval of Architectural Review Standards for “No Waiver” Accessory Dwelling Units for Properties Listed on the California Register of Historic Places, and Properties Designated Individually or as Part of Districts Pursuant to Articles 10 or 11**

1650 Mission St.  
Suite 400  
San Francisco,  
CA 94103-2479

Reception:  
**415.558.6378**

Fax:  
**415.558.6409**

Planning  
Information:  
**415.558.6377**

The Planning Department is requesting review and approval from the Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) regarding Architectural Review Standards for “No Waiver” Accessory Dwelling Units (ADU) for properties listed on the California Register of Historic Places, and properties designated individually or as part of districts pursuant to Articles 10 or 11.

## BACKGROUND

On November 27, 2018 Supervisor Safai introduced a proposed Ordinance under Board of Supervisors (hereinafter “Board”) File Number 181156, which would amend Planning Code Section 207 to authorize the addition of an Accessory Dwelling Unit in the construction of a new single-family home or multi-family building; clarifying the ministerial approval process and creating an expedited Board of Appeals process for certain accessory dwelling units in single-family homes meeting specific requirements.

The Planning Commission conducted a public hearing to consider the proposed Ordinance on February 14, 2019. At that hearing, the Planning Commission continued the item to March 7, 2019 so that the HPC could consider the Ordinance first on March 6, 2019. In March 2019, both the HPC and Planning Commission adopted a Recommendation for Approval of said Ordinance.

San Francisco first adopted a local ADU program in 2015. Since then, the City has made several updates to the program both in response to changes to state law and to improve the City’s local ADU program. The proposed ordinance will update San Francisco’s ADU programs to comply with amendments to the state law. Additionally, the proposed ordinance clarifies the ministerial approval process and streamlines the appeal process for ADUs under the local program implementing the state law.

## ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW STANDARDS

The Planning Department recommended Planning Code Section 207(c)(6)(B)(v) be amended to specify that ADU projects will be required to prevent adverse impacts on properties designated individually or as part of districts pursuant to Articles 10 and 11, and that said projects will not be subject to the Certificate of



# SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

MEMO

Appropriateness (CoA) or Permit to Alter (PTA) review processes. Instead these projects will be reviewed for compliance with Architectural Review Standards adopted by the HPC, including but not limited to those listed under Item No. 19 of the Historic Preservation Commission Motion No. 0349 adopted on October 3, 2018, and the Architectural Review Standards in the attached Motion.

## STAFF ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATION

While current historic preservation guidelines and policies afford a wide range of interpretation to demonstrate compatibility and harmony between alterations to a historic building or within a historic context, the Architectural Review Standards take a conservative approach. This approach is to minimize the loss of historic materials and to ensure that new construction within a historic context does not disrupt the character and quality of life that justifies designation and the local and State levels.

The Architectural Review Standards are intended to address projects that fall into several scenarios.

- A project that proposes an ADU within an existing single-family building,
- A project that proposes an ADU within a newly constructed single-family building, or
- A project that proposed an ADU as newly constructed accessory dwelling on a lot that also contains an existing building.

Department preservation staff provides the draft Architectural Review Standards attached to this memo and incorporating the comments received by the HPC at its March 6, 2019 hearing to address new construction.

## REQUESTED ACTION

Specifically, the Department seeks comment and approval on the following:

- Architectural Review Standards for "No Waiver" Accessory Dwelling Units in properties listed on the California Register of Historic Places, and properties designated individually or as part of districts pursuant to Articles 10 or 11.

## ATTACHMENTS

Draft Motion



# SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

---

## Historic Preservation Commission Draft Motion

HEARING DATE APRIL 3, 2019

1650 Mission St.  
Suite 400  
San Francisco,  
CA 94103-2479

Reception:  
**415.558.6378**

Fax:  
**415.558.6409**

Planning  
Information:  
**415.558.6377**

### **MOTION TO APPROVE ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW STANDARDS FOR “NO WAIVER” ACCESSORY DWELLING UNITS FOR PROPERTIES LISTED ON THE CALIFORNIA REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES, AND PROPERTIES DESIGNATED INDIVIDUALLY OR AS PART OF DISTRICTS PURSUANT TO ARTICLES 10 OR 11.**

WHEREAS, the HPC has approved amendments to the Planning Code to require that Accessory Dwelling Units (ADUs) regulated pursuant to Planning Code Section 207(c)(6) under the “No Waiver” Program shall comply with any architectural review standards adopted by the HPC; and

WHEREAS, the HPC has identified Accessory Dwelling Unit Architectural Review Standards that, if complied with, would prevent adverse impacts to historic resources, including to properties listed on the California Register of Historic Places and properties designated individually or as part of a district pursuant to Article 10 or 11; and

WHEREAS, the HPC has heard and considered the testimony presented to it at the public hearing and has further considered written materials and oral testimony presented on behalf of Department staff and other interested parties; and

MOVED, that the HPC hereby **adopts** the following Accessory Dwelling Unit Architectural Review Standards, compliance with which will prevent adverse impacts to historic resources, including properties listed on the California Register of Historic Places and properties designated individually or as part of a district pursuant to Article 10 or 11. An ADU project on any such property must comply with all of these Standards in order to be regulated pursuant to Section 207(c)(6) as a “No Waiver” project:

1. When an ADU is proposed to be constructed within the building envelope of an existing single-family home, or as an addition to an existing single-family home:
  - a. Character-defining features, as described and depicted in the corresponding designating ordinance and supporting case report for the individual property or district, as designated pursuant to Article 10 or 11, will be preserved or replaced to match the historic feature(s) in material, design, color, and texture.
  - b. Any new cladding will match surrounding historic materials located at the base of the building in regards to material, installation, profiles and dimensions.
  - c. All new windows, doors, and openings will match the size, shape, material, and profile of existing historic windows, doors, and openings on the subject building.

1. Notwithstanding the above, the size and number of new doors and openings will not exceed the minimum required to meet Planning and Building Code requirements.
  - d. Additions to accommodate ADUs will not be visible from surrounding public rights-of-way and will be limited to one-story above grade in height.
  - e. The ADU will comply with the relevant standards described in item No. 19 of the Historic Preservation Commission Motion No. 0349 adopted on October 3, 2018.
2. When an ADU is proposed to be incorporated into the new construction of a single-family home:
  - a. There will be no change to the exterior cladding materials at the location of the ADU.
  - b. Window and door openings for the ADU will not exceed the minimum requirements to meet the provisions of the Planning Code and Building Code.
  - c. The material, shape, and profile of windows and doors for the ADU will match those of the subject single-family home.
3. When an ADU is proposed to be constructed as a new, detached structure on a property also containing an existing single-family home:
  - a. The exterior walls of the detached ADU structure will align with the exterior walls of the existing single-family home on at least one side yard such that the detached ADU structure is wholly located behind the existing single-family home.
    1. When the subject property is a corner lot, the detached ADU structure will be aligned with the deepest side yard setback as measured from the side street to maintain the existing setting.
  - b. The detached ADU structure will be limited to one story above grade in height.
  - c. The roof form of the detached ADU structure will be constructed as a flat roof or will otherwise match the roof form of the existing single-family home on the subject lot.
  - d. The cladding, windows, and doors of the detached ADU structure will match the cladding, windows, and doors of the existing single-family home in material, shape, and profile.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the HPC hereby ADOPTS the proposed Accessory Dwelling Unit Architectural Review Standards in this Motion.

I hereby certify that the foregoing Motion was adopted by the Commission at its meeting on April 3, 2019.

Jonas P. Ionin  
Commission Secretary

AYES:

NOES:

ABSENT:

ADOPTED: April 3, 2019