

SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



Draft – Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Wednesday, October 5, 2016
12:30 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Wolfram, Pearlman, Hyland, Matsuda, Johns, Johnck, Hasz

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT WOLFRAM AT 12:35 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: Jeff Joslin – Director of Current Planning, Pilar LaValley, Stephanie Cisneros, Shannon Ferguson, Tim Frye – Historic Preservation Officer, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

At this time, members of the public may address the Commission on items of interest to the public that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission except agenda items. With respect to agenda items, your opportunity to address the Commission will be afforded when the item is reached in the meeting. Each member of the public may address the Commission for up to three minutes.

None

B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS**1. [Director's Announcements](#)****Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:**

The director's report was included in your packets; happy to answer any questions should you have them.

2. Review of Past Events at the Planning Commission, Staff Report and Announcements**Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:**

Four items to share with you; I have no formal report from the Planning Commission. However, a few items from recent Board of Supervisor's committee hearings and Board of Supervisors hearings. This Monday, we, along with the mayor's office and the Entertainment Commission, attended the Land Use Committee hearing regarding the LGBTQ Cultural Heritage Strategy in district proposed through resolution by Supervisor Weiner. There were no formal presentations by staff; however, Supervisor Campos did attend and encourage that whatever working group is put together that it reflect the diversity of San Francisco and the community and we are actively working with the mayor's office in ensuring that the list of names we supply to the supervisors to reflect that diversity. So as things progress and move along, we will give you periodic updates on the progress of getting the working group together. Then at the full board you may have seen in the newspaper Supervisor Peskin is sponsoring a resolution encouraging MTA to retain the Van Ness Avenue trolley poles as you know this commission and Architectural Review Committee is encouraging MTA to retain four of them that are in the Civic Center Landmark District; however this resolution goes a step further in seeking solutions to attain all of them and we'll certainly give you an update on the progress of that effort as well as a final certificate of appropriateness is required for the project that involves the trolley pole so that will be before you, we anticipate, before the end of the year. So you will see that again.

President Wolfram:

That's for the four poles that are within the district, not for the whole project?

Tim Frye, Preservation Officer:

That is correct but we anticipate they'll have, at that time, they'll have more to report on whether or not they can maintain or save the remainder of the poles. Then as you saw the eleven most endangered list from the national trust was released today and The Embarcadero was listed as a feature that is endangered and as you know the couple members of the HPC are in a working group working with the port on their, sort of, long-range efforts. We certainly are happy to provide any support to the port or to this commission to address the issues identified by the trust. Then finally, myself along with President Wolfram, were in Anaheim last week to celebrate the California Preservation Foundation Design Awards. The Planning Department was recognized along with its consultants for the Civic Center Landscape Inventory. The LGBTQ Historic Context Statement was awarded the trustees award as sort of an exemplary context statement reflecting social and cultural heritage and there were many other projects related to work that this commission is involved in and planning department staff. So San Francisco was well represented and we again congratulate the award winners. We'll have more information on the ceremony in your packets were in the directors report in the future

dates. That concludes my comments unless you have any comments or questions. Thank you.

Commissioner Hyland:

I just wanted to add on to The Embarcadero Historic district that is known 11 most endangered list for the national trust. Its specifically the seawall and the threat of the seawall that has placed it on there, not only because of sea level rise but as well as the seismic issues related to it so that'll help us get some more exposure to helping us fix it. Thanks.

C. COMMISSION MATTERS

3. President's Report and Announcements

None

4. Consideration of Adoption:

- [Draft Minutes for ARC Site Visit September 21, 2016](#)
- [Draft Minutes for HPC September 21, 2016](#)

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Continue ARC Site Visit to October 19, 2016; Adopted HPC September 21, 2016 as corrected

AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman

5. Commission Comments & Questions

Commissioner Johns:

Before today's hearing someone called me on one of the matter that's coming before the commission. I would just like to say that-I say this to those in the audience and I hope everyone who will appear before the commission in the next three years who will be watching us today. I really don't like to get calls about matters that are coming before the commission and the reason I don't like to get them is that I like all the commissioners to be operating from the same set of facts and have the same information. So if someone feels that they need to get something, either in support or opposition to a project, to us after the packet has come out, the way I wish those people would do it is to send their comments to the commission secretary who can then distribute them. Then save whatever they have for the hearing and particularly important to me that it happened that way because if were all in the same room my fellow commissioners frequently asked questions and elicit information which I don't have and might not have thought about . I suspect that's true for all commissioners and if we can all do it together then we all have the benefit of each other's wisdom. So that's my pontification for this afternoon.

D. CONSIDERATION OF ITEMS PROPOSED FOR CONTINUANCE

The Commission will consider a request for continuance to a later date. The Commission may choose to continue the item to the date proposed below, to continue the item to another date, or to hear the item on this calendar.

6. [2013.0384U](#)

(S. PARKS: (415) 575-9101)

AFRICAN AMERICAN HISTORIC CONTEXT STATEMENT – **Consideration to adopt, modify, or disapprove** the African American Citywide Historic Context Statement. Partially funded by the Historic Preservation Fund Committee, the context statement documents the history of African Americans in San Francisco from the City's earliest development to the present day. It outlines significance, integrity considerations, registration requirements, and further recommendations.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt the Historic Context Statement

(Continued from Regular hearing February 17, 2016, April 6, 2016, and May 4, 2016)

(Proposed continuance to February 15, 2017)

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Continued to February 15, 2017

AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman

E. CONSENT CALENDAR

All matters listed hereunder constitute a Consent Calendar, are considered to be routine by the Historic Preservation Commission, and may be acted upon by a single roll call vote of the Commission. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a member of the Commission, the public, or staff so requests, in which event the matter shall be removed from the Consent Calendar and considered as a separate item at this or a future hearing.

7. (T. FRYE: (415) 575-6822)

ADMINISTRATIVE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS AND MINOR PERMITS TO ALTER DELEGATION - **Renewal of Motion No. 0241** to delegate to Planning Department Preservation staff the review, approval and denial of administrative Certificates of Appropriateness for individual Landmarks and Landmark districts pursuant to Article 10 Section 1006.2(a) of the Planning Code and Minor Permits to Alter for Significant and Contributory Buildings & all buildings with Conservation Districts regulated under Article 11 pursuant to 1111.1 of the Planning Code.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: = Tim Frye – Staff report

ACTION: After being pulled off of Consent; Approved

AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman

MOTION: 0289

F. REGULAR CALENDAR

8. 2015-012307PTA (P. LAVALLEY: (415) 575-9084)

340 MASON STREET – southeast corner of Geary and Mason streets; Assessor's Block 0315, Lots 019 (District 4). Request for a **Major Permit to Alter** to construct core and shell remodel of an existing two-story building and an addition of a third floor and terrace. A glass and metal wind screen and metal trellis will enclose the open terrace. On the Geary Street elevation, one bay of the brick cladding will be removed and replaced with a glass curtain wall. The project will include replacement of existing storefront systems and installation of canopies and signage. Constructed in 1968, the subject building is a Category V (Unrated) Building within the Kearny-Market-Mason-Sutter Conservation District, the C-3-G (Downtown General) Zoning District, and 80-130-F Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with conditions

SPEAKERS: = Pilar LaValley – Staff report
 + Claudine Bowe – Outreach
 + Theo Olefaut – Response to outreach questions
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
 MOTION: 0290

9. [2015-005890DES](#) (S. FERGUSON: (415) 575-9074)
546-548, 554 FILLMORE STREET, 735 FELL STREET, 660 OAK STREET – east side of Fillmore Street, north side of Oak Street, south side of Fell Street, Assessor's Blocks/Lots 0828/021, 0828/022, 0828/022A and 0828/012, (District 5) - Consideration to **Initiate Landmark Designation** for the former Sacred Heart Parish Complex which includes the former rectory, church, school and convent buildings pursuant to Article 10, Section 1004(c) of the Planning Code. Sacred Heart Parish Complex is significant for its association with the growth and development of the Western Addition and Catholic religious institutions in San Francisco in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries; with prominent and influential civil rights activist Father Eugene Boyle, pastor of the church from 1968 to 1972; as a distinctive and well-executed example of a Romanesque Revival-style Catholic parish grouping and for its association with master architect Thomas J. Welsh. 546-548 Fillmore Street is located in a RM-3 Residential-Mixed, Medium Density zoning district and a 40-X Height and Bulk district; 554 Fillmore Street is located in a RM-1 Residential-Mixed, Low Density zoning district and a 40-X height and bulk district; 735 Fell Street is located in a RM-3 Residential-Mixed, Medium Density zoning district and 40-X Height and Bulk district; and 660 Oak Street is located in a RM-1 Residential-Mixed, Low Density zoning district and 40-X height and bulk district.

Preliminary Recommendation: Approve

SPEAKERS: = Shannon Ferguson – Staff report
 + Mark Riser – Project presentation
 + Rich Trapani – Tech Art
 + Gabriel Goldberg – Arts collaborative
 + John Nguyen – Arts collaborative
 + Robert O'Pritchard – Support
 + Sandra Finnegan – Support
 + Merle Easton – Support
 + Jan Robinson – Support
 + Virna Shaheen – Support
 + Lorraine Kelly – Support
 + Raymond Soblatne – Support
 + Megan Smith – Support
 + Joe Cakora – Support
 + Jerry Augusta – Character defining features
 + Francine Sosa – Support
 + John Pollard – Issues and concerns
 + Silvia Johnson – Inaudible
 ACTION: Approved with Conditions, as amended and incorporating Commissioner comments related to the connector, stained glass windows and interior character defining features.
 AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman

RESOLUTION: 806

- 10a. [2016-006192MLS](#) (S. FERGUSON: (415) 575-9074)
101-105 STEINER STREET – west side of Steiner Street between Hermann and Waller streets; the south elevation abuts Duboce Park. Assessor's Block 0866, Lot 009. Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a **Mills Act** historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Designated as a contributor to the Duboce Park Landmark District under Article 10 of the Planning Code, the three-story plus basement, wood frame, multiple family building was designed in the Edwardian style and constructed in 1903. The property is within a RTO (Residential Transit Oriented District) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: = Shannon Ferguson – Staff report
ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
RESOLUTION: 790

- 10b. [2016-006185MLS](#) (S. FERGUSON: (415) 575-9074)
361 OAK STREET – south side of Oak Street between Laguna and Octavia streets. Assessor's Block 0839, Lot 023. Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a **Mills Act** historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Individually listed on the California Register of Historical Resources, the two-story, wood frame, single-family dwelling was designed in the Italianate style and built in 1885. The subject property is located within a RTO (Residential Transit Oriented District) and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: = Shannon Ferguson – Staff report
ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
RESOLUTION: 791

- 10c. [2016-006181MLS](#) (S. FERGUSON: (415) 575-9074)
1036 VALLEJO STREET – north side of Vallejo Street between Jones and Taylor streets. Assessor's Block 0127, Lot 007. Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a **Mills Act** historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. A contributor to the Russian Hill-Vallejo Street Crest National Register Historic District, the two and half-

story, wood frame, single-family dwelling was designed in the Shingle style and built in 1906. The subject property is located within a RH-2 (Residential – House, Two Family) and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: = Shannon Ferguson – Staff report
ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
RESOLUTION: 792

- 10d. [2016-006229MLS](#) (S. FERGUSON: (415) 575-9074)
1338 FILBERT STREET – north side of Filbert Street between Polk and Larkin streets. Assessor's Block 0524/031, 0524/032, 0524/033, 0524/034. Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Board of Supervisors approval of a **Mills Act** historical property contract. The Mills Act authorizes local governments to enter into contracts with owners of private historical property who, through the historical property contract, assure the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of a qualified historical property. In return, the property owner enjoys a reduction in property taxes for a given period. Designated as San Francisco Landmark No. 232, 1338 Filbert Cottages, it consists of four, two-story, wood frame, single family dwellings designed in a vernacular post-earthquake period style with craftsman references and built in 1907 with a 1943 addition. The subject property is located within a RH-2 (Residential – House, Two Family) and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: = Shannon Ferguson – Staff report
ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
RESOLUTION: 793

- 11a. [2016-011450LBR](#) (S. CISNEROS: (415) 575-9186)
1737 HAIGHT STREET – south side of Haight Street between Shrader Street and Cole Street. Assessor's Block 1248, Lot 023 (District 5). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business** application. Established in 1986, Escape from New York Pizza is a pizza shop with a unique business model serving the Haight-Ashbury neighborhood. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within a NCD (Haight Street Neighborhood Commercial) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.

Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: = Stephanie Cisneros – Staff report
+ Rosalie Jacques – 1457 Powell
+ Antonella Bonfanti – Oddball Films
+ Paul Gefner – Escape from N.Y. Pizza
+ Dr. Karen Jacobs – Oddball Films
ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman

RESOLUTION: 794

- 11b. [2016-011464LBR](#) (S. CISNEROS: (415) 575-9186)
1457 POWELL STREET – west side of Powell Street between Vallejo Street and Broadway Street. Assessor's Block 0148, Lot 030 (District 3). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business** application. Established in 1960, Gypsy Rosalie's Wigs & Vintage is a wig and vintage clothing shop serving the North Beach neighborhood. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within a NCD (North Beach Neighborhood Commercial) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as Item # 11a.
ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
RESOLUTION: 795

- 11c. [2016-011465LBR](#) (S. CISNEROS: (415) 575-9186)
275 CAPP STREET – east side of Capp Street between 17th Street and 18th Street. Assessor's Block 3575, Lot 101 (District 9). Consideration of adoption of a resolution recommending Small Business Commission approval of a **Legacy Business** application. Officially registered in 1994, Oddball Films is a local film archive and teaching facility that houses an eclectic collection of historic films and specializes in film preservation. The archive not only serves the Mission District but also serves the greater film industries of San Francisco and the United States. The Legacy Business Registry recognizes longstanding, community-serving businesses that are valuable cultural assets to the City. In addition, the City intends that the Registry be a tool for providing educational and promotional assistance to Legacy Businesses to encourage their continued viability and success. The subject business is within a UMU (Urban Mixed Use) Zoning District and 40-X and 58-X Height and Bulk District.
Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Recommendation for Approval

SPEAKERS: Same as Item # 11a.
ACTION: Adopted a Recommendation for Approval
AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman
RESOLUTION: 796

ADJOURNMENT – 2:58 P.M.