

SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Draft – Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

Wednesday, January 20, 2016
12:30 p.m.
Regular Meeting

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johnck, Matsuda, Johns
ABSENT: Pearlman

THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT WOLFRAM AT 12:38 PM

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE: John Rahaim – Director of Planning, Jeff Joslin – Director of Current Planning, Tom DiSanto – Chief Administrative Officer, Eiliesh Tuffy, Justin Greving, Susan Parks, Nick Perry, Shelley Caltagirone, Tim Frye – Historic Preservation Coordinator, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

SPEAKER KEY:

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

A. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

At this time, members of the public may address the Commission on items of interest to the public that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission except agenda items. With respect to agenda items, your opportunity to address the Commission will be afforded when the item is reached in the meeting. Each member of the public may address the Commission for up to three minutes.

None

B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS**1. [Director's Announcements](#)****Tim Frye, Preservation Coordinator:**

The Director's Report was included in your packets; happy to answer any questions should you have them.

2. Review of Past Events at the Planning Commission, Staff Report and Announcements**Tim Frye, Preservation Coordinator:**

A few items to share with you, last week the Board of Appeals heard the appeal to the Van Ness BRT Certificate of Appropriateness issued by this commission in, I believe, November. The Board of Appeals heard from the appellant as well as MTA and the Planning Department staff on behalf of the HPC. The Board of Appeals had a number of questions regarding, as you recall, the appeal was around the removal of the trolley poles and also the removal of trees as part of the project. The Board of Appeals did raise concerns about the removal of all the trolley poles; I would say the line of questioning was going towards the direction of wanting to save more, but the Board of Appeals felt that this commission's decision in asking MTA to retain 4 seemed appropriate and then defers to you on that matter. The Board of Appeals also had a number of questions about why the trees were/had to be removed; however, MTA did talk at length about the number of trees that were going to be removed and the fact that there will be actually more trees replanted in this area after completion of the project. So with that the Board voted 3 to 1 to deny the appeal so the Commission's C of A is upheld in this case and as you know the MTA will be coming back to you within 6 months to discuss a redesign of the bus shelter and also have a plan on how to rehabilitate and retain those 4 trolley poles that there was a lot of discussion about at that previous hearing. Two other items and more just updates, one to remind you the Cowell House is still pending at the Board of Supervisors with the New Year and some discussions with the supervisor we're seeking sponsorship of that item so it could move forward to Land Use Committee. The supervisor of that district is interested in a site tour so we are trying to arrange a site tour prior to any further discussions. Then second, in 90 2nd Street, the Bourdette Building is also pending at the Board of Supervisors and again, we're working with the supervisor's office in that district to also seek sponsorship and we'll have more information hopefully at the next hearing. That concludes my announcements for you today unless you have additional questions. Thank you.

C. COMMISSION MATTERS**3. President's Report and Announcements**

None

4. Consideration of Adoption:

- [Draft Minutes for January 6, 2016](#)

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: Adopted

AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda
ABSENT: Pearlman

Adoption of Commission Minutes – Charter Section 4.104 requires all commissioners to vote yes or no on all matters unless that commissioner is excused by a vote of the Commission. Commissioners may not be automatically excluded from a vote on the minutes because they did not attend the meeting.

5. Commission Comments & Questions

- Disclosures.
- Inquiries/Announcements. Without discussion, at this time Commissioners may make announcements or inquiries of staff regarding various matters of interest to the Commissioner(s).
- Future Meetings/Agendas. At this time, the Commission may discuss and take action to set the date of a Special Meeting and/or determine those items that could be placed on the agenda of the next meeting and other future meetings of the Historic Preservation Commission.

Commissioner Johns:

I don't have a disclosure other than I've become recently quite interested in the I. Magnin Building, the latter of two located on the southwest corner of Stockton and Geary, which I just learned today does not seem to have any protection other than being in a district. I think it was started in 1903 or 5 rather and rebuilt after the fire and earthquake and then substantially totally remodeled by Timothy Pflueger in the late 40s and I think we should address appropriately designating that building so that it can be preserved and not fiddled with in the future.

Commissioner Johnck:

I want to let the commissioners know of a great educational experience I had this past weekend with the Stone Foundation; this is an international organization of stone masons. They conducted a series of lectures at the De Young Museum regarding the stories of stone in the San Francisco landscape and we studied the oldest stone building in San Francisco, 1857; does anyone imagine what that might be? It's on corner of California and Montgomery. It is now the Omni Hotel but it was the Parrot Building built by Mr. Parrot in 1857. I thought perhaps Fort Point might been close on but anyway and then the U.S. Mint; we studied the U.S. Mint as well as the James Flood Building and there was some great lectures on materiality, texture, how stone is worked, the power of stone and the landscape and as we consider the public realm here today. I think it's very timely to think about stones so I learned a lot and met a lot of great stone masons so I just want to let the commissioners know about that. So anytime we have future discussions on stone I can become your expert.

Commissioner Hyland:

I have several items. First off, we, Ellen and I, Commissioner Johnck and I are on the Waterfront Plan Update Working Group and we had our second meeting last week. It was just a general overview of the different entities that we're going to be cooperating with: BCD, State Lands, Port of San Francisco, Planning Department and a few others, so there's really nothing to report on that but the meetings are continuing. We'll give updates as appropriate. Second thing, I've spoken to Supervisor Campos' office as well as Supervisor

Peskin's office about the agenda item today about the Legacy Business Registry and Fund and then lastly I'll be recusing myself on the first regular agenda item for Trinity Episcopal as it's my former firm that's doing that project.

President Wolfram:

Thank you. I just have one disclosure which is that I spoke today with Lacey Bubnash from Architectural Resources Group about the Trinity Church project.

6. Election of Officers

SPEAKERS: None
 ACTION: Elected Andrew Wolfram as President and Aaron Hyland as Vice President
 AYES: Hyland, Johns, Matsuda, Johnck, Wolfram, Hasz
 ABSENT: Pearlman

Upon appointment of officers, Commissioners Hasz, Pearlman, and Hyland were appointed as members of the Architectural Review Committee with President Wolfram as Ex-Officio; Commissioners Matsuda and Hyland appointed as members of the Cultural Heritage Asset Committee.

D. REGULAR CALENDAR

7. 2016-000613CRV (T. DISANTO: (415) 575-9113)
FY 2016-2018 PROPOSED DEPARTMENT BUDGET & WORK PROGRAM - Review the balanced Fiscal Year 2016-2018 department budget and work program
Preliminary Recommendation: None - Informational

SPEAKERS: John Rahaim – Budget introduction
 Tom DiSanto – Budget presentation
 Tim Frye – Preservation WP Budget
 ACTION: None – Informational

8. [2015-009585COA](#) (E. TUFFY: (415) 575-9191)
1668 BUSH STREET- north side of Bush Street between Gough Street and Franklin Street; Assessor's Block 0665, Lot 015. Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** to conduct exterior façade repairs and interior seismic upgrades at the Trinity Episcopal Church (Landmark No. 65). Work to include exterior Colusa sandstone cleaning, repairs and stabilization, window repair and repainting, upgrades to accessibility, life safety and seismic programs, replacement roofing material, mechanical, electrical and plumbing work. A new egress door for the first floor accessory theater space is proposed to be added on the rear elevation of the building's North Wing. Proposed seismic upgrades include vertical cores within the south perimeter wall and selective use of reinforced concrete shear walls. The subject property is located within a RM-4 (Residential – Mixed, High Density) Zoning District, and 80-A Height and Bulk District. Designed by architect Arthur Page Brown and completed in 1893, the subject property is home to the oldest Episcopal congregation in California. The church was granted local landmark status in 1974.
Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions

SPEAKERS: = Eiliesh Tuffy – Staff presentation
 + Lacey Bubnash – Project presentation

- + Patricia Cunningham – Site operation
- + Rory Walsh – Courtyard door
- + George Tigell – Courtyard door
- + Cynthia Kravens – Support
- + Patrick Andersen – Changes now will add an unnecessary burden

ACTION: Approved as amended without conditions
 AYES: Wolfram, Hasz, Johnck, Johns, Matsuda
 RECUSED: Hyland
 ABSENT: Pearlman
 MOTION: 0274

9. [2015-005005FED](#) (J. GREVING: (415) 575-9169)
3455 VAN NESS AVENUE – northernmost end of Van Ness Avenue just south of McDowell Avenue; Assessor's Block 0409, Lot 002. Request for **Review and Comment** on the Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) for the proposed improvement and seismic upgrade of Pump Station No. 2, pursuant to Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act (NHPA). The subject property is individually listed in the National Register and is a contributor to the National Register-listed Fort Mason Historic District. Pump Station No. 2 is located within a P (Public) Zoning District, and an OS (Open Space) Height and Bulk District. Constructed in 1913 in the Mission Revival Style, Pump Station No. 2 was designed to pump water from the bay to feed the Auxiliary Water Supply System (AWSS).
Preliminary Recommendation: Recommend the Planning Director (on behalf of the Department) to participate as a signatory on the MOA

SPEAKERS: = Justin Greving – Staff presentation
 + Scott McPhersen – Project presentation
 ACTION: Recommended the Director participate as a signatory

10. (S. PARKS: (415) 575-9101)
[LANDMARK DESIGNATION WORK PROGRAM](#) – Discussion of the HPC's **Landmark Designation Work Program, prioritization and status of pipeline projects.**
Preliminary Recommendation: Review and Comment

SPEAKERS: Susan Parks – Staff presentation
 ACTION: Reviewed and Commented

11. (N. PERRY: (415) 575-9066)
[CIVIC CENTER PUBLIC REALM PLAN](#) – **Informational presentation** on the Civic Center Public Realm Plan. The Civic Center Public Realm Plan is an interdepartmental project led by the Planning Department that will create a cohesive, long-term vision for the design and activation of the Civic Center's plazas, streets, and other public spaces. The plan area is roughly bounded by Gough Street, Golden Gate Avenue, Market Street, and Fell Street and encompasses the Civic Center Landmark District. The Public Realm plan is part of the City's larger strategy to improve the Civic Center as both a neighborhood gathering space and a public commons for all San Franciscans. This informational presentation will provide an introduction to the plan and describe its background, goals, scope, and timeline.
Preliminary Recommendation: None – Informational

SPEAKERS: Neil Hrushowy – Staff introduction
 Nick Perry – Staff presentation

ACTION: James Haas – Neighborhood park, neglect
None – Informational

12. (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)
[LEGACY BUSINESS REGISTRY DISCUSSION](#) - Request for **Review and Comment** on the review process for nominations to the Legacy Business Registry. Regina Dick-Endrizzi from the Mayor's Office of Small Business will present information on the recently established Legacy Business Registry and the Legacy Business Historic Preservation Fund. As outlined in Section 2A.242(b)(2) of the amended Administrative Code, the Historic Preservation Commission may advise the Small Business Commission on nominations to the Registry. This hearing will provide an opportunity for the Commission and members of the public to comment on the Historic Preservation Commission's review process for Registry nominations. Please contact Shelley Caltagirone at 415.558.6625 for more information.
Preliminary Recommendation: Review and Comment

SPEAKERS: = Shelley Caltagirone – Staff introduction & presentation
+ Regina Dick-Endrezzi – Small Business Commission presentation
+ Hillary Ronin, Aide to Supervisor Campos – Support, point system, consent calendar
+ Aide to Supervisor Peskin – Support, point system, consent calendar
+ Desiree Smith – Qualitative and historical information
ACTION: Reviewed and Commented

ADJOURNMENT – 3:34 PM