



SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Historic Resource Evaluation Response

Date December 19, 2014
Case No.: 2011.1300E
Project Address: 1200 17th Street/901 16th Street
Zoning: UMU (Urban Mixed Use)
68-X Height and Bulk District
Block/Lot: 3949/001, 001A, 002; 3950/001
Staff Contact: Gretchen Hilyard (Preservation Planner)
(415) 575-9109
gretchen.hilyard@sfgov.org

1650 Mission St.
Suite 400
San Francisco,
CA 94103-2479

Reception:
415.558.6378

Fax:
415.558.6409

Planning
Information:
415.558.6377

PART II: PROJECT EVALUATION¹

Pre-Existing Historic Rating / Survey

The subject property was surveyed as part of the Showplace Square Historic Resource Survey and further documented in a report by Page & Turnbull (dated July 8, 2011), which found the brick office building at 1200 17th Street to be the only eligible historic resource on the site. The building was given the status code of "3CS" (appears eligible for the California Register as an individual property through survey evaluation).

Subsequent reports were submitted to staff for review including: a Historic Resource Evaluation (HRE) by VerPlanck Historic Preservation Consulting (dated December 4, 2014); an Evaluation of Integrity report by Katherine Petrin (dated February 2014); as well as letters, historic photographs, and other information submitted by neighborhood groups. All of these documents were reviewed by Planning Preservation staff. Staff concurs with the VerPlanck HRE that the brick office building at 1200 17th Street is the only eligible historic resource on the site. The changes that occurred when the site was rebuilt in 1946-47 as part of the Owens-Illinois Co.'s conversion of the property to warehouse use altered the historic character of the site and its associated structures. The other reports submitted to dispute the findings of the HRE did not provide sufficient information to conclude that the other buildings on the site retain sufficient integrity to convey significance under the California Register criteria described below.

The HRE details the significance of the historic resource as follows: The brick office building at 1200 17th Street is eligible for listing in the California Register under Criterion 1 (Events) for its association with the Pacific Rolling Mill Co. during the time it made its greatest contribution to San Francisco. The period of

¹ For a more detailed description of the property background and proposed project, please consult the following Historic Resource Evaluation submitted by the Project Sponsor to assist in the evaluation of the proposed project: VerPlanck Historic Preservation Consulting, *1200 17th Street: Historic Resource Evaluation Part II*, December 4, 2014.

significance under Criterion 1 is 1906-1928, the period in which the subject property was occupied by the Pacific Rolling Mill Co. and when the company made the bulk of its contribution towards the reconstruction of San Francisco after the 1906 Earthquake. The brick office building is also eligible for listing in the California Register under Criterion 3 (Design/Construction) as a good example of a brick industrial building constructed during the post-1906 reconstruction period in San Francisco, and as a structure that embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, and method of construction – a heavy timber-frame brick building constructed in the mid-1920s as the centerpiece of an industrial plant. The period of significance under Criterion 3 is 1926, the year the building was constructed.

The subject property is part of a larger industrial complex formerly occupied by the Pacific Rolling Mill Co. at 1200 17th Street/901 16th Street. The entire site was found to have significant associations as an important structural steel fabrication company that made a contribution towards the rebuilding of San Francisco after the 1906 Earthquake. Only the brick office building at 1200 17th Street (constructed in 1926) was found to retain sufficient integrity to convey this significance under California Register Criterion 1 and 3. The property is not located within the boundaries of any historic district.

The building is considered a “Category A.2” property (Resources listed on adopted local registers, and properties that have been determined to appear or may become eligible, for the California Register) for the purposes of the Planning Department’s California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) review procedures.

The character-defining features of the brick office building at 1200 17th Street include:

- Timber frame construction;
- Red brick (American bond) cladding;
- Flat concrete slab foundation;
- Symmetrical composition of primary façade;
- Three architectural bays;
- Arched recessed entry in center bay;
- Brick voussoirs capped by keystones in entry arch;
- Multi-light steel sash industrial windows;
- Corbeled brick cornice and stepped parapet;
- Gently sloping roof;
- Wood flagpole anchored to roof;
- Pair of planter beds flanking front entrance;
- Cast cement sign (currently obscured) reading: “JUDSON-MURPHY CORPORATION”.

Proposed Project

Demolition

Alteration

New Construction

Per drawings dated: June 19, 2014 by BAR Architects (901 16th Street building) and Christiani-Johnson Architects (1200 17th Street building).

Project Description

The proposed project entails the construction of two separate buildings containing a total of 395 residential units, 24,968 sf of retail space, 388 vehicle parking spaces, 12,219 sf of publicly accessible open space, 27,219 sf of common open space for residents, and 4,950 sf of private open space. The two buildings will be separated by a 39'-wide midblock courtyard (called the "Mississippi Mews") which will connect Mississippi Street with a proposed public pedestrian promenade (called the "Pedestrian Promenade") that will link 16th and 17th streets along the western property line. Additional open spaces for residents will include a pair of courtyards (called the "East" and "West" Courtyards, respectively) in the center of both buildings. The existing brick office building will be rehabilitated for commercial use as part of the 1200 17th Street building. The brick office building will be surrounded by a landscaped buffer so that it stands apart from the nearby new construction.

New Building at 901 16th Street

The new building at 901 16th Street will occupy the northern half of the subject property. It will be a six-story, mixed-use building measuring 68 feet high. The building will include 260 residential units, 20,318 sf of retail space, subterranean tenant parking for 221 vehicles, and above-ground retail parking for 42 vehicles. The building will have two residential courtyards and the proposed Mississippi Mews will be separate it from the building at 1200 17th Street. The proposed building is designed in a contemporary architectural vocabulary with each façade articulated differently to break its apparent massing down into several smaller, distinct sections. Exterior cladding materials include applied face brick, aluminum windows and storefront systems, metal paneling, aluminum screens, tempered glass, and architectural concrete. The 16th Street façade is the building's primary public elevation, with the residential lobby aligning with the former Texas Street right-of-way. The upper floors above the lobby will be recessed 30 feet back from 16th Street, helping to reduce the building's apparent massing. Flanking the entrance lobby will be retail storefronts made of aluminum and glass. The five residential floors above will be clad in brick and the fenestration will be laid out in a traditional grid pattern recalling historic brick industrial buildings in the nearby Showplace Square neighborhood. A large mural will occupy the northeast corner of the building at 16th and Mississippi streets. The other three façades have a less traditional character with rectangular bay windows lining Mississippi Street, as well as the west (Pedestrian Promenade) and south (Mississippi Mews) sides of the building. The roof of the proposed building is flat with several stair and elevator penthouses rising another 10 feet above the roof.

New Building at 1200 17th Street

The new building 1200 17th Street will occupy the southern half of the subject property. It will be a four-story, wood-frame building measuring 48 feet high. It will have 135 residential units, 4,650 sf of retail/restaurant space, subterranean parking (115 residential stalls, retail parking for eight vehicles, and two car-share stalls). The building will have two residential courtyards and the proposed Mississippi Mews will form its northern boundary, creating a setback between it and the new building on 16th Street. The publicly accessible Pedestrian Promenade linking 16th and 17th streets will form a landscaped buffer between the new building and the two existing live-work residential buildings that are located on the opposite side of the western property line. The proposed building is broken down into multiple volumes to reduce its apparent size. In regard to materials and detailing it is simpler than the 16th Street building, with an architectural vocabulary that takes its cue more explicitly from its industrial neighbors. In addition, a portion of the gable-roofed shed structure at 17th and Mississippi streets will be rebuilt in the

same configuration using corrugated metal cladding as a memento of the existing buildings on the site. Cladding materials on the rest of the building will be different from the 16th Street building, with simpler industrial-type materials, including corrugated metal, cast concrete, vertical ribbed metal siding, steel columns, and aluminum roll-up doors. The roofline of the new building will be broken up into a series of shed and gable-roofed volumes, echoing the existing metal-clad structures on the site.

Rehabilitation of Brick Office Building at 1200 17th Street

As discussed, the historic brick office building will be rehabilitated for retail or restaurant use. During demolition all adjoining structures will be demolished and all piping, conduit, and remnants of adjoining structures will be removed. During construction the building will be protected in place. The brick walls will then be cleaned and restored, with any voids patched and/or repaired using brick that matches the original. The paint on the exterior walls (north, east, and west) of the building will be carefully removed to expose the red brick. Only gentle methods that do not remove the exterior face of the brick will be used, including power washing, hand sanding, blasting with walnut shells, or citrus-based strippers. The mortar will be cleaned and repointed wherever necessary. The existing deteriorated steel-sash windows on the primary (south) façade will be replaced in kind with counterparts that match the existing. The historic cast-cement sign above the primary entrance will be retained and repaired. The two pedestrian entrances on the primary façade both presently contain incompatible, non-historic doors. They will be replaced with doors that resemble historic conditions. The existing wooden flagpole mounted on the roof will be retained and restored. The existing skylights are of unknown origin but because they are not visible from the street they will be removed to build a new roof deck. The roof deck will be set back from the parapet and it will have a guardrail that will be minimally visible from 17th Street. The brick office building's non-historic interior finishes and materials will be removed to expose the historic brick walls. A partial mezzanine level will be constructed within the rehabilitated structure, which will contain a total of 1,500 sf of retail or restaurant space.

The new building adjoining the brick office building at 1200 17th Street is designed to respect and be compatible with the historical resource. The brick office building will anchor the southern end of a 61'-4"-wide break in the new building's street wall. There will be a setback on the left (west) side of the brick building that will serve as the residential entrance to the new building. This setback measures 11'-9" wide and the area behind it will remain unbuilt. Additional setbacks will be located along the north and east walls of the brick office building. On the east side of the brick building there will be a notch-out measuring 10'-5" x 4'-10". The purpose of these setbacks and notch-out is to allow the brick building to "read" as a freestanding structure that is functionally related to the new building but structurally independent from it.

Reconstruction of Metal-clad Warehouse at 1100 17th Street

The project sponsor will dismantle and reconstruct the southern half of the timber-frame, metal-clad warehouse at 1100 17th Street and use it for retail space. The proposed project will retain the gable-roofed volume of the existing structure to a point 60'-5" south of 17th Street. Elements of the existing structure, including portions of its timber posts, wood trusses, and corrugated metal siding may be reused in the new retail structure. It will be given new aluminum-frame storefronts along 17th Street and in the first bay along Mississippi Street. The repurposed structure will house 3,100 sf of retail or restaurant space.

For further detail about the design of the two new buildings on the site, see the Project Description outlined in the environmental document.

Project Evaluation

If the property has been determined to be a historic resource in Part I, please check whether the proposed project would materially impair the resource and identify any modifications to the proposed project that may reduce or avoid impacts.

Subject Property/Historic Resource:

- The project will not cause a significant adverse impact to the historic resource as proposed.
- The project will cause a significant adverse impact to the historic resource as proposed.

California Register-Eligible Historic District or Context:

- The project will not cause a significant adverse impact to a California Register-eligible historic district as proposed.
- The project will cause a significant adverse impact to a California Register-eligible historic district as proposed.

Based upon the analysis provided in the *Historic Resource Evaluation* prepared by VerPlanck Historic Preservation Consulting (dated December 4, 2014), staff finds that the proposed project would not cause a significant adverse impact upon a historic resource such that the significance of the resource would be materially impaired. The subject property is not located within any historic district.

The Department finds that the proposed project is consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation* (Secretary's Standards). The following is an analysis of the proposed project per the applicable Secretary's Standards:

Standard 1:

A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces and spatial relationships.

The proposed project includes the conversion of the brick office building at 1200 17th Street from office to retail/restaurant use. The new use will continue the commercial use of the building and will allow for the preservation of the existing building in place. The proposed project will remove non-historic interior materials and finishes and will convert the interior into a double-height space. The project will retain the building's character-defining features, spaces, and spatial relationships.

As proposed, the project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 1.

Standard 2:

The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize the property will be avoided.

As proposed, the project will retain the historic character of the brick office building. The character-defining features of the building are limited to the exterior, and all four existing exterior walls will be preserved, as well as the building's height, massing and fenestration pattern. The building will be protected in place during construction and non-historic conduit, paint and other additive features will be removed to better articulate the original character of the building. The new construction will occur adjacent to the building and the materials, massing and setbacks of the new construction have been designed for compatibility with the existing two-story character of the brick office building. The brick office building will be surrounded by a landscaped buffer so that it stands apart from the nearby new construction. Although its overall context will change, the building will continue to communicate its significance and association with the Pacific Rolling Mill Co.

As proposed, the project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 2.

Standard 3.

Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

The proposed project does not include architectural features that suggest a false sense of historical development, nor will it add conjectural historical features to the brick office building. The subject building will be rehabilitated in place and the new construction surrounding it will feature contemporary materials that will clearly indicate new construction that includes references to the industrial character of the site through its details in materials and massing. The building will be rehabilitated according to preservation best practices and this aspect of the project is described in detail on pages 3-4 above. Specifically, the existing steel-sash windows will be replaced in-kind; non-historic doors will be replaced with doors that resemble historic conditions; the building will be cleaned and repaired; and non-historic conduit, paint and other additive features will be removed to reveal the original character of the building.

The new construction will be contemporary in nature and will provide industrial-type materials, including corrugated metal, cast concrete, vertical ribbed metal siding, steel columns, and aluminum roll-up doors that will reference the industrial character of the exiting property. The new buildings will be clearly differentiated as new construction and will not create a false sense of historical development.

As proposed, the project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 3.

Standard 4:

Changes to a property that have acquired significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.

The cast cement sign above the entry, which has undergone various copy changes throughout its history (most recently in 1945 when it was changed to read "Judson-Pacific Corporation"), is considered a character-defining feature of the building. A vinyl banner currently covering this sign will be removed and the sign will be repaired and rehabilitated.

As proposed, the project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 4.

Standard 5:

Distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

The proposed project includes the preservation, repair and in-kind replacement of distinctive materials, features and finishes of the brick office building, including the brick façade materials, cast cement sign, and steel-sash windows. No distinctive materials, features, finishes or construction techniques will be removed.

As proposed, the project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 5.

Standard 6:

Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

The proposed project involves rehabilitation of the exterior of the brick office building and protection of the building in place during construction. Historic brick, mortar and cast cement materials will be retained, cleaned and repaired as needed. The deteriorated steel-sash windows will be replaced in-kind and the new windows will be compatible with the historic windows in size, profile, configuration, and overall design. Non-historic doors will be replaced with doors that resemble historic conditions.

As proposed, the project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 6.

Standard 7:

Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.

The proposed project will not use sandblasting or other harsh physical or chemical methods to remove accumulated grime and graffiti on the exterior façade. The brick walls will be cleaned and restored, with any voids patched and/or repaired using brick that matches the original. The paint on the exterior walls (north, east, and west) of the building will be carefully removed to expose the red brick. Only gentle methods that do not remove the exterior face of the brick will be used, including power washing, hand sanding, blasting with walnut shells, or citrus-based strippers. The mortar will be cleaned and repointed wherever necessary.

As proposed, the project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 7.

Standard 8:

Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measure will be undertaken.

An archeological survey is beyond the scope of this report.

Standard 9.

New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

The proposed project includes the demolition of the existing industrial buildings that surround the brick office building and the construction of two mixed-use buildings on the site. Historically, the brick office building was constructed as a freestanding office building for the industrial facility and was designed and constructed of brick to differentiate it from the surrounding industrial buildings. The building will continue to function in this way in contrast to the new residential construction, which is contemporary in design. The overall spatial relationships of the site will be maintained and the detailing (including materials) of the new buildings will reference the industrial character of the existing site. The brick office building will be surrounded by a landscaped buffer so that it stands apart from the nearby new construction.

Adjacent new construction will be detailed to be compatible with the subject building in size, scale, proportion, and massing. Specifically, the proposed new construction at 1200 17th Street (directly adjacent to the brick office building) is broken down into multiple volumes to reduce the apparent size. Materials and detailing are simplified and reference the industrial character of the existing site through the use of corrugated metal, cast concrete, vertical ribbed metal siding, steel columns, and aluminum roll-up doors. The roofline of the new building will be broken up into a series of shed and gable-roofed volumes, echoing the existing metal-clad structures on the site. In addition, a portion of the gable-roofed shed structure at 17th and Mississippi streets will be rebuilt in the same configuration using corrugated metal cladding as a memento of the existing buildings on the site.

Overall, the proposed project maintains the historic integrity of the subject property and introduces new construction which is compatible with the property's overall historic materials, features and spatial relationships and clearly differentiated as new construction.

As proposed, the project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 9.

Standard 10:

New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that the essential form of the property and its environmental would be unimpaired if removed in the future. The subject building will be rehabilitation and the location of the building within the larger site will be maintained. If the surrounding new construction were to be removed in the future, the building could be retained as a free-standing structure.

As proposed, the project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 10.

Summary

The Department finds that the proposed project at 1200 17th Street/901 16th Street meets the *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Rehabilitation of Historic Properties*. As currently proposed, the project will not have a significant adverse impact upon a historic resource, as defined by CEQA.

PART II: SENIOR PRESERVATION PLANNER REVIEW

Signature: 
Tina Tam, Senior Preservation Planner

Date: 12/23/2014

cc: Virnaliza Byrd / Historic Resource Impact Review File
Wade Wietgreffe, Environmental Planning
Chris Townes, Current Planning

GH: G:\Documents\HRER\1200 17th Street\HRER\1200 17th Street_HRER_Part II_updated 12-2014.doc