

# SAN FRANCISCO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION



## Meeting Minutes

Commission Chambers, Room 400  
City Hall, 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

**Wednesday, October 21, 2015**  
**12:30 p.m.**  
**Regular Meeting**

**COMMISSIONERS PRESENT:** Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Matsuda, Pearlman, Johns  
**ABSENT:** Johnck

**THE MEETING WAS CALLED TO ORDER BY PRESIDENT WOLFRAM AT 12: 36 PM**

**STAFF IN ATTENDANCE:** Rich Sucre, Shannon Ferguson, Pilar LaValley, Shelley Caltagirone, Susan Parks, Tim Frye - Preservation Coordinator, Jonas P. Ionin – Commission Secretary

### **SPEAKER KEY:**

- + indicates a speaker in support of an item;
- indicates a speaker in opposition to an item; and
- = indicates a neutral speaker or a speaker who did not indicate support or opposition.

### **A. GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT**

At this time, members of the public may address the Commission on items of interest to the public that are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission except agenda items. With respect to agenda items, your opportunity to address the Commission will be afforded when the item is reached in the meeting. Each member of the public may address the Commission for up to three minutes.

None

## B. DEPARTMENT MATTERS

### 1. [Director's Announcements](#)

**Tim Frye, Preservation Coordinator:**

Good afternoon commissioners. The President's report was included in the packets. Happy to answer any questions or forward any additional questions to the Director should you have them.

### 2. Review of Past Events at the Planning Commission, Staff Report and Announcements

**Tim Frye, Preservation Coordinator:**

No formal report from the Planning Commission. They had a very short hearing last week and the only other item I wanted to bring to your attention was University Mound Ladies Home will be at the Land Use Committee next week and the department will be presenting on your behalf. That concludes my announcements.

## C. COMMISSION MATTERS

### 3. President's Report and Announcements

None

### 4. Consideration of Adoption:

- [Draft Minutes for HPC October 7, 2015](#)
- [Draft Minutes for ARC October 7, 2015](#)

SPEAKERS: None

ACTION: HPC Adopted; ARC Adopted as Corrected

AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman

ABSENT: Johnck

Adoption of Commission Minutes – Charter Section 4.104 requires all commissioners to vote yes or no on all matters unless that commissioner is excused by a vote of the Commission. Commissioners may not be automatically excluded from a vote on the minutes because they did not attend the meeting.

### 4. Commission Comments & Questions

None

- Disclosures.
- Inquiries/Announcements. Without discussion, at this time Commissioners may make announcements or inquiries of staff regarding various matters of interest to the Commissioner(s).

- Future Meetings/Agendas. At this time, the Commission may discuss and take action to set the date of a Special Meeting and/or determine those items that could be placed on the agenda of the next meeting and other future meetings of the Historic Preservation Commission

#### D. CONSIDERATION OF ITEMS PROPOSED FOR CONTINUANCE

The Commission will consider a request for continuance to a later date. The Commission may choose to continue the item to the date proposed below, to continue the item to another date, or to hear the item on this calendar.

6. 2014.1315COA (R. SUCRE: 415/575-9108)  
135 TOWNSEND STREET, located on the south side of Townsend Street between 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Streets, Assessor's 3794, Lot 022. Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** for front and rear façade alterations and construction of a new roof deck, stair penthouse and elevator penthouse. The façade alterations consist of: replacement of the existing windows on the second through fifth floors with new steel-sash windows; replacement of the non-historic storefront and garage doors along Townsend Street with a new storefront; and replacement of the doors on the rear façade with a new aluminum-sash storefront system. These alterations are associated with a proposed project to change the use of 49,995 square feet at the subject property from self-storage (retail) to office use, which require an Office Development Authorization from the Planning Commission. The subject property is a contributing resource to the South End Landmark District, and is located within the MUO (Mixed-Use Office) Zoning District and 105-F Height and Bulk Limit.  
**(Proposed for Continuance to November 18, 2015)**

SPEAKERS: None  
ACTION: Continued to November 18, 2015  
AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman  
ABSENT: Johnck

#### F. REGULAR CALENDAR

7. [2015-007714COA](#) (P. LAVALLEY: (415) 575-9084)  
900 NORTH POINT STREET (GHIRARDELLI SQUARE) – block bounded by North Point, Larkin, Beach, and Polk streets, Assessor's Block 0452, Lot 002. Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** for alterations to the Apartment Building and plaza near the Larkin Street entrance at Ghirardelli Square. Proposed work at the Apartment Building includes: replacing non-historic entry stairs and storefront and restoring ground floor window openings at west façade, replacing non-historic metal stairs at south façade, installing ADA-accessible lift adjacent to new stairs at south façade, and installing new awning, tenant signs, mechanical louvers, and light fixtures. In the plaza around the Larkin Street entry, proposed work includes: relocating a historic globe light fixture, reconfiguring portions of a Halprin-era planter to accommodate the new ADA-lift and a new built-in concrete bench and replacing a Halprin-era planter with a built-in concrete bench. Ghirardelli Square is designated as Landmark No. 30 and is located within the C-2

(Community Business) District, 40-X Height and Bulk District, and Waterfront Special Use District, Subarea #2.

*Preliminary Recommendation: Approve with Conditions*

SPEAKERS: + Elisa Skaags – Profit presentation  
+ Brian Yencheck – Exterior improvements  
ACTION: Approved with Condition as amended  
AYES: Hyland, Hasz, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman  
RECUSED: Wolfram  
ABSENT: Johnck  
MOTION: 0264

8. [2009.0634COA](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)  
VAN NESS BRT STATION DESIGN FOR CIVIC CENTER LANDMARK DISTRICT - Request for **Review and Comment** by the Historic Preservation Commission. The Van Ness Avenue BRT is proposed on Van Ness Avenue and extends approximately 2 miles from Mission Street to Lombard Street. The portion of the alignment that falls between Golden Gate Avenue and Fell Street is located within the Civic Center Landmark District and is subject to Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) review. The SFMTA is seeking comments on the design of the BRT station, sidewalk improvements, and infrastructure to be installed within the landmark district. The COA hearing will be scheduled at a later date.  
*Preliminary Recommendation: The Commission may direct staff to draft written comments about the compatibility of the proposed construction within the landmark district.*

SPEAKERS: + Peter Gobacho – Profit presentation  
+ Martha Keller – Landscape design presentation  
+ (M) Speaker – Design presentation  
= Jim Haas – Civic Center Review Committee review  
+ Bob Macias – Response to question  
ACTION: Reviewed and Commented  
COMMENT: **Plan:** The Commissioners found that the proposed plan is compatible with the character of the district.

**Plantings:** The Commissioners found that the proposed plantings are compatible with the character of the district.

**Station Platform:** The Commissioners recommended the use of granite curbs at the platform edge to match those found throughout the district. They specified that the granite curb should wrap the pavers at front of the platform and at each side, breaking at the top of the ramp. The tall curb edging the car lane should remain concrete.

**Station Fencing:** The Commissioners found that the station fencing is compatible with the character of the district.

**Station Shelters:** The Commissioners were mixed in their opinion of the shelter design, but the consensus was that generally agreed that the “seismic wave” roof shape is not appropriate for the historic district and that the “Clear Channel” shelter frame is too industrial in character for the

district. Some Commissioners recommended exploring a refined version of the "Clear Channel" shelter frame with welded versus bolted joints and a flat roof.

**Station Railings:** The Commissioners found that the station railings are compatible with the character of the district.

**Station Lighting:** The Commissioners found that the station lighting is compatible with the character of the district.

**Station Cameras:** The Commissioners found that the station cameras are compatible with the character of the district.

**Sidewalks:** The Commissioners recommended that new granite curbs are incorporated into the project both where curbs are proposed and where historic granite curbs are currently missing so that there is a consistent treatment at the street edge. They also recommend that the poured concrete paving be replaced entirely so that there is a consistent and high-quality paving treatment at the sidewalk.

**Streetlights:** The Commissioners recommended that the Project Team further explore retention of some trolley poles either in situ or in new locations to be retained as artifacts or re-used in public art displays. Relocation of the trolley poles would not have to be limited to the district boundaries. A maintenance plan for the trolley poles would be necessary. A salvage program for the removed poles was also recommended, perhaps selling or donated the pieces for use in arts projects. They also recommended that an interpretative program be implemented to explain the history of the trolley poles and the district.

AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman  
ABSENT: Johnck  
LETTER: 049

9. [2015-007419COA](#) (S. CALTAGIRONE: (415) 558-6625)  
2239 WEBSTER STREET - located on the west side between Washington and Clay Streets, Assessor's Block 0612, Lot 002. Request for a **Certificate of Appropriateness** for modification of the existing garage opening at the front façade and modifying the rear, non-visible portion of the building. The non-historic brick garage framing would be removed below the historic angled bay so that the garage entry becomes aligned with the plane of the flat front building wall. The opening and the base of the bay above would be re-clad with new wood siding and trim to match the historic façade treatments found within the landmark district. New plantings and permeable paving would be added to the front yard. At the rear of the building, the southeast corner will be demolished to provide a 4' deep open space that allows light and air to the proposed rear windows. A new stair penthouse is proposed for the northwest portion of the building to access an improved roof deck at the rear of the building. Last, a covered breezeway at the south side of the building would be infilled. The subject property is a contributing resource to the Webster Street Landmark District, and is located within a RH-2 (Residential, House, Two-Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk Limit.

*Preliminary Recommendation: Approve*

SPEAKERS: + Dan Phipps – Project presentation  
ACTION: Approved  
AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman  
ABSENT: Johnck  
MOTION: 0265

10. [2015-011315FED](#) (S. FERGUSON: (415) 575-9074)  
800 CHESTNUT STREET (SAN FRANCISCO ART INSTITUTE) – northwest corner of Chestnut and Jones streets, in Assessor's Block 0049, Lot 001 – **Request for Review and Comment** on the nomination of the property to the National Register of Historic Places. The subject property is located within a RH-3 (Residential-House, Three Family) Zoning District and 40-X Height and Bulk District.  
*Preliminary Recommendation: Adopt a Resolution in support of the nomination, subject to revisions, to the National Register of Historic Places.*

SPEAKERS: + Erin Alberg – Criterion C response  
ACTION: Adopted a Resolution supporting the nomination as revised and amended.  
AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman  
ABSENT: Johnck  
RESOLUTION: 756

11. (S. PARKS: (415) 575-9101)  
LANDMARK DESIGNATION WORK PROGRAM – Discussion of the HPC's **Landmark Designation Work Program**, prioritization and status of pipeline projects.  
*Preliminary Recommendation: Review and Comment*

SPEAKERS: None  
ACTION: Reviewed and Commented  
AYES: Wolfram, Hyland, Hasz, Johns, Matsuda, Pearlman  
ABSENT: Johnck

ADJOURNMENT – 2:23 PM

ADOPTED AS AMENDED - November 4, 2015