

# SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



## Draft – Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400  
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

**Wednesday, December 7, 2016**  
**12:30 p.m.**  
**Regular Meeting**

**COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:** Wolfram, Hyland, Pearlman, Johns, Johnck, Matsuda  
**COMMISSIONERS ABSENT:** Hasz

**THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT WOLFRAM AT 12:37 PM**

**STAFF IN ATTENDANCE:** Jeff Joslin – Director of Current Planning, Rich Sucre, Chelsea Fordham, Frances McMillen, Shannon Ferguson, Desiree Smith, Tim Frye – Historic Preservation Officer, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

### **SPEAKER KEY:**

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

### **A. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT**

At this time, members of the public may address the Commission on items of interest to the public that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission except agenda items. With respect to agenda items, your opportunity to address the Commission will be afforded when the item is reached in the meeting. Each member of the public may address the Commission for up to three minutes.

**SPEAKER:** Richard Kurylo – Legacy Business Registration  
Jennifer Fisher – 1523-1525 Franklin St.

**B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS**

1. Director's Announcements

None

2. Review of Past Events at the Planning Commission, Staff Report and Announcements

None

**C. COMMISSION MATTERS**

3. President's Report and Announcements

**President Wolfram:**

I do have a few announcements today. One is, I believe we are going to have a little gathering, a commission gathering, on the day we are not having a hearing, which is the 21<sup>st</sup>. We were going to have a hearing on the 21<sup>st</sup>, but it's been cancelled but the idea was at 5:00 that time to have a gathering at Sam's Grill, a legacy business that we designated or recommended a designation, I think at 5:00. I think Mr. Ionin will send out some information to commissioners and it will also be posted as a public matter. The second item is that I am putting forth a nomination of two landmark trees, which any of us as commissioners, Historic Preservation Commissioners are able to do and we are not actually required to hold a hearing on this item, but I thought as a courtesy, I would tell you what they are: one of them is a California buckeye located at the corner of McAllister and Willard Street. It's really a majestic tree, I think Commissioner Johns is really familiar with it. It's in front of a really charming farm house structure very close to the Koret Center at USF. The second tree is a metrasideros robusta, it's a rare New Zealand tree, in front of 1776 Vallejo Street which is on the property line with the Burr House which is San Francisco landmark number 31. Just for your information. I will keep you posted on the process. This is the first time that we have done it and I'm not sure how it will go.

4. Consideration of Adoption:

- [Draft Minutes for ARC Site September 21, 2016](#)
- [Draft Minutes for ARC September 21, 2016](#)
- [Draft Minutes for ARC November 2, 2016](#)
- [Draft Minutes for HPC November 16, 2016](#)

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Adopted

AYES: Wolfram, Johnck, Johns, Pearlman, Hyland, Matsuda

ABSENT: Hasz

5. Commission Comments & Questions

**Commissioner Johnck:**

I have in my notes to ask about the Planning Commission adoption of Urban Design Guidelines. Did I miss something?

**Director Rahaim:**

Commissioners we have been working for a number of months, perhaps more than a year, on kind of draft urban designing guidelines that would cover larger scale building across the city. Those are still underway. We had another public meeting on that topic on Monday evening. Those are not yet adopted. I don't believe there is a date yet for the adoption, but we hope they can be adopted in the first half of next year. We are happy to have staff come to you and present those as well if that makes sense.

**Commissioner Johnck:**

I would be interested.

**Director Rahaim:**

There is, and Tim could to speak on this, but there is a separate guideline that Tim and his team are working on historic guidelines. These are citywide guidelines for larger scale development.

**Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:**

The historic guidelines will work in concert with the urban design guidelines. They are still in draft form. We anticipate that, I believe by February, we will have a working draft to share with the public and start the process and the public engagement process similar to the UDG's, but we are happy to bring both documents to you in more of an informal hearing. I don't know if the full commission would want to hear that or that's just for the ARC, but we're happy to do either.

**Commissioner Johnck:**

I could attend the ARC if you want to schedule it there. I would be interested in that, don't you all?

**President Wolfram:**

I think a brief hearing would be appropriate.

**D. CONSENT CALENDAR**

All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the Historic Preservation Commission, and may be acted upon by a single roll call vote of the Commission. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Commission, the public, or staff so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item at this or a future hearing.

6. [2016-005462COA](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)  
881-883 FULTON STREET – west side between Fillmore and Webster Streets; Lot 024 in Assessor's Block 0797 in a RH-3 (Residential, House, Three-Family) Zoning District and a 50-X Height and Bulk District (District 5) – Request for **Certificate of Appropriateness** to construct a horizontal addition at the rear of the top floor of the building and to construct a roof deck at the rear of the building. The property is located within the Alamo Square Landmark District within Article 10 of the Planning Code.

*Preliminary Recommendation: Approve*

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Approved

AYES: Wolfram, Johnck, Johns, Pearlman, Hyland, Matsuda  
ABSENT: Hasz  
MOTION: 0294

## E. REGULAR CALENDAR

7. [2016-006763COA](#) (F. MCMILLEN: (415) 575-9076)  
2007 FRANKLIN STREET – west side between Washington and Jackson Streets, Lot 002 in Assessor's Block 0600 (District 2). Request for **Certificate of Appropriateness** for the installation of a fire escape on the rear of the building and modification to a single-story rear pantry addition to accommodate the fire escape ladder; installation of platform lift at the rear porch; and installation of handrails at main entrance staircase, along north property line walkway, and at rear basement entrance. The project also includes the removal of two steps and modification of a walkway along the north property line to create an accessible path to an entrance on the side of the building. A step at the side entrance will be removed to create a level threshold and a new transom panel will be installed above the door. Rear landscape modifications, including new plantings and hardscaping, are also included in the project. Constructed in 1885-1886, the Haas-Lilienthal House was designated as Landmark Number 69 in 1974. The project site is within a RH-2 (Residential, House, Two-Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

*Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions*

SPEAKERS: = Francis McMillen – Staff Report  
+ Mike Buhler – Project Presentation  
ACTION: Approved with Conditions  
AYES: Wolfram, Johnck, Johns, Pearlman, Hyland, Matsuda  
ABSENT: Hasz  
MOTION: 0295

8. [2014.1434COA](#) (R. SUCRE: (415) 575-9108)  
950 TENNESSEE STREET – located on the west side of Tennessee Street between 20<sup>th</sup> and 22<sup>nd</sup> Streets, Assessor's Block 4107, Lot 001B (District 10) - Request for **Certificate of Appropriateness** to demolish an existing two-story industrial building and construct a new four-story (40-ft tall) residential building (measuring approximately 99,075 gross square feet) with 100 dwelling units, 86 off-street parking spaces, 100 Class 1 bicycle parking spaces, and a publically-accessible mid-block pedestrian passage. The project site is located within the Dogpatch Landmark District, which is designated in Appendix L of Article 10 of the San Francisco Planning Code, and is also located in the UMU (Urban Mixed-Use) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

*Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions*

SPEAKERS: = Rich Sucre – Staff Report  
+ Juan Carlos Wallace – Project Presentation  
+ Glen Rescalvo – Design Presentation  
ACTION: Approved with Conditions  
AYES: Wolfram, Johnck, Johns, Pearlman, Hyland, Matsuda  
ABSENT: Hasz  
MOTION: 0296

9. [2016-01105DES](#) (S. FERGUSON: (415) 575-9074)  
1970 OCEAN AVENUE – north side of Ocean Avenue, Assessor's Block 3280, Lot 018 (District 7) - Consideration to Initiate **Landmark Designation** of the former El Rey Theater as an individual Article 10 Landmark pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the Planning Code. The El Rey Theater is architecturally significant as one of the only remaining movie theaters originally designed in the Art Deco style by master architect Timothy Pflugger. 1970 Ocean Avenue is located in a NCT- Ocean Avenue Neighborhood Commercial Transit zoning district and 45-X Height and Bulk district.  
*Preliminary Recommendation: Approve*

SPEAKERS: = Shannon Ferguson – Staff Report  
+ Speaker – Support  
+ Patricia Dove – Support  
+ Mike Buhler – Support  
+ Speaker – Support  
+ Richard Kurylo – Support

ACTION: After hearing and closing public comment; Continued to January 18, 2017

AYES: Wolfram, Johnck, Johns, Pearlman, Hyland, Matsuda

ABSENT: Hasz

10. [2011.1124L](#) (S. PARKS: (415) 575-9101)  
2117-2123 MARKET STREET – South Side of Market Street between Church and 15<sup>th</sup> streets– Lot 012 in Assessor's Block 3543 (District 7). Consideration to Initiate **Landmark Designation** for 2117-2123 Market Street, historically known as the New Era Hall, as an individual Article 10 Landmark pursuant to Section 1004.1 of the Planning Code. Constructed in 1907, the subject property is significant for its associations with the events of the City's post-Earthquake development; its over-scaled combination of Classical Revival and Craftsman architecture by master architect August Nordin; and its associations with prominent, long-standing Mexican-American business, the Visalia Stock Saddle Company. The subject property was added to the Landmark Designation Work Program on June 15, 2011. The property is located within Upper Market Neighborhood Commercial Zoning District (NCD) and 40-X (at the front) and 50-X (at the rear) Height and Bulk District.  
*Preliminary Recommendation: Approve*

SPEAKERS: = Desiree Smith – Staff Report

ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval

AYES: Wolfram, Johnck, Johns, Pearlman, Hyland, Matsuda

ABSENT: Hasz

RESOLUTION: 836

- 11a. [2016-014707LBR](#) (S. CISNEROS: (415) 575-9186)  
1563 POLK STREET – west side of Polk Street at the corner of Sacramento Street. Assessor's Block 0643, Lot 007 (District 3). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business** application. Established in 1905, Brownies Hardware is a long-standing local hardware shop and repair service business serving the Nob Hill Polk Gulch neighborhood. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and

success. The subject business is within a NCD (Polk Street Neighborhood Commercial) Zoning District and 65-A Height and Bulk District.

*Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval*

SPEAKERS: = Stephanie Cisneros – Staff Report  
+ Carol Queen – Good Vibrations  
+ Speakers – Joe’s Ice Cream  
+ Steven Cornel – Brownies Hardware  
ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval  
AYES: Wolfram, Johnck, Johns, Pearlman, Hyland, Matsuda  
ABSENT: Hasz  
RESOLUTION: 837

- 11b. [2016-014912LBR](#) (S. CISNEROS: (415) 575-9186)  
603 VALENCIA STREET – east side of Valencia Street at the corner of 17<sup>th</sup> Street. Assessor’s Block 3576, Lot 128 (District 9). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business** application. Established in 1977, Good Vibrations is an innovative retailer in the Mission District that provides a safe and welcoming atmosphere to buy products and obtain information regarding sexual health and education. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within a NCT (Valencia Street Neighborhood Commercial Transit) Zoning District and 55-X Height and Bulk District.  
*Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval*

SPEAKERS: Same as Item #11a.  
ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval  
AYES: Wolfram, Johnck, Johns, Pearlman, Hyland, Matsuda  
ABSENT: Hasz  
RESOLUTION: 838

- 11c. [2016-014698LBR](#) (S. CISNEROS: (415) 575-9186)  
5240 GEARY BOULEVARD – north side of Geary Boulevard between 18<sup>th</sup> Avenue and 19<sup>th</sup> Avenue. Assessor’s Block 1450, Lot 019A (District 1). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business** application. Established in 1959, Joe’s Ice Cream is a Richmond District ice cream shop and dessert destination known for its traditional and unique ice cream flavors and for continuously supporting local schools and students. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within a NC-3 (Neighborhood Commercial, Moderate Scale) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.  
*Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval*

SPEAKERS: Same as Item #11a.  
ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval  
AYES: Wolfram, Johnck, Johns, Pearlman, Hyland, Matsuda

ABSENT: Hasz  
RESOLUTION: 839

12. [2014-000362ENV](#) (C. FORDHAM: (415) 575-9071)  
1500-1580 MISSION STREET – North side of Mission Street between South Van Ness Avenue to the west and 11th Street to the east; Lots 002,003 in Assessor's Block 3506 (District 6) – Commission Review and Comment on the **Draft Environmental Impact Report**. The proposed project would include the demolition an existing 29,000-square-foot, 30-foot-tall building at 1580 Mission Street and retention and rehabilitation a portion of an existing 57,000-square-foot, 28-foot-tall building at 1500 Mission Street and demolition of the remaining portions on the project site, and construction of a mixed-use development with two components. The residential/retail component would consist of an approximately 767,200-square-foot, 416-foot-tall (to the top of the parapet) residential and retail/restaurant building at the corner of South Van Ness Avenue and Mission Street that would contain up to 560 dwelling units and 38,000 square feet of retail space. The office component would include an approximately 567,300-square-foot, 257-foot-tall (to the top of the parapet) office, permit center, and childcare building for the City and County of San Francisco ("City") on 11th Street between Market and Mission Streets. The proposed project would include a two-level, below-grade basement level parking garage for up to 420 parking spaces. The project site is located in the Downtown General Commercial (C-3-G) Zoning District and 120/320-R-2, 85/250-R-2, 85-X Height and Bulk Districts.  
**Note: This public hearing is intended to assist the Commission in its preparation of comments on the Draft Environmental Impact Report (DEIR). Comments made by members of the public at this hearing will not be considered comments on the DEIR and may not be responded to in the Final EIR (FEIR). The Planning Commission will hold a public hearing to receive comments on the DEIR on December 15, 2016. Written comments on the DEIR will be accepted at the Planning Department until 5:00 p.m., January 4, 2017.**

*Preliminary Recommendation: Review and Comment*

SPEAKERS: = Chelsea Fordham – Staff Report  
- Mike Buhler – Precedence setting  
Pilar LaValley – Response to questions

ACTION: Reviewed and Commented

- ☐ The HPC concurs with the findings that the proposed project does not meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and will result in a significant, unavoidable impact to the identified historic resource, 1500 Mission Street.
- ☐ The HPC agreed that the DEIR analyzed an appropriate range of preservation alternatives to address historic resource impacts. Further, the HPC appreciated that the preservation alternatives not only avoid some or all of the identified significant impacts but also met or partially met the project objectives.
- ☐ The HPC concurs that the Full Preservation Alternative meets the Secretary of Interior's Standards.
- ☐ The HPC agreed that they recommend adoption of the Full Preservation Alternative as it avoids significant impacts to the historic resource by retaining the majority of character defining features and allows the building to continue to convey its significance while also

allowing for adaptive use and new construction to accommodate many of the project objectives.

☐ The HPC generally agreed with San Francisco Heritage's statement about the symbolic importance of this project and its potential to compromise the credibility of the City's preservation program with a façade retention project as the future headquarters of several City Departments, including Planning,. The HPC President noted, further, that he hopes that the Planning Commission will be very thoughtful in their deliberations about the project and consider what the project says about the City's interest in preserving historic resources.

LETTER:

0071

ADJOURNMENT – 2:32 PM